

## DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 250 589

CG 017 788

AUTHOR Herr, Edwin L., Ed.; Pinson, Nancy M., Ed.  
 TITLE Foundations for Policy in Guidance and Counseling.  
 INSTITUTION American Association for Counseling and Development, Alexandria, VA.  
 SPONS AGENCY National Inst. of Education (ED), Washington, DC.  
 PUB DATE 82  
 NOTE 232p.  
 AVAILABLE FROM American Association for Counseling and Development, Publication Sales, 5999 Stevenson Ave., Alexandria, VA 22304 (\$8.00 member; \$9.25 non-member).  
 PUB TYPE Books (010) -- Information Analyses (070) -- Viewpoints (120)

EDRS PRICE MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.  
 DESCRIPTORS Activism; Adult Counseling; \*Counseling; Counseling Effectiveness; Counselor Certification; Futures (of Society); \*Guidance; \*Policy Formation; \*Public Policy; Youth Employment; Youth Programs

## ABSTRACT

This book provides educators, counselors, policy makers, and community members with information about the state of the art of federal and state policy in guidance and counseling. The two chapters in part 1, Overview, are: "Foundations for Policy in Guidance and Counseling: An Introduction", by Edwin L. Herr and Nancy M. Pinson; and "A Counselor Lexicon: Purpose, Process, Practitioner", by Bruce Shertzer. Part 2, Social Challenges to the Profession, includes five chapters: "Future Shock and the Counselor", by Donald G. Hays; "The Environment for Education: The Next Ten Years", by Thomas F. Green; "Special Populations: The Demands of Diversity", by Lee Perry; "Youth Employment: A Past, Present, and Future Issue", by Julia P. Davidson; and "Counseling Services for Adults: New Linkages in the Community", by Paul Franklin and Francis U. Macy. Part 3, Political Challenges to the Profession, presents two chapters: "The Ingredients of Policy: Traditions, Power, Expediency, Morality", by Nancy M. Pinson; and "A Federal Perspective on Guidance and Counseling", by John F. Jennings. Part 4, Professional Challenges: A Three-Part Reflection, contains: "Credentialism: Protection for the Public or for the Profession?" by Allen E. Ivey; "The Effects of Guidance and Counseling: Three Domains", by Edwin L. Herr; and "The Counselor as Political Activist", by Judy Lombana. Part 5, Conclusions and Recommendations for Action, presents "A Review of the Issues: Implications for Research and for Policy", by Nancy M. Pinson and Edwin L. Herr. The book concludes with brief statements about the authors. (JAC)

\*\*\*\*\*  
 \* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made \*  
 \* from the original document. \*  
 \*\*\*\*\*

HARD COPY NOT AVAILABLE

ED250589

FOUNDATIONS FOR POLICY IN  
**Guidance &  
Counseling**

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION  
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION  
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION  
CENTER (ERIC)

- X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it
- : Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality
- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS  
MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY  
HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

*Frank Burtnett*

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES  
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

HARD COPY NOT AVAILABLE

# FOUNDATIONS FOR POLICY IN GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

Edwin L. Herr and Nancy M. Pinson  
(Editors)

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION  
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION  
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION  
CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as  
received from the person or organization  
originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve  
reproduction quality.

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS  
MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY  
HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

*Frank Burtsett*

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES  
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

The work presented or reported herein was performed through agreements with the National Institute of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement, Department of Education. The opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect the position or policy of the U.S. Education Department, and no official endorsement by that Department should be inferred.

Copyright © 1982 American Personnel and Guidance Association.  
All rights reserved.

# Table of Contents

---

	<i>Page Numbers</i>
Foreword .....	v
Acknowledgements .....	vi
Preface .....	viii
<i>Part One: Overview</i>	
Chapter 1 Foundations for Policy in Guidance and Counseling: An Introduction .....	2
Edwin L. Herr and Nancy M. Pinson	
Chapter 2 A Counselor Lexicon: Purpose, Process, Practitioner .....	10
Bruce Shertzer	
<i>Part Two: Social Challenges to the Profession</i>	
Chapter 3 Future Shock and the Counselor .....	20
Donald G. Hays	
Chapter 4 The Environment for Education: The Next Ten Years .....	34
Thomas F. Green	
Chapter 5 Special Populations: The Demands of Diversity .....	50
Lee Perry	
Chapter 6 Youth Employment: A Past, Present, and Future Issue .....	70
Julia P. Davidson	
Chapter 7 Counseling Services for Adults; New Linkages in the Community .....	88
Paul Franklin and Francis U. Macy	

*Part Three: Political Challenges to the Profession*

- Chapter 8 The Ingredients of Policy: Traditions, Power, Expediency, Morality ..... 107  
Nancy M. Pinson
- Chapter 9 A Federal Perspective on Guidance and Counseling ..... 121  
John F. Jennings

*Part Four: Professional Challenges: A Three-Part Reflection*

- Chapter 10 Credentialism: Protection for the Public or for the Profession? ..... 131  
Allen E. Ivey
- Chapter 11 The Effects of Guidance and Counseling: Three Domains ..... 155  
Edwin L. Herr
- Chapter 12 The Counselor as Political Activist ..... 185  
Judy Lombana

*Part . . . Conclusions and Recommendations for Action*

- Chapter 13 A Review of the Issues; Implications for Research and for Policy ..... 198  
Nancy Pinson and Edwin Herr
- Appendix: About the Authors ..... 217

# Foreword

---

An expanded and creative deployment of the unique skills of professional counselors and related guidance specialists is of vital concern to agencies of both the federal and state governments. This is particularly true in a time of fiscal conservatism, when our existing resources must be utilized in a far more intelligent and cost-effective fashion.

Consideration of public policy in the area of guidance and counseling is viewed by many as the inevitable consequence of a long history of legislative attention to that field. For this reason, we at the National Institute of Education have observed the evolution of this study with considerable interest. As its sponsors, we have been particularly concerned that careful attention be paid to the needs of decision-makers at all levels of governance; attention that could yield the kind and quality of information necessary to informed policy discussion and formulation.

This document, edited and in part written by Edwin Herr and Nancy Pinson, represents the work and expertise of scholars from the fields of counseling, psychology, education, philosophy, economics, jurisprudence, and forensic science. Their task has been to propose alternatives to current counseling practice and policy that would be attractive to both the profession and to those who will ultimately benefit: members of the public. Although not all of the policy recommendations contained in this text are shared by the Institute, we believe that the ideas and evidence serving as their genesis are well worth the study and consideration of the nation's policymaking community.

Robert Wise  
Director: Home, Community, and  
Work Division  
The National Institute of Education

# Acknowledgements

---

No text designed to stimulate policy recommendations concerning the delivery—by one group—of services to other groups can fail to take into account the awesome responsibility posed by such a challenge. Not only must its authors be solidly grounded in their subject matter, they must also be capable of communicating this knowledge in terms that are at once practical and persuasive to those who institute policy at every level and to those who must daily implement such policy.

The writers selected bring that unique combination of skills to this task. Their credentials are well documented elsewhere in this text, both by their performance as authors of specific chapters and through the biographical sketches provided in Appendix A. Their work was made easier, however, by the scheduled interventions of a network of advisors and reviewers with equally formidable talents. Charged with advisement, validation, and support, these individuals verified the direction and the content of the text as it evolved. The editors are indebted to the collective insights of the Peer Review Panel members: James Heffernan, Professor, Syracuse University and Editor, National Center for Educational Brokering Bulletin; Mary Howard, Consultant to the New York postsecondary community; Nancy Schlossberg, Professor, the University of Maryland, College Park; James McKenney, Advisor, the Counseling Center staff, Catonsville Community College, Catonsville, Maryland; Lee Richmond, Associate Professor, the Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland; David Bland, State Commissioner of Corrections, Frankfort, Kentucky; Ada Elam, Professor, Bowie State College, Bowie, Maryland; Donald Hays, Director of Pupil Personnel in the Fullerton Union High School District, Fullerton, California; William Erpenbach of the Pupil Services staff, Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction, Madison, Wisconsin, and Norma Ausmus of the U.S. Department of Labor.

Equally valuable and objective was the assistance provided by a carefully chosen Steering Committee: Charles Lewis, Executive Vice President of the American Personnel and Guidance Association; Henry David, Senior Associate at the National Institute of Education and Director of

the Congressionally mandated Study of Vocational Education; Francis Macy, Director of the National Center of Educational Brokering; Thomas Paquin, Education Policy Fellow Alumnus and Associate Superintendent of the Brunswick County Schools, North Carolina. (Special note should also be made to the dual roles played by some of our contributors: Donald Hays, first cast in the role of reviewer, became a chapter author; Ada Elam, assigned a reviewer's task after initial appointment to the Steering Committee, and Julia Davidson, who moved from Steering Committee status to that of a chapter author.)

Critical support was also received from the competent staff of the *National Institute for Community Development*, conference contractor for the study. We are particularly grateful to Gail Wolin and Cathi Rodriques. Their concern for participant comfort and well-being was frequently illustrated when marathon work sessions were required of all parties to this effort. Here, too, it is appropriate to thank the many secretaries who spent long hours in preparing galley proofs of this text.

Finally, in paying tribute to a rarely seen facet of the federal persona, we acknowledge the combined faith and enthusiasm of Dr. Robert Wise, Project Officer. Without his considerable demonstration of support in terms of time, trust, and reallocation of fiscal resources, this effort could not have come to fruition.

Edwin L. Herr  
Nancy M. Pinson



# Preface

---

This document provides interested educators, counselors, policymakers, and community members with information about the state of the art of federal and, to a lesser degree, state policy in guidance and counseling. We acknowledge that at the time of publication rather than at the time of writing of the material in this text, policymaking has become far more diffuse than has been true during the past two decades. Much of the redistribution of power and choice-making about policy, legislation, and regulation is in the process of being transferred from the federal government to the states. The most obvious examples of this redistribution are block grants, but, in fact, there are likely to be other more subtle and pervasive ramifications of heightened state responsibility for design, funding and other types of assistance in mental health, education and other social services. The specific outlines of how this comprehensive shift in policymaking from the federal to the state government will take place is yet dim. Nevertheless, we believe that much of the content of this book can be applied to either federal or state policy formulation. It has been prepared under the auspices of the National Institute of Education to serve as a springboard for discussion by those who must implement as well as legislate related decisions having the force of law.

The Guidance and Counseling Policy Study, genesis for this text, has been conducted over three phases. Phase one was devoted to identifying certain social, occupational, and educational issues that are likely to be the subject of policy discussion in the imminent future. Subsequently, eleven writers were assigned the task of either developing these issues and their implications for the practice and profession of counseling, or specifying the present and potential contributions counselors could make to their resolution.

During Phase two, as writers, editors, and advisors began to draw together the contents of this text, two occasions for formative assessment and progress validation were provided. First, a peer review panel made up of experts on the chapter topics confirmed or modified outlines submitted by each writer. Second, an executive summary of progress—com-

bined with a questionnaire soliciting recommendations—was presented to officers of eight of the thirteen divisions of the American Personnel and Guidance Association. In combination, these events gave impetus and direction to the final phase of the study.

In August of 1979, the entire group of contributors and advisors met to place these and their own deliberations into concrete form. From that moment, the evolving text was designated as having the most value to one target group, counseling and allied professions, while a companion document abstracting key recommendations and related resources was to be developed for use with administrators and legislators in policy discussions.

The publication of this text, then, signifies the real beginning, not the completion, of the Guidance and Counseling Policy Study. In the view of the editors, its contents provide clear evidence of the need for rational allocation of an existing resource: trained professional counselors. Unlike other texts, however, it places these practitioners in the larger context of challenges posed by the society in which we live, describing these individuals as meeting or needing to meet new cultural, institutional, or individual demands that are unprecedented in their requirements of the helping professions.

Edwin L. Herr  
Nancy M. Pinson

# PART ONE

## Foundations for Policy in Guidance and Counseling: An Introduction

---

# 1

## Foundations for Policy in Guidance and Counseling: An Introduction

Edwin L. Herr and Nancy M. Pinson

---

National and state policies regarding social, occupational, and economic issues are shaped in many ways. They sometimes occur as a linear result of comprehensive information gathering and synthesis. More often they result from the processes of compromise inherent in the development of legislation. Sometimes they result from the regulations or the appropriations processes that accompany and interpret an act of legislation. In some instances, policy is formed from an accumulation of disparate legislative actions that upon further examination tend to converge on some set of commonly accepted social needs or principles.

The current status of guidance and counseling processes, services, and programs has obviously been affected by the diversity of policy formulations suggested above. As a result, while the idiom of guidance and counseling has enjoyed wide philosophical appeal, including its designation as serving specific utilitarian goals, such as facilitating equality of access, creating human capital, or stimulating the personal fulfillment of different populations in different settings, it rarely has been viewed as the subject of policy formulation on a national scale and even less so at the level of state government. This is due, in large part, to the fact that the particular stimuli that have shaped guidance and counseling policies in this nation arose at different historical moments and in response to events that varied markedly in their substance: social reform

in the late 1800's; the rise of individualism and cognizance of individual differences in the early 1900's; the concern for the handicapped and mentally ill in the 1920's; the economic exigencies and needs to match persons with available employment opportunities in the 1930's; national defense in the 1940's and the 1950's; the democratization of opportunities of the 1960's; the concern for equity and special needs in a climate of economic austerity in the 1970's. These events have varied in their implication for national or state policy, but, in general, their effects have been so comprehensive as to require federal policies and funding which in some instances were followed by state responses.

In this context, it is accurate to observe that, explicitly or implicitly, guidance and counseling have always been assumed to be part of a larger sociopolitical process; their emphases and substance are directly related to the characteristics of the society in which they are located. In terms of content, on the other hand, the types of questions that youth and adults bring to guidance and counseling specialists are related to how they view the current societal belief systems about personal choice, achievement, social interaction, self-initiative, marriage, prestige, occupational or educational status and many other aspects of life. The resulting anxieties, deficits, or indecisiveness that these persons experience as they compare themselves with what society—in the form of parents, spouses, teachers, peers, employers—says they should believe or do are the content with which counselors deal. The ways such matters of content are resolved carry with them economic and social implications of far-reaching consequence.

It is also true that the personal/social questions a society "permits" or encourages its citizens to ask about themselves and their futures are related to the resources made available for response to these questions. Thus, the national or state policies that prevail at a particular historical moment shape the tasks with which guidance and counseling deal as well as the techniques and intervention strategies employed.

As these historical moments caused new population groups to emerge as contenders for guidance and counseling services, such services were assigned to many government agencies and supported by many different pieces of legislation. Consequently, there is at present no specific location in the federal executive structure from which one can obtain a global view of the needs for and contributions of guidance and counseling to national, state, local, or individual goals. Indeed, virtually all federal departments have some entitlement to support guidance and counseling either for children, youth, or adults or some specific subset of the population: economically disadvantaged, Native Americans, new immigrants, the elderly, the disabled, veterans, ex-offenders, displaced homemakers, or others.

One result of this condition is that national policymaking regarding guidance and counseling is never fully informed about the ramifications of any specific legislative action; terms pertinent to guidance and counseling are used differently across legislative titles; new programs and services are authorized without sufficient attention to the availability of services already in place; authorizations to employ specialists sometimes occur without sufficient attention to the need for preparation or skill-

building opportunities for such specialists. In short, without a coherent national perspective about guidance and counseling, such services have been vulnerable to social and political exigencies and to the possibility that resources available for such services will dilute the quality or delivery of services through fragmentation and lack of coordination.

Until now, state governments typically follow the policies, priorities, funding targets, and agency structures found in the federal government, and therefore, the same types of deficits in coherent and coordinated policy prevail at these political levels as is true nationally. It can be expected that for the foreseeable future, as the responsibility for policy initiatives is shifted from the federal to the state governments, many of these deficits will endure unless the importance of policy formulation is given increased visibility and effective leadership so as to bring coherence to such policy on a state-by-state basis.

## PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS

In laying the groundwork for a discussion in which national or state issues and trends are the subject of policy consideration, charges of short-sightedness could apply if the task were undertaken from the perspective of a single profession. Conversely, if this challenge is addressed through the multiple lenses of different professionals, educators, sociologists, forensic scientists, psychologists, counselors, legislators, and philosophers—each concerned about the interface of these topics with the generic functions of guidance and counseling—scope and credibility are increased. Consequently, the text that follows is the portrayal by this more representative group of observers of a rapidly growing policy culture surrounding guidance and counseling.

Essentially, this culture proposes that guidance and counseling have been and can be instrumental in the resolution of specific social, educational, and occupational problems being confronted by decision-makers at every level of governance. It further states that those trained to provide these skills can be identified as a national and state resource and deployed in rational, cost-effective ways that contribute to the solution of the problems and challenges to be described.

X X X X X

The justification of attention to policy direction in guidance and counseling rests upon answers to many important questions. Among them: Can a case be made for the contribution by guidance and counseling to the amelioration of certain national or state concerns? More important, can individuals professing competence in these areas also demonstrate their knowledge of and sensitivity to these issues? The large concerns of the '80s and beyond are familiar to most thinking adults: equity, the economy, parity, quality of life, and the creative utilization of rapidly

dwindling natural resources are prime examples. But how familiar is any vested group with the meta-issues of youth unemployment, the proposition-13 mentality, the cost-benefit spectre, potential or actual delinquency, the unique needs of minority groups, the handicapped, the poor, the elderly, and the foreign-born? Solutions to these problems, taken as a whole, have thus far escaped the grasp of even our most sophisticated coalitions of scholars and administrators. Given this failure, is it logical to suggest that the insertion of language requiring the inclusion of guidance and counseling in every current and proposed programmatic response to these problems could move us closer to their resolution? The answers given here are affirmative. The writers of this text, each from distinctly different perspectives, document the feasibility of such action. Their recommendations, cast in the context of a clear grasp of one or more of these issues, come at us with unexpected force. Not only do they break way from the mythology that these functions are the exclusive province of a single profession, they look hard, and sometimes cruelly, upon the nonproductive circumstances that characterize, in their view, too many self-proclaimed agents of therapy and social adjustment. Yet they agree totally on a single issue: that guidance and counseling as forms of deliberate intervention and advocacy will be necessary in the future to mediate between the individual and the multiple challenges of learning, job training, information processing, interpersonal relations, and self-identity that are likely to characterize the next decade.

In outlining the necessary perspective on and elements of the foundations for national or state policy in guidance and counseling as well as a companion research and development agenda, the remainder of the text will be divided into four parts. These parts are introduced in the next section.

## THE TEXT: A BRIEF SYNOPSIS

### Part One: Foundations for Policy in Guidance and Counseling: An Introduction

Part One introduces this text through two chapters. The first chapter, which was written by Edwin Herr and Nancy Pinson, has proposed that current and historical intersections of social trends with national policy are rarely accidental. Pursuant to this observation, they lay the groundwork for what follows by suggesting first: the need for a more comprehensive understanding by all the helping professions of the sources and critical nature of these trends; and second, that the profession of counseling, in particular, has an obligation to delineate the unique part it could play in shaping policies responsive to those trends. In a logical sequence, Chapter 2, written by Bruce Shertzer, demystifies the language and practice of guidance and counseling. He inventories the major concepts of the field and compares and contrasts them with their usage by kindred professionals. In the process, he describes the types of results or



outcomes for which the field of guidance and counseling can typically be held accountable, particularly in the settings where these processes are implemented.

## Part Two: Social Challenges to the Profession

Part Two includes five chapters that attempt to anticipate the future social, occupational, and educational events that will form the context to which guidance and counseling must relate. Chapter 3, written by Donald Hays, maps out a future society in which familiar institutions and resources are recast in an array of future-oriented scenarios drawn by governmental groups and by individual researchers. Placed before the reader is the compelling notion that futures can be created either by deliberate planning or by purposeless drift. With the former possibility, he asserts the importance of a national direction for guidance and counseling, both to prepare for the consequences to individuals of various "futures" and to sketch the roles counselors can and must play in the America of the '80s. In Chapter 4, Thomas Green paints the future in narrower but equally provocative terms as he isolates the outcomes associated with the educational environment. In particular, he argues that problems of equity, the dropout problem, educational standards, employment for the noneducated, and the creation of a spectrum of "second-chance" institutions are direct manifestations of the expansion of the educational system during the past seventy years. He proposes future educational scenarios related to issues of efficiency, effectiveness, and pluralism and describes the importance of counseling to such structures. He contends that neither the demand for counseling services nor the nature of counseling practice will remain unaffected by the educational environment. Like Hays, his perspectives provide glimpses of needed policy elements important to the future of guidance and counseling.

Chapter 5, written by Lee Perry, examines the needs of special populations on two continua: those occasioned by historical denial of equity or access to the nation's educational, occupational, and social possibility structure and those resulting from the pressures associated with transition points across the life span. She also highlights the variety of responses—support networks, deliberate psychological education, self-help groups—which need to be incorporated into guidance and counseling systems relevant to special populations. The organization of these populations and the interventions appropriate to them offer important insights for policy formulation and for the practitioner. In Chapter 6, Julia Davidson examines the problems associated with disenfranchised youth and the challenges they represent, both for decision-makers and for the counseling profession. In particular, she analyzes the plight of minority youth, specifically Blacks in inner cities, as they attempt to make the school to work transition. She confirms, as do a growing number of research studies, that problems of youth unemployment are unequally distributed across subpopulations. Davidson argues that minority youth carry the major burden of the anxiety, frustrations, economic deprivation and future employment uncertainty associated with the school to work transition. She



not only discusses the factors that have led to the current problem of youth unemployment but presents creative solutions to this problem. Chapter 7, written by Paul Franklin and Francis Macy, focuses upon the adult learner as a consumer of creative and nontraditional counseling and referral services. They detail the growing visibility and rapid expansion of educational brokering as a community-based method of bringing diverse groups of adults together with the range of opportunities that exist. They further suggest that the structure, rationale, staffing and funding of such organizations should be characterized by boldness, flexibility, and innovation in their operation.

### Part Three: Political Challenges to the Profession

Part Three presents three provocative essays dealing with policy formulation and with political activism. In Chapter 8, Nancy Pinson examines the evolution—from antiquity to the present—of policy, politics, and the effects of both, by differentiating policy from legislation, from moral imperatives and from other perspectives that may influence it or result from it. She further probes the validity of the American proposition that ours is a government of laws, not men, by considering the effects of human manipulation and compromise in creating and interpreting policy. Pinson illuminates dilemmas that policymakers currently face.

Among them are issues of equality and of cost-effectiveness: Do you allocate resources equally to all segments of a society or target their sum total to one especially deprived or underdeveloped constituency? Do you mechanically calibrate cost-benefits of social investments, or do you build in risk capital for imaginative and innovative responses that overcome mediocrity but still retain accountability? Against such contexts, Pinson lays out challenges to the practitioners of guidance and counseling to be active in influencing policy, to exert moral leadership in finding ways to make services more accessible to those who need and want them, and to argue that the enunciation of policy in any area of human welfare should not be dependent upon an advanced commitment to fund it.

In Chapter 9, John Jennings brings the unique viewpoint of a veteran congressional staff member to bear upon identifying reasons for the present forms of federal aid for guidance and counseling. He dispels much of the mythology that states that the past ebb and flow of support for guidance and counseling is simply a function of Congressional disenchantment with such services. Instead, he examines how support of guidance and counseling gets swept up in larger issues of funding patterns and national events. Jennings affirms that a strong correlation exists between political activism and federal support. In doing so, however, he emphasizes the complexity of political action in behalf of guidance and counseling in view of the fact that such support now comes from diverse legislative sources, some of which treat guidance and counseling as separate categories and others which treat these services as components of a larger program. He further maintains that the federal predisposition toward guidance and counseling is not preordained, but in order to influence policy, counselors must show that they make a difference in the lives of people and they

must avoid behaviors that reduce their credibility before Congress. Although he does not speak specifically to policy formulation at state levels of government, Jennings' points seem to have relevance there as well.

## Part Four: Professional Challenges; A Three-Part Reflection

Part Four contains three important viewpoints that encompass the spectrum of possible professional response to the challenges underlying this volume. In Chapter 10, Allen Ivey confronts an internal dilemma by taking a hard look at the costs both to the practitioner and to the consumer of professional turfmanship. He provides persuasive evidence that pooling human services and their providers is often eminently superior in terms of increased access and client responsiveness. He goes on to examine the issue of credentialism as it relates to the practitioners of guidance and counseling. Continuing a theme voiced in preceding chapters, he argues that such portfolio is only relevant insofar as it pertains to effective service delivery. He further maintains that demonstrated competence, not level of education, should be the prime criterion for credentialing practitioners. Pervasive in Ivey's propositions is his concern that service delivery, accreditation and licensure are not currently tuned to the differential treatment needs of all the sub-populations of this country, particularly those previously described as "special needs" groups.

In writing Chapter 11, Edwin Herr aligns for the first time in the literature of this field the philosophical, empirical, and cost-benefit impact of the profession. He submits that the historical support for guidance began at the level of moral imperative and cites some of the philosophical assumptions on which the field has traditionally rested. He then argues that however important the historical, philosophical roots of the field, the past two decades have witnessed the rise of an equally important set of empirically derived findings about the effects of guidance and counseling upon various categories of individual behavior. He concludes the chapter with an examination of the emerging need for and prototypes of cost-benefit analyses directed to guidance and counseling. Contending that the effects of guidance and counseling upon individual behavior are documented in the array of empirical studies currently available, but that connections have not typically been made with their implied economic benefits to the society, he suggests a viable and responsive model of accountability.

Judy Lombana's treatment of Chapter 12, effectively returns the foregoing array of social and political challenges to the individual counselor. She contrasts those factors that have prompted the growing counselor awareness of political proactivity with the sobering reality that gains made to date have been achieved by a relatively small number of highly dedicated persons in guidance and counseling. She examines three sets of variables accounting for the latter circumstances: societal/economic barriers, institutional/economic barriers, and self-imposed counselor barriers. Lombana creates a picture of the areas of required action for political activism to become more effective. In particular, she cites needs

for long-range goals, redefining the counseling process, improving counselor credibility, and establishing linkages with other groups. She concludes with specific recommendations for action.

## **Part Five: Conclusions and Recommendations for Action**

Part Five, which comprises Chapter 13, first summarizes the issues that are the focus of this text, then reiterates the related research and policy recommendations that flow within the individual chapters. These recommendations are placed in the format of an executive summary designed to stimulate new directions for fiscal, administrative, and legislative policies at both national and state levels. Designed not only to appeal to the nation's decision-makers but to professional leaders as well, the chapter concludes by recommitting the profession to its own policy study through an action-oriented research and development agenda.

# 2

## A Counselor Lexicon: Purpose, Process, Practitioner

Bruce Shertzer  
Purdue University

---

The old, new, and changing language and practice of counseling constitutes a lexicon of persuasion and pleading, of intent and hope, of abstraction and empirical method. It can be defined as a language system that portrays both the art and science of helping others. A prime purpose of this chapter is to make available the terms associated with the more than 167,000<sup>1</sup> practitioners who count themselves members of the counseling profession. It is divided into four parts that treat, respectively, the generic processes, professional titles, goals, and the internal/external measures of accountability that presently characterize the field.

### GENERIC PROCESSES

Counselors are placed among the *helping professions* defined by McCully (1966) as being those that, based upon their "... specialized knowledge,

---

<sup>1</sup>*Data sources:* The National Center for Education Statistics and the U.S. Census Bureau reported that this number of individuals described themselves as educational or vocational counselors in 1978–1979. The Department of Labor reported that in 1978 there were 75,000 school employment, rehabilitation and college counselors. The actual figure, both here and abroad, is probably close to 120,000 (Bingham, 1980).

apply an intellectual technique to the existential affairs of others toward the end of enabling them to cope more effectively with the dilemmas and paradoxes that characterize the human condition" (p. 912). McCully further asserted that the definition did not limit the helping professions to those occupations that practice psychotherapy, and that existential problems were those that implied the need for choice or decision. He identified the occupations that he thought met the definition: counseling psychology, social work, school psychology, school counseling, and, in certain settings, clinical psychology and psychiatry. The characteristics believed by McCully as capable of distinguishing "helping" from other professions were (a) that in the application of an intellectual technique to the existential affairs of others, the practitioner could not do so completely as a scientist and (b) the obligation to benefit and not to injure was a heavier obligation for the helping professional than it is for other occupational groups.

Four generic terms have been used to define the enabling acts involved in helping others. These include "guidance," "psychotherapy," and "consulting." Despite being periodically criticized from the early 1900s to the present for its vagueness, the term *guidance* has been used as a key descriptor of school programs designed to help students to understand themselves, the society in which they live, and to maximize their potentialities and opportunities. Such a definition suggests that, in its narrowest sense, guidance is concerned primarily and systematically with the personal development of students. Critics of the term point out that the word guidance conveys direction, authoritarianism, and paternalism, just the opposite of that which people in the field claim they practice. Defenders of the term suggest that in a historical sense guidance has meaning in education and, furthermore, no better term has yet been coined that is acceptable or sufficiently descriptive of all that is attempted under the rubric.

Incorporated in a school guidance program is an *appraisal* element designed to collect, analyze, and use a variety of objective and subjective personal, psychological, and social data about students for the purpose of better understanding them and assisting them to understand themselves; an *informational* element designed to provide students with a greater knowledge of educational, vocational, and personal-social opportunities so that they make better-informed choices and decisions; a *counseling* element designed to facilitate self-understanding and self-development through dyadic (one to one) or small-group situations; a *planning, placement, and follow-up element* that is designed to help students decide, select, and use opportunities within the school and the outside labor market, and, a *consulting* element designed to provide technical assistance to parents, teachers, and administrators to improve their work with students as well as the school as a social system. Sometimes, guidance is subsumed under the term, *pupil personnel*, used to designate a complex of noninstructional services in elementary and secondary schools. These services include pupil accounting, psychometrics, guidance, social work, speech and hearing, and nursing and health. The counterpart in higher education is *student personnel*, or student services. As such, it incorporates admission and orientation of new students, counseling, supervision

of student government, health services, housing, financial aids, registrar or records, discipline, and assistance to foreign students.

Historically, the primary, if not the only mode by which school or institutional guidance was conducted has been through such individual behavioral processes as personal interviews, counseling relationships, test-interpretation sessions, and educational and vocational planning. More recently, small- and large-group modes of operation and consultation and curricular experiences have been used.

*Counseling*, too, has been used to describe a wide range of procedures for changing behaviors, giving advice and encouragement, interpreting tests, making decisions, providing information and planning careers. Although defined as the assistance given by formally trained individuals to a person or persons troubled by developmental, relationship, psychological, or situational stresses, it should be noted that a precise, inclusive definition has proved extremely elusive. The *practice of counseling* has been defined as "rendering, offering to render, or supervising those who render to individuals, groups, organizations, corporations, institutions, government agencies, or the general public any service involving the application of counseling procedures and other related areas of the behavioral sciences to help in learning how to solve problems or make decisions related to careers, personal growth, marriage, family, or other interpersonal or intrapersonal concerns" (APGA Licensure Commission, 1977).

*Psychotherapy*, another generic process, came into use originally to differentiate treatment given by clinical psychologists from that of psychiatrists. It has been defined by Brammer and Shostram (1977) as "... assisting the client to gain perceptual reorganization, to integrate consequent insights into everyday behavior, and to live with intense feelings originating in past hurtful experiences. Existing defenses are modified so that readjustment is obtained" (p. 8).

A final generic process, *consulting*, has become recognized as a means for helping people and influencing change. Defined as providing "technical assistance to an individual, a group of individuals or an organization unit or system," Kurpius and Robinson (1978) point out that a definition of consultation has yet to be accepted universally. They view it as a process for synthesizing environmental and human adjustments. Practicing counselors have no such difficulty in defining the term. Consulting is viewed as an economical yet indirect method for reaching a target group with counseling assistance. In effect, the counselor who works with parents, teachers, administrators, and other adults so that they might be more effective with students, is consulting. So, too, is the counselor working in business and industry as a personnel policy advisor, as an advocate for needed improvements in the worker's environment. Splete and Bernstein (1981) confirm that, while consultation training is only recently emerging as a part of existing counselor education curricula, practicing counselors are developing these skills on the job.

While attempts to differentiate between the terms counseling, consulting, and guidance have had some small success, distinctions between counseling and psychotherapy are more difficult to express. Efforts to do so have used such words as are presented in Table 1.



**Table 1**  
**Words Used to Differentiate Counseling from Psychotherapy**

	<i>Counseling</i>	<i>Psychotherapy</i>
Recipient of service	Client or counselee, "Normal" individuals	Patient, "Neurotic" individuals
Type of problem	Situational, developmental concerns	Severe emotional disabilities
Focus of treatment	Conscious awareness; supportive; information; problem solving; personal assets; growth	Early experiences; supportive; depth analysis; analytical; remediation
Time	Short-term	Long-term

Many counseling practitioners and many psychotherapists believe that distinctions between the terms are artificial and that the terms should be used interchangeably. Others think distinctions can and should be made because these practitioners differ in educational level and setting, in their emphasis upon psychopathology versus personal assets, in the settings in which they are usually employed, and in the methods they use (Forster, 1978). Yet the nature of these distinctions appears to many to be quantitative rather than qualitative. For example, differences between clients experiencing "situational" stress and those experiencing "emotional disorders" appear to be those of degree rather than kind except in those instances where the latter is a function of chemical imbalance or other organic dysfunction.

## Titles of Practitioners

The language represented in titles defines that which practitioners undertake, serving to limit what is and is not done by those upon whom the titles are bestowed. Presumably, titles project or communicate to the public what can be expected from those so titled. Finally, a title serves to distinguish specialties within an occupation. Although the original generic process was labeled guidance, its practitioners were titled *counselors*. Because counselors never sought legally to preempt the title, it has been claimed by, or bestowed upon, persons in an increasing number of occupations. The historical use of advice as a descriptor of what counselors do remains prevalent, causing conflict and confusion about the title among the general public. This situation has grown even more distressful in recent years as automobile sales people and representatives from brokers' firms, loan agencies and mortuaries have distributed cards bearing such titles as "Automotive Counselor," "Investment Counselor," "Financial Counselor," and "Grief Counselor." Perhaps there is one saving grace—usually they spell the word "counsellor."

Still another matter to note is that, over the years, adjectives have been added to the title counselor. Among these are elementary or sec-

ondary school counselor, guidance counselor, psychological counselor, college counselor, community or agency counselor, mental health counselor, vocational or career counselor, rehabilitation counselor, employment counselor, drug abuse counselor, crisis counselor, public offender counselor, marriage and family counselor, to cite but a few. These adjectives have been used to identify either the setting in which the counselor has been employed or the area of specialization engaged in by that counselor. Lewis (1981) provides an excellent update of these new settings where more professionals are employed.

The title *counseling psychologist* represents a synthesis of many related trends in guidance and psychotherapy processes. As psychologist with doctoral level training in counseling, the competencies of these individuals are believed to represent contributions to "(a) the development of an individual's inner life through concern with his motivations and emotions, (b) the individual's achievement of harmony with his environment through helping him (or her) to develop the resources that he must bring to this task (e.g., by assisting him (or her) to make effective use of appropriate community resources), and (c) the influencing of society to recognize individual differences and to encourage the fullest development of all persons within" (*American Psychologist*, 1956, p. 283). In 1952, "Counseling psychologist" was incorporated in occupational titles used in the Veterans Administration. Credentialing is through state psychology licensure boards.

*Community counselor* or *community psychologist* represent emerging titles intended to communicate that such individuals are skilled in community change, such as changing corporate hiring practices to reflect affirmative action policies, and in client advocacy or representation as well as in facilitating the maximum human development of individuals who, for the most part, are found in non-school settings.

Disregarding adjectives, the generic title *counselor* applies to those individuals whose *formal training* has been in counseling and whose *credentialing* enables them to practice counseling. "Formal training in counseling" refers to at least a master's degree,<sup>2</sup> earned from a regionally accredited institution of higher education, that is primarily professional counseling in content and acquired in not less than thirty graduate semester credit hours. This formal training enables these individuals to apply *counseling procedures* defined as "including but not restricted to the use of counseling methods and psychological and psychotherapeutic techniques, both verbal and nonverbal, which require the application of principles, methods or procedures of understanding, predicting and/or influencing behavior, such as principles pertaining to learning, conditioning, perception, motivation, thinking, or emotions; to methods or procedures of administering and/or interpreting tests of mental abilities, aptitudes, interests, achievement, attitudes, personality characteristics, emotions or motivation; informational and community resources for career, personal or social development; group and/or placement methods

---

<sup>2</sup>See Charles Schmitz, "Baccalaureate Programs in Counseling: Follow-up and Implications". *Counselor Education and Supervision*, September, 1981, 21,1,16-21 for discussion on alternative routes to credentialing.



and techniques which serve to further the goals of counseling and designing, conducting and interpreting research on human subjects or any consultation on any item above" (APGA Licensure Commission, 1976).

*Credentialing* on the other hand, refers to the authority or right to use the title of counselor or to engage in the practice of counseling or both. The methods used to credential counselors include certification, licensure, and registry. Credentialing is discussed more fully in Chapter 11 but here some key terms are defined. As a credentialing method, *certification* authorizes the use of the title "counselor" and specifies the minimum amount of education, training, and supervision required to use the title. Certification is awarded by voluntary associations, agencies, or by governmental bodies, some of which are recognized by state laws. It has been the practice to credential counseling in public schools. Usually, school counseling certification is conducted by an office within the state government's department of education whose officials check the applicant's university transcripts for evidence that required courses have been completed in an acceptable counselor education program.

*Licensure* as a counselor credentialing method regulates use of title and specifies the particular acts or practices held to be the sole prerogative of the profession. It is a method established by state legislation that gives authority to licensure boards to make rules and examine applicants. Licensure is considered essential for counselors who engage in private practice for a fee or who are employed in agencies that extend services to the public reimbursed by third-party payments (vendorship): e.g. Blue Cross, Medicare, etc. Licensure subjects violators to greater legal sanctions than does certification.

*Registry*, the third credentialing method, has been used by national professional organizations to record those professionals who meet strict training and experience criteria for membership. A national registry makes public the credentials of professional counselors to institutions, government agencies, and other parties interested in using their specialized knowledge, skills, and experiences. Marriage and family counselors have established a national registry and so have rehabilitation counselors. During the past few months, the American Personnel and Guidance Association also has taken steps to do so.

*Accreditation* of programs preparing counselors for the diverse tasks they will perform is probably the most far-reaching credentialing initiative undertaken by the profession. The extent to which future practitioners will achieve entry to positions of public trust will increasingly rely upon documentation of the rigor with which these individuals are trained and in the objectivity with which they are judged ready to practice.

Traditionally, counselor education programs have been accredited through regional bodies, (e.g. Middle Atlantic States) through the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education, or through the American Psychological Association. A current initiative, spawned by the American Personnel and Guidance Association, is the establishment of an independent board: The Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs. Membership accrues to professional groups who qualify as either sustaining or constituent members, with the public at large representative providing an objective balance.

## THE PROFESSION'S GOALS

Needless to say, a spectrum of goals associated with these titles and practitioners does exist, but whether it serves any purpose other than convincing the practitioners of their own personal effectiveness within a socially approved context is questionable. However, words—verbal criteria of progress or goals that make sense of their activities—must be used by practitioners in an effort to make rational to themselves what they do and to convey the meaning of their activities to others.

Questions about the goals or expected outcomes of these processes are rightfully raised by those who practice them, by those who seek help, by public officials in various organizations and agencies and by the public. These queries take many forms:

What is the purpose of guidance, counseling, psychotherapy, consultation?

What are the objectives of guidance, counseling, psychotherapy, consultations?

What results are expected from guidance, counseling, psychotherapy, consultation?

Fundamentally, the words "purpose," "objective," and "expected result" are loosely used as synonyms for "goal," generally preferred by the professionals in the field. *Goal* is defined as the end result sought. Statements of goals for guidance processes are often general, idealistic, and rife with value implications.

The most frequently expressed goal of guidance in the nation's schools is the advancement of students' personal development. In that setting, guidance seeks to help students marshal intelligence about themselves and the environment, understand their experiences; and engage in planful behavior to achieve their maximum potentialities. Such phrases as "to become more mature and self-actualized, to plan their educational and vocational futures, to make decisions, to remove personal obstacles to their functioning, to make use of information" address that goal. The goal of guidance is further extended through such statements as the following: students' grades will improve, satisfaction with school will be increased, discipline problems will be reduced, reduction of the school dropout rate will be observed, antisocial behavior will be reduced, more students will participate in extracurricular activities, fewer students will capriciously change their programs of study, and students' statements of educational and vocational objectives will be judged more consistent with their abilities and aptitudes. In short, while most guidance goals assume that with such programs—students will feel better, function better in school (and in life in all of its aspects), achieve at higher levels, and live up to their potentials . . . there goals also imply adherence to the institution's mission as well.

Conversely, effecting change in behavior most often has been set forth as the goal of both *counseling* and *psychotherapy*. Some have identified the preservation or attainment of positive mental health as goals of these processes, suggesting that if it is reached, the client achieves integration, adjustment, and positive relationships with others. Closely related to the

preservation or attainment of positive mental health have been statements of personal effectiveness. Others have suggested that the goal of counseling or psychotherapy was the resolution of whatever troubles or problems were brought to the relationships. As such, relieving suffering and disability, altering maladaptive behavior, learning decision-making skills and preventing problems have been formulated as goals.

Still others suggest that enabling individuals to make decisions that are of critical importance to them is the goal of counseling and/or psychotherapy. For example, Tyler (1969) has stated that "The purpose of counseling is to facilitate wise choices of the sort on which the person's later development depends. Counseling should not be *just* for persons who are anxious, unhappy, or unable to cope with the circumstances of their lives" (p.13).

Various classifications of the goals of counseling and psychotherapy have been suggested. Dolliver (1965) classified goals as being either expressive or instrumental. The former spurs the client to be more expressive and is usually stated in self-terms such as to live well, to work well, to love well, to think well. The instrumental category usually is more specific, it refers to a reduction in certain kinds of behavior—for example, overcoming shyness. Dolliver believes that the expressive and instrumental categories may, at times, be complementary, but generally are not. London (1964), on the other hand, formulated an action-insight dichotomy. The "action" label refers to goals associated with shaping or changing behavior; The "insight" label to those of achieving self-awareness, self-understanding, or consciousness of self. During the past five years, attempts have been made to categorize goals into a three-fold classification system; cognitive, affective and overt behavior. Table 2 illustrates such a classification.

As can be observed by examining Table 2, most goal statements do not fit easily into any one category.

*Counseling goals* are usually formulated to effect changes in individuals, groups, organizations, or a community; to assist consultees to deal effectively with either specific clients, or with problems or situations confronting groups or large organizations of programs; to assist consultees in generalizing knowledge and skills acquired to similar situations they might face in the future.

**Table 2**  
**Classification of Goals of Counseling and Psychotherapy**

<i>Cognitive (Thinking)</i>	<i>Affective (Feeling)</i>	<i>Overt Behavior (Doing)</i>
Increased self-knowledge	Improved self-esteem	Improved performance
Choice of major or career	School/job satisfaction	Attainment of academic or vocational objectives
Information about educational/occupational alternatives	Reduction of anxiety	More assertive in decisions about and pursuit of options

What individuals and groups expect of helping processes often differs from the goals expressed by its practitioners. Helping is usually thought to be something *done to* or *for* its consumer while goal statements generally specify that it is the recipient who acts, decides, changes, becomes. Expectancies about helping are likely to stress remediation and repair; goal statements imply that helping is preventive in nature.

\* \* \*

Clearly, there are more likenesses than differences among counseling practitioners in terms of general philosophy, if not in choice of setting, clientele, or preferred style of human intervention. Their ultimate purpose is to enable people to be free and informed: conscious of themselves, their strengths and weaknesses, their sicknesses and health; to be at home in a pluralistic universe; capable of viewing the world unblinking and unafraid; capable too, of making decisions for themselves in harmony with their own unique natures and value systems.

## REFERENCES

- American Psychological Association, Division of Counseling Psychology, Committee on Definition. Counseling psychology as a specialty. *American Psychologist*, 1956, 11, 283.
- APGA Licensure Commission. *Licensure commission action packet*. Washington, D. C.: American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1977. (Mimeographed)
- Bingham, William, personal communication to the Editors, November 2, 1980.
- Brammer, Lawrence M., & Shostrom, Everett L. *Therapeutic psychology* (3rd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1977.
- Dolliver, Robert H. "Expressive" and "instrumental" conceptualizations of counseling. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1965, 12, 414-417.
- Forster, Jerald. Counseling credentialing revisited. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978, 56, 595.
- Kurpius, DeWayne, & Robinson, Sharon E. An overview of consultation. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978, 56, 321.
- Lewis, Judith. Transition: From School to Community Mental Health Counseling. *Counseling and Human Development*, October, 1981, 14, 2, entire bulletin.
- London, Perry. *The modes and morals of psychotherapy*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1964.
- McCully, C. Harold. Conceptions of man and the helping professions. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1966, 44, 912.
- Schmitz, Charles. Baccalaureate Programs in Counseling: Follow-Up and Implications. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, September, 1981, 21, 1, 16-21.
- Splete, H. and Bernstein, B. A survey of consultation training as part of counselor education programs. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, March, 1981, 59, 7, 470-472.
- Tyler, Leona E. *The work of the counselor* (3rd ed.). New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1969.

# PART TWO

## Social Challenges to the Profession

---

# 3

## Future Shock and the Counselor

Donald G. Hays  
Fullerton Union High School District, California

---

### INTRODUCTION

Approaching the turn of a century is similar to waiting for a new year—it is a time to review past events and to anticipate, to speculate, and to prepare for what is yet to come. At no time in our history has so much thought been given to the transition from one century to another as has been given to the coming twenty-first century. Before the midpoint of the current century, creative thinkers of our society began forecasting future possibilities. This forecasting has developed many varied scenarios, creating alternative futures available to a society. The rapidity of change in all facets of our lives requires that we consider these alternatives and participate in shaping those we as a people want to create for ourselves and for those who follow us.

Speculations about the future present a continuum of possibilities ranging from utmost pessimism to glorious optimism. Knowledge that we hold as intelligent and reasonable people seems to indicate that our future will lead us somewhere in between these two extremes. For the majority of Americans reacting to the rapidity and complexity of changes in our



life style, a high level of anxiety has emerged along with a deep sense of frustration that "things are not what they used to be or should be!" Americans tend to become nostalgic when conditions surrounding them upset their equilibrium. If it is difficult to face the present, and one cannot face the future with any degree of certainty, it is comforting to look back and yearn for "the good old days." But, such nostalgia only delays the day when our society must address current future issues with energy and dispatch.

It is reasonable to assume that all individuals want to improve the quality of their lives. But an improved quality of life in a world of alternative futures needs more definite direction. There needs to be a consensus of where we, as a people, are going, and why. We need structure in our lives. We need to know that what is waiting for us in the future is worth pursuing and achieving. It is suggested that those who are forecasting a pessimistic concept of the future fail to consider the spirit of the people and their will, not only to survive, but to seek the good life. Kahn, Brown and Martel (1976) offered a concept that appears to be acceptable to a majority of us in the helping professions. They stated "Any limits to growth are more likely to arise from psychological, cultural or social limits . . . , or from incompetency, bad luck and/or monopolistic practices interfering with supply, rather than from fundamental physical limits on available resources" (p. 181). If their argument is valid, then we have a base upon which to build.

The concept of planning for the future has become at least as important in our thinking as any other significant challenge facing us today. Events affecting our lives usually tend to be external to our inner selves; they are typically viewed as beyond our control. Yet we worry about disarmament, depleting energy sources, balance of trade, the value of the dollar, wage-price controls, inflation, full-employment and other events with considerably more energy than we devote, as a nation, to learning how these events affect us personally. We recognize what is happening to our attitudes, behavior, values, and beliefs but no major attempt is made to do something about this cause-and-effect relationship on a national basis.

While we must accept certain of these phenomena as inevitable facts of life, we need also to recognize that they can be modified in terms of their human impact. Planned change is difficult. More often, desired change comes as the result of bizarre or unforeseen events. The student unrest of the late 1960's emanating from our involvement in Southeast Asia brought significant changes in attitude and behavior in the rest of our society. The gasoline crises of 1974 and 1979 emphasized the harsh consequences to a society that was not prepared to respond to sudden and dramatic but predictable changes in its way of life. The air disasters over San Diego and Chicago captured our attention about the general welfare of our flying population and, afterwards, changes resulted. The impact of a "Guyana-type massacre" explodes the shell of our apathy for the moment, and we hasten to establish safeguards insuring that such an occurrence cannot be repeated. We are, historically, a people more prone to reaction and remediation than to taking necessary preventive measures.

If our society is to be motivated to consider an anticipatory planning posture, one needs only to cite the costs of drifting into the future on the assumption that the "good life" will be provided for us. There is abundant evidence, collected through the last decade, that our shortsightedness has delivered us to the point where we now find ourselves a society with great expectations but with scarce or unexploited resources with which to realize them.

## CURRENT ISSUES/FUTURE IMAGES

Any proposed social policy needs to take note of the major issues that confront a global society; to be aware of the possible, and plausible, impact of these issues on the society, but always in the context of human development and how each person will act or react to these issues. Kahn and his associates at the Hudson Institute (1976) identified almost seventy problems, which they called the "1985 Technological Crisis." Space does not permit a complete listing and discussion of these problems here. Kahn and Phelps (1979) set forth two categories of issues facing mankind, however, that tend to summarize and sharpen the issues of the future. They assert: "Our basic thesis here is that further progress by mankind is being held up, and perhaps even endangered, by confusion over the nature of the problems we face" (p. 211). These can be classified as follows:

### Understandable and Presumably Surmountable Challenges

1. Likelihood of peak in percent rate of growth of world population and GNP; the slowdown being caused more by 'natural' limitation of demand than by shortage of supplies and space or by pollution.
2. Various demographic, locational, and income issues that occur as a result.
3. An adequate supply of food.
4. Transition from fossil fuels to 'eternal' sources of energy.
5. Expanding base or capability for alternative resource development.
6. Pollution, ecological, and environmental programs to provide clean air, clean water, and aesthetic landscapes.
7. An important role for space and advanced technology related to its exploration.
8. 'Surprise-free' partial images of the future, including the likely emergence of first the super- and then the post-industrial economies.
9. The extraordinary capability and flexibility associated with coming levels of affluence and advanced technology.

On the other hand, there are a number of challenges to be faced that are far more explosive in nature. Solutions are neither simple nor universally available. In all cases, the exact shape of these challenges, the degree of danger and risk involved, the opportunities presented, and the



care required to arrive at some rational resolution for them is a major task. Kahn and Phelps (1979) describe these as:

1. Good use or misuse of science and advanced technology.
2. Degree of bad luck and/or bad management; ergo, inflation and unemployment.
3. Effects of U.S. *super*-industrial economy on environment, society, and culture of U.S. and the world.
4. Effects of U.S. *post*-industrial economy on environment, society, and culture of U.S. and the world.
5. Parallel developments in other countries—including the likely dynamic of economic and technological development within and among various nations.
6. Popular and elite images of the present and future of these groups (by themselves and others) and the likely problems and opportunities caused by these images.
7. Other issues relating to quality of life, attitudes, values, morals, morale, and cultural change for the above groups.
8. Subsequent internal and external political, institutional, strategic and arms control issues and control of violence generally.
9. Complicated, complex, and subtle ecological and environmental issues.
10. Stabilization or reversal of the long-term multifold trend of Western culture toward a sensate society—or its replacement by a new source of meaning and purpose" (Kahn and Phelps, p. 209).

Kahn and Phelps conclude by saying, "Our deepest concern therefore should be with the ten basically uncertain issues that are much more likely to cause serious trouble. Furthermore, if we do a good job on the nine essentially surmountable challenges, the resultant affluence, technological capacity, and flexibility should improve our ability to handle any setbacks bound to arise" (p. 211).

In a study sponsored by the National Education Association (Shane, 1977), a panel of fifty distinguished world citizens were asked their opinions regarding the future of society in general, and education specifically, for the remainder of the twentieth century. The panel identified a number of developments likely to affect the lives of persons in every country, whether affluent or poor, weak or powerful, industrialized or developing, resource-rich or resource-poor. Among these developments:

1. Continued acceleration in the rate of change
2. Greater complexity
3. Twilight of the hydrocarbon age
4. Re-examined concepts of growth
5. Increased crowding, lingering hunger
6. Continued pressure for human equity
7. Increasing demands from less-developed countries for a new economic order
8. Troubled international waters
9. Changing concepts of work and leisure
10. Governmental debt and capital deficits

11. Problems of governance and threats to freedom
12. A postextravagant society

An examination of these different lists of issues, concerns, and problems (and these are not exhaustive) will identify the commonalities and the differences among those who look to the future. (The reader will find extensive confirmation of that fact by studying the material prepared by Coates and Amin-Arsala (1979) for the Office of Technology Assessment.) It appears obvious that each proposed issue has and will have a significant impact on every individual living today and yet to be born in the generations to come. We can only speculate what that impact will be on the basis of the best intelligence we have today. The NEA panelists (Shane, 1977) offered interesting advice as to how we, as a people, might most successfully confront the future. They suggested six points:

1. Old beliefs and ideas must be re-examined.
2. There is no "surprise-free" future.
3. We "create" the future.
4. "Facts" can be the enemy of truth.
5. Fields of human knowledge overlap and interact.
6. The time for positive action is limited.

It would appear that social decisions related to domestic and international problems (energy shortages, resource depletion, widespread malnutrition) need to be reached by the mid-1980's. Action needs to be taken as soon thereafter as possible, and no later than, say, 1990, if the planet as a whole is to avoid a rerun of the more tragic aspects of the middle ages: tyranny, poverty, fear, ignorance (Shane, 1977, p. 34). Swift's (1980) summary of the National Council of Community Health Centers Task Force in Environmental Assessment Report confirms this action mandate.

## THE NEED FOR POLICY ON EMERGING HUMAN ISSUES

Laszlo et al. (1977) stated that "in the United States, authorized national goals are usually expressed and justified in terms of 'canonical' writings." They point to the Declaration of Independence, the Constitution, the Bill of Rights, and to other documents, as the reference points for all formal national goals, and "if (the proposed goals) are to have legitimacy, (they) must be based on these documents." The founders of our nation believed that the basic goals of the federal government existed only in the Preamble to the Constitution. The basic objectives were to: (a) provide for the common defense, (b) make rules about trade, (c) fix a common currency, and (d) collect taxes. "By and large, the federal government has resisted any systematic program of comprehensive long-range planning, and usually it has resisted the formal setting of goals as well" (Laszlo et al., 1977, p. 20). This blind devotion to and complete faith in an extrapolated, deterministic future (Theobald, 1972) has prevented us, as a nation, from seriously addressing planned change.

Within America there is an increasing need for policy based upon reliable human-needs data, which in turn is translated by reasonable people into a consensus. Through something like Toffler's (1975) "anticipatory democracy," a process or way of reaching decisions that determine our future can be conceptualized. In order to sense the country's pulse, today's policymakers collect representative opinions through regional hearings or national opinions polls. The results often translate to a particular set of national "goals" to be pursued during particular periods of time. Through a variety of inputs obtained during the recent decades, one basic goal and ten specific operational goals for the United States can be inferred (Laszlo et al., 1977, pp. 32-35):

**The Primary U. S. Goal: Health of the Democratic System Related Specific Operational Goals:**

1. Peace and the protection of national interests
2. Prosperity—full employment and economic stability
3. An orderly, just, and free society
4. A healthy populace
5. An aesthetic and healthy environment
6. A well-educated populace
7. A better world
8. Good housing
9. Livable cities
10. Arts and culture

If the operational goals stated above reflect what we as an American society want for the future, then it is through well-conceived, mutually agreed upon national policy on these issues that we will, collectively, accomplish our goals. In the absence of policy we, as a people, have not been idle. The American spirit emerges in many forms, and one of the most prominent is the caring and concern for our fellow human beings. It is out of this personal/social milieu that guidance and counseling developed as a unique twentieth-century American phenomena, one increasingly cited as an unexploited resource.

## **All Things To All People**

Over the years counseling professionals have, by virtue of their willingness to tackle almost any human needs, created social expectations of their prowess that exceed reason and current resources. What began sixty years ago as their positive response to some of society's needs has become, during the past two decades, a collage of services competing for the attention of more and more target groups. There are many causes for this professional myopia, but five seem to stand out: (a) lack of consensual mission or purpose; (b) genuine concern for the multiple audiences to be served; (c) competing methodology; (d) unfulfilled and possible unrealistic expectations; and (e) resistance to change. Each of these causes is important and needs further consideration and/or explanation, but in terms of identifying one upon which all others depend, it has to be the profes-

sion's lack of consensus about its purpose. So long as every school, agency, or clinic develops its own guidance policy independent of those being formulated by others with similar clientele, continuing fragmentation and duplication of services and programs for youth and adults will result. As with any professional group seeking a clear-cut identity in the marketplace as well as with its peers, the counseling profession is twice challenged: to first confirm its mission, its limits, and its promise; to then propose these elements as a unified national perspective that can, in fact, play an important part in a future planned for and by this nation's citizens.

A national posture on guidance and counseling should be couched in terms that bear witness to America's commitment to its most valued resource: human potential. It would mobilize its practitioners in planning and implementing those changes in our society that develop this potential and would seek to ensure that society proceeds in an orderly manner toward this objective. Any national direction must allow for some stability, or basic framework, but it also must be flexible enough to allow for and be open to change as new social challenges or crises are encountered. Under the current transfer of power from federal to state governments, national directions for guidance and counseling must be broad and comprehensive enough to allow their translation in terms of local operational realities.

Two competing concepts that need to be confronted as a national direction for guidance and counseling is being developed will pose serious problems for many public policymakers:

1. The identification, recognition, promotion, and protection of each person as an individual of worth and dignity, and
2. The general well-being of the total society.

Early America was built on "rugged individualism." Each person, given the "right" set of conditions, could become someone in our world. Unfortunately, not all segments of our society were able to enjoy such fulfillment. We were a country of great promise but less than full delivery on that promise. As America aged and our leaders saw that each person was not being treated as an individual, the emphasis shifted from individualism for a few, to a society that would protect the rights of all individuals, creating additional laws to guarantee that right. But individual rights versus the complexities of a society expanding in a finite space has caused the general good of the society to take precedence over the call for individual freedom. In nearly every moral, social, or economic challenge faced by this and many other countries today the individual is pitted against the larger society. For this reason, when such posture evolves, every effort must be made to reestablish the delicate reciprocity between the individual and the society that is exemplified in our other governmental systems where checks and balance are employed.

The staff of Stanford Research Institute's (SRI) International Center for the Study of Social Policy (Schwartz, Teige, & Harman, 1977) identified forty-one specific future problems that could become major societal crises in the coming decades; problems not widely recognized at the present time. Each is important to consider in the development of a national

direction for guidance and counseling, but some have more urgency and are more related to the work of counselors than others. These critical issues have been grouped into four general categories: society and the individual; society and the family; society and the environment; and society and education. The specific issues are cited for illustrative purposes only and do not appear as the only issues within these categories. Following the identification of some issues within each category, recommendations are made that could serve as a foundation for national policy.

## I. Society and the Individual

- A. *The growing conflict between central control and individual freedom.* The growth of technology and multinational business has led to increasing national and global governmental controls. The urgency of some problems and the decline of social cohesion places greater demands on the formal institutions. All of this has led to, and will continue to lead toward, a progressively authoritarian society, and thus more controls on individual freedom.
- B. *Effects of technology on the individual psyche.* We are beginning to observe the negative aspects of a technology that was developed in response to the need to create an improved quality of lifestyle (pesticides, nuclear power, gas-powered engines, etc.).
- C. *Loss of political and social cohesion.* A number of forces are interacting resulting in a movement away from a "shared purpose that provides the balance between individual desires and the general well-being." We have been and seem to be still in a "MEism" society in which we are more concerned with "what's in it for me" than with our self-respect and the respect for others.
- D. *Institutional boundaries as impediments to societal problem-solving.* Society's institutions have grown to such an extent that there is considerable overlapping and interconnectedness. Attempting to resolve serious problems impacting on society becomes no one's responsibility and thus, no resolution, or a plan for resolution, exists.
- E. *The danger of computer dependency and the computer's impact on rights to privacy.* Our faith in the contribution of computers to make our life better has created a dependency situation that tends to ignore the risks involved to the individual. Society's efforts to improve society through technology tends to set aside the interests of the individual. Who knows how much privacy exists for the individual in today's information-oriented, computer-based society?

Americans need to develop appropriate skills to meet the challenges inherent in these problems. Mature adults must be equipped to seek and implement their solutions to these challenges with the best interests of others in mind. Counselors, acting as advocates of these individuals, can serve as the gyroscope that maintains a balance between society's needs and the rights of the individual; their considered plan of action could include supporting the following recommendations:



## A. SOCIETY AND THE INDIVIDUAL

1. Within the federal government, a Human Development Commission should be created. This commission would strive to ensure that human potential would be developed, maintained, and safeguarded. The Commission would link together all current efforts; e.g., EEOC, which presently are too fragmented in nature.
2. Within each state a Human Protection Agency would be created to operate in a similar fashion to the Environmental Protection Agency (a body created to review all construction and industrial expansion activities in an area to determine the impact they would have on the environment of that area.) The Agency would review all laws proposed by state legislatures to ensure that the individual's rights are not subverted by the needs of the state.

## B. Society and the Family

1. *The social implications of changing family forms.* The variety of family structures developed as a result of changing values will see an increase in youth anxiety, delinquency, alienation, and mental illness. How is it possible for our young to cope with these conditions? Can we depend upon the "nuclear family" in the future or do we need to recognize alternative family forms, accepting and strengthening each?
2. *The social impact of changing roles of women.* There is no question that women, exerting their inalienable rights as human beings, have had an impact on the "new" family. The liberation of both male and female creates new pressures on the family and, in turn, places the young in a potentially stressful condition. As we approach genuine human equity, attitudes and behaviors of all people will change. Are we ready to face up to this reality?
3. *The sociocultural impact of media.* We recognize the impact one media form, television, has made on our young; one that has encouraged "spectatorism" and the erosion of the distinction between fantasy and reality. Creativity and judgment become impaired. We are becoming a nation that is not only apparently willing to accept mediocrity, but almost appears to pursue it.
4. *The cultural exclusion of the aged.* Earlier retirement, longer life, and the increasing number of senior citizens without participating roles in the society are intensifying the political conflict between young and old. It is a time of enforced idleness and loss of meaning in life. Feelings of guilt by the younger generation toward their "aged, useless parents," poses serious problems for the general well-being of society. Must we continue to waste the human potential present in the growing segment of the population that is over sixty years of age?
5. *Teenage alcoholism.* To reduce stress, our youth are turning to a variety of placebos for relief. While drugs continue to be highlighted and deplored, alcoholism is growing alarmingly, leading to still other indices of juvenile crime and suicide. Given the choice between drugs and alcohol, parents "prefer" and will accept their children's drinking.

6. *Potential for new urban violence.* Changes in family structure, stress on the individual, increasing discrepancy between the "haves" and the "have-nots," all beg for release of tensions that can lead to violence within the inner-city, spilling over into the suburban, more affluent areas.

The family of the future will assume many forms. Its role in society will continue to remain what it has always been: to nurture developing human beings and to provide the life-support system necessary for their fullest development. Every effort must be given to support, strengthen and maintain this vital component of our society. "Effective parenting" does not just happen—it must be taught. Parenting has been "handed down" from one generation to another through what might be called "modeling behavior." Unfortunately, we have too many inappropriate models for the youth of tomorrow. Mead suggests that "human society has shifted from a 'post-figurative' culture—one in which the young learn from the old—to one that is 'co-figurative,' that is, one in which both adults and children learn chiefly from their peers . . . the next stage, already emerging, will be the development of a 'prefigurative' culture, in which the old learn from the young . . . We must create new models for adults who can teach their children not what to learn, but how to learn and not what they should be committed to, but the value of commitment" (Cornish, 1977, pp. 128–130).

## RECOMMENDATION

That every parent be encouraged, through all possible incentives, to avail themselves of parent effectiveness training programs at critical parenting stages: pre-natal/pre-adoption; pre-entry of the child into kindergarten; pre-entry of the child into junior high school; and pre-entry of the youth into senior high school. Counselors skilled in parenting would lead these programs and would emphasize the positive personal/social interaction of parent and child. They would coordinate the introduction of other disciplines into the program to assist the parent and child in understanding the growth process of the child through various stages of psychosocial, physical-sexual, career, cognitive and moral development.

### C. Society and the Environment

1. *Cumulative effects of pollution.* The staff of the Stanford Research Institute (Schwartz, Teige, & Harman, 1977) stated that "the effects of (new chemical compounds) on human health and personality and on the stability of the ecosystem may be unknowable for years or even generations. Effective monitoring of the increasing pollutants are beyond our capabilities." Our inability to consider the long-range effects of these activities is cause for serious concern.
2. *Rape of our natural resources.* While Schwartz, Tieg, and Harman (1977) did not specifically state the problem in these precise words, they did allude to a number of problems that could be collapsed into this central concern. The unchecked depletion of nonrenewable

resources places an additional burden on our future that will be inhabited and managed by our children.

3. *Critical advances in biomedical technology.* Our emphasis on the worth and dignity of the individual will be challenged by at least these three developments:
  - a. Access to life extension—the development of life-extending medical techniques raises important questions about who will have access.
  - b. Genetic engineering—the ability to control the sex of human beings and their physical, mental, and emotional characteristics threatens the moral basis of human social organizations. Who will have control?
  - c. Euthanasia—adoption of euthanasia to dispose of the aged and unfit promotes the concept of voluntary death for those lacking a place in society. Who will decide?
4. *Catastrophic experiments.* The traditional ethic and practice of science and the potential benefits predicted from the successful development of such technologies seem to demand that the experimentation go forward in spite of the risk. Can we afford the risks? The dilemma we face is that if we are overly cautious, no progress is made—if we gamble, what is the price we must pay and once it is paid, who will decide?
5. *The potential use and misuse of "consciousness technologies."* In our efforts to seek solutions to many problems through research and experimentation in a variety of consciousness fields of endeavor, we are creating both good and bad effects. We may be on the verge of significant breakthroughs in improving the quality of life or we may be opening "Pandora's box."

For what purpose will we develop all individuals to their potential if their world will be uninhabitable? Counselors, whose work may appear to emphasize the inner person, are equally concerned with the outer person as that person interacts with the environment. The total community is the counselor's true work setting.

Whether or not to continue probing the unknown requires people who have the ability to analyze the alternatives; make deliberate, but well-thought-out decisions; and accept responsibility for the consequences. Counselors can be key persons in coordinating growth-development efforts to nurture or to reclaim the type of person that is needed.

## RECOMMENDATION

That the counseling profession take a more positive and active role in examining the impact of technology on the environment by assisting business and industry to think through proposed new developments before they are implemented. A cadre of counselors, specifically trained, should be available, at no cost, to business and industry leaders to advise them in a way similar to federal inspectors who serve the meat-packing in-



dustry, the aviation industry, etc. McCollum (1981) forecasts this broader role for mental health educators in the imminent future.

#### D. Society and Education

1. *Lack of functional life skills in adults.* Less than half of the nation's adults possess the basic academic skills necessary to functioning in today's society. Therefore, serious questions are raised about the efficacy of American education. This suggests that as our society becomes increasingly complex even more people will need to restore or acquire the skills necessary to function effectively.
2. *Chronic unemployment.* It is conceivable that our current progress toward the future may give us a false sense of security and that hidden from view is the continuing problem of unemployment. Sophisticated technology, coupled with a lack of functional skills within the general population, may be the spark that will ignite this chronic condition.
3. *Decreasing utility of higher education.* Higher education may be contributing less to individual and social needs and may no longer ensure the greater personal and societal rewards traditionally expected. It is expected that higher education may take a different form that ensures life-long learning to meet a multitude of individual and social needs.

In the future there will be no school as we currently conceive of that entity. We may have what Hoffman (1978) calls the open learning system, made up of three major components: (a) an instructional television network; (b) a computer-based educational program using both computer-assisted instruction and computer-managed instruction; and (c) a comprehensive apprenticeship program. Individualized, or personalized, learning will be a reality that can be experienced without leaving the home. If this is so, how will it be possible for our youth to learn how to socialize? What arrangements must be made for them to come together and to learn the process of social interaction? Counselors will be challenged to provide for the appropriate activities to ensure that masses of people, confined to a finite planet, have the opportunities to work through social/personal problems that often occur when space is limited.

## RECOMMENDATION

That a first order of business for those in government charged with educational leadership be the study of the entire education industry and process in terms of its relevancy and capacity. Every effort should be made to bring together expert "investigators" from all phases of our society and not exclusively from education. Their recommendations would serve as the basis for extensive changes in education at all levels.

### The Counselor's Role

Carlson (1973) pointed out that "the focus for the future will be on the community or the total living environment. The counselor will use an

ecological systems approach and establish priorities based upon the maximum effect that the service has upon the total system. The counselor will focus on what needs to be accomplished before selecting the means." Carlson's comments were directed to school counselors but they have implications for counselors in a myriad of work settings.

From what has been said, the primary functions of the counselor may be:

1. To coordinate and facilitate efforts to produce mature adults,
2. To strive to maintain an equilibrium between the needs of society and the rights of the individual,
3. To coordinate and monitor the psycho-social, career, cognitive physical-sexual, and moral development of those individuals contacted,
4. To teach decision-making skills, and
5. To assist individuals to clarify their values.

## SUMMARY

The time has come to devise a national posture on the development and conservation of human resources and within such posture there needs to be a strong guidance and counseling component. In this chapter, only a few of the issues confronting America have been touched upon. The evidence is persuasive, however, that in light of these issues, certain necessary constructs and services are tied intimately to the practice of guidance and counseling.

Mature adults anticipating and shaping a positive future will attend to the concerns identified in this chapter. Counselors have been working and will continue to work toward the development of such people. A national direction in guidance and counseling could provide the basic framework for the coordination of their collective efforts. Its measured effectiveness in the resolution of certain social/educational/occupational concerns and challenges will depend on many people working with public policymakers, with counselors playing a central role.

## REFERENCES

- Carlson, J. The future of school counseling. *Focus on Guidance*, March, 1973.
- Coates, J., & Amin-Arsala, B. Setting priorities at the U.S. Office of Technology Assessment. *World Future Society Bulletin*, 1979, XIII(2), 15-26.
- Cornish, E. *The study of the future: An introduction to the art and science of understanding and shaping tomorrow's world*. Washington, D.C.: World Future Society, 1977.
- Hoffman, C. K. The year 2000: A positive future for U.S. public education? *Educational Technology*, December, 1978.
- Kahn, H., Brown, W., & Martel, L. *The next 200 years: A scenario for America and the world*. New York: William Morrow and Company, Inc., 1976.
- Kahn, H. & Phelps, J. B. The economic present and future; a chartbook for the decades ahead. *The Futurist*, 1979, XIII(4), 202-222.

- Laszlo, E., et al. *Goals for mankind: A report to The Club of Rome on The New Horizons of Global Community*. New York: E.P. Dutton, 1977.
- McCollum, M. G. Recasting a role for mental health educators. *Associationm of Mental Health Counselors Journal*, 1981, 3, 1, 37-47.
- Schwartz, P., Tiege, P. J., & Harman, W. W. In search of tomorrow's crises. *The Futurist*, 1977, XI(5), 269-278.
- Shane, H.G. *Curriculum change toward the 21st century*. Washington, D.C.: National Education Association, 1977.
- Swift, C. Task Force Report: National Council of Community Mental Health Centers Task Force on Environmental Assessment. *Community, Mental Health Journal*, 1980, 16, 7-13.
- Theobald, R. *Futures conditional*. Indianapolis, Indiana: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, Inc., 1972.
- Toffler, A. What is anticipatory democracy? *The Futurist*, 1975, IX(5), 224-229.
- Wayson, W. W. A conceptual model for roles and functions within a school designated to meet the requirements of life in the last third of the twentieth century. Paper presented to the American Educational Research Association, Los Angeles, California, 1969.

# 4

## The Environment for Education: The Next Ten Years<sup>1</sup>

Thomas F. Green  
Syracuse University

---

The purpose of this paper is to describe the likely environment for educational policy, and therefore, for counseling services, in *all* educational settings during the next ten years. The focus is on the future of the formal educational system because the future of that system will be informed by educational enterprises carried on outside the existing system of schooling to whatever extent those efforts can be touched by educational policy.

The decisive fact here is that the expansion of secondary educational attainment (expressed as the proportion of 17 year olds completing the twelfth grade) ceased in the United States in 1965. Reaching 76 percent attainment at that level for each successive cohort is a spectacular social achievement. But this very success has had the consequence of transforming how schooling is experienced, why it is pursued, and what benefits can be gained through schooling. This success has not produced dropouts, but it has produced the drop-out *problem*. For large numbers of

---

<sup>1</sup>The central arguments of this paper are elaborated in detail in, *Predicting the Behavior of Educational Systems*, Thomas F. Green. Syracuse, New York: Syracuse University Press, 1981.

youth, it has transformed schooling from the aggressive pursuit of a good into a merely required defense against personal disaster. These consequences are especially distressing and frustrating for racial and ethnic minorities and for all "special populations." For them, success in secondary education is increasingly necessary and increasingly indecisive in determining subsequent life chances.

The policy agenda for education during the next ten years may be determined largely by the end of expanding high school attainment rates, the already transformed value attached to schooling, together with other forces internal to the dynamics of the educational system itself. The result will probably be (a) the conversion of educational equity issues into issues of effectiveness, efficiency, or educational pluralism; (b) fewer appeals for legislation calling for special treatment for "special populations," and (c) more bitterly open contests for limited resources, especially for the handicapped. The policy response to declining enrollments in higher education will probably be to press for an expanded pool of those eligible to receive BEOG, and that effort, if successful, may have the further consequence of reducing youth unemployment to a level as low as 15 percent. And finally, it will be increasingly perceived by decision-makers that we may already have seen a peak in the expansion of *noncompulsory*, informal, adult education.

In a concluding section, the argument is advanced that to remedy these problems we need not a system of education that is more equitable (although we need that too), but a system that is less powerful, less fateful in shaping the destinies of people. This can be accomplished by a variety of measures—some already in place—that will *reduce* the high school attainment level and prevent high school completion from being used as a firm prerequisite either for employment or for admission to postsecondary institutions. But these policy objectives should be pursued *only* if the high school attainment rate can be reduced to a level reached back in 1950 when a more socially equitable distribution of those who do and those who do not attain a high school diploma was observed. Such an achievement may be more practical now than it has been in the past to whatever extent there has been progress in the past fifteen years toward securing racial and ethnic equality. If such a goal can be reached, then the demand for counseling services will expand, and the need for them can be more precisely determined.

## THE ENVIRONMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM

### The Completion of the Secondary School System

The annual ratio of high school graduates to 17 year olds in the United States reached 76 percent in 1965 and has remained at that point since then. This unusually high rate of attainment, together with its stabilization, signals the plateauing of the secondary sector of the educational system as we know it.

During the past seventy years in American education, perhaps the most significant development has been the maturing of the secondary school system; in particular, the completed expansion of the comprehensive secondary school. Beginning in about 1910, the American people apparently embarked upon a long-term effort to make secondary education universal. The annual proportion of 17 year olds completing high school was fairly stable through the first decade of this century. Beyond that time, however, there began a steady, persistent, and remarkable increase in the high school attainment rate. Its most substantial rise occurred in the midst of the depression during the 1930's, although not until 1940 did as many as one-half of each 17-year-old cohort complete high school. The rate of high school attainment did not reach 60 percent until the mid-fifties. But the important point is that in 1965 this expansion ceased. The ratio of high school completion to the 17-year-old cohort has remained stable at about 76 percent for the past fourteen years. This is a remarkable occurrence.

It is all the more remarkable in view of the fact that that expansion, in the proportion of 17 year olds completing the secondary school, ceased at precisely the point when we embarked upon the most intensive effort in our history to continue it. It is the only period in more than seventy years in which the rate of attainment did not rise. It is important, furthermore, to note that the high school drop-out rate was not widely viewed with alarm until some time in the mid-fifties. It is as though the drop-out problem, *as a social problem*, becomes serious only as a number of drop-outs declines. Being a drop-out is not serious problem in a society where 90 percent of one's peers are drop-outs. Being one in a society where only 25 percent are drop-outs is suddenly a serious problem.

## Implications of Secondary Expansion

Many problems of educational policy have been produced by the successful and rapid expansion of high school attainment. It has produced the drop-out problem, transformed the perceived value of going to school, produced a crisis of standards, and made it appear that the chief value of success in school is only that it permits access to more schooling.

The importance of this development is not that it may represent the successful conclusion of seventy years of basic educational policy, but that attaining that policy goal has created a legacy of other problems. Among them is the so-called drop-out problem. But there are others. In general, when the educational attainment rate is relatively low, then those who complete a given level, for example, high school, are likely to secure advantages in life over those who do not. Going to school will seem to them a good thing to do, something worth pursuing. But when everyone completes high school, then doing so no longer produces any differential advantages. What it permits is simply access to the next higher level of the system. High school completion is then converted from a good into a necessity. As we move closer and closer to the reality of universal sec-

**Table 1**  
*High School Graduates*  
*17 Year Olds in Population (Percentage)*

<i>Year of Graduation</i>		<i>Year of Graduation</i>	
1870	2.0000	1936	42.7000
1880	2.5000	1938	45.6000
1890	3.5000	1940	50.8000
1900	6.4000	1942	51.2000
1902	6.4000	1944	42.3000
1904	6.9000	1946	47.9000
1906	7.4000	1948	54.0000
1908	7.4000	1950	59.0000
1910	8.8000	1952	58.6000
1912	9.8000	1954	60.0000
1914	11.7000	1956	62.3000
1916	13.8000	1958	64.8000
1918	15.8000	1960	65.1000
1920	16.8000	1962	69.5000
1922	17.8000	1964	61.3000
1924	23.4000	1966	75.8000
1926	25.5000	1968	77.8000
1928	26.2000	1970	75.6000 <sup>a</sup>
1930	29.0000	1972	76.0000 <sup>b</sup>
1932	35.5000	1974	75.1000 <sup>b</sup>
1934	39.2000	1976	

Source: Ferriss, Abbott L., *Indicators of Trends in American Education*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1979.

<sup>a</sup>U.S. Department of Commerce - Bureau of the Census; *Historical Statistics of the United States (Part I)*; Washington, D. C., 1976.

<sup>b</sup>National Center for Education Statistics (DHEW); *Digest of Education Statistics - 1976*; Washington, D. C., 1977.

ondary education, it will follow that getting a high school diploma will be less decisive for those who do get it, but not getting it will become more and more a disaster for those who do not. Under these conditions, going to school becomes defensive. It becomes compulsory in a new way. One "has to go on." Therefore, going on is likely to be experienced less and less as something worthwhile. Instead, it is likely to be experienced as something like a civil right, something one is entitled to, something that society has no right to withhold. In short, the expansion of educational attainment, beyond a certain point, is likely to transform the experienced value of going to school. But if this transformation of experience occurs, then it is also probable that the processes of evaluation, assessment, and so forth will become more serious and more difficult to maintain. We would expect to encounter a crisis of standards.



## The Group of Last Entry

These results are especially frustrating for the group of last entry, i.e., that lower socioeconomic group that is the last group to reach attainment at a given level of the system. When they attain a given level in large numbers, then securing the benefits that such an accomplishment has bestowed on previous groups will then require still higher attainment. The policy problem is thus to encourage escape from membership in the group of last entry.

These dynamics, however, have even more serious implications. It happens to be true that in no education system in the developed world has it been possible to expand the total enterprise uniformly across the social structure. That is to say, given any expansion in the rate of educational attainment, we can describe who will benefit first, second, third, and so forth and in what magnitude. The expansion always takes place through a downward movement along lines of social status. In short, there will be a last group to reach attainment at any level, and that last group will be defined by lower socioeconomic criteria.

This group of last entry (or completion) is confronted with a dilemma that is peculiarly its own. If members of that group seek to gain the same advantages that the educational system has bestowed on others, then they will be disappointed, because as they complete the process of universal attainment, the relative benefits that others have gained will no longer exist. As they reach their target of educational attainment, the target will require still higher levels of educational attainment. Nevertheless, it may be argued that there are strong social benefits to be secured by any society in seeing that the group of last entry does attain its goal of greater and greater education. The difficulty is that nobody ever pursues an education and persists to its completion because the society will benefit if they do. For the group of last entry, completing high school will be experienced as a necessity, but as a necessity that nevertheless has declining worth. Education, for them, is a ladder to an abyss, a ladder that, nevertheless, they must mount.

These observations suggest that the expansion of the educational system during the past seventy years has its own dynamics. That very expansion has created many of the problems that we now have to deal with: problems of equity, standards, employment for the noneducated, and the creation of more and more so-called "second-chance" institutions. In short, when the American people, early in this century, embarked on a fundamental policy of creating universal secondary education, they embarked on a policy that when satisfied, would produce precisely the problems that we now have.

Those problems are not produced by a corresponding expansion in the social demand for more persons educated at higher levels of the system. On the contrary, they are produced by the internal dynamics of a fundamental American love affair with the social and individual utility of educational attainment. (There is very little evidence that the expansion of the educational enterprise is due to an expanding social demand for technical skills. The history of every important technology utilized in American society has been the history of its downward mastery in the

schools. That is to say, the schools have demonstrated again and again that they can transmit employment skills needed in the economy in less and less time, at lower and lower levels of the educational system. Such expansions of technologies as have occurred do not require anything like the expansion of education that we have witnessed.) Instruction in computer technology and information processing, like the study of calculus, used to occur only at the highest levels of the university. Now those subjects are offered and learned in virtually every high school and in increasing numbers of middle schools. It is doubtful that the demand for education is created by the demand for increased expertise in the economy. Rather it is more likely that the demand for more education is created by the presence of large numbers of educated persons. As late as the early 1950's, business and industrial firms could not have operated had they insisted on a high school diploma as a prerequisite for employment. There were not enough persons completing high school to make such a practice workable. But now there are; and so educational credentials are used as a screen for access to many occupations, and ever high levels of educational attainment are required to obtain differential access. Reaching higher levels of education becomes a necessity.

## From Common Education to Special Education

But the policy agenda for the system is shaped also by a dialectic between two competing principles. The first demands that each receive that education that is best for him or her. The other demands that each receive an education as good as that provided to all others. The first requires differentiation of programs; the second requires a commonality in all programs. It is the expansion of the system that forces the shift from one emphasis to the other and back again. The coming emphasis may be a return to stress a common education for all, and this will make the pleadings of "special populations" more difficult.

This American love affair with constantly expanding educational attainment may also underlie the repeated shifts of policy from the need to provide a universal common education to the need for special programs for special groups and back again to a concern with common education. Any curriculum satisfactory for 20 percent of the population is unlikely to suffice if the system is to include 50 to 60 percent. When only 5 percent of each generation go to college, the classical curriculum and the collegiate model will probably suffice. But if 40 percent are to go, that curriculum will probably not suffice. Either the curriculum remains the same and the educational system ceases to expand, or the curriculum changes and the system, as a consequence, grows larger. Expansion mandates differentiation. In order to carry out the fundamental American commitment to universal education the curriculum has to change. The meaning of "comprehensive" in the phrase "comprehensive secondary school" expresses that necessity. There probably can be no curriculum in which everyone can succeed. Therefore, there must be many curricula, so that

for each person or each group, there is some curriculum, some prescription for success.

This necessity is simply the practical expression of an elementary fact, namely that between different people or groups, there are similarities, but there are also variabilities. In every educational institution, in every classroom, in every curriculum, some decision must be made whether to attend to the similarities between persons or to the differences. And this decision in turn is the expression of two fundamental principles. On the one hand, it is a firm American belief that every person is entitled to receive that education that is best for him or her. This produces differentiation. But at the same time, it is also generally accepted that each person is entitled to receive an education at least as good as that provided for everyone else. This calls for a common education. These two general principles could be described as "the best principle" and "the equal principle." They are in conflict.

In order to provide that education that is best for each person or for each group, we must attend to their variabilities. There will be significant differences mandating significantly different programs. But if we are to provide for each, an education as good as that provided for all others, then we shall attend to their similarities. We cannot exclude anyone from the education the society provides. The point is that when the system is small, the presiding principle of policy is likely to be the obligation of providing for everyone the education received by a few. That is, we shall have to provide for everyone, the same education any one person gets. The system will expand. But this effort to provide the same education for all is not likely to proceed very far. Inevitably, it will become apparent that the education provided for a few is unlikely to suffice for many, and certainly not for all. We will have to either take into account the differences between people in the population or else the system will cease to expand. But as the system expands and moves downward in the social structure, more and more of the significant variabilities in the society will appear also within the educational system. There will need to be introduced special programs for immigrants, then for Blacks, subgroups of minorities, other minorities, the handicapped, and so forth.

With each special population, special requests will arise for special programs. Why? Because when attendance in the system is relatively small, it is possible to treat the population as homogeneous. But as it expands, whatever variabilities occur within the population itself will occur in the system with more frequency. It will become more and more a necessity to acknowledge them in practice. Hence, as the system expands, it will become increasingly difficult to respond to the population as homogeneous, and increasingly possible and necessary to respond to the variabilities. The focus of policy will shift from the "equal principle" to the "best principle."

Perhaps the process looks like this. First, we learn to discriminate, for example, between different racial groups distinguished from the majority. Later we learn that there are relevant differences between language groups within those minorities. At each step we differentiate programs to respond to newly relevant variabilities entering into the fair distribution of resources in the system. Yet, if this process is extended to

anything approaching its logical conclusion, it will clearly produce the complaint on the part of some groups, "The system is not providing for us what it is providing for others." The insistence, in short, for the *same* education will reemerge. We shall again have to attend to those homogeneous aspects of the population. The policy agenda will shift again.

Thus, in the expansion of the secondary and higher educational systems we are likely to find an important dialectic. It begins with an emphasis on the claim that each is entitled to the same education provided for others. But as the expansion of the system continues, this path of action will probably produce a halt to expansion. The argument will then be introduced that each is entitled to that education that is best for him or her, and that means that we will turn to an emphasis upon the variabilities in the population. But again, as this appeal to principle succeeds, it will inevitably give way to the appeal once again for the same education that others receive. This pendulum, back and forth, between "the best principle" and the "equal principle" is the dialectic that we have seen played out during the past fifteen to twenty years, a dialectic providing the grounds for such practices as tracking, bilingual education, special programs for racial groups, special education in all of its forms, and full-service legislation for the handicapped.

This last step in the exposition is likely to be also the last step in this process of differentiation. If we were to rank all those groups in society that might appeal to "the best principle" in order to secure their educational interests, and if we were to regard that rank order as a sequence, then I suspect that the last groups to advance such an argument would be the handicapped and the so-called "retarded." I base this judgment upon the claim that if we were to actually indentify the *social meaning* attached to the categories defining the populations of special education, we would identify them as the ugly, the strange, the useless, and the dying. The blind are treated often as though they were dying, the handicapped as though they were ugly, the retarded as both strange and ugly, but also as useless. Surely these groups, like the elderly, are likely to be the last to claim special treatment as their due. They are likely to be the last groups to appeal to their particular variabilities as requiring special treatment.

Yet, just as those voices urging special programs for Blacks are somewhat more muted and are being replaced by those insisting on Blacks getting the same education as others, so also the movement is on for the deinstitutionalization of the handicapped and "retarded." Institutionalization can be construed as stemming from the application of "the best principle." It is a social response to significant variabilities. Mainstreaming, in contrast is the shift to "the equal principle," the insistence that even though some may be handicapped, still what should be stressed is not their deficits, but their assets. They are different, but the important point is that they are the same as others. I suspect that we have already witnessed the most strident applications in legislation and social practice of the claims of the "best principle" and are about to see, in the next decade, a return to the claims that, despite our differences, nevertheless, we are the same and should be treated so. Dr. Seuss may be the prophet for the 1980's: "A person's a person no matter how small."

## Transforming Issues of Equity

Furthermore, the dynamics of the system in the next ten years are likely to convert all issues of equity into issues of efficiency, effectiveness, or the need for pluralistic educational goals. The only remaining problems of equity will take the form of increasingly bitter contests over scarce resources, especially for the handicapped.

Within the next ten years, partly for reasons I have already sketched, we may anticipate that, on the whole, issues of equity will become transformed into issues of efficiency, effectiveness, or pluralism. There is one possible exception to this conjecture, and I shall consider it in a moment. But first, let us consider how, by the peculiar alchemy of educational policy, problems of equity become redefined.

In general the problem of equity in education (as opposed to equality) is to ascertain that whenever inequalities occur, they are nevertheless fair. Thus, the existence of educational equity does not require that all groups within the society "get as much as all others" *for* education or that they "get as much" *from* education. Equity requires only that if inequalities arise between different social groups, then those inequalities must have some justification. They must have some foundation in justice. And, in general, that foundation in justice requires showing that inequalities arise from something like differences in choice, or abilities, or tenacity, and not from differences of race, social class, sex, ethnicity, or religion. We do not find any injustice in inequalities that clearly result from the decision of others to learn less, or from the choice of some to learn certain kinds of things and the choice of others to learn other kinds of things. Neither do we ordinarily find any injustices in the claim that some groups benefit more in either resources or results because on the whole they are more able than others, or more resolute and determined. Acceptable inequalities may exist between different races, sexes, and classes. But when they become extreme, then we generally take that to be evidence that the differences do not arise merely from choice, or differential abilities, or a peculiar concentration of virtues. Thus, *extreme* educational inequalities may be taken as presumptive evidence of inequity even though, "equity" does not *mean* "equality."

The practical policy problems of equity do not arise because of any uncertainty concerning the conditions of equity. They arise always because we do not know with much clarity just when those conditions are satisfied. If choice is an acceptable basis upon which to permit the rise of inequalities, then our problem is to know how to achieve the conditions of free choice. Suppose we could show, for example, that the educational system in respect to awards of licenses operates on a system of monopoly rents. In that case we would know that the differential awarding of licenses results not from the exercise of choice, but from a simple inefficiency of the system. The problem of equity is then defined as problem of efficiency.

When we say that there is variation in different persons' abilities, we may mean one or the other of two different things. We may mean that although everyone is really good at something, they are not all good at



the *same* things. If we take a narrow range of abilities and say that they are the *only* ones that it is good to be good at, then there are likely to be some who are not good at *any* of those things. It would follow then that resulting inequalities do not arise from differences of ability. They arise instead from the way we define which abilities it is good to have. Justice then requires not a showing of equity, but an *educational* defense establishing what things are good to be good at. It may be concluded that the problems of equity arise from the absence of a pluralistic definition of "ability." But this is no longer an issue of equity. It is now an issue concerning the establishment of educational goals and not merely the acceptability, but the desirability of pluralism.

On the other hand, by saying that persons have different abilities we might mean simply that among those who have certain abilities, some will be more able than others. If this is what we have in mind, and if there then occur large differentials in achievement between different groups, we are not immediately entitled to assume that they result from differences of ability. The more reasonable assumption is that they arise from differences in the presence of effective teaching. The problem of equity then becomes not a problem of efficiency, or pluralism, but simple effectiveness.

This translation of equity into issues of effectiveness, efficiency, and pluralism, is already far advanced. I doubt that the next ten years will witness any new issues of equity in education that are not translated either into issues of effectiveness, efficiency, or pluralism. There is one possible exception, however. The argument goes something like this.

Being a handicapped person is something that is socially defined. Being handicapped is the result of social policy. It arises from policies that attend to the variabilities between persons rather than their common characteristics—dyslexia, blindness, autism, or whatever. If there are policies that attend to these deficits and, therefore, label persons "handicapped," then there *can* be policies that attend to their assets, and thus do not label them "handicapped." Those are the policies that we should adopt in the name of equity.

The rub comes from the fact that there is a counter-argument. It is certain to arise. The fact is that we live in world of scarcity. There is no prospect whatever that that will change. It would be less expensive and probably more rational if we were to try making the world safe for illiterates rather than to try making everyone literate. In short, sooner or later, it will take more resources to attend to the assets of the "handicapped" in the context of ordinary classes, than it will to not do so. Hence, the "normal" population will turn out to be "handicapped" by resource allocations aimed at overcoming the liabilities suffered by the "handicapped." If being handicapped is the result of social policy, then the result of social policy aimed at accounting for those handicapped could turn out to "handicap" the "normal" population.

When this happens, as it surely will, then we shall see the rise of a real issue of equity, and it will not get translated either into efficiency, effectiveness, or pluralism. It will remain an issue of equity. In short, it is likely to happen that some will benefit from the system as much as others only on condition that they sacrifice more, try harder, and pay a

greater price. If the education of minorities, the handicapped, the elderly, and other "special populations" takes away from the education of "normal persons," and if that is believed to be evident, then the elderly, the handicapped, and minorities are likely to pay the price. It will turn out once again that we will accept as literal truth the claim that there are persons who are handicapped in the sense that a race horse may be handicapped—by having to bear a greater weight. This is a genuine issue of equity. The issue is whether we care more about exploiting the assets of all persons in our society or whether we care more about the preservation of advantage and greater awards for greater abilities socially defined. The issue will be resolved politically, and it is likely to be resolved on the side of advantage.

## Other Issues

The declining pool of college students is likely to produce pressures to extend the pool of those eligible for BEOG student aid. This would simultaneously allow some colleges to survive, change the characteristics of college students, and possibly reduce the level of youth unemployment. Unless the expansion of adult learning takes the form of extending compulsory education, then it too, may have peaked.

These are forces that will have a powerful impact upon the educational environment of the next ten years. There are, however, at least two others likely to influence the context and practice of counseling. Both are related to the probable effects of the wavelike undulations of changing age-cohort size working their way through the society in the eighties. First, consider the likely consequences as the declining 18-24 age-cohort becomes evident in American colleges. For the next nine years, the size of that age group, the group from which most colleges draw their enrollments, will decline between 2 and 3 percent per year. It will bottom out at a point some 20 to 25 percent below its present magnitude. Many colleges will close their doors or be absorbed by other stronger institutions. This is already beginning to occur. Others will survive, but probably at the cost of somewhat lower standards. None is likely to close without a struggle. They will exert some political pressure to permit their survival. What is that response likely to look like? The first, and most probable response would be to encourage something like the recent Packman-Moynihan proposals permitting tax credits for tuition payments. But such a proposal is anathema to the executive branch of the federal government because of its clearly inequitable effects.

The more likely response will be to extend the eligibility criteria for BEOG grants to cover 50 percent of the age-cohort instead of the current 33 percent. With a declining age-cohort such loosening of eligibility will probably be possible with relatively small increments of funding. If this occurs, then we shall probably also witness a gradual transformation of the population enrolled in post-secondary institutions. Some of those currently enrolled in community colleges and other two-year programs will be able to enter four-year colleges. Some of those currently in CETA-type programs could return to two-year schools, and some youth currently



unemployed may be induced to enter school. Thus, we may see within the next ten years—and fairly early in that period—a decline in the youth unemployment rate to something like 15 percent, which would be a lower rate than we have experienced since 1945. These developments are highly probable even if we assume no other changes to occur. In connection with this scenario, it is vital to note the evidence of past experience, that a small age-cohort is likely always to do better economically than a large one, and their economic well-being will provide few political incentives for fundamental change.

By the same token, as this age-cohort declines in size, the by now older, enormous generation of the sixties will be chiefly responsible for the rising mean age of the entire population. Will they return to school? Many seem to think so, and believe that they will provide a new and growing clientele for something called life-long learning. This prospect, however, is highly problematic.

In favor of such a forecast we may note that educational benefits, on the whole, have increasing marginal utility to the individual, and that the youth group of the sixties is the "most-schooled" generation in our history. These two facts together constitute a strong argument that this is the generation that will most likely seek more education. They may turn out to be the first generation of life-long learners.

But weighing against this claim are a number of other considerations. Paramount among them is the conjecture that the "most-schooled" generation is not the generation whose experience with schooling has been most rewarding. If they return to schooling in some form it is not likely to be because, as a group, they value learning more highly, but because, as a generation, they are the ones who have found it to be most compulsory.<sup>2</sup> It may be reasonably conjectured that they are likely to continue their education only if doing so is compulsory; and if the compulsoriness of education continues to expand, then there is likely to be a growing need for counselors to serve that generation. It is worth observing that the "golden age" of life-long learning may well have been the 1930's.<sup>3</sup> When we consider the enormous network of adult learning opportunities that existed in those years and the possibility that we may only now have reached that proportionate level, then it could be that the growth of the past ten years may have already reached a ceiling and that any further

---

<sup>2</sup>See K. Patricia Cross, *A Critical Review of State and National Studies of the Needs and Interests of Adult Learners*, a paper prepared for an NIE Invitational Conference, Washington, D.C., September 26-28, 1977, pg. 6. In figures compiled from the NCES Triennial Survey for 1975, Cross reports that participation in adult learning in 1975 was drawn disproportionately from the 25-44 age group (35.6%). This is the group most likely to contain participants in career entry and mid-career, employer-supported, learning opportunities. And these are also the opportunities that are most likely to be compulsory as things stand currently. They are often as compulsory for such individuals as the bar exams are compulsory for those seeking to engage in legal practice.

<sup>3</sup>We do know that library circulations per one-hundred population were greater in 1932 than in any year until 1972. So the base figures used in estimating the growth of adult learning may be those that starting with abnormally low rates of participation, grossly exaggerates more recent growth.

expansion of life-long learning will actually represent an extension of compulsory education to later years of life.

## PROSPECTS FOR COUNSELING

Are there solutions to these challenges and dilemmas, and, if so, what is their likely effect upon the future of guidance and counseling professionals both within and without the educational system? Clearly, if there are any *desirable* answers to the issues I have described, they call not for more tinkering with the system that produces these problems, but with rather drastic revision. What might that look like?

Let us accept as given (a) that the high school attainment rate has stabilized and will remain at its present level, and (b) that the effects of this state of affairs are approximately as they have been described. It follows that about 25 percent of each generation are disadvantaged, indeed, disinherited, and probably, therefore, disenchanting, not by any lack of native ability, but simply by not attaining at a certain level in the educational system. I submit that this is a socially unacceptable result.

What might be a remedy? Just this. By a variety of measures, some of which are already occurring, let us aim at a point where (a) possessing the high school *diploma* can no longer be used by the educational system for awarding access to post-secondary education, and where (b) the rate of high school completion is reduced to about 55 or 60 percent of each successive 17 year age-cohort. The first of these conditions has the effect of preventing the educational system from using high school diploma as a screen for access to further education, and the second has the effect of reducing the high school attainment rate to its level between 1945 and 1955.

What might be the advantages? Let us consider three contrasting sets of circumstances. For the first two let us hold constant the total *number* of employment positions in the private and public sectors of the economy.

1. Consider first then, an 18-24 age-cohort of 1,000 persons in an employment system with 850 positions and twelfth-level attainment rate of 75 percent. Suppose further that employers rigorously apply attainment at the twelfth-grade level of the system as a screen for job placement; a practice that, together with job-related tests, is currently followed by many industrial firms. It follows that 750 jobs will be allocated to high school graduates and 100 to the remaining 250 non-high school graduates.
2. Consider the same assumptions under conditions where the high school attainment rate is only 55 percent. In that case 550 positions would be allocated to high school graduates and the remaining 300 to non-high school graduates. Under these circumstances employers will either leave positions unfilled or else they will have to develop stronger devices for screening applicants *on other grounds than high school attainment*. The high school diploma would become an increasingly less useful device in allocating employment opportuni-

ties. Furthermore, it would probably become more apparent, under these conditions, that using the high school diploma as a first or even second step in allocating jobs is a practice that, with increasing frequency, eliminates persons of high ability. More nonattainers would secure positions; and among those who do, there would be many who would have had no opportunities at all under a higher attainment rate. In short, the 300 nongraduates employed would be more likely to include some of the 250 who would not get opportunities at all when the attainment rate is as high as 75 percent.

3. Consider a third set of conditions, one in which there are only 600 positions available for the 18-24 age-cohort. That is to say, let us suppose that unemployment in that cohort remains at about 40 percent and that high school attainment remains at 75 percent. In that case, there would be no jobs for non-high school graduates. Indeed, some high school *graduates* would be without jobs, and so the employment sector would have to develop devices for screening among *graduates* in the 18-24 age group. That screen would probably take the form of required educational attainment at the fourteenth grade of the educational system. The demand for higher levels of education would be extended not by the demand for higher levels of skill in employment, but simply by the *supply* of those who have education at higher levels.

On the other hand, with an attainment rate below 60 percent, despite 40 percent unemployment in the age group, it would follow on these assumptions, that some of the nonattaining group would have opportunities for jobs.

*Note:* Some of these systemic problems would be modified and the place of counseling within the system would be altered if we can (a) reduce the high school attainment level, (b) prohibit the use of the diploma as a screen for job entry, and (c) at the same time produce a more equitable participation rate at all levels for the group of last entry. Doing this would require an enormous expansion of counseling services.

The point of these observations is to seek a useful conceptualization of the claim that what is needed as the aim of policy, what is needed to meet the problems outlined, is a reduction of the present capacity of the formal educational system to determine the future of individuals and the value that society places upon their work. What we need, for reasons of justice, as well as general well-being, is not a system of education that is more equitable (although we need that too), but a system that is less powerful in determining the destinies of individuals. Under conditions of lower attainment rates in the educational system, the capacity of the system to shape the destinies of youth is reduced, the nonattaining group is better off and the society *necessarily* must provide more opportunities for people *independently* of their attainment level in that system.

These are by no means small advantages. Yet, there are two conditions without which such a social movement should not be encouraged, and these two conditions define the political difficulties. The first is that if there are any reductions in the high school attainment rate, say, to the level of 1950, that reduction should only be encouraged if it can be ac-

accompanied by a social distribution of the nonattaining group on criteria of class, race, and ethnicity more equitable than that which existed in 1950. It may be, however, that the group of last entry is now present in large enough numbers in the educational system so that our chances of retaining their proportional presence with a lower high school attainment rate is greater now than it would have been had the rate of attainment never advanced beyond its 1950 levels.

Beyond this, however, we must agree that it would be indefensible to urge a somewhat lower high school attainment rate without providing increased opportunities for *all* to continue learning *at whatever age they may reach*. In the service of this aim, it would be useful to introduce measures prohibiting the formal educational system itself from using attainment measures *of any kind* as a screen for admission to post-secondary opportunities.

## CONCLUSIONS

By a combination of the most conservative and the most radical elements in educational thought and in political movements, this may be the direction in which our educational system is moving. That direction of change commands a radical revision of the structure of our educational system, including an outright abandonment of that cherished American assumption that the comprehensive secondary school should be universal. A workable revision of the system, one in which the eleventh and twelfth levels of the system are permitted to atrophy and in which the high school is seen as an effective transitional school whose main purpose is to empty itself as rapidly as possible and in as many ways as is feasible may be a practical possibility. This reconstruction of secondary education in America is precisely the proposal of Ernest Boyer, recently United States Commission of Education. It is also a direction endorsed, perhaps unwittingly, by conservative demands for exit standards from high school, and by the continuing spread of experience-based career education at the high school level.

If such a path of development occurs, it will not occur as the forthright proposal I have described. It will be introduced, as all significant changes of policy are introduced, by stealth. It will receive a conventional name, and the name will no doubt be some combination of "back to basics" and "extended educational opportunity."

But to see this more clearly, we may briefly attempt to gather these observations into a focused set of conjectures on the future of counseling.

If there has been a central theme in these remarks, it has been the claim that the educational *system*—the system of schooling—has become too large. It has become too large in the sense of becoming too powerful in determining the lives of persons, too fateful in deciding their destinies. The strategic institution on which to focus attention in such a claim is the high school. I have argued that we may have to give up the ideal of a universal, comprehensive secondary system as we currently know it. To do so would be traumatic for the American people for whom that ideal

in its present expression is deeply endorsed. But fortunately, the American conscience in these matters is complex. I have not argued that we should give up the ideal of a society that provides abundant opportunities for learning. And that is probably the ideal that currently underlies the American commitment to universal secondary education. But such a transformation of belief may be especially difficult for counselors to adopt, especially if, as I suspect, it may mean giving up one of their most cherished and historically central professional interests, namely, the extension of success in school. Under the conditions I have described, good counseling practice, whether in the schools or out of them, is likely to take on more and more the appearance of simply "excellent teaching."

On the other hand, the kind of high school hinted at would require larger counseling and guidance capabilities than currently exist perhaps anywhere. A secondary system whose principal mission is to empty itself as rapidly as possible in as many ways as possible with the end in view of competence in life rather than educational success in school, would require higher professional skills and more interpersonal wisdom than exists currently in most counseling staffs. And if such a society, along with giving up the notion of universal secondary schooling, would also seek the widest possible enlargement of opportunities for learning without respect to age, then the services of counselors, teachers, wise advisors skilled in "brokering" the needed services would have to be increased with breathless speed and in almost endless variety. Such a vision calls for the invention of new institutions or the elaboration of existing ones in ways that resemble neither schools nor employment centers, nor community health clinics. It amounts to the need to "deinstitutionalize" or "mainstream" the "normal" population.

Consider, however, the amount of wisdom and restraint, how much insight and how much reluctance to "meddle in the lives of others" is called for in the fulfillment of such a vision. Any calm and dispassionate attempt to evaluate the probabilities would probably convince us that we can reasonably anticipate only the most marginal gains toward such an achievement even in the face of the most monumental efforts. Such wisdom and restraint are no doubt the most elusive of goods. They are unlikely results of even the best public policy. But neither can they be ruled out as the compelling consequence of the thinking of which we are capable.

# 5

## Special Populations: The Demands of Diversity

Lee Perry  
Harvard University

---

### INTRODUCTION

In the past ten years, the delivery of relevant services to special populations has been a focus of mounting concern within the helping professions, in national legislation, and in the heightened awareness of these diverse populations themselves.

This chapter highlights four major themes in guidance and counseling that should significantly shape the nature and the delivery of services to a pluralistic society in the 1980s and beyond. These themes are summarized as follows.

#### 1. Socially and Culturally Relevant Service

The next decade will continue the development and application of counseling theory and methods that are appropriate to the specific and unique needs of special populations who are subject to historical, social, legal, and educational inequities. New methods will emerge that combat the negative social stereotyping these groups face.



## 2. Primary Prevention Through a Developmental Perspective

Counseling and guidance services should be coordinated with national and state policies regarding primary prevention as suggested in the 1978 U.S. Presidential Commission on Mental Health Report. The field of counseling has traditionally been defined as the facilitation of healthy personal development in natural settings. A new and strong emphasis should be placed on the counseling and guidance professionals' role as agents of primary prevention. At different points in the lifespan where services are most advantageous to populations at risk, there is need to define and address "developmentally" special populations for whom specific services are strategically effective.

## 3. Diversity of Settings: Community-based Guidance and Counseling

A theoretical focus within counseling and guidance on the *interaction* of personal development with its surrounding psychosocial ecology calls for provision of counseling and guidance services in a wide variety of settings. This theme recognizes that while historically counseling services were based primarily in formal educational institutions, their expansion and relocation to community-based settings in the public and private sectors will become a more visible trend.

## 4. Variety of Services

The fourth theme addresses the need for diversity of interventions and strategies offered by guidance and counseling in all settings. National, state, and community policy and legislation may stimulate broader client choice among a complementary variety of approaches in addition to one-to-one counseling. New functions are consultation, the development of support networks, the increased use of paraprofessional, indigenous, and volunteer counselors, self-help groups, deliberate psychological education, use of new technologies, counselor advocacy, and the increased participation of the client-consumer in the definition and the evaluation of services.

These four themes suggest significant policy implications, described in the conclusion of this chapter, in the areas of equity and effectiveness of service delivery at the national, state, and community action levels.

## THE CONCEPT OF SPECIAL POPULATIONS

"Special Populations" can be restrictively defined as the most underserved members of our country, or conversely, the definition may include



unique aspects of the entire population. In this chapter two major categories of "special" citizenry are described. Both have different justifications for particular legislative and policy attention to their needs: those groups who are "special" from a social/historical perspective, and those who are "special" from a lifespan/developmental perspective.

The first category comprises all those special populations for whom, historically and at present, cultural stereotypes, the legal system, processes of socialization, and corrosive social stigma operate to provide a negative social-psychological ecology: women, racial and cultural minorities, the elderly, the handicapped, learning-disabled or gifted children, and other groups, such as the mentally ill, the incarcerated, and persons of alternative sexual orientation.

The second major category consists of persons who are at significant points of transition and stress in their lives, for whom guidance and counseling services would serve as a means of primary and secondary prevention. As Caplan (1961) points out, at major anticipated developmental turning points in the lifespan, there is at the same time an increased risk of mental illness on the one hand, and on the other an openness to new coping strategies directed toward personal and employment alternatives in the resolution of these crises. Thus these changing "developmental" special populations are cross-sections of the population at times of family planning, pre- and post-natal care, early childhood support and day care systems, school entry screening, school-employment transitions, illness and death in the family, separation and divorce, career transitions, periods of unemployment, and retirement.

## SPECIAL POPULATIONS FROM A SOCIAL-HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

Despite heightened social awareness, and major federal and legal initiatives, economic, employment, and social progress for specific populations such as women, racial and ethnic minorities, the handicapped, the elderly, and other socially stigmatized groups is currently *below* 1960 standards (U.S. Commission, 1978). These inequities persist despite affirmative action, and major federal legislation in the areas of unemployment training (CETA), Title IX, and Title XX. The processes of socialization, and the negative economic, legal, and social-psychological ecology in which these groups must function continue to be immune to legal policies of equal access and equal opportunity.

Guidance and counseling services in schools and in the community stand at the crucial intersection between these groups of children and adults, and career and personal opportunity. In the past, counseling theory and practice attempted to approach a universal ideal of maximizing human potential, usually through a uniform approach to all students and clients. Both professionals and representatives of special populations now recognize that the definition of this "universal client" often covertly assumed male, white, middle-class values, and related cultural social norms.

The field has now moved dramatically towards training and practice emphasizing a diversity of roles, skills, and services specifically tailored for relevance to cultural, racial, and sex role differences in the populations (see, for example, Special Issues, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1973, 1977, 1978; *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 1978).

Thus for reasons of equity in assuring genuinely equal access to opportunity and appropriate services for all, major efforts at a federal, state, and community level are needed to provide *relevant* and *accessible* counseling and guidance services. Likewise, for effective practice, service delivery must be sufficiently diverse to account for the unique needs and backgrounds of these various groups.

## Women

In 1975, according to the Department of Labor, the median income of fully employed college educated women was less than that of fully employed men with an eighth-grade education. More than two as many adult women are treated for "depression" than men. These simple statistics illuminate the way in which women, as a majority "special population," represent our nation's largest unused human potential. The women's Educational Equity Act, affirmative action, the possible passage of the Equal Rights Amendment and programs such as the Sex Equality and Guidance Opportunity project (SEGO) are attempts at the federal level to redress this situation. At all ages in the lifespan, however, girls and women are in a process of transition in which the challenges are tri-dimensional: (a) internalized factors within themselves (Maccoby, 1973); (b) the ingrained sex-role stereotypes of helping agents (Broverman, 1970); (c) and those traditional psychosocial environmental forces that often preclude rather than expand choices in personal and career development (Ryan, 1971; Taylor, 1977).

Guidance and counseling services within the schools provide important points of access for dealing with the dependency, passivity, and covert expectations that socialization and environmental forces inculcate and reinforce (Harmon et al., 1976; "Sexism and Counseling" 1976). As a special population women demonstrably make extensive use of guidance and counseling services (Chesler, 1972). Thus an educational emphasis on career development, self-concept, assertiveness training, family systems, and an awareness of legal, personal, and employment opportunities at an early age could contribute to preventing the statistically significant incidence of greater psychological depression, and lower-socioeconomic status that adult women manifest. As one-half of minority members are women, and two-thirds of the elderly are women, guidance and counseling services directed towards this "majority" special population address multiple groups who are subject to double or triple discrimination, thus having a ripple effect across other populations (Davis, 1977).

Innovative approaches for battered wives, rape victims, and molested and abused girls are imperative and immediate needs. As previously covert or legally sanctioned crimes become openly discussed, it is clear

that much of social sex-related oppression begins at home and must be dealt with in that context (Hare-Mustin, 1977).

## Racial and Cultural Minorities

Blacks, Hispanics, Asian Americans, and Native Americans have long been foremost among the underserved, with higher incidences of unemployment, mental and physical illness, and mortality in adults and youth than is true of the population at large (*Report to the President*, 1978). In addition to the negative social-psychological environment that they face daily, the forms and nature of traditional service delivery have been frustratingly ineffective in meeting the real priorities of these groups. The diversity of cultural orientations, the goals they bring to counseling, and the modes of communication with which they function must be taken into account if counseling and guidance are to be effective for such persons.

In the past ten years the profession has made major strides in the conceptualization, training, and research of relevant and effective services (see, for example, Special Issues, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977, 1978). For example, Black professionals advocate a style of service that emphasizes outreach to acknowledge and attempt to overcome distrust; a focus on action over traditional styles of reflection and passivity; and a conceptualization of Black clients in terms of their history, strengths and complexity, rather than as "culturally deprived" (Jones, 1972; Pierce, 1969; Jackson, 1976).

The misuse of culturally and linguistically biased testing, both in educational and career guidance, has been a source of concern and reform that minority professionals have acted to correct (Special Issue, *Journal of Non-White Concerns*, 1978).

Both language and cultural discrepancies have been major barriers to effective service for the Spanish-speaking and Native American populations, as well as other cultural groups (Casas, J. and Atkinson, D., 1981). In addition to emphasizing bilingual counseling with indigenous workers, Pederson (1979), Sue (1973), and Ivey (1977) have developed models of counselor training and practice that facilitate crosscultural communication. Rather than emphasizing acculturation, a recognition of diverse cultural skills, expertise, and pluralism are highlighted for both counselor and client.

In addition, a diversity of services for these groups beyond one-to-one counseling is consistently advocated. For example, in Hispanic culture, stress is often not conceptualized in terms of psychological or career dissatisfaction, but rather in health terms (Martinez, 1978). Thus an alliance of guidance and counseling services with medical services and with indigenous community healers enable greater service access and utilization. Again, for particular cultural groups, family rather than individual approaches appear more effective (Mirandal, 1976). Sue (1973) has also illuminated the cultural factors that have been barriers to service utilization by Asian Americans and provides models for surmounting these obstacles.

Government approaches to these problems have been diverse but uncoordinated. Currently CETA and YEDPA programs represent important community supplements to ongoing school-based guidance and counseling programs in facilitating employment but these programs often have been divorced from community mental health centers. Current programs often do not provide means of support for community network activities, do not enlist paraprofessional and indigenous community workers, self-help groups, or encourage the participation of the special population consumer in either the design or the evaluation of services delivered. Community or school-based services must address the cultural psycho-ecology in which these groups function (Pastor, 1972).

## Exceptional Children: The Handicapped

With the passage of Public Law 94-142, assurance of appropriate educational provisions for children with special needs within the public educational system is required. As adolescents and adults, this special population evidences great distress in emotional and employment areas (Cantwell, 1971). Guidance and counseling services that emphasize consultation on psychosocial aspects of the classroom, family counseling, and school to employment transitions, are becoming crucial to implementing the law at the local level. Because neither the law nor its accompanying regulations give sufficient attention to the services school-based counselors are now providing, reauthorization or amendment will need to document this contribution.<sup>1</sup>

## The Elderly

With the passage of the Older Americans Act in 1965, its amendments in 1973 and 1978 establishing Area Agencies on Aging, PL 95-478 extended the retirement age and strongly implied that guidance and counseling services should become more accessible and coordinated through networks in the community. The extensive needs, however, of this growing sub-population for preretirement counseling, counseling about jobs and career development, and information regarding nutrition, health, leisure, housing, transportation, and social security services have become increasingly complex and diverse and will require amendment to current law that reflect these facts (Ganikos, 1979). The degree to which societal attitudes, external and internalized, influence major lifespan and productivity factors for this visible and vocal population has yet to be recognized. In addition, the effects of helplessness in regard to living situations and life choices suggest new roles for the counselor as psychosocial reeducator and consultant to nursing homes (Murrell, 1978; Langer & Rodin, 1977; White, 1960).

<sup>1</sup> See Vernon (1981) for an extensive discussion on the adverse impact of this law on certain educational constituencies.

## The Handicapped Adult

Recent major legislation has made dramatic shifts in social awareness, and in educational and social access to community resources for the handicapped. Related policies at the state and community level, however, continue in many instances to omit adequate input from both professional and handicapped groups, and tend to perpetuate paternalism by reinforcing continued dependence and isolation. Here, in addition to rehabilitative and family counseling services, an active counselor advocacy role is called for to increase mainstream educational, career, and social participation and foster rehabilitation and the continued development of competence (Scott, 1970; Garrett & Levine, 1973).

## Other Groups

There are other major populations for whom social stigma and legal barriers have dramatically reduced the opportunity for effective functioning and, in many cases, served to induce or perpetuate disability. Among such populations the incarcerated, the chronically mentally ill, and persons of alternative sexual orientation stand out. Guidance and counseling practitioners, with their emphases on individual strengths, on coping skills and on career development are not now sufficiently available through community mental health centers, courts, prison systems, and community or work resource centers to adequately counteract the negative social system in which these special groups operate (Perry, 1979). Social action, consultation, public education and advocacy roles for the counselor, in addition to more traditional methods of service delivery, are important responses in behalf of these groups (Rappaport, 1977; Lehrer, 1981).

In summary, for those special populations that have been and continue to be socially stigmatized, a diversity of guidance and counseling services, designed to address the special needs of these groups, can provide vehicles through which individuals facing oppression can mobilize internal and group resources with which to exert greater control and choice regarding their personal and employment destiny. In neglecting such appropriate services, the public ultimately pays for the far more expensive services (health, welfare, unemployment, institutionalization) needed to deal with the effects of crippled lives (Sarason & Spielberger, 1976; Rabkin & Struening, 1976).

## SPECIAL POPULATIONS FROM A DEVELOPMENTAL PERSPECTIVE

Significant points of environmental or developmental stress create "special populations" needing guidance or counseling services to maximize their opportunities for productive or creative resolution of their problems rather than disability or stagnation (Albee, 1977). Interventions empha-



sizing present and future-oriented coping models and psychoeducational approaches, rather than medical frames of reference focusing on psychopathology, have demonstrated effectiveness in providing support, skills and alternatives for persons who might otherwise become employment, medical, or psychiatric casualties (Caplan, 1964; Kelly, 1978; Spector & Clairborn, 1973). The role of counselors as agents of primary prevention on a national level is greatly underestimated, although the counselor's strategic placement in natural settings in educational, vocational, and community institutions provides an available and important leverage for early identification, intervention, and education in behalf of the needs of special populations. Community-based counseling programs, in addition to school-based programs, aiding families at times of predictable stress and transition, such as planning and birth of children, career and child care decision points, adolescence and child separation, marital separation and divorce, and occurrence of illness and death in the family can and do provide front line, immediate primary prevention throughout the nation (Albee, 1977; Klein, 1977).

### Family Planning, Pre- and Post-Natal Care, Early Parent-Infant Interaction

Provision of counseling and information regarding family planning, pre-natal care, infant physical and emotional health needs, parental bonding, the special needs of low birth weight and premature babies can be critical interventions in promoting the basic groundwork and interaction patterns enabling family solidarity and healthy children (Broussard, 1977). Health service delivery has often focused more on providing physical/medical rather than psychological information while counseling and support services may actually be more cost-effective in dealing with emotional and interactional issues that present themselves in medical guise, such as low birth weight, "failure to thrive" and abused infants (Jameson, 1978).

### Early Childhood Education and Day-Care Systems

With thirteen million mothers of preschool children working, and increasing numbers of dual-career couples and single parents, consultation to nursery and day care centers, as well as provisions for family counseling during these early developmental years are important community resources (White, 1976). Counselors can often act as agents in the development of mutual support networks for single parent families, provide career development and educational access information, as well as help to create mutually supportive family interaction (Beavers, 1977).

### School-Employment Transitions

Guidance and counseling programs have traditionally had their major national impact in the developmental needs of adolescents at the sec-

ondary school level. Vocational and career education programs are often focused on the individual student or groups of students. Here it is suggested that greater family participation in this process, particularly in decisions that involve the separation and independence of the adolescent from the family are an imperative adjunct to these programs. Cutbacks in counselors in school settings because of economic exigencies or diminishing student enrollments often threaten these skilled resources; but family participation, increasing access to modern information, technology, and a focus on group processes may create both wider support for and greater efficiency in these services (Olson, 1979). An increased emphasis on counselor consultation to teachers about the needs and behavioral problems of children and youth is also necessary (Carlson, 1975; Special Issues on Consultation, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978).

## Separation and Divorce, Death and Illness in the Family

Research studies have now established that personal loss through separation, illness or death is a precursor of high stress and of future mental and medical illness (Rabkin & Struening, 1976). Psychoeducational classes regarding the natural course of grief reactions and adaptation create spontaneous support groups and healing communities that can provide the setting for creative, productive resolutions rather than depressive or somatic maladaptions (Sarason & Spielberger, 1976).

## Career and Educational Transitions for Adults

Shifting economic and social factors create conditions in which adults at every socioeconomic level reconsider earlier career decisions and educational paths (Super, 1977). For example, both the unemployed government worker and the full-time housewife with grown children often are without local community resources through which to gain access to information and support for the choices they confront at turning points in their lives. The management of educational and career brokering services, matching adult learners and employment seekers with educational and career resources, is an increasingly viable role for guidance and counseling in the community (Heffernan et al., 1976). Such community based service centers can also provide the preretirement guidance and counseling that is otherwise often unavailable to older adults (Lichtman, 1978).

In summary, at particular developmental and crisis points within the lifespan, groups with special needs for guidance and counseling services are continually created because of the particular issues they face. Recognition and coordination of vital guidance and counseling services in the community must be directly related to national and state policy regarding primary prevention.



## DIVERSITY OF SETTINGS: COMMUNITY-BASED GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING SERVICES

The third theme for the future is an increasing diversity in the settings in which relevant services to special populations are provided. The decrease in school enrollments and the needs of special groups of all ages call for increasing, not decreasing, the provision of counseling and guidance services (Lewis & Lewis, 1977). Traditionally linked to schooling and school-based services, the definition of education in the past ten or fifteen years has increasingly taken into account informal and community-based processes of learning throughout the lifespan in a wide variety of settings (Ylvisaker, 1977).

Servicing the needs of special populations calls particularly for shifts in the traditional locales in which guidance and counseling are currently provided. For example, alliances of counselors with professionals in health care settings would at once decrease the cost of medical assistance and provide those at either developmental or medical crisis points with natural on-site access to guidance and counseling services. Day care centers, unemployment offices, libraries, and Area Agencies on Aging are also logical and easily accessible public institutional settings for increased counseling services. Increased emphasis on guidance and counseling, and upon self-help groups rather than on psychiatric service, in community mental health centers, courts, and correctional institutions would create linkages for populations for whom lack of adequate employment and career competence translates to deviance and depression.

In the private sector, corporations and unions are increasingly important sites for both career and psychoeducational development programs (Osipow, 1978). Both personal and career stress often manifest themselves in lowered productivity, employment disability, and soaring medical insurance costs (Cummings, 1979). Increased provision of both personal counseling and career guidance services in these settings would be in the self-interest of the organizations themselves, as well as in serving the needs of employees. The counselor is in a vital position for modifying institutional attitudes towards special populations and in facilitating equal opportunity and promotional access. Increases in private community-based counseling centers are also predicted for the 1980s. Educational and career brokering, and new demands for personal development counseling within communities, particularly in centers organized by special populations that emphasize self-help groups and paraprofessional workers need to be stimulated and supported by federal and state "seed" funds.

### Increased Diversity in the Nature of Services

Historically, guidance and counseling services have moved from a reliance on one-to-one counseling as the primary mode of service delivery to a proliferation of approaches (Hacker et al., 1978). The needs of special populations require the development of innovations and new repertoires

of skills and alternatives for the counselor of the future. Certainly, considerations of economy and efficiency also serve as stimuli for a shift from primarily one-to-one relationships to multiple modes of service delivery. For example, career counseling and development are currently significantly augmented by career education: with classroom teachers as significant members of the guidance and counseling team, the relationship of basic skills to information regarding careers can be provided to large numbers of children and adolescents with maximum efficiency and economy. Individual counseling, computerized information systems, and skillfully packaged career decision programs can provide important supplements to the groundwork laid in the classroom context. As a part of career education activities, sex role, cultural, racial, and other social stereotypes can be addressed within the context of peer group value formation, opening up new modes of thought for both majority and "special populations." Consultation by counselors with community groups, unions, business and industry, and professionals in diverse settings is a logical follow-up procedure for assuring that exploratory and employment opportunities for adolescents in special needs group are continually developed.

Many of the difficulties experienced by special populations lies in the interaction of the individual with her/his environmental context. Creating significant positive changes in both elements of this dyad can maximize growth and new opportunity. Therefore, many of the newer guidance and counseling functions emphasize addressing both sides of the interactive system: the individual and the social-psychological environmental context (Moos, 1973; Kuriloff, 1978). New approaches in counseling stress interventions in systems and in the social ecologies that perpetuate stigma (Ryan, 1971; Cowen, 1973).

## Deliberate Psychological Education and Other Psychoeducational Approaches

One new kind of service delivery is an integration of counseling and of formal group teaching. This approach involves discussion and skill training concerning particular psychological or developmental issues in which information, psychological principles, and research results are deliberately placed in the hands of client/consumer populations themselves. Group learning regarding job interviewing skills for CETA participants; the SEGO (Sex Quality in Guidance Opportunities) program of systematic workshops regarding sex stereotypes and discrimination; and assertive training for groups socialized into passivity, dependence, or helplessness are examples of innovative approaches for socially stigmatized special populations (Munoz, 1976; Signell, 1976).

There have been similar attempts with special populations with developmental crisis: Sprinthall's approach with adolescents and underachievers is an excellent example within school systems (Sprinthall, 1973). Weiss's work on *Marital Separation* (1976) in which individuals participate in a six-week course studying the stresses, coping strategies, and frequently used paths of resolution of this statistically increasing and often disabling life event has proven effective in reducing the number of

individuals needing formal medical assistance and psychotherapy (Walker, 1978). Similar group education approaches to coping with psychological stress such as that which illness and loss in the family could provide cognitive and psychological support for persons encountering these transitions (Caplan, 1964).

## Initiation and Support of Self-Help Groups

Special populations themselves have been innovators in finding and creating effective means of self-help such as Alcoholics Anonymous, organizations of racial and cultural minorities, and women's consciousness-raising groups. Research comparing effectiveness of such groups with traditional helping services has demonstrated significant effectiveness for self-help approaches (Katz & Bender, 1977). Professionals can be invaluable in both initiating and serving as consultants to such groups in their provision of multiple benefits to their clients: reduction of loneliness and isolation, the absence of perjorative social and medical labels, the increased sense of power and competence to deal with one's situation, and the development of the individual and community strategies of change and healing (Davis, 1977). For all the "special populations" defined earlier in this chapter, such groups, either leaderless or with paraprofessional or professional assistance, make a significant contribution in surmounting the barriers to effective vocational and personal lives for our citizens. Self-help groups provide the weight of numbers in gaining access to formal services. They also give professionals feedback about the relevance of service to their population, the negative ways in which professionals reinforce social norms, or the tendency to serve bureaucratic rather than client convenience (Signell, 1976).

## Initiation of Support Networks

In overcoming the barriers facing socially designated "special populations," and in navigating the developmental transitions all citizens face, the existence of support networks within the community can be crucial in regard to outcome (Caplan, 1974; Sarason, 1977). A counselor responsibility lies in enabling individuals and groups to become aware of their own potentialities in personal and career development. Counselors can also provide linkages between environments that create the social contexts in which these groups can flourish. For particular special populations, where loneliness and isolation are demonstrably debilitating, particularly for the elderly, the handicapped, the bereaved, and single parent families, these sustaining community support systems provide and extend a social environment in which the services of guidance and counseling can be maximally utilized. Support networks can therefore be viewed as an extension into the private, nonprofessional sector of the professional delivery system.

In addition to encouraging individuals to make use of family, friends, and other personal resources, the counselor can also directly refer individuals to existing community organizations in which further supportive

help can be mobilized. Psychoeducational approaches and self-help groups often provide, in addition to information, insight, understanding, and access to resources, an immediate network of persons whose longevity of support extends far beyond the six- or eight-week professional course, thereby reinforcing and continuing the process.

## Increased Usage of Paraprofessional, Indigenous Workers

Guidance and counseling services in schools are directly tied to state-based legal certification requirements for counselors. Yet through outreach programs and strong affirmative action, and usage of facilities such as the Minority Student Locator Service, increasing numbers of representatives of special populations could be encouraged through career education and graduate training programs to consider opportunities in paraprofessional counseling (Atkinson, 1977). As guidance and counseling services become increasingly diversified in a wide variety of community organizations and facilities, provision for training and utilization of paraprofessional mental health counselors may be increasingly justified (Zimpfer, 1978). The strong protectionist guild activity of long-established professions belies the current fact that the majority of services offered through community mental health centers, for example, are currently delivered by paraprofessional counselors (Bass, 1978).

## Family Guidance and Counseling

The past ten years of experience in psychology and mental health service delivery have strengthened a systems perspective, particularly with regard to "labeled" clients and "special populations." A focus on person-environment interactions highlights the family system as the most potent interpersonal environment of any given individual (Hare-Mustin, 1977). Correspondingly, in all areas of guidance and counseling a move away from regarding the individual as the single unit of focus calls for inclusion in counseling activities of the major members of the individual's psychosocial system (Beavers, 1977). For example, an unemployed or disabled father may need career counseling to aid him in future planning; in addition, participation of his family in dealing with his current status and the decisions that will affect each family member can be critical in maintaining cohesion during the time of crisis and in attempts at future resolutions. Likewise, an emphasis on families, particularly for special populations where cultural individualism is less valued, increases the participation of multiple cultural groups in guidance and counseling services and resultant effectiveness (Sue, 1973; Martinez, 1978).

## Consultation

Consultation and advocacy are indirect but often highly potent modes of community service delivery with regard to special populations. Coun-

selors can frequently maximize their effectiveness in assisting special populations in schools and communities through consultation with those aspects of the immediate educational and community environment with which they most frequently interact: teachers, work supervisors, nursing home and day-care center directors, police, and future employers. These environmental interventions can actually be the most significant factors contributing to the outcome of counseling and guidance services, yet they are least frequently acknowledged and supported by school or community bureaucratic policies favoring one-to-one counseling sessions as the most easily measured for accounting purposes (Carlson, 1975; Special Issues, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978) The counselor-consultant role, however, in reducing social stigma and in creating a supportive and understanding environment for those in developmental crisis, if more difficult to quantify in hours, can be dramatically effective in terms of altered lives (Murrell, 1978; Kuriloff, 1978; Klein, 1977).

## Advocacy

Particularly with regard to socially unempowered special populations for whom ingrained negative social stereotypes operate covertly in the community, the function of advocacy is a new role that counselors and representatives of special populations must engage. It is an educative process facilitating the delivery of programs of cultural and developmental relevance. While advocacy is addressed particularly to policy makers and implementors, increased counselor involvement in public education programs regarding the availability of such services is a secondary effect of such efforts (Rapaport, 1977). For example, the provision of services for rape victims or battered women, or admission to counseling groups is often contingent on the victims filing police reports as a condition of receiving treatment, thus violating the confidentiality and freedom of choice of the potential client. Counselor and client activism can have significant impact in modifying regulations that place special populations in a double bind or those that result in culturally irrelevant or at times destructive services.

## Media, Technology, and Public Education

Among all the helping professions, guidance and counseling professionals have taken the leadership role in exploring and adapting modern technological innovations to their work in three major areas: training, research, and service delivery. The reliance on tape-recording initiated by Carl Rogers has expanded to videotaped methodologies for increasing counselor and client interpersonal skills (Kagan, 1967; Ivey, 1970; Pedersen, 1973), films on developmental transitions (Whitely, 1970), and the incorporation of computer technology in the delivery both of career information and career decision making. Predicted increases in the availability of these technologies suggest additional modalities of massive and



efficient service delivery to special populations through which culturally relevant information can dramatically expand.

## PROVISION FOR PARTICIPATION IN PLANNING AND EVALUATION OF SERVICES BY REPRESENTATIVES OF SPECIAL POPULATIONS

From socially stigmatized populations or culturally different subgroups, a recurrent plea in the literature is for increased participation both in planning and in evaluation of needed services. Too often, however, professional and bureaucratic personnel have adopted paternalistic approaches in structuring services and in designating outcomes. In assuring responsible and relevant delivery of services for special populations, engaging the expertise of these groups is not only a hallmark of responsible guidance and counseling, it is also an important process in itself. By aiding populations socialized into a position of helplessness and dependence to recognize and mobilize their own power and resources, major change can occur in self-perceptions and behavioral repertoires.

Evaluation research, so crucial to future policy formation, has long been the sacred province of professionals only. Conversely, the participation of special populations in the selection of relevant outcome criteria could prevent results of limited usefulness such as those surrounding the Head Start evaluation (Guttentag, 1973). Client input in designating research variables useful in both summative and formative research, permitting program modification and adaptation in process (Weiss, 1976), might also insure more adequate feedback processes for guidance and counseling systems, and more informative outcomes for policy makers.

## SOCIAL POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

Social policy recommendations regarding counseling services for special populations must address multiple constituencies: the guidance and counseling profession itself, policy makers and implementors on federal, state, and community levels and the special population groups at issue. All participate in a shared process with shared responsibilities. Such recommendations should include the following:

### Recommendations for the Profession

1. *Emphasis in all training programs on the development of expertise in cross-racial, cross-cultural, and cross-sex counseling.* Despite the dramatic shifts of the past ten years, programs often relegate material regarding the psychology of women, Black studies, and other minority groups



or persons of diverse cultural and linguistic backgrounds to separate, nonrequired courses rather than integrating such material into all courses dealing with principles of guidance and counseling or making such courses required.

2. *Training emphases in community counseling, with specific regard for consultation, psychoeducational approaches, the enlistment of community and personal support networks, advocacy, crisis intervention, and family counseling.* Training programs often adhere to a primarily school-based conception of guidance and counseling, with innovative community skills learned individually on the job rather than systematically in the training process itself.

3. *Deliberate and systematic encouragement, within schools and colleges as well as within training programs and professional organizations, for members of all special populations to join professional and paraprofessional ranks.* Deliberate outreach that extends beyond affirmative action, particularly among often neglected constituencies—such as the handicapped and the elderly—could enlist resources with important perspectives and contributions. Insuring access to positions of leadership and power within the profession is also vital.

4. *Consideration of "nontraditional" applicants as future counselors, such as those without bachelor's degrees but with established competencies in other fields who wish to receive formal training to effect career shifts.*

5. *Increased lobbying and public education efforts, particularly through alliances with special population lobbies, for adequate guidance and counseling services and research funds.* Counseling and career guidance, as compared with medically oriented psychotherapy, guidance and counseling tends to be more relevant and valued by special needs groups and should be expanded in its access and relevance for these populations.

## Recommendations for Federal, State, and Community Action

### *Federal:*

1. *Coordination of Service Policies:* Guidance and counseling has received federal support through a wide range of departments and legislative initiatives: education, labor, health, aging, the handicapped, mental health, and commerce. To the degree that such federal, as contrasted with state, initiatives continue increased coordination of legislation in these areas is crucial to insure diversity and relevance to special populations and provision of adequate services.

2. *Representation:* Legislation should be worded to encourage the participation at state and community levels of more than token representation of special populations in the design, setting, diversity, and evaluation of services.

3. *Increased training, seed, and research funds:* To provide the stimulus and substance for research in and delivery of services relevant to the needs and characteristics of special population, policy and legislative initiatives need to include emphases on training, "seed money" and research support.

## *State:*

1. *Professional Competence:* State counselor certification requirements should be reviewed to insure expertise in the multiple areas of competence relevant to service delivery for special populations.

2. *Professional Access:* Modification of counselor certification requirements should facilitate access to such roles by members of special populations themselves.

3. *Legislative Pluralism:* The structuring of programs, based on state or federal funds, should permit and encourage diversity of available services. Often such programs are bureaucratically rewarded in ways which support only one-to-one counseling, for example, rather than increased community and consultive functions.

4. *Local Design:* Each state is unique with regard to the number and variety of special populations represented in its citizenry. Planning for state level programs should include specific attention to the different population needs suggested by the state's demography. State agencies must engage representatives of the counseling profession and persons representing the special needs populations in the formulation and execution of legislation, program design, and evaluation.

## *Community: The Special Populations Themselves*

*Group Initiative:* In reviewing both legislative and attitudinal changes toward many special populations during the past twenty years, it is clear that major social changes have not always been initiated by Washington or by state capitols, but by these groups themselves. A Black woman refusing to move to the back of the bus in Selma, Alabama, may have triggered far more social policy change than could any one federal statute. Legislation often follows, rather than precedes, action for effective social change. Therefore, a great responsibility lies within communities, and within the self-help efforts of special populations themselves. They must press for appropriate legislation and service delivery, and work with others to create innovative services pertinent to their needs.

2. *Cooperative Linkages:* Oftentimes special populations are seen and see themselves as competitive rather than cooperative special interest groups. Not only is there a great overlap among the populations themselves (for example, one half of minorities are women and it is hoped that all of us will reach the status of "elderly") but support and appreciation for "difference" in any community positively affects multiple social and developmental groups alike.

3. *Consumer Pressure:* At the community level, regardless of federal and state policies, citizen support and demand for appropriate services through pressure on school boards, local agencies, and through the creation of self-help systems is recommended.

4. *Advocacy:* Coalition and cooperation, rather than competition, among representatives and organizations of special populations at a community, state, and national level should characterize community action.

## REFERENCES

- Albee, G., & Joffe, J. *Primary prevention of psychopathology*. Boston: University Press of New England, 1977.
- Atkinson, D. Selecting counselor trainees with cross-cultural strength. Unpublished paper, 1977.
- Atkinson, D., Morten, G., & Sue, D. *Counseling American minorities: A cross-cultural perspective*. Dubuque: William C. Brown, 1979.
- Bass, R. *Community mental health center staffing: Who minds the store?* U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, NIMH Series B, No. 16, 1978.
- Beavers, W. *Psychotherapy and growth: A family systems perspective*. New York: Brunner/Mazel, 1977.
- Broussard, E. Primary prevention program for newborn infants at high risk for emotional disorder. In D. Klein, *Primary prevention*, 1977.
- Broverman, I.; Broverman, D., & Clarkson, F. Sex-role stereotypes and clinical judgments in mental health. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 1970, 34.
- Cantwell, D. (Ed.) *The hyperactive child*. New York: Spectrum, 1975.
- Caplan, G. *An approach to community mental health*. Grune and Stratton, 1961.
- Caplan, G. *Principles of preventive psychiatry*. New York: Basic Books, 1964.
- Caplan, G. *The theory and practice of mental health consultation*. New York: Basic Books, 1970.
- Caplan, G. *Support systems and community health: Lectures in concept development*. New York: Behavioral Publications, 1974.
- Carlson, J., Splete, H., & Kern, R. *The consulting process*. APGA Reprint Series, No. 7, 1975.
- Casas, Jesús and Atkinson, Donald. The Mexican-American in Higher Education: An example of Subtle Stereotyping. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, March, 1981, 59, 7, 473-476.
- Chesler, P. *Women and madness*. Garden City, New York: Doubleday, 1972.
- Consultation I and Consultation II, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978, (February, March)
- Counseling across cultures. Special Issue, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, April 1978.
- Counseling minorities. Special Issue, *Journal of Employment Counseling*, December 1978.
- Counseling the culturally different. Special Issue, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977.
- Counseling women. Special Issue, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1973.
- Cowen, E. Social and community intervention. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 1973, Vol. 24.
- Davis, M. Women's liberation groups as a primary preventive mental health strategy. *Community Mental Health Journal*, 1977, 13 (3), 219-288.
- Evaluation of psychological service delivery programs. Special Issue, *Professional Psychology*, 1977, 8 (4).
- Ganikos, M. (Ed.) *Counseling the aged*. Special training project, American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1979.
- Garret, J., & Levine, E. *Rehabilitation practices with the physically disabled*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1973.
- Guttentag, M., & Streuning, E. (Eds.) *Handbook of evaluation research*, Vol. 1 and 2. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1975.
- Hatcher, C., & Brooks, B. *Innovations in counseling psychology*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1977.
- Heffernan, J., Macy, F., & Vickers, D. *Educational brokering a new service for adult learners*. Syracuse, New York: National Center for Educational Brokering, 1976.
- Ivey, A. Cultural expertise: Toward systematic outcome criteria in counseling and psychological education. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, February 1977.
- Ivey, A. A person-environment view of counseling and psychotherapy: Implications for social policy. Paper presented at the Conference on Cross-cultural Counseling and Psychotherapy: Foundations, Evaluation, and Training. Honolulu, June 1979.

- Ivey, A., & Authier, J. *Microcounseling: Innovations in interviewing, counseling, psychotherapy, and psychoeducation*. Springfield, Illinois: Thomas, 1978.
- Jackson, A. Mental health delivery systems and the Black client. *Journal of Afro American Issues*, 1976, 4 (11), 28-34.
- Jameson, J. Vulnerable mother-child dyads. Unpublished paper, Harvard Graduate School of Education, May 1978.
- Jones, R. (Ed.) *Black psychology*. New York: Harper and Row, 1972.
- Kagan, N., & Krathwohl, D. *Studies in human interaction and interpersonal process recall*. Final Report. East Lansing, Michigan: State University, 1967.
- Katz, A., & Bender, E. (Ed.) *The strength in us: Self-help groups in the modern world*. New York: New Viewpoints, 1977.
- Katzell, L., & Waters, E. *Facilitating career development of girls and women*. Washington, D.C.: Monograph National Vocational Guidance Association, 1973.
- Kelly, J., Snowden, L., & Munoz, R. Social and community interventions. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 28, 323-361.
- Klein, D. *Primary prevention*. Rockville, Maryland: NIMH DHEW Publication No. (ADM) 77-447, 1977.
- Kuriloff, P. The psychological counselor in Hatcher and Brooke. *Innovation in Counseling Psychology*.
- Langer, E., & Rodin, J. The effects of choice and enhanced personal responsibility for the aged: A field experiment in an institutional setting. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 1976, 34, 191-198.
- Lehrer, Sande. Career/Life Planning for Ex-Offenders. *Journal of Public Offender Counseling*, October, 1981, 2, 1, 13-19.
- Lewis, J., & Lewis, M. *Community counseling: A human services approach*. John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1977.
- Lichtman, R. Jobs and mental health in a social context. *Center Magazine*, 1978, XI(6).
- Maccoby, E. *The psychology of sex differences*. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1974.
- Martinez, J. (Ed.) *Chicano psychology*. New York: Academic Press, 1978.
- Midlife career change: Special Issue. *The Vocational Guidance Quarterly*, June 1977.
- Miller, J., & Leonard, G. *Career guidance practices for disadvantaged youth*. Monograph of the National Vocational Guidance Association, 1975.
- Miranda, M. (Ed.) *Psychotherapy with the Spanish-speaking: Issues in research and service delivery*. Monograph Number Three, Spanish Speaking Mental Health Research Center, 1976.
- Moos, R. Conceptualizations of human environments. *American Psychologist*, 1973, 28, 652-665.
- Munoz, R. The primary prevention of psychological problems. *Community Mental Health Review*, 1976, 1 (6), 5-12.
- Murrell, S. *Community psychology and social systems*. New York: Behavioral Publications, 1973.
- Murrell, S. *Mental Health Consultation*. New York: Behavioral Publications, 1973.
- Olson, L. *Lost in the shuffle*. Santa Barbara: Citizen's Policy Center, 1979.
- Osipow, S. Occupational mental health: Another role for counseling psychologists. American Psychological Association, 1978.
- Padilla, A. Pluralistic counseling and psychotherapy for Hispanic Americans. Paper presented at the Conference on cross-cultural counseling and psychotherapy: Foundations, Evaluation and Training. Honolulu. June 1979.
- Paster, V. Organizing primary prevention programs with disadvantaged community groups. In D. Klein, *Primary prevention*, 1977.
- Pederson, P. A cross-cultural coalition training model for educating mental health professionals to function in multicultural populations. Paper presented at the IXth International Congress of Ethnological and Anthropological Sciences. Chicago, Illinois, 1973.
- Pederson, P., Lonner, W., & Draguns, J. *Counseling across cultures*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1976.

- Perry, L. Primary prevention in delinquency: A reconceptualization. Proceedings, Fifth Annual Children's Advocacy Conference, New England Children's Mental Health Task Force, 1979.
- Pierce, W. The comprehensive community mental health movement and the Black community. American Psychological Association, Washington, D.C., 1969.
- President's Commission on Mental Health. *Report to the President*. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1978.
- Ralskin, J., & Stoening, E. Life events, stress, and illness. *Science*, 1976, 194.
- Rappaport, J. *Community psychology: Values, research, and action*. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1977.
- Report of the task force on the status of women in psychology. *American Psychologist*, 1973, 28 (7).
- Ryan, W. *Blaming the victim*. New York: Random House, 1971.
- Sarason, I., & Spielberger, C. *Stress and anxiety*. Washington: Hemisphere, 1976.
- Sarason, S. *The psychological sense of community: Prospects for a community psychology*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1974.
- Sarason, S., Carroll, C., Maton, K., Cohen, S., & Lorenz, E. *Human services and resource networks: Rationale, possibilities, and public policy*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1977.
- Sexism and counseling: Special Issue. *The School Counselor*, November 1976.
- Signell, K. On a shoestring: A consumer based source of person power for mental health education. *Community Mental Health Journal*, 1976, 12 (4), 342-354.
- Spector, G., & Claiborn, W. *Crisis intervention*. Human Science Press, 1973.
- Sprinthall, N. Deliberate psychological education. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1973.
- Sue, D. Counseling the culturally different: A conceptual analysis. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977, 55 (7).
- Taylor, S. Cognitive bases of sex role stereotyping. *Personality and Social Psychology*, 1977.
- Testing: Special Issue. *Journal of Non-white Concerns*, April 1978.
- Tiedeman, D. Can a machine develop a career? Harvard Graduate School of Education, July 1968.
- Turner, N. Cross-cultural competence: A concept with implications for social policy in job training programs. Paper presented at the Society for the Study of Social Problems, September 4, 1978.
- Vandesen, R., & Sheldon, E. The changing status of American women: A life cycle perspective. *American Psychologist*, 1976, 31 (2).
- Verheyden-Hilliard, M. *A handbook for workshops on sex equality in education*. American Personnel and Guidance Association.
- Vernon, McRay. Education's Three-Mile Island: Public Law 94-142. *Peabody Journal of Education*, October, 1981, 59, 1, 24-29.
- Weiss, C. *Evaluating action programs: Readings in social action and education*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1972.
- Weiss, C. *Evaluation research: Methods of evaluating program effectiveness*. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1972.
- Weiss, C. *Marital separation*. New York: Basic Books, 1975.
- White, B. *The first three years*. Edgewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1975.
- White, R. The concept of competence and the psychosexual stages of development. Nebraska symposium on Motivation, 1960. University of Nebraska Press.
- Whitely, J., & Whitely, R. *Divorce film, Part I, II, and Handbook*.
- Ylvisaker, P. *The dean's report to the president*. Harvard Graduate School of Education, 1977.
- Zimpfer, D. *Paraprofessionals in counseling, guidance, and personnel services*. American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1974.

# 6

## Youth Employment: A Past, Present, and Future Issue

Julia P. Davidson  
National Alliance of Business

---

### INTRODUCTION

Perhaps the greatest challenge to our country and to the resolution of its current problems is the continued conservation, restoration, and revitalization of our human resources. The most viable, vital human resource now available to us is our young people. In them we find a tremendous reservoir of talent and energy ready to be tapped and developed. We also have the knowledge, the access to information, and the expertise to tap this resource. There is neither the time nor the excuse to fail in capitalizing on this opportunity.

This chapter is intended to address youth development, specifically the point at which young adults begin to move into the world of work or into further training or education. The full dynamics of the school system (K-12) and of the labor force are not dealt with explicitly here. Instead, the focus is on those youth and young adults who are now receiving great amounts of publicity but for whom all systems have failed in providing adequate support and services: the young, low-income minority citizen.

During the past twenty years, we have witnessed a new responsiveness to the disadvantaged by the federal government, manpower agencies, and



educational entities; they have made significant progress in illuminating the needs of more of this group, and of minorities and women. But the lack of more than marginal success by these efforts with the problems of youth, particularly minority youth, has led to public disenchantment. The low-income, minority citizen is still too often found outside the range of educational and job opportunities, existing services, and agencies. However well-intentioned, these agencies have been minimally effective in responding to the diverse needs of these youth. These needs cannot be defined from a separate and abstract value base but must be defined by the affected youth themselves and through cooperative efforts of the broader groups and institutions seeking to serve them. Education has a role to play in group and community efforts to overcome immediate problems; citizens have the right to participate in institutional decision-making affecting their welfare; government, business, industry, and all sectors of our country have an obligation to exercise every human, technological, educational, and economic resource available in the solution of the critical social problem we are calling youth unemployment.

The rapid social and technological changes that have occurred in this country since the beginning of the twentieth century have brought to the surface a variety of complexities and contradictions that baffle experts and citizens alike. Several disparate forces, including shifts and expansions of populations and their highly mobile characteristics; changes in social units and institutions; changing priorities accompanying technological, scientific, and intellectual discoveries; dwindling of critical natural resources; racial and sexual discrimination, rising unemployment and extension of the educational franchise mandate, all require a redefinition of the needs of youth and young adults, a restructuring of our delivery systems, and a reexamination of how we value and use our human resources.

## Youth and Society

Many young adults and particularly minority youth have demonstrated their latent leadership abilities in traditional and nontraditional ways through their self-government ventures and peer-guidance/gang leadership. They show vision and adaptability through initiation, acceptance, and promotion of change, evaluation skills through rejection and non-participation in institutions and programs that do not meet their needs/interests, economic sense through successful self-help ventures and quality control of products, social consciousness as evidenced by the "Black Power" revolution and Vietnam-protest movement, and their "survival" skills by moving into adulthood without many of the advantages enjoyed by their age peers of other races. For too many of these youths, however, these skills continue to go largely unrewarded, untapped, and even disenfranchised in the traditional educational system and job market. Technology and urbanization have made them expendable. Society no longer needs them, having replaced them in the home by processed food and natural gas and in the labor market by computers and adults (Hruska, 1977).

This obsolescence and devaluation of youth makes it difficult for them to gain a sense of usefulness or to participate actively in all aspects of American society (Pearl, 1978). The rapid pace at which change is occurring in this country and throughout the world appears to mask for some people, particularly those in policymaking positions, the inherent dangers of the exclusion of individuals during their prime: youth and young adulthood. Though civil authorities are "protest-proof" today, few people, young or old, have not felt the effects of the "Youth movement of the 60's." This "idealistic," spontaneous, mass social revolution, which maintained a future orientation, forced many changes upon our society, redirected our economy, and presided over a revolutionary period of "Future Shock" (Toffler, 1970).

During that period, the adult world reflected on the problems of the stepped-up pace of life because of technological acceleration; the shift of populations from rural to urban centers; the new sources of wealth, power, and prestige; the separation of institutions: education, work, and religion; the weakening of their control over the young, and looked to past history for answers and solutions while the younger people took this country to task. The genesis of youth unrest might be pinpointed in 1946 when the postwar baby boom commenced, and to several sequentially related events: the 1954 Brown vs. Board of Education decision; efforts that led to lowering the voting age to eighteen in 1971; the "Southern Manifesto" in 1957; Governor Faubus's attempt to block school desegregation; the 1960 sit-in by four black students in Greensboro, North Carolina; the 1961 "Freedom Riders"; the 1964 Civil Rights Act and Berkeley "disturbances"; the 1965-1970 Black student "riots" culminating in the 1970 Kent State and Jackson State protests in which six students were killed. From this period to the present, young people, and particularly minorities, have rebelled against the inconsistencies, contradictions, and failures of American democratic principles of "Freedom and Justice for All." An analysis of the new "Youth Culture" in "The Report of the President's Commission on Campus Unrest" (1970) summarized it as "a mass social condition, a shift in basic cultural viewpoint."

Importantly, and perhaps the most traumatic impact of the period, was the lack of communication between the youth culture and the adult world. These young people, who rejected the work ethic, materialism, conventional social norms and institutional disciplines became alienated and in opposition to the larger society (Scranton, 1970). This separation was further exacerbated by parents who could no longer serve as guides, as their parents had done for them, because the rapid changes occurring left them with no experiential base to understand the world around them (Mead, 1969). Parent and other adult pressures on youth to conform may account for the memories of sadness and regret described by Hardwick (1979). She describes that troubled proportion of young people who were eighteen in the late sixties as falling within three categories: the "counter culture, (those tempted to self-destruction, hallucinogens, drugs, communes, cults);" "revolutionaries" who found a choice between hiding, police records, death, or exile; and, for those who refrained from either, there was Vietnam, decaying moral values, and corrupted authority.

There are those who view the youth movement as one that generated a great deal of passion but "failed to produce a single new idea" and missed the opportunity to "become a powerful agent of regeneration and genuine social and political change" (Herrera, 1970). Others argue that the gains made by youth of the 60s were not new. The history of American colleges is filled with incidents of student unrest and certainly racism was not a "new" discovery by Blacks. But with the dawn of Black consciousness, a new generation of Blacks began the pursuit of social justice (U.S. President's Commission on Campus Unrest, 1970). More recently we are reminded, and it is disturbing, that we are treating the problems of youth in this highly industrialized society as we did decades ago (Pearl, 1979).

## EDUCATION AND WORK

At the present time we are particularly aware of a trend that views education as a lifetime pursuit rather than a task completed between ages six and twenty-one. Schooling commits itself to provide all students with educational credentials, intellectual insights, and the ability to embrace the need to change and not to resist that change. It follows that we need to emphasize the integrated rather than the fragmented approach to education and recognize that it continues throughout life. We recognize that educational institutions play a major part in preparing individuals for the society in which we live. Their activities and operations must therefore reflect efforts to provide full and equal involvement, if not direct participation of all members of the community. Education has been charged with the socialization as well as the learning tasks of our society. It has been asked, indeed it has offered, to eradicate racism and sexism, to facilitate communication and understanding among all members of the community at all levels and activate new educational processes through constant study and applied experimentation.

That formal education as it now exists, has fallen short in many of these tasks has been documented through many evaluations and analyses. Pearl (1978) states that as presently constituted "they (the schools) may perpetuate inequality, confuse youth about social and economic realities, and contribute to the delinquency problem" (p. 21). The personal freedom and rights granted by parents as youth "mature" are substantially denied in the school environments. Grades, honor rolls, track positions, privileges, and praise are certifications afforded academically successful students, those who excel in sports and extra-curricular activities, and usually those from the middle or upper class (Greenberg, 1978). Blacks, other minorities, and poor youth are not similarly rewarded and suffer even more serious devaluation in the educational arena. While gains have been made, continuing and pervasive racism, myths, stereotypes of broken homes, poor skills, language difficulties, as well as overt criticism and denunciation of minority youth by many teachers make the school a hostile environment. Thus, too many minority youth leave school psychologically long before their physical departure at age fifteen or sixteen.

Clearly, we must reorganize our public education system to more adequately and equitably reach these youth, to develop those skills compatible with their interests and abilities without rigid classification by unfair testing procedures or on racial, religious or economic grounds. "The idea of assembling masses in a centrally located school (factory)" is an earlier industrial model based on the expectation that "young people passing through this educational machine, would emerge into an adult society whose structure of jobs, roles, and institutions resembled that of the school itself" (Toffler, 1970, p. 355). With minor exceptions, this model continues today in both our educational institutions and in the postindustrial society that surrounds us.

The separation of education and work, particularly for young people, has also been punitive. Before the industrial era, young people worked along with their parents and were an integral part of the community. Subsequent changes in the economic and social structure brought about the need for compulsory school attendance and child labor laws that, in addition to their advantages, also excluded children and adolescents from the work place. Youth today have fewer opportunities to see parents and adults in a work situation. Those adults with whom they come in contact are isolated from the world of work. It is no longer possible at the age of fourteen to drop out of school, move into the job market and up the job ladder to successful, rewarding careers. In order to bridge the gap between school and the job young people need help.

Generally it is believed that high youth unemployment is expected and not as serious as if adults were unemployed, and that the high youth unemployment that has continued from the 70s into the 80s is the expected consequence of the postwar baby boom, to disappear when the population of youth in the labor force decreases in the mid-80s. Frequently youth are at a severe disadvantage in seeking employment in that they have no experience, little knowledge of jobs available, are unaware of their abilities or interests, have poor work habits, and experience difficulty with on-job relationships (see Smith and Chemers, 1981, for an extended discussion on this issue).

Additionally, there have been many changes in the hiring practices of employers. The minimum age for hiring is higher than it was twenty-five or thirty years ago. The labor force is better educated and better trained, therefore job requirements are more demanding than they were in the past. Minimum wage laws have been cited by employers as reasons for not hiring youth. Government programs requiring increased paperwork and strict regulations are considered onerous by many employers. Vacation, part-time jobs and "youth" jobs are decreasing. Competition in a tight job market, with increasing numbers of new entrants among women and immigrants and shifts among experienced workers in the field make it extremely difficult for young people to move into the labor force at a time when it is critical for them to obtain that first full-time job.

Black and other minority youth are severely hampered by these strictures in addition to continuing instances of discrimination and limited access. Moreover, the dual-labor market has a significantly negative effect on minorities. Rivlin (1976) describes the primary sector as having

the rewarding, steady and preferred jobs and the secondary sector, which is characterized by low-paying jobs, as having limited advancement and unstable employment. The reasons given for the disproportionate number of nonwhites in the secondary sector are (a) discrimination that limits entry into the primary market and (b) lower educational attainment that limits access to the primary markets because of lack of needed skills or candidates who are judged less trainable by prospective employers. Upward mobility from the secondary market to the primary market (which is the core of our economy) is facilitated (or hindered) by the school and job placement systems to which minorities and their children have access (Harrison, 1972).

Within the past decade considerable efforts have been undertaken to close the gap between school and work. Ironically, these efforts have been far more successful in their provision of more employment for adults. The proliferation and definition of terms such as "career education," "vocational education," "experiential education," "cooperative education," "internship," "apprenticeship," "work-study," "work experience," "service-learning" is confusing at best. The diversity of programs within these categories provides a far longer list. The extension of the educational franchise to the community, technical/vocational schools, two-year institutions, businesses and industry, government agencies, private, nonprofit and not-for-profit groups, voluntary groups and clubs/organizations, as sponsors of these programs has indeed been a positive move. But the lack of coordination and cooperation between and among these groups, particularly as it impacts on the career development of ethnic minorities, is one which has become a recent concern and is beginning to receive needed attention (McDavis and Parker, 1981).

Many federal initiatives since the 60s—including the Manpower Development and Training Act (MDTA), the Economic Opportunity Act (EOA), Title VII of the Civil Rights Act, the Social Security Act, the Career Education Incentive Act and the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA) have attacked the unemployment problems of youth by specifically emphasizing the reversal of these trends for Black and other minority youth. Despite these efforts, minority youth unemployment continues to escalate.

Despite the plethora of studies, conferences, special commissions, task forces, reports, and commentaries that "explain" high youth unemployment, none has yielded satisfactory solutions, particularly for Black and other minorities. A basic concern here is the labeling of minority youth, who are too often required to identify themselves as either hardcore, high-risk, disadvantaged, delinquents, drug/alcohol abusers or juvenile offenders in order to qualify for quality education, meaningful jobs, adequate social services and effective guidance and counseling. So while certain youth are neatly spotlighted by this classification system, they are also held responsible for many of the system's failures.

## Guidance and Counseling

The dilemma of youth, the problems faced by youth and the needs of youth are not insurmountable. We do need to reexamine these needs and



to restructure the delivery of services that can meet them. The resources necessary to provide this response are available and in place. There is definitely a leadership role for guidance and counseling professionals. As noted by Herr (1978), guidance and counseling processes are "major social instruments capable of improving the quality of life for many persons, stimulating life-long learning, facilitating human development, and rehabilitating those on the margin of American education and occupational opportunities" (p. 17).

Guidance and counseling practitioners must constantly reevaluate their view of youth, their understanding of their micro-culture and the most useful approach to working with these youth in changing world. We cannot use the same approaches with disadvantaged youth that were considered effective in the last decade or even last year. Much of what is going on in career guidance and vocational guidance is either obsolete or ignores certain bodies of knowledge to which we now have access. Some knowledge we don't yet have. There is limited knowledge, for example, on what works best for minority youth. The policy questions raised by Green in Chapter 3—whom to serve, how well to serve them, what mix of program aspects young people need, why young people tend not to be where the programs are—are still unanswered.

As both Hays and Green have suggested in earlier chapters, guidance and counseling specialists addressing the school to work transition need to be aware of some important and related issues. In 1978 alone more than 2.5 million youth were unemployed. While some were voluntarily changing from one job to another, many were looking for full-time permanent jobs and could not find them. Males had a more difficult time looking for employment than females; school drop-outs were more likely to be involuntarily unemployed than school completers; and Blacks, Hispanics and Native Americans had overwhelmingly higher unemployment rates than did other minorities and whites. Other changes that have implications for the education, training, and employment of youth are the following: people live longer and work longer; education is a lifetime pursuit; part-time work is a viable option for an increasing number of men and women; and most persons will pursue a series of occupations over a lifetime. In addition to these trends, recreation environments will prosper; service, particularly information processing, will be the biggest business and as executives need to be more open-minded, sensitive, flexible, and adaptive to change, there will be more women executives, and men will find value in taking on those characteristics of empathy previously and incorrectly limited to the female (Mitchell, 1978).

Guidance and counseling programs and practitioners have a long history of being the facilitators and initiators of the kind of changes suggested by these trends. Most education to work objectives "are either completely comprised of the types of knowledge (e.g., *self and career awareness*), attitudes (e.g., personal commitment to work and educational values) and skills (e.g., decision making) which guidance and counseling processes clearly facilitate or such knowledge, attitudes and skills are the mediators of other behaviors; e.g., educational achievement, work adjustment" (Herr, 1978b).



Herr (1978a) concludes that work-focused guidance related to the school-to-work transition should be a developmental extension of career guidance—a process, not an event. Further, his overview of research and development implications for youth affirms that the major transition problems are disproportionately experienced by “certain groups of disadvantaged youth” and points out that career development theory provides little systematic information on the career development of minority group members; thus suggesting that minority group members should be an integral part of the planning and development of these programs.

## Federal Government Initiatives—Knowledge Development

Until recently, the federal government's investment in programs for youth approached more than four billion dollars a year, enough to give every youth between the ages of sixteen to twenty-one \$250 a year, and low-income youth \$750 a year. Still, we don't know how to use federal funds to improve the transition from school to work. Each year, more than a half million youth leave school without completing their high school education. Many of them enter the ranks of the labor force and, unable to find work, become unemployed or discouraged, moving from one job to another trying to find meaningful, satisfying employment. Others stop looking, or never start, knowing that no jobs are available. And while the current unemployment rate for minority youth hovers in the high forties, some cities record youth unemployment at 60 percent (primarily Black males in inner city areas). In an amendment to CETA, The Youth Employment and Demonstrations Projects Act (YEDPA) of 1977 was funded at \$1.5 billion to increase knowledge about how best to resolve these problems. It was expected that the research nature of the Act would yield knowledge about the most effective way to ease the transition from the school to work (Mangum, 1978).

While direct support for youth employment is no longer able to command a high priority under the current administration, it is useful to recall that the exemplary programs proposed under Title IV-A were aimed at knowledge development; ergo, the YEDPA Planning Charter of August 1977 stated:

“Knowledge development is a primary aim of the new youth programs. At every decision-making level, an effort must be made to try out promising ideas, to support ongoing innovation and to assess performance as rigorously as possible. Resources should be concentrated and structured so that the underlying ideas can be given a reasonable test. Hypotheses and questions should be determined at the outset, with an evaluation methodology built in” (p. 5).

The fact that this knowledge base is available is well known to Congress. Despite the current reduction in social services spending, a bipartisan concern for these youth will be reflected in the reauthorization of CETA, due early in 1982. While youth programs will be refocused to provide training in skills needed by labor-short industries, and while

dollars amounts provided will be far smaller, the intent of Congress is clear: to emphasize private sector involvement in the planning and operation of employment and training initiatives at the local level (Pinson-Millburn, 1981).

## The Schools

In trying to address the problem of youth transition, schools have come in for perhaps more than their share of the blame. Some believe that if the schools did well what they were established to do—prepare young people for life after school—retention would improve, youth who graduate would be employable in terms of skills, attitudes and abilities, and would be able to enter and succeed in postsecondary education or to progress in mainstream employment. Others have argued that schools already are fulfilling their mission for most students and that the problems lie primarily in lack of jobs for youth. Still others feel that it is beyond most schools' capacity to deal with hardest-to-reach youth who probably would not benefit in the best of economic times. Often, they look back to an Eden when schools were loved and where responsibility for transmitting the common culture stopped at the school door.

At least four arguments can be made in support of continued effort by the schools:

- *Education is still the best long-term investment:*

Schools are better set up, this argument runs, to transmit the common culture: information, knowledge, ability to reason, the more complex information-processing abilities. These learnings still may make a difference between dead-end work and fuller participation in mainstream work and society. While some persons, this argument continues, are self-learners in a society increasingly rich in informal learning opportunities, for most people school is still the best transmitter of the common culture and the best way to get an education.

- *The business of schools is learning:*

Schools are better able to put youth first, according to this argument, because the business of schools is learners and the business of most businesses is business. Schools are judged by their success in preparing people for life, this argument continues; businesses are judged by their profit and loss sheets. This assumes that schools are better motivated to try harder to help youth, and that the mechanism for large-scale implementation of effective programs is already there: preservice training, a delivery system education, and the enlightened self-interest in putting youth first.

- *Schools provide general socialization to adult life:*

Schools, it is sometimes claimed and sometimes blamed, have more common elements of the workplace and other responsible adult roles than any single job could offer. Socialization in school, this argument continues, includes learning to complete assigned tasks, learning to do one's best, habits of punctuality, the need for good interpersonal relationships, and adaptation to working as an individual within a

hierarchical structure. This socialization, the argument runs, is the best preparation for responsible adults, including workers.

- *Youth attract youth:*

Schools have greatest potential, this argument goes, because of the drawing power of other youth and a preference for associating with age-mates, which is typical in our society. Peer learning, the argument continues, is an almost untapped resource to help the transition from school to work (Datta, 1978).

Finally, as the number of secondary school age youth declines, schools may have more incentive to serve students whose loss had previously made less impact on jobs available for teaching staff. With fewer students to serve in absolute terms, schools may have a better chance, not only to retain but also to succeed with their previous failures. Both educators and employers may be more willing now to cooperate with each other and with training institutions, building on each others' strengths, with more clearly defined roles.

Despite the considerable activity already underway, information for improving policy and practice too often seems to fall short of what is wanted. More is known about the intentions of innovative youth programs than about what is happening in these programs, who is being served, or program quality. Yet more is known about what is happening than about outcomes. And more is known about outcomes than about what caused the results. Too little has been learned from past failures: not enough has been learned from past successes.

Still missing, for example, are detailed statements about the feasibility of different approaches; about what service mix seems essential for program success; about paid versus unpaid in-school and work experiences; about how jobs for youth can be expanded without displacing adults, or about how to assure quality when programs go from thirty or so youth to much larger scale efforts.

While rapidly disappearing into history, YEDPA funds permitted the exploration of a larger number of promising ideas than previously has been possible. In an example of an approach that provided a model of cooperation between education and employment and training systems, the Department of Labor (DOL) contracted with Youthwork, Inc., an intermediary corporation formed by a consortium of private foundations. In 1978-1979 Youthwork awarded grants by a competitive process seeking to identify those programs that present exemplary approaches in four key areas: (a) Career Information, Guidance and Counseling; (b) Academic Credit for Work Experience; (c) Expanded Private Sector Involvement and (d) Job Creation through Youth Operated Projects. A Knowledge Development Agenda for Career Information Guidance and Counseling was developed from the following recommendations (Macy, 1978):

## General Considerations

1. Programs for in-school youth should not rely exclusively on school personnel and resources but should utilize community resources—human and physical—as well.

2. Career guidance programs in general and DOL funded projects in particular should be integrated with the entire educational program for students. This is particularly true when schools are developing competency-based curricula and minimum competency testing for graduation.
3. Knowledge development by DOL Exemplary Demonstration Projects is limited and shaped by (a) the short duration of the projects, (b) the DOL timetable for knowledge development, and (c) the emphasis on demonstrating good practice rather than producing hard research outcomes.
4. The state of knowledge in the field does not provide strong criteria for judging "what works" and "what doesn't work." Knowledge and attitude indicators are not sufficient. Criteria need to be refined in terms of student behavioral outcomes.
5. Some of the most important knowledge gaps in the area cannot be filled with measurements and evaluation techniques available to demonstration projects. More understanding is needed, for example, on how to motivate or coerce students to participate in career guidance programs, and on the relative influence on career/job decision-making of counselors, teachers, fellow students, family, internship supervisors, mentors, etc.
6. Data collection should be carried out from the outset of the project in accordance with a knowledge development design geared to priority information needs.

A number of other reports, studies, and documentaries have analyzed the status of guidance and counseling and made recommendations for improving the practice and delivery of services. Only a few of these have polled youth about their priority issues for youth policy research and action. One recent research project on guidance (Olsen, 1979) found that "urban young people—in and out of school—speak of three critical areas of need for information and guidance: help in planning their futures; help in getting through school; and, help in understanding themselves and relating to others.

## Necessary Program Thrusts in the Future

Young people recognize that various types of information are important for planning and decision making about work and education. Much available occupational information, however, is incomplete and/or distorted. Government agencies, professional and occupational organizations, business, industry, and commercial firms provide information that is often so time-bound or selective that it loses its relevance. At the same time, we have little evidence that furnishing the present type of information to youth helps them with planning. Clearly, students will probably not process the information (if indeed they access it at all) unless they are aware of and stimulated by its relationship to something meaningful in

their current lives or imagined futures (Mitchell, 1978). Young people are desperate for realistic information and real work exposure (whom they will work with, under what conditions, and what it feels like). They need to understand the labor market, workers' rights, union activities, affirmative action, laws that protect them, women and minority problems in the job market and other realities they will face throughout their adult lives (Olsen, 1979). This information needs to be available when the student is ready, at a place it is easily accessible, in a form that is easily digestible and linked to a person (counselor) who can help the student relate the information to his or her characteristics, needs, values, and experiences (Arthur and Ebbers, 1981).

Additionally, young people need planning skills (financial, personal and educational) and decision-making skills (defining problems, assessing resources, determining options, and taking action). Few programs actively teach individuals the components of a sound decision-making process or provide for guided practice of these skills in real life educational or occupational planning. Learning must be related to the learners' current and/or perceived future needs (not those perceived by the teacher or the counselor). Although motivational theories and psychological research have demonstrated that the individual cannot be separated from the social milieu in which he or she functions, we continue to ignore these interrelationships. Therefore, there is a strong need to obtain additional information on the different ways of providing information, how the information changes the behavior of individuals, and how it should be tailored to meet the needs of minorities and low-income youth.

A lack of sociopolitical sophistication (Pearl, 1978) is also expressed by urban young people as a barrier to learning. They feel helpless and angry because they don't acquire skills and don't know how to demand a proper learning environment. Misunderstood or ignored by teachers and other adults, fearful of other students or racial prejudices, they feel themselves at the mercy of dynamics beyond their control (Olsen, 1979). This litany supports the call for counselors and other professionals to become "systemic change agents" and social action lobbyists (Smith, 1978). Schools that value youth must integrate self and societal appreciation and must bring together individual needs and societal needs. To adapt Pearl's (1978) theory of valuing youth to minority youth requires addressing the "whole" range of critical individual and community needs within a cultural context. Minority youth must be provided with a sense of group identification and personal power/control over their lives and future. No longer can education or employment issues be separated from each other or from the many other problems minorities face in this society.

## Societal Factors

Only a few people identify racism, language, and cultural barriers as causes of high unemployment among Blacks and other minorities. And only a few people recognize the critical and chronic nature of minority



youth unemployment. The generalization that youth unemployment will abate because of a tapering off of the size of the youth population is not true for minority youth in the labor force who overwhelmingly come from low-income families and who will experience minimal population decrease.

There have been some efforts made in determining the nature of the problem by disaggregating the labor force population into component parts. *Frictional unemployment* accounts for youth who enter the labor force on a short-term voluntary basis, move from job to job, hold part-time jobs, generally live with their families and basically have no serious economic needs. *Cyclical unemployment* accounts mostly for poor youth, who are usually in school, who move into the job market during the summer, and may include that "discouraged" population lured into the market by a CETA Summer Jobs Program.

*Structural unemployment* accounts for the majority of unemployed minority youth who have been identified as having serious problems of long-term unemployment or who are locked into the secondary labor market characterized by short-term, menial, dead-end jobs. The special nature of the problems associated with this population and intervention strategies to address its needs are the major focus of recent employment studies and reports. This population has also recently become a priority in many employment and training programs because of the inability of previous programs to make any impact on its inherent problems.

A simplistic answer to the employment problem of youth is that there are not enough jobs available or young people qualified to fill the vacancies. These are interlocking forces comprising a complex array of economic factors that tend to become insurmountable when applied to minority youth. The demand factors include the total number of jobs available; employers' requirements and geographic locations of the available jobs; the dual labor market and the "irregular" or "underground economy."

The problem with providing more jobs for minority youth takes on enormous political overtones because the most frequently espoused economic theory is that increasing the number of jobs available causes prices to go up (inflation), bringing more people into the labor market. The least recognized economic theory is that increasing the number of jobs decreases inflation because youth, minorities, and poor people (those most in need of jobs) when employed, tend to spend rather than save, placing their earnings back into the economy, thereby producing a "healthier economy."

Minority youth's chances of finding a job are affected by other factors and issues on the supply side of the labor market. The number of workers available seeking employment (illegal aliens and women), level of education/skill and discrimination in the labor market combine to create the "discouraged" worker and the "irregular" economy.

The illegal immigrant factor (whose reported numbers vary from four million to 12 million) has been presented as affecting minority youth unemployment in two ways: (a) adult aliens take the undesirable jobs that minority youth will no longer accept and (b) employers prefer to hire the foreign-born illegal entrant because that individual is in no position to



complain about pay or working conditions (Herbers, 1979). These and other faulty assumptions are indicative of "blame-the-victim" syndrome, suggesting that a horde of foreigners is invading this country taking jobs from Blacks as well as their own brothers and sisters, draining the economy by using social services without paying taxes and that if all the illegal aliens were removed, these low wages and conditions would suddenly become desirable to unemployed Blacks and other minorities. Massey (1979) points out that the numbers are inflated because it does not take into account (a) the number of aliens who leave the country; (b) illegal aliens very likely pay taxes (65 to 90 percent have social security; income tax is withheld from their checks) and are actually subsidizing the system; (c) many of these alien youth were born in this country and therefore are American citizens and could well be providing supervisory and administrative jobs for other American citizens. Politically, the geographic closeness of the United States and Mexico (which accounts for the largest number of illegal aliens) and the growing U.S. dependence on the vast oil and natural gas deposits in that country makes it difficult for authorities to deal with the fact that it is against the law for them to work, but not against the law to hire them (Jackson, 1979).

The fact that minority youth suffer disproportionately from the impact of unemployment goes unchallenged in its documentation. The structurally unemployed are viewed as malingerers who are refusing to adhere to the American work ethic (Berry & Pine, 1979). Moreover, the hard-core disadvantaged are described by Mangum (1978) as youth, who are poor; minority (cultural disorientation, language difficulties, racial discrimination); lack jobs where they live; and, suffer severe personal problems, arrest or conviction records, drug and alcohol use, lack of motivation, antisocial behavior and severe mental and physical handicaps.

There is no magic answer to completely eradicating the problems of racism and discrimination in the schools, in employment and training programs, or in economic policies or government, but there is evidence to support the mobilization of young people to bring about change. In the late 60s, for example, Black students successfully shifted their targets from the "streets" to the college campuses and demanded that institutions make structural and environmental changes that would meet the needs of Black people. Such political power, combined with job creation (self-employment and performing needed services) and having youth participate in planning for these is an important and necessary ingredient of career development for all students.

It is obvious that resolution of the issues facing young people can more effectively be addressed if it involves them. Youth are capable of originating and assisting in the phases of planning, decision making, and knowledge development that characterize effective school to work transition.

Based on this premise, policy in guidance and counseling as it relates to these youth can be quite straightforward. The following recommendations lend themselves to changes in legislative or executive authorities at the national, state, and local levels, changes that have the potential to release the energies and talents of this country's young people.

# IMPLICATIONS FOR POLICY IN GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

## Recommendation I

Youth development programs should be designed to provide young people the opportunity to assume the major responsibility for planning, implementing, and evaluating the programs. Youth should be trained to deliver services to other youth, to become aware of and capable of initiating effective community resource development and utilization, to do a community need assessment with appropriate planning and follow through, to initiate dialogue with and negotiate for education and training services in the school system and private industry.

*Assumption:* Young minority persons have strengths, skills, and abilities that have not been adequately tapped to provide a systematic way to plan and prepare for the future.

## Recommendation II

Programmatic efforts to address the needs of youth must be comprehensive: family, health, transportation, education, work, leisure, politics, and community development are all interrelated concerns.

*Assumption:* Any attempt to develop skills and abilities to their fullest potential requires a comprehensive approach planned, developed, and implemented by the young people themselves.

## Recommendation III

Any intervention, education, career, guidance and/or counseling must address systemic changes.

*Assumption:* We must recognize that while much of it has gone underground oppression and racism continue. Only a few people identify racism, language, and cultural barriers as causes of unemployment, school dropouts, crime and drug abuse. Current program strategies tend to address "minority youth deficits" rather than the environmental factors that cause them.

## Recommendation IV

Youth employment legislation should be enacted that would be diverse and nontraditional. To incorporate the recommendations above and focus on developing decision making, problem-solving and self-management skills, coping with change and engineering one's career and future, the following major components should be integrated into the legislation:

A. *Counseling and Guidance*

Counseling responsibilities should be delegated mainly to youth with consultation from professionals. They should focus on developing peer networks, self-help groups, advocacy roles. Guidance activities should also include information collecting analyzing and evaluating resource materials and planning dissemination strategies. Counseling and guidance services should also be provided by professionals where indicated and by paraprofessionals, employers, parents, clergy and community lay persons when appropriate.

B. *Parent/Community Involvement*

The development and potential success of proposed legislation is dependent on the support and cooperation from parents and the lay community. These are critical resources that would provide the credentials, reinforcement, and linkages necessary for its accountability as well as its success. They should be an integral part of the planning, development and implementation of this federal initiative at the local level. Although young people would be the key actors, they would utilize consultants for the expertise needed in many areas; would negotiate with parents, school personnel, business, and industry for education and training services; would "broker" the services of other programs and agencies and would provide a resource to help present programs and services in the community.

C. *Business and Industry*

Business and Industry are beginning to focus very actively on forecasting and projecting future needs and services. Their vested interests in increasing profits and improving the quality of the labor supply, combined with a desire to help young people, provide a timely opportunity to use this resource. Business and industry are concerned about youth development as an investment in addition to their commitment to fairness and equality. From the labor market projections for the 1980's, selected companies from the key growth industries should be asked to participate with parents and community in a Futures Employment Task Force. Coordinated planning by the task force would focus on minimizing the problems presently inherent in getting young people into the labor market. The goal would be to design the kind of training and education program that prepares youth for future occupations.

## SUMMARY

These recommendations have been designed to generate some serious thought to the overriding concerns most of our institutions, businesses, industries, government agencies, and individuals have about youth unemployment. The ideas are not unique, untested, or original. The problems we face have been well documented, but federal and local employment/training efforts have yet to register impact on the employment problems of youth.

Those persons involved in identifying social problems and assessing individual needs recognize that effective and lasting response requires programs that are built on quite different rationales, value orientations, and educational/training approaches. Recognition of a "fractured society," a cultural phenomenon that separates Blacks/other minorities and whites, psychologically, socially, and economically is critical if we are to effectively overcome youth unemployment.

The community must be involved in the planning, development, and implementation of the solutions to this problem: A critical social issue that needs to be addressed is the lack of access to useful information by people and groups in urban settings. One reason this problem exists and continues is because current programs do not provide community residents with the technical and human skills to improve their life situations and to develop vital new infrastructures to maintain these important changes.

## REFERENCES

- Arthur J. V. and Ebbers, L. Using Learning Packages to develop job-search readiness. *College Student Personnel Journal*, March 1981, 22, 2, 125-129.
- Berry, J. M., & Pine, A. Jobs goals consensus seen. *New York Times*, 1979.
- Bremmer, R. H. *Children and youth in America. A documentary history*. Vol. III, 1933-1973. Parts 5-7. Cambridge, Mass., 1974.
- Datta, L. E. Knowledge development plan for in-school youth programs. Unpublished paper, Youthwork, Inc., 1978.
- Green, E. *Public forum on the education and employment of high risk youth*. Sponsored by Youthwork, Inc., February 1978.
- Hardwick, E. Domestic manners. *Daldelus*, Winter 1978. A new America? Issues as Vol. 107, No. 1 of the proceedings of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.
- Harrison, B. Testimony before the Senate Subcommittee on Employment, Manpower and Poverty. April 26, 1972.
- Herbers, J. Changes in society holding black youth in jobless web. *New York Times*, March 11, 1979.
- Herr, E. L. *Work focused guidance for youth in transition: Some implications for vocational education research and development*. Occasional paper No. 43, The National Center for Research in Vocational Education, Columbus, Ohio, 1978(a).
- Herr, E. L. The relationship of guidance and counseling to national educational, social and occupational priorities. Unpublished paper. Washington, D.C.: The American Personnel and Guidance Association. 1978(b).
- errera, F. The generation gap and international development. In Brimner (Ed.), *Children and youth in America: A documentary history*. Cambridge, Mass., 1974, pp. 277-279.
- Hruska, J. Obsolescence of adolescence. Unpublished paper, University of Massachusetts, 1976.
- Jackson, J. Illegal aliens big threat to black workers. *Ebony*, May 1979.
- Macy, F. Recommendations of the knowledge development panel on career information, guidance and job seeking skills. Unpublished paper. Youthwork, 1978.
- Mangum, E. *Career education and comprehensive employment and training act*. U.S. Department of Education, February 1978.
- Mangum, E., & Walsh, J. *Employment and training programs for youth: What works best for whom?* Report to the Office of Youth Programs, Employment and Training Administration, U.S. Department of Labor, May 1978.

- Massey, D. S. Hordes of "illegals"? No. *New York Times*, May 31, 1979.
- McDavis, R. and Parker, W. Strategies for Helping Ethnic minorities with career development. *Journal of Non-White Concerns*, July, 1981, 9, 4, 130-136.
- Mead, M. The generation gap. *Science*, CLXIV (April 11, 1969), in. *Children and youth in America, A documentary history*. Vol. III, 1933-1973, Parts 1-4, Cambridge, Mass., 1974, pp. 167-168.
- Mitchell, A. E. Youth and work some random thoughts on issues, problems, and possible solutions. Unpublished paper, 1978.
- Olsen, L. Lost in the shuffle: A report on the guidance system in California secondary schools.
- Pinson-Millburn, N. Alternative Program Resources for Disadvantaged Youth. Falls Church, Va.: Unpublished paper prepared for the NVGA/CETA Project, American Personnel and Guidance Association, December, 1981.
- Rivlin, A. *The unemployment of non-white Americans: The effects of alternative policies*. Background paper No. 11, July 1976. Congress of United States Congressional Budget Office, Washington, D.C.
- Smith, A. and Chemers, M. Misconceptions of motivation of economically disadvantaged employees in work settings. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, March, 1981, 18, 1, 24-34.
- Smith, G. Guidance and counseling with special populations. In *The status of guidance and counseling in the schools*. A series of issue papers, American Personnel and Guidance Association: Washington, D.C., 1978.
- Stern, B. E. A proposal for high school entitlements. *School Review*. University of Chicago: May, 1978.
- Toffler, A. *Future shock*. New York: Random House, 1970.
- U.S. Department of Labor, A Planning charter for the youth employment and demonstration projects act of 1977, August 1977, Washington, D.C.
- U.S. President's Commission on Campus Unrest. In *Children and Youth in America. A documentary history*. Vol. III, 1933-1973, Parts 1-4. Cambridge, Mass., 1974, pp. 169-173.

# 7

## Counseling Services for Adults: New Linkages in the Community

Paul Franklin and Francis U. Macy  
National Center for Educational Brokering

---

Educational and occupational counseling services are expanding outside of educational institutions. Community agencies and independent organizations constitute a growth sector for the guidance and counseling field. Since the clientele, staff, and package of services are different from those in schools, colleges, and universities, community-based information and counseling services deserve a chapter devoted to their particular contributions, prospects, and policy needs.

The delivery of personal support services from a base in the community is certainly not a new phenomenon. The Employment Service, vocational rehabilitation programs, manpower programs, and a score of other human service agencies have long recognized the need to decentralize service delivery and extend into the communities where their clients live.

What is a phenomenon of the 1980s, however, is the growth of occupational and educational information and counseling services that operate independently from the educational systems as community outreach services linking adults to educational resources. A diverse lot, with varied clientele in a host of locally appropriate settings, these services have a



strikingly similar set of functions (Heffernan, 1979). With changing demographics and employment needs in the 1980s, they are expected to play an increasingly important role in assisting adults in making appropriate occupational and educational choices at many points in their lives.

This chapter describes community-based counseling services as they exist currently and offers some policy and research recommendations believed necessary for these services to more closely approximate their potential in the 1980s.

## COMMUNITY-BASED COUNSELING SERVICES: THE CONTEXT

The 1970s witnessed a significant broadening of the concept of education. New clientele were enfranchised and a new legitimacy extended to learning opportunities previously viewed with suspicion if not indignation by tradition-oriented educators. One of the more poignant effects of this redefinition was the recognition that not all legitimate learning occurs within classroom walls and between the ages of five and twenty-five. As new populations emerged as legitimate consumers of educational opportunity, so too did recognition that they need assistance in taking advantage of those opportunities.

A major conclusion from a study of thirty large-scale surveys of adult learning interests and barriers was that adults are quite clear in their desire for more and better information on educational opportunities, and many want a wider range of counseling services than is now usually provided (Cross & Zusman, 1978). It was further found that educationally disadvantaged groups have more interest in counseling than more educated people (Cross, 1978).

The prospective adult learner or the adult desirous of making a career change or reentering the labor force after a prolonged absence did not have easy access to support services. One of the critical populations to be educationally enfranchised in the 1970s, adults are outside the structures where career and educational counseling normally occur (Schlossberg, 1974; Jacobsen, 1979). Put another way, there is no place where adults "hang out"—like the schools for the young—that provides the structure suitable for delivery to them of comprehensive educational and occupational information and counseling services.

Schools and colleges rightfully concentrate services on those already enrolled or are anticipating enrollment in the given institution. Even when they reach out to potential adult students, as in Women's Resource Centers, institutionally based counselors can find their primary allegiances and missions standing in the way of serving that client and his or her needs. They sometimes feel pressure to recruit that individual rather than refer him or her to another institution that might be more appropriate. (See Levin, 1981, for a departure from this trend in given career development centers located on some campuses.)

It was noted, for example, in a study of 500 college-based support programs serving the needs of women that "some so-called 'services for women'

get caught in the vested interests of the institution so that the program becomes a recruiting vehicle, say, for new students or clients. . . . Many women's programs in institutions are, in fact, little used by the adult public" (Mawson, 1979).

Similarly, traditional human service agencies have their own parameters that often limit their ability to offer the broad array of educational and occupational services necessary to meet adults' needs. Employment Service offices, for example, are best equipped to assist individuals in locating a job in a field she/he is already prepared to enter (Jacobson, 1979). This service is too limited to meet the full needs of such people as those making career transitions—a population estimated to be as high as 36 percent of the American population between the ages of sixteen and sixth-five (Arbeiter & Associates, 1978).

## COMMUNITY-BASED COUNSELING SERVICES: AN OVERVIEW

Community-based occupational and educational counseling services have emerged to meet the special needs of adults. Located in sites that are easily accessible to their clients, these new services are grounded in a spirit of consumerism. *Client needs* are placed at the forefront of service delivery with "... making adults stronger, more self-motivated and self-directed learners" the goal (Cross, 1978). Their distinctive nature is found in their purposes, locations, and staffing. As Heffernan aptly characterized them,

Community-based services are committed first and foremost to the needs of local communities and individuals rather than to the needs of institutions. They seek to serve community members at large with information, referral and counseling services, and target populations with special services such as tutoring or rural outreach. Community-based services utilize sites which are easily accessible to their clients, such as storefronts, libraries, and mobile vans. Only in special circumstances would they be located on college campuses. Their staffs typically are local people who, as part of the community, keep in daily job and social contact with other local people and with community needs. They usually are not "career-mobile" professional counselors (Heffernan, 1979).

At the close of 1978, the National Center for Educational Brokering surveyed more than 700 programs and agencies that were providing information and counseling to adults. From these, 302 were found to be offering a full range of educational brokering services in a comprehensive and impartial fashion. At least one third of the programs had more than one physical site and thus services were offered in a total of 433 sites. These brokering services were identified in forty-nine states, the District of Columbia, and Puerto Rico. They were unevenly distributed throughout the country, with the largest number on the east coast and the west coast with New York boasting forty-two programs, California twenty-two, Pennsylvania nineteen, and Texas sixteen. Thirty of the states were found to have four or more programs. Only twelve of these programs can trace their history back more than ten years, into the 60s or earlier.

All of the programs identified in the NCEB study offer services to members of the community, are located in accessible situations and tend to be sponsored by a wide variety of organizations and institutions. Approximately 131 of the brokering programs are conducted by independent community agencies. Of these, forty-seven are organizations devoted exclusively to the provision of counseling and information to adults. Another eighty-four of the programs are conducted by community agencies, cultural, ethnic, or religious organizations that have a variety of services including educational brokering. Examples of the latter group include: YM-YWCAs, libraries, the Hopi Tribe, Jewish Social Services, and the League of United Latin American Citizens. Another seventeen programs are sponsored by coalitions of these organizations and local government and school districts.

In the late 1970s, there was an increase in the sponsorship of educational brokering activities by postsecondary institutions, often in consortial arrangements. Over two thirds of some 150 programs connected with one or more postsecondary institutions are supported by federal funds. The institutions act primarily as fiscal agents; the services are often offered off campus at community sites by personnel not from the institution's staff but hired specially for this purpose. The principal federal agencies are the Talent Search and Educational Opportunity Centers Programs of the former U.S. Office of Education Student Services Division, often referred to as the "TRIO" Program. Others are funded by the Continuing Education and Community Services Program known as Title I of the Higher Education Act. Still others are supported by the Fund for the Improvement of Postsecondary Education.

In 1978, the National Center for Educational Brokering collected data indicating that these brokering programs served a total of approximately 866,000 clients. While this does not include client figures for all 302 identified programs, it does include as the largest single clientele some 146,000 clients of the 132 Talent Search Programs (*Bulletin*, National Center for Educational Brokering, February 1979, 4(2)).

The growth of community-based support services for adults making mid-life career decisions is expected to continue in the 1980s (Brown, 1981). The National Center identified more than thirty programs that had been first established in 1978. The growing support for such programs from the federal and state governments will lead to their expansion. This growth in programs is a response to the significant need described by K. Patricia Cross:

"One of the greatest needs in a society with a rich variety of learning resources and a potential constituency of millions is to make the necessary connections between learners and resources" (Cross, 1978).

## CLIENT CHARACTERISTICS AND NEEDS

In assessing the role that community-based services have come to play in linking adult learners with learning resources, it is important to ask "Who are the clients and what are their needs?" Answering this question

takes on added significance when it is remembered that it is the *expressed needs* of clients that is the point of departure for delivering services.

As a group, the clients of community-based agencies vary in different communities. Heffernan notes, for example, that "Agency studies indicate widely varying profiles according to age, sex, race, SES and needs expressed" (Heffernan, 1979).

Given those variations, practitioners indicate that certain patterns do exist, however. Again, Heffernan summarizes those patterns:

Essentially two age groups, the late twenties to mid-thirties and the early forties, tend to dominate. Very few older clients and few school age clients are seen. Female clients have tended to outnumber male clients about two to one. Storefront agencies attract lower-class ethnic populations, and agencies with high fees attract upper-class populations (Heffernan, 1979).

Regardless of demographic characteristics, practitioners indicate that the primary concerns of adult clients are with jobs and careers. Most of those seeking service are currently employed and are seeking either to change fields or to change the level or status in their present fields (Arbeiter, 1978). As a result, the pursuit of additional education is not generally considered as an end unto itself but as a potentially propitious, if not necessary, step for attaining a higher career level or for making the transition to a new field.

This consistent emphasis on job and career is one of several adult client needs that practitioners indicate is relatively consistent among clients. Others include:

- Adults tend to be place bound, which limits their ability to go great distances to pursue a learning opportunity or seek desired employment.
- Time and cost considerations tend to be seen as important limitations when considering educational alternatives.
- Family roles and responsibilities are often perceived as major obstacles to pursuing additional education, particularly for women.
- Clients' inquiry skills tend to be rusty or underdeveloped, making it difficult for them to seek information on their own and process it in making decisions.
- Many harbor a love-hate relationship with schools, resulting from poor past experiences or a belief that education is for the young, making it difficult for them to see education as a viable alternative. (Arbeiter, 1978; Cross, 1978; Cross, 1979; Franklin, et al., 1979; Heffernan, 1979; Jacobson, 1979).

Additionally, clients seeking career changes can be further characterized by one or more of the following:

- Dissatisfaction with their present situation without a sense of how to change it.
- Unfamiliarity with setting up concrete goals and then going about attaining them.
- A lack of self-confidence and self-esteem, being more aware of their weaknesses than they are aware of their strengths.
- Unwillingness to take risks.

- Inability to describe what they are good at, or what they are bad at; what they need; or where they want to go.  
(Frederickson, Macy, Vickers, 1978)

Practitioners generally classify these client needs into the four categories of *awareness* needs, *empowerment* needs, *action-taking* needs and *follow-through* needs, which are defined below:

*Awareness Needs:* Clients' need for knowledge of educational and career options and how those options relate to their own abilities, interests, and goals.

*Empowerment Needs:* Clients' needs for ways to begin to do things for themselves, to become independent of counselors and institutional directives.

*Action-Taking Needs:* Clients' needs to move ahead, to plan, to strategize, and actually do something about career and life situations.

*Follow-through Needs:* Clients' needs to receive additional assistance and support at critical junctures after pursuing a course of action. (Franklin et al., 1979).

Practitioners point to the importance of *differentiation* in the provision of services to meet the particular needs of individual clients. Moreover, they indicate the importance of special efforts to attract and meet the needs of particular client sub-groups that have been traditionally left out of the educational mainstream. Educational dropouts, minority populations, those isolated from education—rural or ghetto populations—and displaced homemakers, to name a few, are among traditionally underserved populations for which special outreach efforts must be made and more concerted services targeted if they are to benefit from the availability of services. Simply providing services generally will not be enough to attract those with little or no experience in education or in seeking assistance in making occupational and/or educational choices.

In sum, the service needs of adult clients tend to be distinguishable from those of younger consumers of occupational and educational information and counseling services. Adults as compared with adolescents tend to see more hurdles between themselves and a new course of action, whether that action results directly in career change or entry into post-secondary education. Helping them to overcome those hurdles and develop or hone inquiry skills are the key tasks of community-based agencies.

## Meeting Client Needs: Core Services

The services of community-based agencies are commonly known as educational brokering activities. To practitioners, the term "educational brokering" is more than a hollow and faddish euphemism for describing conventional counseling practices. Rather, it is a concept whose definition helps to distinguish the services of community-based agencies from those of conventional practices. Terms like "neutrality," "client centeredness," "client empowerment," and "client advocacy" are conceptual cornerstones of educational brokering and are seen as distinguishing features of the services rendered by those who subscribe to the concept.



Functionally, educational brokering can be defined as:

- Helping clients *to define their goals* through self-assessment, value clarification, occupational exploration, and long-term planning;
  - Helping clients *to set objectives* for pursuing further education; including assessing whether formal education or other forms of learning are appropriate;
  - Helping clients in *gaining access* to appropriate learning opportunities, including advocating on their behalf with institutional personnel for admission, financial aid and credit for prior learning.
- (Heffernan, Macy, & Vickers, 1976)

While the actual service mix and emphases employed in carrying out their functions vary among agencies, there are generally six core services: (a) information-giving, (b) assessment, (c) referral, (d) counseling and advising, (e) advocacy, and (f) outreach.

*Information-giving* may involve descriptions of and procedures for gaining credit for previous learning; availability and scheduling of local course offerings; procedures for applying for financial aid; information on local or regional labor market conditions; and/or information on educational requirements for certain jobs.

*Assessment* may involve diagnosis of basic skills, personal and vocational aptitudes or interests or analysis of job and learning skills. *Referral* may include directing clients to those educational institutions, informal learning opportunities, or other community, social service agencies (such as employment, mental health, legal aid) most likely to meet their needs and characteristics. *Counseling and advising* might focus on career exploration, life planning and personal decision-making, educational choice-making or working out problems associated with returning to school (such as family resistance, child care, and study habits).

*Advocacy* may entail seeking, in behalf of clients, educational credits or other institutional recognition of prior formal learning or of competencies attained on the job; working out a special major; getting around formal admission policies; helping clients secure financial aid; or securing changes in institutional policies for part-time students or in their scheduling practices and course offerings for adults. *Outreach* activities are instrumental in making prospective clients aware of the availability of services. While a variety of outreach techniques are utilized, the more common include publicity through local media, visits to shopping centers or actual delivery of services via branch offices or itinerant counselors.

## Adults: Important Distinctions in Information Needs

The following points raised by Heffernan (1980) should be considered when information resources and data systems are being utilized with adults.

1. Because adults are more restricted with respect to times and places for learning activities and career moves, they require information that is highly detailed regarding local learning resources and em-



ployment opportunities. For example, statewide or nationwide labor market statistics are less useful to adults bound to one region than is detailed information on local employers that might include such things as openings and growth projections; their acceptance of workers with nontraditional career patterns; training and advancement opportunities; availability of flexible work schedule arrangements with availability of transportation and/or day-care services. Important, too, for adults is the simple physical accessibility of the information: telephone services, shopping mall offices, and remote computer terminals are far more important incentives for adults to use information than they are for youth.

2. Adults' prior learning and work-experience histories mean that they require information on transferable skills and credentials and on the potentials and procedures for occupational crossovers. Capacities for assessing formal, nonformal, job-based, and job-relevant learning are also necessary components for an information system.

Perhaps equally important for adults is to unlearn prior skills or job-hunting approaches before they can develop new techniques. Just as adults have established work skills and capabilities they also have established habits, some nonproductive, for job-searching or inquiry and planning. Youth typically do not have such impediments to overcome. Thus, adults' interviewing, resume writing, study skills, and information-processing procedures must be more consciously and directly dealt with as part of information-giving, at a far more precise "how-to" and "how-not-to" level.

3. Adults, whether they are career-changers or new entrants to the labor market, typically do not want the same kinds of entry-level job information as youths. They need to know about such things as middle- and upper-level salary ranges, "transition trade-offs" (what they can gain or lose by changing job fields) and relationships between education/training and salaries or advancement. They need to know about family benefits—medical, dental, maternity—and about retirement plans, profit-sharing plans, day-care services, and relocation policies that are of relatively less concern to entry-level youth. They also need to have detailed information on licensure and certification requirements in certain occupations; i.e., reciprocity agreements, relicensing costs, anticipated changes in requirements. Finally, adults require information on the "work-place lifestyle" that is associated with various careers; e.g., the social ambience of the work-place, the authority/responsibility climate, characteristics of colleagues, opportunities for leadership, retention/turnover information. Indeed, for adults who have a basis for comparison, the elements of "work-place lifestyle" may figure more strongly in their decisions to change or begin a career than most other factors, but surely more than for youths who are just entering the labor market.
4. The fact that adults are no longer part of the formal schooling system means that they require information on nonformal as well as traditional learning opportunities. Information on traineeships, non-institutional learning and self-directed study, and on flexible scheduling and part-time opportunities in traditional institutions

are more important for adults than for youth, given their time and place restrictions. Also important is information on support services for adult learners and/or career changes; e.g., resources in the community, informal support networks, or organizations which provide counseling, tutoring, financial help and "human touch" support for adults in transition. While youth may have access through school programs and peer activities to such support systems, adults' access is less structured. Adults typically do not access institutionalized counseling support so the information systems that they utilize must have components that help them with self-assessment and self-directed planning. Moreover, the information system inquiry-procedures—the probes, the sequence of self-exploration steps—must be "multiportal" and flexible for adults. For instance, rather than starting a career-planning sequence with values clarification or life-time goals, many adults start with the identification of marketable or transferable skills or salary levels and ceilings. Yet a number of the computerized information systems and prepackaged planning sequences do not permit starting at these points of entry. Finally, with respect to their information-accessing skills, adults may also need to have information materials available in several media—needle-sort decks, telephone tapes, remote terminals, loose-leaf directories—to account for differences in self-confidence, readiness, or desires for anonymity (Heffernan, 1-3)."

## STAFFING: SELECTION AND TRAINING

The internal operations of community-based agencies are generally nonhierarchical and find staff filling a variety of roles. Staff members working daily with clients are most often drawn from the community and selected to be representative of the populations they will serve.

Practitioners indicate that they place emphasis on hiring staff who are "natural counselors" and who also know the community. The title "counselor" is sometimes avoided and preference given to "education adviser," "learning consultant," "career consultant," "adult learning advisor," and the like. Professional credentials are usually not the major consideration in staff selection, although they are not shunned as a matter of course. (Frequently the director of a service has a master's degree in counseling.) Rather, the emphasis is on selecting people with the background and the personal characteristics that are appropriate for the particular clientele and the services provided to them.<sup>1</sup> These are qualities that cannot be quickly trained but are developed in the course of living.

Some of the characteristics and qualities that community-based services often seek in candidates for counseling positions include problem-

---

<sup>1</sup>The selection criteria employed in hiring staff in a number of community-based programs are described in *Educational Brokering: New Services for Adult Learners*, by Heffernan, Macy, & Vickers, 1976.

solving resourcefulness, self-awareness, self-confidence, flexibility, tolerance, empathy, interpersonal warmth, political sophistication, comfort with authority, experience with bureaucracies, optimism, workplace wisdom, parenthood, and ethnicity (Vickers, 1973).

In addition, specific competencies are needed for each task to be performed by staff members. Administrators for these programs need to list the tasks and functions their staff will perform and define the competency needed. A study by the Syracuse University School of Education and the National Center for Educational Brokering identified five generic functions that are found in virtually every community-based counseling service:

1. Informing the public
2. Informing the client
3. Counseling the client
4. Referring the client
5. Advocating for the client

Each of these functions has a number of tasks and requires several competencies. For example, the counseling function requires such competencies as establishing rapport, fostering self-awareness and understanding, identifying problem/goal for counseling, keeping records. Likewise, the advocacy function has specialized competencies such as identifying advocacy needs, taking action for individuals, taking action for groups, promoting self-awareness and self-advocacy.

A careful definition of competencies permits the managers of adult counseling services to design in-service training programs tailored to the specific competencies needed and lacking by the staff. The Syracuse-NCEB study produced by this method a publication in 1980 entitled, *A Manual for the Selection and Training of Counselors of Adults*.

A number of other counselor training programs were developed in the late 1970s using competency analysis. At Florida State University, a team of faculty members produced for the U.S. Employment Service a self-administered training program for employment counselors based on competencies in eight major areas:

- Relationship Skills
- Career Development
- Group Counseling and Guidance
- Individual and Group Assessment
- Community Relations
- Continuity of Service
- Accountability and Productivity
- Professional Development

Dr. Allen Ivey at the University of Massachusetts in Amherst has produced a series of videotaped instructional materials keyed to a set of counselor competencies. The competency approach is gaining adherents and most certainly will characterize training in the 1980's. Many states, including Washington and New York, have been moving towards a requirement for competency-based certification and training of counselors.

## SOURCES OF PROGRAM SUPPORT

The 302 educational and occupational counseling services identified by the National Center for Educational Brokering had budgets in 1978 totalling more than \$25 million. This figure would be substantially higher if "in kind" contributions were counted from the many sponsoring agencies that often provide space, equipment, published resources, printing facilities, or staff. The cash income of these programs is derived from a wide variety of government, foundation and corporate grants, private contributions, and user fees. Most programs make use of a mix of these sources and are continually seeking greater financial stability and the means to expand operations in response to demand.

The largest source of financial support is from federal programs through direct grants (as in the TRIO, Fund for the Improvement of Postsecondary Education, and other Higher Education programs) and through state government programs (the continuing education, vocational education, Adult Education and CETA programs).

A second major source of financial assistance is state government grants and contracts, emanating from Boards of Higher Education, Departments of Labor, Displaced Homemakers Programs, manpower development offices, health and rehabilitation services and human resources departments.

A third source of funding is local public and private funding. In the public sector, city and county government, including CETA prime sponsor offices, city school districts, and library and welfare systems are examples. From the private sector, funds have been made available from businesses, foundations, the United Way, local fund drives, and user fees (*Bulletin*, National Center for Educational Brokering, February 1979, Vol. 4, No. 2).

Federal and state support to community-based adult counseling services increased at the end of the 1970s with the passage in 1976 of the Educational Information Centers program as an amendment to the Higher Education Act. The EIC legislation provides federal grants to each state submitting an approved plan to develop, extend, and support guidance, counseling, referral, and information services for all its residents. This new legislation establishes as a federal public policy that *all* citizens with needs have the right to information and counseling services to facilitate their educational and occupational decisions.

In the first year of grants under the EIC program (Fiscal Year 1978), the \$2,000,000 appropriation was divided among forty-four participating states, each of which received some \$35,000. In the second and third years of the program, the appropriation was increased to \$3,000,000 awarding to forty-eight participating states and five territories \$50,000 each except for the six largest states that received up to \$120,000. This small scale funding was sufficient to establish in each state a new position of "Educational Information Centers coordinator" and to conduct surveys of information needs and information and counseling services in each state. The responsibility for the EIC program was, in the vast majority of states, assigned to the postsecondary education commission that has comprehensive planning responsibilities. In at least six states responsibility was

placed in the state student aid commission. In a few states, the state library system was the lead agency.

In the second and third years of the EIC program, the appropriation was not sufficiently large to enable state governments to provide significant financial assistance to stimulate local counseling programs. Small federal grants were used in a number of states to collect or support the collection of educational information on a statewide basis and to disseminate it to local counseling programs. In twenty other states telephone hot lines were established to provide up-to-date educational information to both counselors and individual users. Several states made plans to provide training to local counseling service personnel in order to upgrade their services. To stretch their dollars and impact, the EIC coordinators in most states collaborated closely with the director of the State Occupational Information Coordinating Committees, the governor's manpower office, the Employment Security Office, the Continuing Education program, and the Vocational Education program.

## POLICY AND RESEARCH RECOMMENDATIONS

The first set of recommendations to be made as a consequence of the foregoing discussion are seven program actions that would significantly improve the services to adults facing the need to make educational and occupational decisions. One of these recommendations is directed to the federal government alone; one to the federal and state governments; two to state governments, and three to both state governments and community agencies and institutions.

1. *Increase federal appropriations for Educational Information Centers Program.* No single federal or state action would have a greater impact on the availability of educational/career support services for adults than a strengthening of the EIC program inaugurated through the Education Amendments of 1976. Because federal funds are provided to the states for planning, coordination and support services to counseling, referral, and information services, these federal dollars have a high degree of leverage in their impact on local conditions. The state is required by law to match half of the federal funds. Furthermore, the state EIC program coordinator is required by federal regulation to coordinate that program with other federal/state programs that are supportive of guidance and counseling referrals and information. Experience has already shown that the coordinator can help channel other federal funds as well as EIC funds to the aid of local counseling services. The federal EIC appropriation should be increased by one or two million dollars per year until it reaches the level of ten to fifteen million dollars. This level of funding would assure that each state could effectively achieve the legislation's intent.

2. *Make federal/state student financial assistance programs more broadly available to adult learners.* Prospective adult learners, particularly those with low levels of educational attainment, cite the cost of learning opportunities as a significant barrier to their participation (Arbeiter, 1978;



Cross, 1978). Federal student assistance programs do make eligible those enrolled at least half-time, which has helped to extend aid to many adult learners, but many adult learners attend school less than half-time.

The extension of eligibility for students enrolled less than half-time, notably in the Basic Educational Opportunity Grant Program (BEOG), would help enfranchise a considerable segment of the adult population who do not now participate in education: those with low educational attainment—and those who, even if they desired to, could participate less than half-time.

Beyond modifying eligibility criteria for federal assistance programs, there is perhaps an even more demonstrable need for states to modify eligibility criteria for state financial aid programs. Stimulated by the federal Grants for State Student Incentives (SSIG) subpart of the Higher Education Amendments of 1976, most states now operate student financial aid grant programs. By priority, however, if not by law, they focus aid on full-time students only; a group that, almost by definition, excludes adult learners.

In a society that places great policy emphasis on equal educational opportunity, the import of extending financial aid more broadly to adults, without regard for enrollment level, is even more clear. Financial assistance is one of several services necessary to realize the extension of education to poorly educated adults who, as a group, participate at a far lower level than their more educated counterparts. Indeed, research persistently indicates that there is a growing gap between poorly educated and well-educated adults and without broad-targeted extension of financial assistance and other services to underserved populations, "... the more will the well-educated with the motivation, the information network access, and the money increase their educational advantage over the poorly educated" (Cross, 1978).

Increased financial assistance targeted to adult learners coupled with greater availability of information and counseling services are keys to reversing this trend.

3. *Create state positions of "lifelong learning coordinator."* Several states have used federal planning funds or their own funds to establish a position of lifelong learning coordinator. State officials in these positions are able to engage in comprehensive planning for adult learning needs—including both instruction and support services—regardless of their educational specialties. They are able to study and coordinate the use of federal and state funds from a large number of different programs that impact on adult learners. The remaining states would benefit by establishing such positions. The incumbent might also have responsibility for administering the Educational Information Centers program or supervise someone with this responsibility.

4. *Improve dissemination of financial aid information to adults.* State-wide surveys of adult learning needs and barriers have dramatically demonstrated that adults have very little information on the financial aid for which they are eligible from their employers, from the states and federal government and from individual educational institutions. At the same time, the largest barrier cited by these adults to their resumption of learning is the cost of education. State governments should "package"



and disseminate information specifically tailored for potential adult learners and provide such information directly and indirectly through local brokering activities.

5. *Make high school information and counseling services available to adults.* Adults, particularly those who are least experienced in education, indicate that a high school open at night and on weekends would be a suitable place to receive information and counseling assistance (Cross, 1978; Parente, 1981). To be sure, high schools are relatively accessible to everyone and they have many of the informational resources that would be useful to adults making educational and occupational decisions. Computerized career information systems, for example, are primarily found in high schools, thus making them generally unavailable to adults. Yet, much of their information content would be as useful to adults as it is to high school students if adults had greater access to it.

To effectively meet adult information and counseling needs, however, some modification in a high school's regular guidance program would be required. First, services would have to be made available at night and on weekends—the times when adults have the most opportunity to break away from job and/or family responsibilities.

Counselors would have to be trained to meet the particular needs of adults. Perhaps, in addition to regular guidance staff as the primary means of delivering services to adults, adjunct staff would need to be hired. Peer counselors or volunteers, paraprofessionals or CETA-sponsored employees, could be used to assist regular guidance staff in serving this new clientele.

New connections within and among educational providers would need to be made, as well. Staff would need to relate to Adult Basic Education programs, courses and programs offered in the community (e.g., YMCA), and programs that allow part-time students, as well as their normal connection with institutional admission offices. They would need to be able to deal with those making or thinking about career changes as well as those entering the labor market for the first time. Finally, a concerted effort would need to be made to make adults comfortable in coming to the high school for services.

Most of the changes necessary for high schools to become a point of service for adults can be achieved without great expense. Rather, the greatest hurdle may be in getting schools to refocus their missions so that providing counseling and information services to adults becomes a legitimate activity. The Educational Information Centers program could play an instrumental role in this process by developing models by which high schools can serve adults cost effectively; stimulating such services, training staff, and providing additional information resources to augment existing sources.

6. *Develop adult information and consultation services in Public Libraries.* Libraries are natural homes for educational and occupational advisory services. They offer facilities that are visibly accessible in center cities and neighborhoods. They enjoy the neutrality needed for an impartial brokering service. Necessary resources are either on hand or available through normal acquisition channels and budgets. What they generally lack is a priority in dispensing educational and occupational information

and advice. Their staffs have not been trained for the proactive brokering role, but they could be, or—even more desirable—counselors could be hired for this role (National Center for Educational Brokering, 1979).

7. *Increase the capabilities of human service agencies to perform brokering functions.* Many traditional human services agencies could well improve their ability to meet the broad array of service needs of the adult learner and career changer if they were given new support and organizational flexibility. While the structural and service modifications necessary to achieve this end will vary among agencies, the common needs are for staff training, stronger information resources and improved interaction among service agencies in a local community (see Goodman, 1981, for an excellent discussion on this potential.)

A local women's resource center, for example, may be good at relating with clients and advocating on their behalf but might have little information about the array of educational and occupational alternatives available to their clients. While they may do well in referring clients to certain other agencies for appropriate services, they may lack the skills and/or information necessary to make informed referral to all of the agencies or institutions that may offer services to clients. Moreover, they may not know how to help clients overcome the "social service shuffle" that often occurs when clients are referred from one agency and then shuffled to another (and another) without ever having their needs met.

A well-financed Educational Information Center program could serve as a focus for delivering additional staff training, providing information and promoting better interaction among extant service agencies. Even with limited resources, several state EICs are beginning to play these roles and are indicating positive results. In Iowa and New Mexico, for example, EIC funds are being used to improve the information resources and staff skills of local organizations interested in brokering services. Traditional human service agencies can be expected to encounter large numbers of prospective adult learners and career changers in the 1980s. Helping these agencies to understand the needs of this clientele and deliver client-centered educational and occupational services would serve to better meet adult needs without developing an entirely new social service network.

The second set of recommendations is directed to the National Institute of Education and concerns research which should lead to improvements in information and counseling services for adult learners and career changers.

1. *More research into the patterns of adult career transition.* Are there critical junctures or identifiable developmental stages that spark adult transitions? Are there consistently identifiable, propitious interventions that can be made to help adults through those transitions and improve their ability to deal with transitional stages? Better understanding of these issues could lead to development of new techniques for helping adults assess their interests and options at various crucial junctures in life.

2. *More empirical research in the transfer of skills among occupations.* A key to assisting adults in making career transitions is in identifying

what skills they have and how those skills transfer to new occupational areas, as well as what additional occupational areas would open up with particular skill-competency development. Too little is currently known about occupational skill transferability for individual assessment to be done systematically. Beyond research, there is a need to support development and testing of systematic approaches to the assessment of effective skill transferability in work environments (Papalia and Kaminski, 1981).

3. *Study of the influences of different types and mixes of information media and information networks on adult participation in educational opportunities.* This effort could lead to better understanding of what information delivery models work best in stimulating adults, particularly educationally disadvantaged adults, to participate in education. Computerized career information systems would likely be appropriate mechanisms to use in developing and testing such an approach and as one of the services whose effectiveness needs to be compared.

4. *In-depth study of why educationally disadvantaged adults lack motivation to pursue educational opportunity.* If realistic plans are to be formulated to increase the participation of underserved populations, more must be known about how to motivate them to pursue education (Cross, 1978). Such information needs to be available for different subpopulations classified on race, ethnicity, sex, SES, and other bases.

## SUMMARY

The greatest number of career and educational counselors and their clientele will, in the 1980s, no doubt continue to be located in the schools of our nation. Postsecondary educational institutions will also be important counseling sites and may, if budgets permit, expand support services for a growing number of students past the traditional college ages. Community-based services, targeted to adults who have not applied or registered at educational institutions, can be expected to continue to increase in number and kind. Educational institutions would well serve their own interests and the interests of their prospective students if they continue to increase their sponsorship and support of community-based counseling services. Greater government support to community services will be important. By the end of the 1970s, all but two state governments had undertaken to establish and support networks of educational information centers. Greater financial support from the federal government and resourceful leadership at the state level will foster the proliferation of educational and occupational support services to reach those adults poorly served by the traditional educational system. An improvement in the quality of these services will be significantly enhanced by further research into the area of adult learning and advisement. The gap in educational levels of American citizens will continue to grow—with unfortunate social consequences—unless there is an increase in the number and quality of community-based facilitative services for members of our society with low incomes, ethnic disadvantages, and poor educational backgrounds.

## Concluding Note

Subsequent to the completion of this chapter, additional research information on the impacts of brokering-type services has been summarized by James Heffernan in *Educational and Career Services for Adults* (Lexington Books, 1981). Heffernan has found that community-based counseling services have had direct and tangible effects on their adult learner clients in terms of specific career and job changes, action taken with regard to education, and effects on personal and family life. Also documented are adults' uniformly high levels of satisfaction with such services, and their indications that the combination of counseling and information on education and occupations was precisely the kind of help they needed. Finally, it is evident that college policies regarding adult learners have been changed as a result of brokering agencies' advocacy efforts, and improvements in local communities' human services operations have resulted from their referral and linkage activities. These latter types of changes are less frequently demonstrated, however, and appear to be far more slowly wrought.

The data on impacts of brokering-type services underline one of the unhappy features of the community-based information and counseling services movement: its most valuable and dramatic effects are realized at the level of the individual, yet individuals are not the best sources of financial support. Clients' willingness and ability to pay for such services are not sufficient to totally support them. Impacts on institutions and communities are more difficult to effect, and are evident only after long periods of time. Broad public awareness of the benefits of brokering-type services to individuals and the commitment of public monies to support such services may come too late for a number of existing but struggling agencies. In many cases, only after their good effects were demonstrated did community-based information and counseling agencies receive state or local support; unfortunately, many also had had to close their doors before their impacts were known and recognition gained. The idea and the practices of educational and occupational services for adults appear to be well tested and ready for application in a number of settings. This application cannot occur, however, unless the recommendations for changes in related public policy are given a hearing at the highest level of decision-making.

## REFERENCES

- Arbeiter, S. et al. *40 million Americans in career transition: The need for information*. New York: Future Directions for a Learning Society, College Entrance Examination Board, 1978.
- Brown, Duane. Emerging models of career development groups for persons at midlife. *Vocational Guidance Quarterly* June, 1981, 29, 4, 332-340.
- Centra, J. A. *College enrollment in the 1980s: Projections and possibilities*. New York: College Entrance Examination Board, 1978.
- Cross, K. P. *The missing link: Connecting adult learners to learning resources*. New York: Future Directions for a Learning Society, The College Entrance Examinations Board, 1978.

- Cross, K. P. Adult learners: Characteristics, needs, and interests. In R. E. Peterson and Associates, *Lifelong learning in America*. San Francisco, California: Jossey-Bass Publications, 1979.
- Cross, K. P., & Zusman, A. The needs of non-traditional learners and responses of non-traditional programs. In C. B. Stalford (Ed.), *Papers on non-traditional educations*, 1977. Washington: National Institute of Education, 1978.
- Franklin, P. L. et al. *Education information and advisement services: A resource guide for creating local services and building statewide networks*. Washington, D.C.: U.S. government Printing Office, 1979.
- Frederickson, R. H., Macy, F. U., & Vickers, D. F. Barriers to career change. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978, 57(3).
- Goodman, H. Adult Education and Counseling: An emerging synthesis. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, March, 1981, 59, 7, 465-469.
- Ginzberg, E. *Career guidance: Who needs it, who provides it, who can improve it?* New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1971.
- Heffernan, J. M. Community-based information and counseling services. In R. I. Wise (Ed.), *Improving educational information services*. San Francisco, California: Jossey-Bass Publications, 1979.
- Heffernan, J. M., Macy, F. U., & Vickers, D. F. *Educational brokering: A new service for adult learners*. Syracuse, New York: National Center for Educational Brokering, 1976.
- Heffernan, J. M. Needs of Adults vs. Needs of Youth, *Bulletin*, Syracuse, New York: National Center for Adult Brokering, May/June, 1980, 1-3.
- Heffernan, J. M. *Education and Career Services for Adults*. Lexington, Mass.: Lexington Books, a subsidiary of D.C. Heath Publishing Company, 1981.
- Jacobson, M. D. *Adult career advocates training project interim report*. Evanston, Illinois: Northwestern University, 1979.
- Kordalewski, J. B., & Johnson-Alamprese, J. *Impacts of services, 1974-1977*. Syracuse, New York: Regional Learning Service of Central New York, 1977.
- Levin, E. Reaching potential students through a university's career development center. *College Student Personnel Journal*, March, 1981, 22, 2, 179-180.
- Mawson, C. D. Women's centers: A critical appraisal and case study. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1979, 58(1).
- National Center for Educational Brokering. *Bulletin*, February 1979, 4(2); August 1979, 4(5).
- Papalia, A. and Kaminski, W. Counseling and counseling skills in the industrial environment. *Vocational Guidance Quarterly*, September, 1981, 30, 1, 37-42.
- Parente, F. et al. A computer-assisted method of counseling. *AMHCA Journal*, July, 1981, 3, 2, 62-71.
- Schlossberg, N. K. Linking people and resources: The case for community-based guidance. Paper delivered at Annual National Conference on Higher Education of the American Association of Higher Education, Chicago, Illinois, March 1974.
- Stern, B. E. *Toward a federal policy on education and work*. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1977.
- Vickers, D. F. The learning consultant: A response to the external degree learner. *Journal of Higher Education*, June 1973, XLIV(6).

# PART THREE

## Political Challenges to the Profession

---



# 8

## The Ingredients of Policy: Tradition, Power, Expediency, Morality

Nancy M. Pinson  
Research Consultant

---

"... Between our ideals and our daily action are hollow spots where politics ought to be: a practical scheme of persons, constituencies, laws, and programs that forces us to test out our philanthropic visions, to ride them into the thick of political chatter, threats, anxieties, and the hurly-burly of a thousand legislators and like-minded activists."

Novak, 1979

This could be described as a book about politics, and as such, its primary subjects should be people and government policy. It is also a story about a constellation of helping professionals, their relationship with those who need their services, and those who decide upon the conditions allowing for their delivery. This chapter suggests that these two descriptions are not incompatible; instead, they are the correct consequence of deliberations by thoughtful adults who recognize that their commitment to a specific aspect of human welfare needs witness at the highest level of decision making.

Three overarching themes will be engaged in this presentation. The first deals with the current and historical purposes of that art or science we call the politics of governance. The second probes the genesis and adequacy of current social policy formation: its source, its means, its

arbiters, and its participating groups. The third and final theme poses the question of what relationship actually does or could exist between those who influence social policy and one group charged with carrying it forward into practice: the counseling practitioner of this nation.

## ANTECEDENTS OF POLITICAL BEHAVIOR

What is politics? *Sui generis*, it can be defined as the science or art of government, with polity a particular form or system of government, and its adjective connotation one of sagaciousness or prudence. In the modern textbook sense, politics is the process of making government policies, and a political system accommodates those institutional processes and interactions through which values are authoritatively allocated in a society (Shattuck, 1978; Ranney, 1975). Politics has also been more loosely defined as the conflict, and its resolution, within and among groups or human beings as to the formulation and implementation of governing or government policy (Truman, 1971).

While people have debated the actual and ideal roles of politics and government in human society at least since the time of Socrates in the fifth century, B.C., most members of the helping professions, and counselors in particular, have disassociated themselves from the appearance, if not the fact, of politically oriented behavior. It was and still is believed that such behavior carries with it connotations of cunning, crudity, and overbearance—if not authoritarianism or despotism. In the last two decades, however, public perceptions of the reasoned practice of political intervention have become more enlightened. No longer does this insinuation of a shadowy craft conjure up on the one hand an elite corps of economists and historians, or on the other, a motley band of aspiring or elected officials. On the contrary, the effective political activist of today is recognized by most as that individual with the persistence, knowledge, and credibility to influence a desired policy change within a given social structure.

This more liberal characterization of the politically oriented is not new. It was, in fact, the one put forth by Aristotle and Plato as well as Socrates; a thesis concerning itself not only with the roles of people within a given society but with the conduct of human affairs in general. They wrote about what we now separate into ethics, history, economics, religion, psychology, and education as the single subject matter with which politics and government should be most concerned. What has occurred since their time is clear even to the neophyte historian: the separation of disciplines and their related practitioners into the physical or natural sciences, the political and behavioral sciences, and myriad other fields distinguished from one another by their concerns, the kind of knowledge they seek about these concerns, and their special methods for acquiring that knowledge. If this ordering succeeded in making human discourse more manageable, it also succeeded in narrowing, if not eliminating, the participation of the broadly educated in the development of human policies that underlie the formation, regulation, and governance of our social structures.

In the 16th century, for example, the decision to behave politically was based on a choice between the contemplative or the active life. Thus while many literati were attracted to the classical ideal of the eloquent scholar-statesman, they also worried about the disappointments and compromises that might accompany the quest for power or influence in government. Some, like Erasmus, chose to keep their distance from civic matters and to influence kings and courtiers through their writings. Others, like Sir Thomas More, chose to combine an education in the classics with the study of law in preparation for a political life.

Not until late in the 17th century did Locke, Montesquieu, and Rousseau address this impoverishment in leadership by persuading their evolving democracies to separate the powers conferred by law between an executive, a legislative, and a judicial branch of government. Locke insisted that the end of law must not be to abolish or restrain, but to preserve and enlarge freedom. He believed that government governs best that governs, not least or most, but most justly; that human beings have as much personal liberty as they deserve or can use justly, when their conduct is regulated by just laws. From these and other progenitors came the thesis forming the rationale for the Massachusetts Constitution in 1780; a government of laws and not of men. The framers of that testament believed that lives and fortunes should be governed not by the passing whims of a dictator, a ruling class, or even a popular majority, but by fundamental and changeless principles of right and reason.

Flawed as this first of several articles of our confederation was in its inference that the knowledge of right was in the hands of an educated few who could define it in legal terms, it had two demonstrated capacities. The first was its ability to distinguish between the expression and the administration of the authority residing in laws made by human beings; the second, its potential for reflecting human amendment down through the years. The idea of political representation: to be made present in the decision-making processes of government without literally being there, had become a fact. Representatives would be authorized to act by the same constituents who could effectively strip them of power. They would be chosen for their similarity to the constituent group; symbolic in that they personified the noblest qualities inherent in that group as well.

Yet then even as now, a certain aura surrounded those electing to represent if not mingle with the bourgeoisie. They were either viewed as legal scholars, trained to interpret or adjudicate laws already on the books, or—in far smaller numbers—as seekers after their own or public truths that had promise of reordering the lives of others. This narrowing of descriptors—from the broadly educated citizen of Athens, the “perfect men” Plutarch regarded as those who were able to mingle and fuse political capacity with philosophy, to those embracing Hegel’s belief that to be politically authoritative derives not at all from moral or physical force, only to a small extent from habit and custom, but really from insight and argument—became the foundation for today’s more narrowly conceived political persona.

So it is that the person “entering politics” today is more likely to identify with the study of law as opposed to the study of human behavior; the law as reason, unaffected by desire. If individual freedoms are evoked, they

are addressed within the larger framework of jurisprudence. Across three centuries three major conceptions of law have been put forth under that framework. The first was the conception of a higher law or the law of nature. This was essentially a body of prescriptions for human behavior ordained by God or Nature, which proposed that rules made and enforced by human agencies should approximate these external principles. Under this tenet, people had no moral obligation to obey rules that contravened these principles. The second conception dealt with the positive law or the analytical school of thought, arguing that because people have no certain way of identifying principles of right and wrong, the only meaningful definition of law is in terms of the particular human agencies that make and enforce its rules. The 19th-century jurist Austin, for example, defined such law as the command of a political superior to inferiors, backed by sanctions against those who disobeyed those commands. The third view, by far the most parsimonious, is the more prevalent today. Simply stated, it holds that law in any nation is the body of rules emanating from government agencies and applied by the courts; being clearly distinguished from the rules implied by moral precepts and customs (Ranney, 1975, p. 442).

## WHO MAKES POLICY?

Some would observe, with good reason, that few of the philosophical viewpoints that characterized this country's early political thought are currently embraced by today's decision-makers. The fundamental objective of our first legislatures may seem to have been forgotten by those individuals who now occupy this country's highest elected or appointed offices. To accept this judgment without further investigation begs the real question, however. What *does* govern policy . . . a law or rule that is said to be the expressed will of the majority, or those who either in the presence or the absence of such rule establish their own authority?

### Policy: A Definition

Webster defines policy as a principle, plan, or course of action pursued by a government, an organization, or an individual; and wise, expedient, or prudent conduct or management. In neither definition does Webster assign policy the weight of law or regulation. Yet when one speaks of social policy today, a fair assumption is that a relatively fixed authority or legislative precedent has guided the development and implementation of certain services provided by federal, state, or local governments. It is further assumed that such policy or guideline was reached through due process: the involvement of those who would be affected as well as those who would provide the services described. A third party to this process would ideally be those individuals or groups who, in the judgment of the majority, have expert credentials in the content or subject matter of the given initiative.

Were this a correct interpretation of how social program policy is actually formulated, one could agree that—to this point—it remains fundamentally consistent with Webster's much more parsimonious definitions. The fact is, however, that social program policies are rarely arrived at in such a rational manner, nor are they demonstrably affected by the three constituencies mentioned. (On its face, such rationality and involvement would appear to be easily achieved. Few social programs designed to achieve specific purposes fail to imply consideration for these constituencies in their authorizing language. But the leap between language and reality is large.) It would be safer to say that policy formulation and subsequent oversight actually rest with that handful of individuals who—charged with program administration and budget—must hasten to develop policy *after the fact*. In effect, these agency personnel are empowered to redefine what is already policy in the generic sense; to recast it in terms that may or may not agree with the enabling or legislative authority's intent. Further compounding this anomaly of dual and possibly conflicting authority in the development of social policy is that rarely, in either stage: policy conceptualization or policy interpretation, do the constituent groups affected by both sets of consequences become involved early enough or long enough to assure policies of effective means.

### Policy: Inhibitor or Enabler?

Lind (1975) suggests that Americans are becoming increasingly alienated from government and other institutions, but proposes that the present crisis of trust and confidence stems not from a decline in the performance of these institutions but rather to substantial increases in need. In short, he says, we are experiencing a revolution of rising expectations. These expectations focus less on material resources than on the expressed hunger for trust and mutual esteem in human relations; a hunger that when translated politically, is an exploding demand by people for more significant involvement in their governance—whether it be in units of families, neighborhoods, towns, states, or nations. While once a person established an identity in the marketplace, parlaying that identity into a claim on other values, the other values are now primary. The larger social network, specifically the political system, has become the major focus of identity and the principal testing ground for one's self-esteem.

There can be no question that we are experiencing a convulsive ingathering of groups, for the more global our science and technology are, the more tribal or specialized our politics become. When more groups are formed because more identities are uncovered and proclaimed, the result is an enormous strain on the political process. The agenda of politics must not only get longer, but the background noise and conflict against which it must be conducted will increase (Skolnikoff, 1976). These strident new demands are inimical to efficiency, creating not only competition, more time needed for resolution, but reducing the levels of competence and information. (Regulatory agencies and mechanisms also share these problems because even when the general public's interest wanes, the groups to be regulated continue to exert pressure.)



Tugwell (1977) forecast this generalized failure of positive political development and the emergence of a persistent and self-reinforcing form of institutionalized incompetence. This malperformance in the determination, validation, and implementation of public policy is due, Tugwell is convinced, to (a) political transience encouraging transient affection by groups who are represented, (b) an enlarged political arena that permits new groups and interests to excuse their incompetence, (c) the activation of ethnic and primordial identifications and conflicts, and (d) the uneasy coalition of urban middle-class leaders and those who represent the urban poor.

## The Architects of Policy

Because policies do not parade across the public scene independent of human manipulation, one is forced to agree with Mazlish (1977) and before him with Erickson (1959) and Lasswell (1948) that the American proposition—that ours is a government of laws, not men—is open to reclarification.

Erickson insisted that people in positions of power fashion policy and that these individuals may or may not act out roles in line with the expressing, or legislative, authority (Mazlish, p. 8). Erickson's view is consistent with what many political scientists today (Dickenson, 1978; Hine, 1977; Ranney, 1975) are recognizing as a growing body of knowledge called psychohistory: the premise that control over governing or government policies is a function of a leadership or executive persona that may either exceed or attend to the dispassionate precedents set by law. Thus policies are actually made—they are convinced—not only by those with executing authority, but inferentially, by those who can influence that authority to some successful degree.

In today's vernacular, the measure of that influence depends upon the petitioning group or coalition's size, social status, leadership, cohesion, and the immediate political and governmental environment in which they operate (Bailey, 1975; Ranney, 1975; Truman, 1971). Defenders of these criteria of influence contend that because there is no objective test by which a democratic polity can determine the true range and content of public interest, policies are best determined through a pluralistic process of peaceful discussion, negotiation, and compromise among those groups and the legislators, executives, and administrators they are openly trying to influence (Finn, 1977; Pessen, 1977; Swierenga, 1977; McFarland, 1975). So long as all these groups have overlapping rather than mutually exclusive memberships, they add, the probability is that government policies will more genuinely approximate the needs of those for whom they were intended.

These and other writers observe that all too often today's policymakers start with a judgment about how much money is available, and shape policy accordingly. Compounding this deficit are others: the essentially remedial and short-term nature of related legislation; the capability of agency personnel to administer these programs; and the capacity of the legislating body to review the policies it has set into motion.



What can any professional group make of this limited, but possibly accurate, assessment of the challenges associated with policy development of any kind? The question of policy focus alone is a dilemma, according to Halperin (1975). Each year, decision-makers in government face choices between capital building, equity, innovation, and diversity; between allocating resources equally to all segments of society and targeting their sum total to one especially deprived or underdeveloped constituency (Halperin, p. 10).

The proliferation of social programs addressed to nearly every conceivable human need attests to the difficulty of these choices, even as it illustrates what now is viewed by the majority of the electorate as an ungovernable translation of its desires. Indeed, the public today finds itself in the unique position of knowing that if much of what it wants and needs is at last legislatively available, it is still, too often, restricted in access. This phenomenon can be attributed in most cases to either of two causes: the absence of sound policy in the conceptualization, administration, and funding for such programs, or the presence of policies that are inappropriate, ineffective, or conflicting in nature.

In spite of these obstacles, experts on the issues from which future social policy is to be drawn should not be so constrained. To paraphrase Tribus (1970), who spoke of science, the enunciation of a national policy in any area of human welfare should not be dependent upon an advanced commitment to fund it. What is important in the long run is to have a policy that makes that struggle for fiscal resource more rational (Tribus, p. 1293).

What is the purpose of policy in any area of human advocacy? By what set of human or fiscal premises can it be justified? Which current and future issues facing this country's policymakers argue for such position?

As this nation enters a new decade, profound changes can be observed in the proportionate influence of certain citizen and interest groups upon decisions made by its governing institutions: decisions affecting where, how, and to what qualitative degree the people for whom they speak will be born, be schooled, live, work, grow old, and die. Experts on these matters have emerged from every quarter, and the legacy of oversight—once conferred upon a few established bureaucracies and ancient professions—no longer goes unquestioned.

As we enter the eighties, among the more predominant of trends engaging these experts are two concerns that are of equal seriousness to both the public and those who make policy. Treated elsewhere in this text, but from different perspectives, the issues of equity and of human capital investment in cost-benefit terms are touched upon here not only because they dominate much of the present discourse associated with the nation's current policy agenda but also because of the enormous challenge they present to the counseling profession.

## Equality vs. Parity

Studies of equality of educational opportunity have been published intermittently for about fifteen years; starting with the landmark con-

troversty generated by the Coleman Report in 1964, and continuing more recently with Jencks's 1979 study on *Who Gets Ahead* (Basic Books, New York.) As a result, the dissection of what makes people unequal has become the subject of major debate by social scientists, sociologists, economists, and anthropologists. Griedler (1979), a contemporary journalist, suggests that the premise from which these academicians operate—the perfect society in which opportunity is not merely vast but truly equal—departs from our reality. In dividing how much of which factors lead to success, better jobs, and other worthy goals, these scholars separate things into “good” and “bad” influences; that is, schooling is theoretically good, family background is bad, and so forth. What’s wrong with this picture, Griedler argues, is that it ignores a basic component of the human experience: the desire to pass on some sort of inheritance to one’s children, whatever the impoverishment or lack of it that characterizes the family. In ignoring that component in order to create a perfectly equal society, he adds, one could never hope to change one’s status.

The stark illustration is the experience of American Black families, principal subjects of the inequality studies, who have long suffered from what Featherman and Hauser (1978) call a perverse form of opportunity: achieving Black parents having great difficulty passing their rung of the ladder on to their children. These writers sound a cautious note of optimism, however, when they compare economic mobility from parent to child in 1962 with that observed in 1973: the inheritance of status is increasing, albeit slowly, among Black families. In other words, if a Black family is middle class, the odds have improved that sons and daughters will retain that status instead of falling randomly to the bottom: the consequence of greater disinheritance that has applied without distinction to Black children of affluent or poor parents alike.

So the theme that Griedler offers as he cautions social scientists (and by inference, those who develop social program policy) extends beyond race into ethnic, sex, age, and socioeconomic considerations. He proposes that most Americans see no inconsistency between the social goal of greater opportunity and the personal goal of helping their own children advance. Thus the moderation of the costs of “disinherited” group membership and the assistance of such groups in developing their own inheritance might well be the major task for the helping professional in the eighties.

## The Cost-Benefit Issue

Levitan (1979) and Cousins (1979) approach this 20th-century phenomenon from two perspectives, each yielding intriguing but not necessarily popular conclusions. Levitan contends that the statistical decline of U.S. productivity, the output per work hour, is both misunderstood in terms of its causes and overinflated in terms of its consequences. He suggests that we ran a slow-growth economy in the seventies, and that neither a decline of the work ethic nor of “Yankee ingenuity” can be indicted as root causes. Instead, he proposes that worker surplus, increase in service industries (which cannot so easily measure productivity as can their goods

producing counterparts), and an emphasis on research and development spending by business are more accurate explanations of the declining GNP. Seeing these as positive trends, Levitan argues that Department of Labor statisticians should place as much weight on indices of social productivity, such as clean air, safe work, and living environments, expanded health care, and equal employment opportunities as they now do on worker output. In effect, he is suggesting that not only should the basic concepts defining productivity be reexamined, but that social productivity should establish an entirely new cost-benefit paradigm.

Cousins comes at the issue with a persuasive argument against the traditional requirement that social investments show immediate and tangible returns. Calling this requirement the imposition of a death sentence for any proposal applying creative imagination to socially essential programs or long-range goals, he cites education as an illustration of the best system yet devised for creating real wealth and the worst in terms of the CBR credo. By the same analogy, he notes science as another victim when its main business is to bring about a juncture of trained minds and seminal accidents (Cousins, p. 8). Attaching the cost-benefit ratio to the fruits of all human endeavor would result, he insists, in a mediocrity in which Socrates would have become a baby sitter; Galileo and Giordano Bruno, court jesters; Columbus, a Venetian gondolier; John Milton, a maker of limericks; Jefferson, a tax collector; Edison, inventor of the rubber stamp, and Einstein, a uranium prospector.

These two viewpoints, one that substantially upsets the ratio and the other that abolishes it altogether, are positions undeniably attractive to many helping professionals. As self-proclaimed members of that population historically excused by the public from the cost-effectiveness rules applied elsewhere in our society, arguments as seductive as these could well be misinterpreted as the public sense of the moment. Knowing the converse to be true—that both the public and the current administration have become more insistent upon an immediate accounting of the benefits resulting from tax dollars, including those spent on social programs and their providers—the helping professional no longer has the luxury of waiting, with Levitan, for the new CBR to materialize. Neither should this practitioner entertain any hopes that one day, the policymaking community will return to the forgiveness vision espoused by Cousins. Not only is such return improbable, it is viewed by more and more professionals as a stereotype with which they can no longer be associated.

## The Helping Professions Under Siege

Illich (1978) has commented that the Age of Professions will be remembered as the time when politics withered, when voters guided by professors entrusted to technocrats the power to legislate their needs. Better called the Disabling Professions, he charges, for they could not have become dominant and disabling unless people had been ready to accept as a lack what the experts impute<sup>1</sup> to them as a need. These unkind words come as no real surprise to us for every profession has its unique

problems, its own heroes and villains, and its own way of policing itself. Each of them today is also caught in something like an identity crisis that extends beyond that profession's code of ethics.

This crisis is viewed by Barzun (1978) and Yoder (1979) as a consequence of the struggle by the helping professions with a number of choices: merging or separating displays of mental or moral force; guildism versus the language of allied service; consumer oversight versus policing by peers; and the vexing companion issue of how much if any political action for their clientele is appropriate. On this latter point we know that a professional, in the textbook sense, is one who professes, testifies, and bears witness not only to some sort of faith or confidence in the art or science underlying his or her beliefs, but to those being served as well. Traditionally, at least, it was only because he or she did so that the term could be applied. But many practicing counselors face a unique problem with this definition. They are unable to reconcile commitment and advocacy to the objectivity, if not the neutrality, they have been trained to bring to the counseling relationship (Cohn, 1981).

If being above politics implies an individual sanctity, how do we explain the social amorality it also conveys? Lawler (1981) and Miller (1975) are explicit in their condemnation of those in positions of professional authority and leadership who, as they choose neutrality, contribute to the decline of courage they see associated with the new American ethic. In substance, they believe, this is a prime example of the neoconservative or Malthusian view: that if you can't legislate humanity or have no money to apply to social problems, why get exercised at all?

Gillam (1977) confirms that the neoconservative response of many helping professionals is the inverse legacy of the radical sixties. If then the mood was aggressive, questioning, critical, now, by way of correction, it is cautionary, accepting, and apologetic. These neoconservative professionals, he notes, make up a remarkably cohesive group of mostly academic social scientists linked together by a generation of shared intellectual experience. That the adversary ideal no longer commands the allegiance it once did is due, Gillam believes, to the perception that as reality becomes more ominous and power more expansive, confidence in the autonomy of the mind and will have significantly declined. Scholarly interpretations of what is happening in the world now often resort to such impersonal concepts as bureaucracy, modernization, technological change, and the scarcity and depletion of resources.

In such a society, the neoconservatives among us insist as Orwell did that the proper role of policy is adaptive and conformist. Such disjunctive forces as equality and populism must be counteracted so the system can endure, and substituted for criticism from the adversary intellectual are the homilies of a managerial society that will be run efficiently by technicians. Thus a post-industrial construct of a country run as an organization rather than as a civilization—currently so attractive to a wide range of bedfellows—continues its undeniable appeal even as it exacts untold human costs.

Do we as professionals accept these indictments, this classification, or are counselors ready or able to take the risks associated by Gillam (1977) with the defining factors of the intellectual: political relevance, intellec-

tual polarization, and the constant search for ways to improve, rather than defend, what is?

## The Professions Reexamined

Barzun (1978) points out that a profession is not a single, invulnerable entity, it is a hundred or many thousands of individuals expected to act in a standard manner and to be invariably successful in doing so (Barzun, p. 63). Yet this scheme, this expectation beyond human strength, is aspired to by increasing numbers of occupational groups. Not only does this complicate the issues of ethics or standards, too often it overlooks the initial purpose of a profession: the transformation of those who are *not* born teachers, born builders, born advocates, and born healers into the real thing. Digression from the purpose; in effect, limiting the number of these transformations in order to produce an artificial shortfall in their supply, not only confuses or angers the public, it increasingly provokes its search for alternative providers of the help it perceives as necessary. Today, we find that it is more and more the cluster of practices that one distinguished the professions, and less and less the practitioner assigned by tradition that the public "sees" and the laws describe. Moreover, the most vulnerable of groups to this shift in emphasis are the helping professions. The sheer weight of their numbers, their visibility, their overlapping functions, and their versatility—have undoubtedly contributed to this fluctuating public viewpoint.

To combat these perceptions of political and social sterility through reexamining early territorial claims in light of their current validity, many of our kindred practitioners are now engaged in a form of redefinition. The American Psychological Association, for example, has removed the term *neurosis* from its diagnostic manual—replacing it with a simpler word: *anxiety* (Gross, 1978). Others have suggested that more and more assistance with the so-called normal vicissitudes of life be left to counselors, paraprofessionals and psychologists; that psychiatrists re-medicalize through focusing again on those serious illnesses, such as schizophrenia and manic depression, that have a physical basis. Not only would this approach be less costly, they argue, it would achieve a more equitable distribution of services to that 94 percent of the public estimated to be free of serious pathology, and which has the right to 94 percent of the skilled help that is presently available (Gross, p. 64).

According to the President's Commission on Mental Health (1978), 6.7 million people were seen by mental health specialists in 1975 alone. This number is estimated as 21 percent of the 32 million Americans who profess or display emotional problems within the normative range. Current figures show that 17 billion dollars are spent annually on this aspect of mental health: a tenfold increase in fewer than twenty years; one that sums to more than 11 percent of total health care costs for the nation (*U.S. News and World Report*, October 8, 1978, 64).

Should this found group, now interpolated as 25 percent of the population estimated as "troubled," be added to another 65 percent of the total population, we have a close approximation of the 90 plus percent about



which Gross comments. Essentially, this latter group is made up of those individuals who are variously but measurably involved with the employment services, rehabilitation agencies, CETA programs, public health agencies, alcohol, spouse, and drug abuse centers, correctional institutions or half-way houses, the armed services as members or veterans; in schools, colleges, adult or continuing education programs and myriad other outreach services. Wegmann (1979) notes, for example, that career concerns alone account for requests for advocacy by more than 36 percent of the 40 million members of our population between the ages of sixteen and sixty-five. And merged within and outside of these groups are some of those described by Wolfbein (1979) who have yet to petition for help: the one in four women who will be 75 years old or older after 2000 A.D.; the service occupation worker who will be increasingly challenged by interpersonal skill deficits as well as with dislocation crises affecting long-established patterns of living, housing, marriage, and educational attainment.

## SUMMARY

Clearly, these demographic changes and their recognition by allied professions have implications for an increased visibility within this nation's social policy framework of those processes we associate with guidance and counseling.

From its recognizable inception late in the last century, this loosely knit confederation of practices has evolved largely as a response to the observed as well as the expressed needs of citizens of all ages. And if these needs have been normative and cumulative for the most part, the practices designed to address them reflect the remarkable passage of both the professional counselor and the "client" through national periods of stability, growth, alternative forms of schooling, war and rumors of war, sexual revolution, depression, family upheaval, prosperity, unemployment, internal and social tensions, the testing of civil and human rights, ad infinitum. Understandably, the processes applied by these practitioners became more diversified in direct relationship to the complexity of the issue and of the individual concerned. Understandable, too, was the emerging counseling profession's recognition that it would need to borrow heavily from other disciplines these knowledges and practices that would permit its more effective response.

Such astuteness will not have been recorded by future historians without noting its costs, however. This uniquely contemporary phenomenon, the practice of guidance by the professional counselor, is enjoying an unusually close scrutiny by the public and its sister professions alike. It is at once a demanding and an affectionate attention; one mixed with an impatience and an expectation that are still formless and largely without focus. The investments have been heavy in this, the amalgam of all helping professions; heavy in the sense Herr (1977) describes as its equation with human reclamation by legislators; heavy in its bastard spring—Medusa-like—from the collective foreheads of the ancient professions;



and not insignificantly, astonishing in its capacity to be almost everywhere that people are.

But it is no time for celebration. If the objects of this attention are to correctly anticipate and plan for the decades ahead; if they are, in fact, to give voice and substance to those formless public expectations in terms of wise as well as healing social policy, vast new stores of intelligence and courage will need to be tapped. In a future where the measure of a helping profession will be its demonstrated capacity, its role within a larger alliance active in the cause of human advocacy—never again to be assessed upon the basis of its mystique and scarce supply—the enormous potential of guidance and counseling has only begun to be exercised.

## SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bailey, S. K., Education interest groups in the nation's capital, Washington, D.C.: American Council on Education, 1975, 18–20.
- Barzun, Jacques, The professions undersiege. *Harper's*, October, 1978, 61–68, 63.
- Cohn, Judith. Advocacy, treatment, and the legal paradigm. *Counseling and Values*, October, 1981, 26, 1, 42–46.
- Cousins, N. L. The fallacy of cost-benefit ratio. *The Saturday Review*, April 14, 1979, 8.
- Comfort, A. Adding sensitivity to democracy. *Center Magazine*, September/October, 1974, 7, 5, essay: back cover.
- Dickenson, J. R. Dilemma of the treaty debate. *The Washington Star*, Op-Ed, February 13, 1978.
- Erickson, E. H. Identity and the life cycle. *Psychological Issues*, Monograph 1, New York: International University Press, 1959.
- Featherman, D. L., and Hauser, R. M. *Opportunity and Change*. New York: Academic Press, 1978.
- Finn, J. Fighting among the doves. *Worldview*, (Ed.) New York: April, 1977.
- Gillam, R. Intellectuals and power. *Center Magazine*, May/June, 1977, 10, 3, 5–30.
- Griedler, William, Social Science: chin-deep in banality. *The Washington Post*, Op-Ed, September 16, 1979.
- Halperin, S. Top education need: restored confidence. *Christian Science Monitor*, February 3, 1975, 10.
- Gross, Martin, as quoted in the *U.S. News and World Report*, October 9, 1978, 64; and in the *Washington Star*, May 4, 1978, p. 1 on the occasion of being interviewed about his recent book: *The Psychological Society*. New York, N.Y., Random House, Inc., 1978.
- Herr, Edwin L. The relationship of guidance and counseling to national educational, social, and occupational priorities. Washington, D.C.: American Personnel and Guidance Association, Winter, 1977.
- Hine, V. H. The basic paradigm of a future socio-cultural system. *World Issues*, April/May, 1977, 19–22.
- Illich, I. The age of professions. *Washington Post*, Op-Ed, January 16, 1978.
- Lasswell, H. D. *Power and personality*. New York: W. W. Norton & Sons, Inc., 1948.
- Lawler, Peter. A message to political educators. *Peabody Journal of Education*, October, 1981, 59, 1, 43–44.
- Levitan, Sar, Rational evolution of american society causes lamented slump in productivity. *The Washington Star*, Op-Ed, September 16, 1979.
- Lind, A. The future of citizen involvement. *Futurist*, 1975, 9, 6, 316–328.
- Mazlish, B. Psychohistory and politics. *Center Magazine*, September/October, 1977, 10, 5, 5–14.

- McFarland, S. Interview, quoted in Pinson, N., The lobbying dilemma; implications for the american personnel and guidance association. Report to the Board of Directors, Washington, D.C.: American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1976, 21.
- Miller, W. L. Political ethics, then and now. *Center Magazine*, July/August, 8, 4, 1975, 63-68.
- Novak, M. Mr. Carter and the art of politics. *Washington Star*, Op-Ed, June 23, 1979.
- Pessen, E. Who rules America? power and politics in the democratic era, 1825-1975. Prologue, Washington, D.C.: National Archives, Spring, 1977.
- Ranney, A. The governing of men. Hinsdale, Ill.: The Dryden Press, 1975, 29, 426.
- Shattuck, J. Scarce resources and civil liberties. *Center Magazine*, January/February, 1978, 11, 1, 18-19.
- Skolnikoff, E. B. Is policy possible? *The Wilson Quarterly*, Autumn, 1976, 1, 1, 56-58.
- Swierenga, R. P. Ethnicity in Perspective. *Social Science*, Winter, 1977.
- Tribus, Myron, as quoted on the Editor's page, *Science*, September 25, 1970, p. 1293.
- Truman, D. B. The governmental process. (second edition) New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971, 33, 264-270.
- Tugwell, F. The spectre of political transience. *World Issues*, June/July, 1977, 26-28.
- Wegmann, R. G. Job-search assistance: a review. *In press*, *The Journal of Employment Counseling*, 1980.
- Wolfhein, Seymour. Luncheon address to the National Vocational Guidance Association. Las Vegas, Nevada: April 4, 1979.
- Yoder, Edwin. Professionalism and the language of service. *The Washington Star*, Op-Ed, March 1, 1979.

# 9

## A Federal Perspective on Guidance and Counseling

John F. Jennings, Counsel  
Subcommittee on Elementary, Secondary, and Vocational  
Education  
U.S. House of Representatives

---

Throughout the country, at every level of government, there is increasing pressure to hold down spending. The clearest examples of this pressure are the passage of Proposition 13 in California, the call by thirty state legislatures for a constitutional convention to write a "balance-the budget" amendment to the U.S. Constitution, and currently, the effort at the Federal level to do the same.

Since most counselors are either directly or indirectly supported by governmental aid of one type or another, it is natural that they should be concerned about this general trend. But, there also seems to be a special concern on the part of many counselors that support for their profession may have eroded recently in a unique way in the Congress, in the federal executive agencies, and at the state and local levels of government.

Layoffs of school counselors instead of teachers in these days of declining school budgets, and threats of such actions, undoubtedly have helped to exacerbate this anxiety. Less sharply focused federal support for guidance and counseling has also undoubtedly played a part in fostering this apprehension.

The principal purpose of this chapter is to discuss the reasons for the present forms of federal aid for guidance and counseling by focusing on how that aid has historically been provided within the larger area of

education. A second purpose is to discuss the factors that will influence that aid in the future.

## Factors Affecting Federal Support: Their Consequences

In the many areas of activity encompassed within the term "education" in this country, there are several that have enjoyed special attention and encouragement from the federal level. Compensatory education, vocational education, and postsecondary student assistance programs are found in this category. For many years guidance and counseling also received this special support.

When the first modern federal law aiding education was enacted in 1958, guidance and counseling was provided with a separate program targeting assistance on expanding such services in the public schools. As a direct consequence, the number of school counselors more than tripled—from 13,000 in 1958 to 43,500 in 1967, and the average number of students per counselor was cut in half—from 960 to 450 in high schools and from 17,500 to 6,500 in elementary schools.

Unfortunately this categorical, obviously effective support program for the profession became entangled in the political pressure for program consolidation that occurred in the late 1960s. In the Education Amendments of 1970, the NDEA program was consolidated with the federal program to encourage innovation in education: Title III of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 (P.L. 89-10). This consolidation led to a 50 percent decline in federal support for guidance and counseling—from nearly \$32 million in 1967 to \$16 million in 1973.

In 1974, federal support for counseling received another jolt by being moved from this 1970 consolidation to yet another, more restrictive consolidation. This new consolidation provided grants to local school districts for three purposes: purchase of library books and materials, acquisition of instructional equipment, and provision of counselors' salaries. A school district could use whatever proportion it chose from its consolidated grant for each of those three purposes.

Under this new program—called Title IV-B of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act, as amended (P.L. 93-380)—\$14.6 million was used for counseling in 1978. This amount for counseling was a serious decline from the earlier levels of support, especially when inflation is considered.

In 1978, Congress enacted yet another change in form for federal assistance for guidance and counseling. This modification was based on testimony from counselors and from librarians and media specialists that the competition for funding at the local level among purchase of books, acquisition of equipment, and payment of counselors' salaries was proving to be too disruptive to all three fields.

The Education Amendments of 1978 (P.L. 95-561), therefore, limited the uses of funds under the Title IV-B program to the purchase of books

and equipment and created a new, separate program for the support of guidance and counseling. This new program—Part D of Title IV—also considerably expands the types of activities that can be supported to encourage growth and improvement in guidance and counseling. While funds for this new program were appropriated for the 1980 fiscal year, they were totally rescinded by the 96th Congress. Furthermore, no funds were recommended by either the Congress or the Administration in FY 1991.

So in the course of ten years, assistance for school counseling went from a categorical program, to a consolidated program, to a broader consolidated program, back to a categorical program, and now to its inclusion in a block grant to the States where it must compete with other programs for attention. This is surely enough in itself to cause some confusion about the degree and the constancy of federal support for guidance and counseling in one of the many settings in which it occurs, in the schools.

During this period, it was understandable that many counselors began to fear that federal attitudes had changed regarding the importance of guidance and counseling. Some came to believe that the federal government, which had done so much to encourage the growth of the profession in the late 1950s and early 1960s through the National Defense Education Act, had reassessed its view and had decided that guidance and counseling were not so important after all.

That attitude is far too simplistic in its portrayal of what actually occurred. During all those years and up to the present there was really an ebb and flow of support at the federal level for counseling in education. For instance, within two years of the movement of the counseling program from its first consolidation into the broader Title IV-B consolidation resulting from the Amendments of 1974, the Congress also required States to spend at least 20 percent of their vocational education program improvement funds (Subpart 3, Title II, P.L. 94-482) on counseling. This has led to an increase from a few million in 1976 to more than \$26 million currently being spent nationally for vocational guidance and counseling.

Furthermore, within three years of the enactment of the IV-B consolidation the Congress required the states to spend at least 15 percent of their career education pass-through funds on counseling (P.L. 95-207). Amendments were also added to a number of other laws encouraging spending on counseling, such as those recommended in the youth employment portion of the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (P.L. 95-524) and in the Higher Education Act (P.L. 96-374).

Consequently, the pattern is not simply one of commitment and then retreat; rather, it is a more complicated pattern of highly visible funding through the NDEA, a fallback in 1970, a further fallback in 1974, then a renewed commitment manifesting itself in many different legislative acts within the last three years . . . yet with variable to no funding recommended. What does all of this mean? Does it mean in fact that the federal attitude towards support of guidance and counseling shifted from positive to negative and then is beginning to shift back to positive again? And, since education is but one of many areas of federal support for guidance and counseling, what can be learned from these experiences in education that would be applicable to other areas of federal support?

## Broad Pressures and Issues

The first and foremost conclusion to be drawn from this chronology is that support for counseling within a broader area of activity like education is subject to strong pressures that go beyond the particular question of whether federal support should or should not be expanded for counseling assistance.

In 1970, the NDEA program became embroiled in the larger debate over whether there were too many federal categorical programs in education. That debate resulted in a relatively minor consolidation—moving the guidance and counseling program into the Title III innovation program; (a “relatively minor” consolidation in terms of federal education programs in general, but a devastating consolidation in its effects on guidance and counseling in particular, as measured by the cut-back of half of its federal support).

By the time all of the federal elementary and secondary education programs were renewed again in 1974, the effects of the continuing pressure for consolidation of programs were more serious. By then, President Nixon had become stronger politically and his Administration had settled on “special revenue-sharing” as its domestic agenda. That term really meant massive consolidations of federal domestic assistance programs into broad, block grants.

As a result, massive consolidations occurred in the federal manpower programs and in federal housing programs. In education, the reduced assistance for guidance and counseling being provided through Title III of ESEA was swept up again and carried into the broader Title IV-B consolidation that also affected funding for books and equipment. Aid for a number of federal innovative programs and for the improvement of State departments of education was also consolidated into a broader program. Lastly, in 1976, federal vocational education programs were consolidated into two block grants of their own.

But, in another turn of the wheel, President Nixon’s powers began to wane until he at last was forced from office; and President Ford was never able to aggrandize his political power sufficiently against a reassertive Congress. As one off-shoot of these broad events, Congress moved away from consolidation and back to support of categorical programs.

This turn of events led to the restoration of a separate program for guidance and counseling in the Education Amendments of 1978: the new Title IV, Part D program. It also made it possible to set aside funds in other education programs for guidance and counseling. (While this set-aside trend has been fought by the current Administration, which voted no funds for counseling within education’s block grant programs, Congress remains “silent” on this state discretionary area.) And although general school counseling again has won, then lost, its own legislative authority analogous to the original NDEA, the battle over how much ought to be “spent” appears to be relocated to state and local government settings. It is there that decisions on how much of the block grant will be spent on counseling services will be made. Consequently, it can be seen that federal decisions about whether there ought to be separate program to encourage counseling in the schools are often totally unrelated



to decisions about funding such a program. Even if Congress and the Administration do not agree on suggested dollar amounts for these programs, current law places the final decision in the hands of state and local governments.

Several conclusions can be drawn from this history. These conclusions are most pertinent to school counselors.

## The Perception of Counseling by Government Decision-Makers

Counseling was chosen as one of two programs to be consolidated in 1970 and as one of seven in 1974 partially because it was perceived as one of those professions with a weak political constituency. Conversely, counseling was separated out from the 1974 consolidation and given its own program again in 1978, and counseling received earmarkings of funds in 1976 and 1978, because the field became much more politically assertive and lobbied its way to greater attention. In other words, a strong correlation exists between political activism and federal support.

This judgment is not to be interpreted to mean that all of these decisions turn merely on the basis of who has the most and who has the least power. But that is an important consideration when other pressures are brought to bear.

Clearly political considerations play a large role in Congressional treatment of programs, but counselors had yet another problem that led to their bailiwick being singled out for consolidation in both 1970 and 1974. Counseling is frequently perceived as being important in education, as well as in many other social welfare programs, but not as an activity that ought to be separated out for special treatment all of the time.

In fact, most federal programs aiding counseling outside of the area of education do not single out counseling at all as a targeted activity with its own funding. The \$11 billion Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (P.L. 92-203 as amended), for instance, probably provided more funding for counseling than had come through the old Title IV-B program or will ever come through the newer Title IV-D program. That CETA assistance, though, was provided only as part of broad training programs or public employment programs.

The CETA legislation states clearly that in youth employment programs "(a)ll activities assisted under this part, pursuant to such regulations as the Secretary shall prescribe, *shall provide appropriate counseling and placement services* designed to facilitate the transition of youth from participating in the project to (1) permanent jobs in the public or private sector, or (2) education or training programs." (Emphasis added) Other parts of the Act are not quite as clear although the same intent is evident.

Regardless of such language, statistics are not even maintained at the federal level on how much is spent on counseling under CETA. This is due to the attitude that counseling is merely a component of an overall program and does not need separate attention. The same is true for many other federal programs.

Given this attitude, counseling will frequently be mentioned in many pieces of federal legislation. But without requirements that a certain percentage of funds be spent on counseling, such services will and do receive quite different treatment among national programs and even within the same federal programs at the local level. Frequently, as with CETA, for example, statistics are not even maintained on the degree of support for such services in a national program.

A deference by Congress to local decision-making is largely responsible for this form of aid, especially since counseling is not always viewed as separable. Undoubtedly, another factor leading to this attitude is a view among some members that counseling is helpful but not essential. It is difficult, if not impossible, to determine how many have this view, but it does crop up fairly routinely during consideration of related legislation.

The nature of the profession tends to encourage this view at times since school counselors, at least, frequently are diverted to recordkeeping and testing duties in the schools. The conflict over the degree to which counseling should or does involve the use of psychological or therapeutic techniques also tends to confuse the role of the profession in the eyes of legislators.

All of these factors make it difficult to persuade national decision-makers to separate out counseling for special treatment. In the area of education, this is somewhat easier to do even though such treatment has tended to ebb and flow with the times. The reasons for this easier educational path are found in the history of special treatment that goes back all the way to 1958, predating most of the federal education programs now in existence.

Another problem counselors face in trying to maintain and expand federal aid is that their representatives share with other professional groups the tendency to rely on professional jargon when defending their programs. This problem is not unique to counseling, but it is a factor that proves to be detrimental when attempts are made to influence decision-making.

\* \* \* \*

The purpose of this section has been to point out the various factors affecting the federal role for support of school counseling and to link these factors to the treatment of counseling in other areas of federal assistance. In summary, the strongest factor is one over which the profession can have little control: the range of broad issues being debated within an area and even within the entire federal government, such as consolidation in the late 1960s and early 1970s and the fiscal austerity today that is reflected in block grants to the states for many social programs.

The second most important factor is the political activism of the profession within a particular area. In education, counselors have moved between political weakness and political strength depending on the particular point in time and the issue in question.

The third factor is the perception of counseling as only a component of programs and not as a service that can be viewed separately and targeted for special assistance.

The other factors are concerns about the precise role of counselors and the manner in which the profession communicates internally and the manner in which the profession communicates with policy-makers.

These factors all intertwine at different points in decision-making about the degree of support of guidance and counseling. Some are almost beyond control, such as the effects of the economy, but others are controllable with thorough and consistent attention to assure a proper degree of support.

Securing this attention in Washington is especially difficult for counseling because federal funding for the profession comes from so many different sources. Consequently, it is extremely difficult to try to "stay on top" of all of the federal agency decisions and congressional decisions affecting counseling.

For example, more than \$14 million is now being spent on legal and related counseling services under the Older Americans Act (P.L. 89-73, as amended). Many millions of dollars are being spent for counseling under the former Title I, ESEA, compensatory education program and under the Education for All Handicapped Children Act (P.L. 94-142) now contained in the various chapters of the Education Block Grants to the States (P.L. 97-35). Almost the entire budget for the United States Employment Service (P.L. 73-30, as amended) involves counseling, and many thousands of counselors are hired under the Vocational Rehabilitation Act (P.L. 93-603, as amended). The Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention Act (P.L. 92-31, as amended) and the National Health Planning Act (P.L. 93-641) are two other programs providing some aid. Many millions of dollars for counseling are undoubtedly providing directly under the Social Security Title XX program (P.L. 93-647, as amended) and indirectly under the general revenue-sharing program (P.L. 94-488). Furthermore, many agencies of the federal government, such as the Bureau of Indian Affairs and the Department of Defense, hire counselors directly.

As can be easily surmised, the task of following all of these programs is very difficult and time-consuming. But to do less than a thorough and persevering job is to neglect many areas in which federal aid could and should assist in making counseling services available.

And, it is important to emphasize that frequently decisions being made by officials in the various federal agencies and departments are as important as the more publicized actions of the Congress. Permitting the use of funds for guidance and counseling or encouraging such use in regulatory language can have as much impact on the profession as the enactment of a new law. Consequently, it is important for the profession to monitor all of these federal agency decisions as well as legislative activity.

## FUTURE OF FEDERAL SUPPORT

Broadly stated, the future of federal support for guidance and counseling depends on the decisions made by the Congress and the President over the next few years on the extent of federal spending. Presently, a mood of fiscal austerity reigns, and most efforts are geared to achieving

a balanced budget. But if the current slow-down in the economy turns into a serious recession then there will be compensatory efforts in a year or so to revive the economy through increased spending; and the goal of a balanced budget will be temporarily laid aside.

Support for the reauthorization of the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act may be the bellwether of these shifts. After 1976, efforts to revive the economy resulted in an increase in the appropriations for the Act from \$1.6 billion to \$11 billion in 1979. Today (1982), because the economy has worsened, and because attention has shifted to balancing the budget, CETA will undoubtedly receive renewed scrutiny, a completely "new" look in its reauthorization, and probably—far fewer dollars in support. If there should be a serious recession, with accompanying higher rates of unemployment, the tendency of Congress is to set aside partisan differences and restore—to some degree—some of those lost dollars.

Other areas of federal support will not show such clear swings, although they will be affected in general by the prevailing general mood on spending. Even within this restricted economic framework, other factors will influence decisions on the exact degree of federal support for particular programs.

For instance, federal elementary and secondary education programs will almost surely feel comparable curtailments in funding ceilings. This decision is based in part on the "new Federalism" but can also be laid to the rapidly declining enrollments now occurring in the schools.

The degree of federal assistance for education is bound to be affected by these trends. Its political effects are more easily understood when it is realized that ten years ago 44 percent of the adults in the country had children in public schools while today only 28 percent are public school parents and two of three adults have no children of school age at all.

Conversely, it is estimated that by 1990 one of every five Americans will be 55 years of age or older. This group will then actually exceed the number of children in school. Since elderly persons vote the most regularly of all age group and since many of them will undoubtedly be living on tight incomes, an era of growth in federal services for older people assuredly lies ahead.

The beginnings of this trend can be seen in the rash of bills recently introduced to expand special counseling services for the elderly. It can also be seen in the clamor to become a member of the House Select Committee on Aging—a committee that can only hold hearings and that cannot actually write legislation but that nonetheless has 45 members—more than a tenth of the House of Representatives.

Consequently, it can be seen that federal support for guidance and counseling will rise and fall at different levels in different programs depending on the particular or general factors affecting those programs, and depending on such general factors as the economy and the overall level of federal spending.

Another important factor affecting support for guidance is the attitude that officials in the various federal departments and agencies take towards such services. Since so many different federal agencies administer the vast array of programs affecting guidance, the attitude in one program

can be quite different from that in another.' This factor is much more important for counseling than it is for many other social services, precisely because federal support for counseling is spread among so many federal departments and agencies.

The same holds true for the Congress. Since so many different congressional committees and subcommittees have jurisdiction over all of these programs, the attitude of the various full committee and subcommittee chairpersons towards counseling can lead to quite varied treatment.

One example of this factor is a recently enacted law that provides special counseling and psychological aid to Vietnam veterans. That legislation focuses additional federal aid for outpatient counseling and mental health follow-up services on these veterans. Its enactment is due to the responsiveness of Senator Alan Cranston (Dem., CA) and others to that approach. A different set of personalities could have written a quite different bill not so clearly focused on providing counseling assistance.

Still another example of pending legislation affecting counselors is HR 4974, the Vocational Guidance Act of 1981. Because its intent is to amend current (PL. 94-482, Title II) vocational education law, without increasing total appropriations, its cointroducers Congressmen Kildee (Dem., Mich) and Goodling (Rep., PA) find particular merit in its approach to increased private sector involvement by counselors and by students enrolled in vocational programs.

## CONCLUSION

General economic trends and overall demographic trends obviously cannot be controlled, but the responsiveness of political decision-makers is clearly a variable. In this regard, the counseling profession will help to determine its own future.

Just as the ground lost in federal support for counseling in education was partially regained, then lost again, so can other fields of federal aid feel the activism of counselors. Absent that activism, counselors will be subject to a future determined by others.

In addition to political activism, the profession ought to deal with the other factors affecting federal aid: the feeling that counseling is merely a component of programs and therefore not properly aided separately, a concern over the role of counselors and of the effects of counseling, and the seemingly excessive use of jargon in public presentations by the representatives of counseling.

Obviously, not all of these perceptions can be changed easily. But an awareness of them and of decision-makers' perceptions of the profession will better enable counseling to present itself in such a way as to secure a proper degree of support to provide its services to those in need.

The federal disposition is not preordained. The activism of individuals and of their organizations will largely determine those results.

In the days ahead counseling must make the best possible case that its services make a difference, and that in these times of fiscal austerity a cutback in support for counseling will mean a real loss to individuals. If that case can be made, and if the profession assumes an activist role, then support will follow.

# PART FOUR

## Professional Challenges: A Three-Part Reflection

---



# 10

## Credentialism: Protection for the Public or the Professional?

Allen E. Ivey  
University of Massachusetts, Amherst

---

"Persons without credentials in mental health can have a positive, measurable effect on individuals in need of help . . . whatever enables one person to help another is not the exclusive province of the credentialed mental health professional. . . Few findings in the area of mental health have been replicated as often with such a variety of helpers, helpees, and outcome criteria" (Anthony & Carkhuff, 1977, p. 113).

"Unfortunately, the present situation is almost totally out of control. Despite the existence of laws regulating the practice of psychology, social work and psychiatry, essentially nothing prevents a licensed practitioner from originating a new technique, claiming cures, and using it widely on clients. Even more distressing is the fact that thousands of unlicensed persons are now practicing their own versions of psychological therapy under titles and guises that are not legally controlled . . . it is vital that professionals and the public press for uniform state licensing laws that demand quality therapeutic performance prior to licensure and that restrict unlicensed use of therapy techniques" (Lambert, Bergin, & Collins, 1977, p. 477).

Two statements, both taken from careful reviews of the literature, illustrate the dilemma faced by the helping professions. It is clear that counseling can help or harm individuals and the uncontrolled provision of services can actually hurt the public through incompetence and char-

latanry.<sup>1</sup> At the same time, the data are clear that unlicensed volunteers, paraprofessionals, and aides can be as effective (and often more effective than certified and licensed counselors, psychologists, social workers, and psychiatrists).

The prime responsibility of the government and the profession is to represent and protect the public, the people whom both serve. The traditional route toward consumer protection has been the careful delineation of educational and training standards so that one is adequately prepared to deliver services. Unfortunately, *education does not equal competence*. The real issue for the future is not the determination of the most appropriate training for counselors and therapists, but rather the determination of what competent ethical performance is, how it can be measured, and how it can be communicated clearly to the public.

The central thesis of this chapter is that *credentialism is only relevant insofar as it pertains to effective service delivery*. Present systems do not offer sufficient information and protection for the public. A credentialism based solely on education and training tends to mystify or obscure the actual practice of counseling and therapy. A more effective, consumer-oriented approach would focus on the competence of the practitioner and what he or she actually can do to enhance the life of the person seeking aid. Further, there is a tendency within credentialism to focus on the single "most effective" mode of service delivery. People with differing concerns and problems and from differing ethnic and social backgrounds tend to react in varying ways to the helping process. It has been found, for example, that 50 percent of Asian-Americans, Blacks, Chicanos, and Native Americans terminate counseling after the first interview (Sue & McKinney, 1975), expressing dissatisfaction with the WASP prototype counselor.

This chapter presents five major policy recommendations leading toward a more open and equitable delivery system for mental health services. The recommendations, based on research in the profession, would lead to a delivery system that would: (a) be based on freedom of choice in that clients would have the power to determine who and what type of service delivery they wanted; (b) certify alternative agencies and a wider array of service providers as eligible for third-party payments and state and federal funds so as to ensure freedom of choice, with all such individuals and agencies required to demonstrate competence; (c) be based on an increased centralization of control of mental health providers in the immediate community; (d) give extensive attention to primary prevention; and (e) be culturally and individually relevant in that special populations, as defined by race, age, and sex would receive appropriate and adequate service.

The purpose of the policy recommendations that follow is to challenge legislators and counseling professionals to develop and support effective programs of licensure and accreditation that serve and protect the consumer rather than the professional.

---

<sup>1</sup>See Nietzel, M. and Fisher, M. G. (1981) for their critique of the "romantic mystique" surrounding the paraprofessional.

*Licensure and accreditation procedures cannot be separated from the effective delivery of human services to the public. As such, this list of policy recommendations deliberately ties licensure and accreditation policy recommendations to effective service delivery.* In the past, single professions have sought and won approval for restricting their services without adequate documentation of their ability to deliver services to the consumer.

## POLICY RECOMMENDATION 1

Given the diversity of the U.S. population, it is necessary to provide an array of distinct and diversified mental health delivery alternatives that are of demonstrated quality. Those who provide these alternatives must be screened for competence. These alternatives may or may not have traditionally certified practitioners on their staffs. Further, alternative service providers need not necessarily follow traditional routes of academic training and licensure.

Legislative implications of this policy:

1. It is recommended that *individual* certification procedures of psychologists, social workers, and psychiatrists continue much as they are. Despite some questions as to their efficacy, there is at least some evidence that these certification and licensure procedures act to protect the public.
2. It is recommended that *alternative human service agencies* such as street clinics, volunteer alcohol prevention agencies, programs for battered women, and other innovative groups who do *not* have traditionally certified psychiatrists, social workers, and psychologists on their staffs be accredited for third-party payments (e.g., by insurance agencies, state departments of social welfare, etc.) and for full access to all federal and state funds.

Research data are clear that these nontraditional agencies, operating at desired levels, can often serve the diversified U.S. population more effectively (and at less cost) than mental health professionals certified by traditional routes. A free marketplace thrives on competition. At present, psychiatrists, social workers, and psychologists have a monopoly on services, thus promoting an artificially scarce supply. In background data to be presented, it is clearly demonstrated that such alternative service delivery systems can be a highly useful alternative to the expensive and sometimes inappropriate delivery system provided by traditional mental health professionals (see Johnson and O'Brien, 1981; Romaniuk, *et al*, 1981 for related discussions on church workers and the older peer counselor).

3. It is recommended that individual certification for third-party payments be extended to new professional groups such as rehabilitation counselors, guidance workers, marriage and family counselors. Therapy and counseling are generic skills much as less expensive generic drugs are suitable alternatives to expensive "name drugs"

from pharmaceutical concerns. Research again has demonstrated that a wide array of individuals can perform at the same level or at higher levels than many present psychologists, psychiatrists, and social workers.

In summary, the diverse needs of the United States population for mental health services can no longer be adequately met by traditional professions and their members. It is assumed in this discussion that an artificial scarcity has developed raising the price of services to unreasonable levels. Opening the marketplace to alternative agencies and alternative personnel will likely maintain the level of mental health services and help lower the costs of service delivery.

## POLICY RECOMMENDATION 2

Given the need for more equitable and economic delivery, state certification and licensure boards (and national, where appropriate) should implement procedures whereby alternative agencies and alternative mental health professionals shall have the opportunity to demonstrate their competence and eligibility for funds. Legislative implications of this policy:

1. It is recommended that consumers stratified by race, sex, and SES be given majority representation on mental health accreditation and licensure boards. Professionals such as psychiatrists, social workers, and psychologists should be represented in such numbers as they are proportionately in each state. Further, as alternative agencies and individuals gain certification and licensure under new laws, these practitioners or groups shall obtain proportional representation on accreditation and licensure boards.

A major change represented by this recommendation is that professionals no longer shall regulate themselves, but ultimately should be controlled by consumers. This, of course, is in the tradition of Boards of Directors of large corporations or Boards of Trustees of colleges and universities. The New York State Board of Regents is one example of this policy that is already in effect.

2. It is recommended that competency-based criteria be established for certifying all professionals, individual service deliverers, and agencies. Too long have we relied on education and training as the means for proving "competence," failing to require professionals and those seeking licensure to *demonstrate* that they can make a difference in the lives of their clients.

In the attached discussion, specific recommendations based on research data and practical experience are suggested whereby a competency-based approach to individual and agency certification and licensure is feasible.

3. It is recommended that all individual and agency mental health service deliverers open their practices to consumer inspection. This could mean providing (in an ethical fashion) videotapes and types-

cripts of past counseling and therapy performance for possible clientele to read and view, development of a meaningful peer review system (which would include alternative agency staff examining traditional professionals and vice versa), data about the short- and long-term effectiveness of psychotherapy (including data about possible negative effects in therapy as well demonstrated by research). Wherever possible; e.g., in those cases where the prospective client is not so highly disturbed as to preclude such choice—consumers will choose their mode of service delivery and individual or group service deliverer rather than being “assigned” to a staff member without consultation. Data are clear that each client does not relate equally well with each therapist or mental health deliverer. Freedom of choice has long been denied in mental health areas. A new openness to examination of practice is required.

### POLICY RECOMMENDATION 3

Given the need for more adequate coordination of mental health services, it is necessary to thoroughly reorganize service delivery systems and centralize related agencies wherever possible. In addition, it is equally important that the diversity of alternative agencies and alternative service delivery systems be maintained. Despite this new scope, it is critical that costs of mental health services not be increased.

Legislative implications of this policy:

1. It is recommended that human service delivery systems and mental health systems in particular be centralized in communities where citizens can take control of their own desires rather than relying on distant professionals and bureaucrats to determine their fate. It may be noted that through laws such as P.L. 94-142 that schools are playing an increasingly important part in the delivery of human services and in mental health services in particular. School districts (especially as represented by a high school or regional high school “catchment area”) are the best place in U.S. society to centralize services. They are natural organization points for the centralization of services. With the closing of school buildings because of population changes, many communities offer these physical facilities at relatively low cost for innovative service centralization. It is recommended that mental health services and agencies be brought together insofar as possible in school districts. Ideally, placement services, rehabilitation services, social benefits, etc. should also be placed in such centralized locations.
2. Locally elected officials should be in charge of human service delivery systems as a Board of Control roughly equal to the present school committee. They will be vested with deciding who and what agency can be vested with the responsibility for provision of human services within state or federal guidelines.
3. Diversity of services shall be encouraged through specific funding, both formerly initiated alternative agencies or those already ac-

credited. A certain percentage of funds shall be delegated for innovative projects initiated by community members.

In summary, mental health services should be increasingly centralized in local communities and brought under community control. At the same time, however, diversity of services relevant to each community is necessary. At larger units beyond the school district catchment area, innovation and new projects can be encouraged at country and state levels. Given the broad diversity of U.S. society, it is appropriate that individual agencies be given the opportunity to respond uniquely to the need of their own community without undue interference by the state. Given a time of economic adversity and the increasing difficulty of obtaining funds, it is appropriate that a new "diversified centralism" be developed.

## **POLICY RECOMMENDATION 4**

Given the need for primary prevention and the obvious economic benefits of such activities, a minimum of 25 percent of the national mental health budget should be applied to an array of community-based developmental and educational mental health programs and projects.

1. It is recommended that schools, alternative service agencies, and individual practitioners be encouraged to initiate developmental/educational workshops, courses, and training programs in values education, parent training, community development, communication skill training, and other such programs that have demonstrated effectiveness and show considerable promise in reducing the need for more expensive remedial services.
2. It is recommended that communities develop innovative programs in conjunction with welfare, Social Security, and other agencies of an educational/developmental nature with the aim of reducing dependence on state funds. Specific job training, health training, and human effectiveness training can reduce the long-range welfare and social costs caused by ineffective and inefficient programs currently in place.
3. It is recommended that state and federal agencies develop standards (with appropriate consumer, and professional consultation) for the delivery of such developmental and primary prevention activities.

## **POLICY RECOMMENDATION 5**

Given the need for innovative new modes of mental health delivery, it is especially critical that specific populations of varying race, age, and sex be given specific and special consideration in each community.

It is recommended that the reader turn to the specific policy recommendations in Chapter 5 that speak to special needs of these groups. There is real



danger in any reassessment of delivery services that those most in need will again turn out to be those that receive the smallest amount of service.

Further, it is critical to note that mental health professionals are *not* necessarily the most qualified persons to work with special populations. Data are clear that clients stay in counseling and feel more satisfied with results when they are counseled by people whose background closely resembles their own. We can no longer assume that degree-oriented professionals are the "people of choice" for all mental health concerns.

## Comment

The above recommendations in some ways seem radical and impossible. The goal of the remainder of this paper is to demonstrate that they are indeed "doable," logical, and are backed up by extensive theoretical and research data. Further, careful examination will reveal that these recommendations are in concert with Hogan's four volume series (1978, 1979), *The Regulation of Psychotherapists*. Hogan's work is the most comprehensive study available on licensing counselors and psychotherapists. As in this series of recommendations, he concludes that licensure protects the professional more than the public, that consumers must control their own destiny more fully, that competency standards for certification are more important than education and training, and that alternative routes toward licensing and certification beyond those presently available are needed.

## On the Competence of Professionals and Nonprofessionals to Deliver Services

Although the research data on the effectiveness of counseling and psychotherapy are mixed, there is increasingly clear evidence that they do make a positive difference in the lives of clients (c.f., Garfield & Bergin, 1978; Gurman & Razin, 1977). Given the assumption of effectiveness, the research issue in mental health service delivery has turned to "which treatment is most appropriate for which individual with what problem and in what contextual situation?" *Differential treatment*—the selection of the most appropriate treatment alternative for each client—is clearly the wave of the future.

Goldstein and Stein (1976) have conducted a careful review of psychotherapy literature to determine what it says about appropriate methods of treatment for a wide array of problems that might appear for therapy (e.g., depression, phobia, smoking, obesity, etc.). They then summarize the findings for these and other problems making specific treatment recommendations based on the literature. Research data clearly indicate that in certain mental health problems there is a "treatment of choice." A treatment of choice, however, still depends on the individual needs and background of the unique client. Authier and Lutey (1979), for example, illustrate this point with a discussion of the "tearfully de-

pressed" client. A client who has recently lost a spouse through death and is tearful and depressed is *different from* a client who one year later remains tearful. A client with suicidal ideation is *different from* a sociopathic individual who may be using tears as a means to "con" the therapist. These four types represent only a few of the many individuals who might present the facade of tearful depression. Obviously, each needs a different method of treatment. Unfortunately, research data from Goldstein and Stein (1976) reveal only seven studies on depression and do not consider the wide array of depressive types that might appear in a clinical interview. Thus, it seems clear that diagnostic categories alone do not provide sufficient data for us to make informed clinical decisions. Differential treatment is indeed more complex.

The skilled helper needs to be able to meet the needs of a diversified clientele whose background (both in terms of problem and socioeconomic status) may be unfamiliar to even the most highly trained professional. Further, when the extensive demands for mental health services in our complex society are considered, one begins to wonder if *any* professional can indeed meet the needs of all clients.

We have mentioned earlier that up to 50 percent of nonwhite clients drop out of psychotherapy (Sue, 1977). Most therapists tend to be white, middle-class individuals working out of white, middle-class theories and structures. Berzins (1977) has reviewed the literature on "matching models" in counseling and psychotherapy and has attempted to synthesize key points in terms of favorable matching of patients and clients. Among important findings in this literature is that the more similar the background of client and therapist, the longer a client may stay in therapy and the more satisfied he or she may be. It seems but a small step to suggest that the high drop-out rate among many nonmajority clients may be a result of ineffective matching with a counselor or therapist who simply is presently unable to meet the client effectively. Lorion (1978) reports research that indicates that sensitivity to this dynamic in training for counselors and clients could ultimately reduce drop-outs among disadvantaged clients.

The paraprofessional movement has grown in strength and power over the years. Reviews by Anthony and Carkhuff (1978) and Rappaport (1977) are but two examples where it is concluded that *nonprofessionals appear to be as effective as professionals in delivering counseling services*. Regardless of how one interprets the data, the evidence for the efficacy of utilizing paraprofessional staff is highly convincing. An easy conclusion to draw from research is that extensive and expensive funding for psychiatrists, psychologists, and others may not be the wisest use of funds. Lambert, Bergin, and Collins (1977) wisely remind us, however, that if psychotherapy can help, so can it also be harmful if provided ineffectively. And there is no reason to suggest here that nonprofessionals with little experience or sense of ethics could not harm clients just as severely as could unethical and incompetent professionals. A tendency among some who endorse the paraprofessional movement is to grandly assume that abolition of professionals is "the answer." In truth, it seems more logical to consider a reasoned balance of professionals and nonprofessionals, both of whom are expected to deliver competent and ethical service.

Emrich, Lassen, and Edwards (1977) provide an important review of "Nonprofessional Peers as Therapeutic Agents." In this work, they discuss the impact and effectiveness of groups such as Alcoholics Anonymous, Synanon, and "TOPS" (Take Off Pounds Sensibly). Such community-based self-help groups provide an increasingly important array of services in this country. Groups for abused wives, feminist consciousness-raising groups, Alateen, senior citizen action committees, and many others are providing important personal contact and therapeutic gain for their members. Some have pointed out that the feminist movement, the Gay Rights movement, and the Black Power movement have each done more for mental health of their constituents than any professional mental health theory or service.

This evidence from paraprofessional literature has reinforced this writer's belief that counseling is a *generic skill* just as aspirin is a generic drug. Professionals have in fact restricted delivery of what should be a readily available service.

In my home community, there is a group working with battered women who carry an annual case load of approximately 200 and maintain a "safe house" (the location of which must be kept secret from local police, among whom are some who reportedly batter their own wives) for a cost of less than \$10,000 yearly. One cannot avoid the conclusion that the costs of their services are less than the salary of one underpaid social worker or counselor who might be working with less complex cases and could have real difficulty in understanding the specific needs of battered women.

As noted earlier, a free marketplace thrives on competition. It seems critical that clients be able to determine what type of agency and whom they want to offer them help. Psychotherapy and counseling are effective—they do help people. As provided by professionals, however, this is perhaps an overly expensive service that will not necessarily meet the needs of all clients. As such, the first recommendation of this policy paper is that a wider array of delivery services should be provided and supported by the state and federal governments. No longer can licensed professionals be the sole beneficiaries of third-party payments and government funding. Paraprofessionals and other groups should share in these benefits. Additional professional groups such as counselors who are members of the American Personnel and Guidance Association as well as therapists in family counseling offer strong data concerning their impact and effectiveness with clients. There has been a professional elitism in psychiatry and psychology that has failed to come to grips with the fact that other professions and other training routes exist that can provide quality services for clientele (c.f., A.P.G.A., 1978; Forster, 1977; Messina, 1979).

## On Ensuring Competence in Service Delivery

Given that many professionals, paraprofessionals, and community self-help groups can facilitate client growth and development, the question of certifying competence and ability to help becomes paramount. If both professionals and nonprofessionals can provide research evidence for as-

sisting clients, who should be licensed to help? Receive third-party payments? Obtain state and federal funds? Further, what role should the consumer play in these decisions? The second policy recommendation of this paper focuses on expanding licensure and certification opportunities to all helpers who can make a positive difference in the lives of their clients *and* who are chosen by clients to provide these services.

The consumer has too long been at the mercy of professionals who through effective lobbies, personal connections, and control of human service delivery systems have managed to make psychotherapy and counseling an artificially scarce resource that is marketed at a higher price than is necessary. Psychiatrists, psychologists, counselors, and others in conjunction with state and federal agencies and insurance companies have produced a virtual monopoly. Albee (1977) has commented that inclusion of psychology within national health insurance may be considered a subsidy "to the rich from the poor."

But what of the helping profession's efforts to insure competent services? Hadley and Strupp (1977) and Lambert, Bergin, and Collins (1977) have clearly demonstrated that counseling and psychotherapy can bring negative results upon their clientele. Research studies on "negative effects in psychotherapy" are convincing and logically tend to suggest that tightening licensing requirements and restricting helping to the most highly trained professionals is required to protect the public. Unfortunately, state and federal licensing requirements, the National Registry of Human Service Providers in Psychology, national examinations, etc., although seeking to protect the public, have proceeded full speed to ignore research data on counseling and therapy process and outcome, and use education and training as almost exclusive requirements for certification. The Professional Examination Service, for example, tests psychologists for state licensing boards with an examination that has no tested validity. *Specifically, the licensing test has to date not been related to competence in delivering service!* Professionals have tended to use data to say that licensure is needed, but then to ignore these same data when implementing "standards" of excellence.

Some of the best work justifying professionalism and inclusion of psychologists and professionals in National Health Insurance has been completed by Cummings (1977a, 1977b). Studying the cost-effectiveness of mental health services in the Kaiser-Permanente Health Plan in San Francisco, Cummings found that *effective* provision of counseling and psychotherapy could reduce the number of visits to physicians to the degree that total patient costs to the health plan were reduced. It has often been thought that provision of psychotherapy and counseling under a National Health Insurance system could bankrupt a total health plan. Cummings's work demonstrates that this is not necessarily so. The major issue, however, is the nature of *effective* psychotherapy and determining the most appropriate method of help for each individual. One interesting finding of Cummings's work was the discovery that with some patients long-term psychotherapy actually resulted in *increased* use of medical services. From these data, Cummings argues that: (a) effective psychotherapy of a short-term duration is cost-beneficial; (b) long-term and frequent psychotherapy begets more psychotherapy and more medical

visitation; (c) under judicious management, mental health will play an important part in a cost-effective program of National Health Insurance.

The question of "what" is effective, however, remains. How can competence in service delivery be manifested that is more meaningful and valid than present examination systems? Some alternative recommendations follow:

1. Examination for licensure and accreditation must demonstrate that the individual (or group) service provided makes a positive difference in the lives of clients. The direct presentation of clinical case material (e.g., videotapes, audiotapes, typescripts) coupled with theoretical statements as to why the therapist or counselor is acting as he or she did is a better base for measuring competence than degrees, internships, and test-taking ability.
2. There now exists an array of well-validated systems for classifying and rating the quality of helping interviews. These range from subjective ratings of empathy (e.g., Carkhuff, 1969a, 1969b), classification of the verbal utterances of counselors and their clients (Ivey & Gluckstern, 1974, 1976; Ivey & Authier, 1978), examination of counselor and client construct systems (Landfield, 1971), to computer analysis of language patterns of client and counselor (e.g., Meara, Shannon, & Pepinsky, 1979). Any of these systems singly or in combination, could add objective and systematic formulations to certification of competence among counselors and therapists. All are based on extensive research, allow for examination of client gain, and—perhaps most importantly—do not require that the interviewer/counselor/therapist have formal training before the quality of helping is measured. Through these systems it is possible to examine the quality of a therapy relationship of a board-certified psychiatrist, a school guidance counselor, and a community volunteer and to determine which indeed offers the most constructive relationship for the client.
3. Outcome measures of psychotherapy and counseling have progressed. The Sloan et al. study (1975), methods reviewed in Gurman and Razin (1977) and Garfield and Bergin (1978), plus others all suggest that it is now possible for any counselor or therapist to provide data for an examining board on their own personal effectiveness in professional function. Action research models, client reports, third party observers, easily administered scales of general well being (c.f., Dupuy, 1978) all could be part of any demonstration of "professional" competence.

The point of the above is that the burden of demonstrating effectiveness in counseling and therapy must be on the service provider, not on the training agency or with some professional association. It is people who deliver services and it is they who must demonstrate their abilities. Evidence to date is that most professionals can demonstrate reasonable levels of competence. Equally true, however, is that large number of nonprofessionals can demonstrate equally high levels of competence.

Further, it must be recalled that many professionals are not fully prepared to work with nonwhite, nonmiddle-class populations. Those of dif-



ferent cultures or socioeconomic backgrounds may receive effective services from nonprofessionals where professionals fail. A service delivery system relying on formal credentials may exclude large numbers of people from those same services unless professionals are carefully retooled and instructed in how to provide adequate services (Lorion, 1978).

In the policy recommendations in this paper, it was suggested that alternative agencies should be considered as viable for licensure. Under the policies suggested here, they would simply demonstrate the same competence required of professionals—the ability to assist clients. They obviously can and it seems to defy logic to prohibit such agencies from funds. Methods for certifying alternative agencies and new professional groups such as counselors within A.P.G.A., marital counseling agencies and professionals, nursing practitioners, etc. can and should be developed.

Undergirding this section is the belief that consumers must have *freedom of choice* in selecting their counselor or therapist. This is particularly true in public agencies where clients are routinely “assigned” a counselor. If the client leaves therapy, it is her or his “fault.” Little effort is given to following-up and assisting a client find a comfortable niche with a therapist of choice. A school guidance office assigns students to counselors giving no opportunity for self-selection or exploration. Freedom of choice in mental health services will require some variation of policy recommendation 2.3 of this paper where it is suggested that service providers open their agency and practice to consumer inspection, present videotapes or typescripts of past helping sessions, involve themselves in exacting peer review processes, and present personal background and idiosyncratic biases that may influence the flow of the helping process. The freedom of choice concept implies a voucher system where clients can choose where they go and to whom they will talk. Insurance, federal, and state funds should go where clients go rather than where credentials hold power.

This same freedom should include increased participation of consumers on certifying boards. Whereas psychiatrists, counselors, and psychologists now certify themselves, consumers need to have extensive opportunity to influence policy and decisions as to whom is competent to serve and which agencies are eligible for accreditation.

Needless to say, the sum and substance of these recommendations would radically alter the pattern of service delivery in this country. The basis for becoming a service provider would be objective ability to provide service rather than credentials. Further, it may be anticipated that nonprofessionals and professional groups now omitted from the opportunity to receive funds would enter into a freer marketplace and have the chance to demonstrate equal or superior competence to licensed professionals (or, conversely to demonstrate their lack of competence). With a larger marketplace, we can anticipate more even distribution of mental health services with adequate competency safeguards.

To summarize the main points of this section concerning competency in human service delivery:

1. While there is extensive research data indicating the efficacy of counseling and psychotherapy, there is also clear evidence that ineffective counseling and therapy can be damaging to a client. There-



- fore, it seems imperative that consumer protection measures be instituted in the form of licensing, peer review, and accreditation.
2. Unfortunately, existing licensing practices have tended to ignore research data and simply use education and training plus test-taking ability as sufficient for licensure. The effectiveness of present licensing procedures in assuring consumer protection is seriously questioned.
  3. Cummings's data at Kaiser Permanente clearly indicates that effective short-term relevant therapy can be cost effective. Previously cited data indicate that self-help groups, paraprofessionals, presently nonlicensed personnel (e.g., guidance workers, marriage counselors, psychiatric nurses) are likely to be as effective as professionals in providing service. Thus the major issue becomes defining "effectiveness" as a criterion for licensure.
  4. From currently available training and research literature a number of competency-based clinical presentations and evaluation instruments exist whereby actual competence in service delivery can be measured and demonstrated. It is no longer necessary to rely on outmoded credentials such as the Ph.D., Ed.D., or M.D. as "competency" measures. *The ultimate question is what can the professional or paraprofessional offer the client?*
  5. Clients must have freedom of choice in selecting their counselor or therapist. Data must be generated in an open way (tapes, advertisements, etc.) that permit consumers to make informed choices rather than being "assigned" to a therapist or counselor. Advocacy assistance may be needed to help clients whose first or second choice do not prove satisfactory.

## On the Need for Reorganization of Service Delivery Systems

... if I could figure out a strategy and a technique, it would include making real the distinctions of individual and society ... in a therapeutic context. I would not permit a patient to say, "It's the social system which has imposed itself on me," thereby ignoring, or obfuscating, the fact that the social system is inside of one, not outside of one and pressuring one. On the other hand, neither would I permit patients to take on the whole responsibility for their situation and to ignore the fact that they have been formed originally in a social context (Lichtman, 1978, p. 17).

To date the delivery of counseling and psychotherapeutic services has been conceptualized as primarily an individual phenomena. *Individuals* come to counselors and therapists and receive *individual* counseling and therapy about *individual* problems. Although group and family approaches are important developments in the field, even they are closely related to individual approaches, seldom considering broader contextual-environmental issues.

Community psychology (e.g., Rapaport, 1977; Lewis & Lewis, 1981 and 1977) helps us view communities, schools, businesses, and institutions as systems impacting on individuals. Changes in institutions may

be more powerful and impactful on the mental health of individuals than years of individual therapy. Some would point out that the Black Power movement, the women's movement, and similar action groups have—from an environmental base—done more to help individuals than years of counseling and therapy.

The issue, however, is not individual versus community interventions. Rather, it seems vital to consider the individual in the context of her or his living situation, the total environment. In some cases individual interventions are appropriate, in others more broadly based community action is required. The competent practitioner of the future must integrate work in the community with traditional professional practice.

Present organizational frames for delivery of helping services need careful examination to discover new, more relevant approaches that do not dismember the client into a wide array of social agencies. Typically, a family in distress may visit a community mental health clinic for therapy, a family services clinic for family group work, a social welfare office for financial benefits, the employment service for unemployment compensation or job search, Social Security for SSI benefits, the school for action on child educational problems, and so forth. Many families and individuals drop out of the "helping" network as they are pushed from agency to agency. Further duplication of services is rampant and extensive waste of federal, state, and local funds occurs as agencies compete for clientele.

The Danish Social Legislation of 1974 provides an interesting model for reorganization of social services, especially for children and youth. Believing that the focus of service delivery should be on the client rather than on the specific training background of the professional, Denmark has begun to centralize helping agencies in single locations and to blur professional roles. (As indicated earlier, we have no data indicating that any one profession is more effective at providing helping services than another.) These new centers provide conception to death services and involve both individual and community services. The new agencies are often located in schools and the intent is to have the agency provide services for a territory roughly the same size as that of a school district. The school guidance worker, social service benefit officer, counselor/therapist, and other related specialists become one person instead of a widely dispersed group of professionals. No longer is it necessary to maintain separate offices and worry about communication linkage.

The United States is not Denmark. Could such a model work effectively in this country? Under the Office of Children and Youth of the Department of Labor, several experimental projects have been initiated in which an integration of services closely similar to that described in Denmark is attempted. Early results are promising. This should not be surprising for under Public Law 94-142 schools have become perhaps the major purveyor of human services in this country. Counselors, school psychiatrists, psychologists, social workers, audiologists, and others meet with parents and child to develop an integrated plan of attack to resolve a wide array of difficulties. P.L. 94-142 is an important and effective beginning step toward a reorganization of helping services within each community.

Under such an organization, it would be possible to bring together different professionals and nonprofessionals in one setting for client benefit at lower taxpayer expense. Specialized agencies (in-patient psychiatric facilities, schools for the emotionally or physically handicapped requiring special treatment beyond school capability, juvenile homes, etc.) can be developed through the joint efforts of areas served by several small school districts or as special functions of larger districts.

It must be remembered, however, that simple reorganization of services does not equal improved service delivery. A sad, but common, fact of systems is their constant reorganization with little change in what happens to people. Crucial to the suggested changes here is accountability. At present it is too easy to shift off difficult and troublesome clients to some other agency, citing some regulative authority as responsible. With newly centralized services, workers simply would be unable to refer as they are responsible for the unique needs of each client. In addition, because of centralization of functions, workers would have the power to arrange funds, employment, and mental health services as needed. With our present mode of service delivery, the helper who is powerless to make a difference in the lives of clients evokes apathy, discouragement, and even hostility on the part of colleagues as well as clientele. If human service workers were able to cover the full range of human needs, there is at least preliminary evidence that their interest in their jobs and the people whom they would serve would increase. We have seen these changes in certain staff who work with Public Law 94-142; staff empowered with funds and special services to *actually meet* the needs of their clients.

At one level, the changes suggested here are staggering in scope. It is suggested that competing professions meet together, blend their roles and functions, and work with clients within the community in an intimacy not heretofore conceived possible. When a client comes for help, *all* human services could be mustered on sites there would be few requirements for delayed or outside referral. At another level, the changes are mild. With the focus on meeting client needs, each counselor or human service worker would be able to work through with the client a total program of service far more quickly and easily than is presently possible. The need for psychotherapy and counseling would likely diminish (as was found in Cummings's work) as a more integrated level of service was provided.

Would human service workers be able to provide all these services? The answer is a qualified "yes." Ivey and McGowan (1979) describe the functions of native social workers in the Canadian Arctic. Young Inuit (Eskimo) social workers typically have from five to eleven years of education. All their specialized training has been through workshops and individualized training provided by area supervisors. Yet without college degrees or Masters of Social Work, these nonprofessionals handle all the complexities of adoption, parole, probation, financial benefits, individual counseling, and community outreach programs (e.g., a teenage drop-in center). In short they fulfill more social work functions than most traditional workers from more southerly climates can now claim. Thus, it does not seem extreme to suggest that master's and doctoral level professionals in this country should be able to handle a wider array of activities than those in which they presently engage.

The "yes" answer, however, was qualified. The qualification centers not on competence of staff to deliver services, but on the need for continuing to expand our diverse array of helping services. Each community is unique. An alcohol-abuse program may be needed in one community, a drug-abuse center in another. Some communities will be intensely interested in psychoeducational activities and parenting classes, others may prefer new recreational facilities for children or meals for senior citizens. An important feature of human services and counseling facilities in this country has been diversity in emphasis. The argument here is that centralization is desirable, but it must not eliminate the unique and innovative approaches that each community has developed and will continue to wish to develop. As such, funding must be provided for alternative agencies with special emphases.

To summarize this section, it is proposed that helping services of a wide range of types be brought together in school district "catchment areas" and that blurring of professional and nonprofessional roles be undertaken. Then, rather than forcing clients to transfer among agencies to receive services, clients would work with a single helper (of their choice, not the agencies "assignment") to work through all problems. A small group of specialized professionals (e.g., audiologists, physicians, physical therapists) would back up the generalist helper. It is anticipated that counseling and psychotherapy needs would diminish with fully adequate and integrated services. Counseling and psychotherapy, for the most part, would be provided in these broad-based school agencies rather than by expensive and exclusive professionals who may not be able to relate to all members of a community, particularly those who do not come from their same middle-class strata.

## Prevention Is More Important Than "Cure"

There is no cure for life. The client in counseling or therapy who comes to realize that life is a never-ending array of difficult decisions and problems—and it is necessary to live with this fact—is well on the way to increased mental health. Too many clients come to psychotherapy expecting to solve their problems by finding magic answers to the totally comfortable life. But the most basic and important learning that can come from any counseling or therapeutic procedure is the realization that one will always face problems, conflicts, and difficulties and that one of the major developmental tasks of life is to surmount these issues with as much persistence as possible. In psychotherapy clients learn new ways of conceptualizing the world and new skills that will be helpful to them in maintaining a new equilibrium.

Yet,

"... The sheer magnitude of psychosocial problems demands that we revolutionize traditional forms of helping in ways that will increase our effectiveness. Current methods cannot succeed because they aim at remediation of the few in crisis instead of promoting psychological growth for all and because traditional practices do nothing to cure the pathogenic institutions that cause 'mental illness' and create major obstacles to normal development.

We can no longer afford the luxury of treating individuals or small groups while ignoring the 'sick' institutions that produce the symptoms in people we try to heal—too late to have prevented the symptoms.

... As counselors we collude in the misdiagnosis of 'the problem' by treating victims of inhumane institutions instead of mobilizing ourselves and others to restructure learning, interpersonal and intergroup relations, and schools so that there will be more healthy human beings and fewer casualties.

... We advocate a new definition of counselor role: that of psychological educator who actively intervenes in the life of institutions and teaches healthy skills to others" (Ivey & Alschuler, 1973, pp. 591–592).

## Models of Prevention

Prevention of psychological distress is generally discussed within two models. The *primary prevention model* (Caplan, 1964) seeks to deal with the multitude of factors in a community that induce mental *ill*-health through varied activities in the community to enhance personal and community development. The *psychoeducational model* (Ivey & Alschuler, 1973; Authier, Gustafson, Guernsey, & Kasdorf, 1975) gives less attention to "fighting" illness and emphasizes positive human development.

Most of the advocates of such an approach agree that the educational model means psychological practitioners seeing their function not in terms of abnormality (or illness) ◊ diagnosis ◊ prescription ◊ therapy ◊ cure; but rather in terms of client dissatisfaction (or ambition) ◊ goal setting ◊ skill teaching ◊ satisfaction or goal achievement (Authier, Gustafson, Guernsey, & Kasdorf, 1975, p. 31).

Thus the psychoeducational model is concerned with people setting their own goals and using educational methods to help them achieve their objectives.

The primary prevention and psychoeducational models are closely related, however. Primary prevention may involve psychoeducational techniques and all psychoeducational procedures are forms of primary prevention. The medical model of illness, however, dominates primary prevention techniques whereas psychoeducation assumes "wellness" and is concerned with positive human development and realization of potential. The distinction is small, but important. Both approaches demand community intervention, organizational development, the teaching of helping and communication skills to lay populations, and a wide array of psychoeducational alternatives (Rappaport, 1977; Lewis & Lewis, 1981 and 1977; Ivey & Alschuler, 1973; and Authier, Gustafson, Guernsey, & Kasdorf, 1975).

The recommendation that a minimum 25 percent of mental health and counseling budgets be given to cost-beneficial psychoeducation and primary prevention programs is based largely on the evidence cited, with important support coming from the Executive Branch of Government.

The President's Commission on Mental Health (1978) has developed a broad framework for prevention that includes prenatal and perinatal care, child health assessment and development, developmental day-care programs, and foster care. An implicit federal confirmation of such a rec-



ommendation on prevention: a proposed "Center for Prevention" is mentioned as needed by that Commission in the Federal Government to develop increased understanding of the potential social value of improved mental health.

Implementing prevention activities in school-based mental health/human service unit is a more natural activity than would be seen today in a typical community mental health center. Schools are close to children and families and have a prevention/psychoeducational history making implementation of community-based educational and developmental activities more logical. As schools have moved closer to meeting the mental health needs of their communities through Public Law 94-142 and other legislative programs it may be anticipated that a school-based mental health system would be more responsive and effective than presently existing modes of service delivery.

The many possibilities for primary prevention and psychoeducational activities will not be spelled out here. What is critical to underscore is that all types of emotional "illnesses" or "psychiatric disturbance" are amenable to primary prevention and psychoeducational approaches. Carkhuff (1969a, 1969b), Authier, Gustafson, Guernsey, and Kasdorf (1975), Danish and Hauer (1973); Goldstein (1973); and Ivey and Authier (1978) each report, and support highly documented and research based methods of psychoeducational change as opposed to demonstrably less effective, traditional modes of treatment. They confirm that populations as varied as inner city disadvantaged youth, in-patient psychiatrically disturbed, intellectually retarded, parents of disturbed youth, juvenile court populations, and a wide variety of culturally different groups can and do respond to the psychoeducational model. It is time for a major controlled comparative test of traditional therapy and counseling approaches against the specific modes of psychoeducation and the practice of primary prevention. Existing data suggest that these newer and less expensive approaches will be more effective in both the short and long run than our present-day method of providing mental health services through individual therapy.

An important point in the psychoeducational model's favor is that its methods can be employed both with normal and "disturbed" populations. The distinction between a treatment approach and a prevention approach becomes blurred and irrelevant as similar methods are used with each imparting a special dignity to the individual. Lewis and Lewis (1977) essentially present a psychoeducational view of community change when they talk about the importance of professional practitioners teaching community members to take charge of their own lives and to manage their own collective affairs rather than having professionals dictate to them what is "correct" and "needed."

## Toward Licensing Culturally and Individually Effective Helping Professionals

Licensure and accreditation systems have given scant attention to culturally different populations. The tradition has been to certify and license



individuals who meet educational standards recommended by professionals in the specialty area. Shimberg and Roederer (1978) have defined licensing as:

a process by which an agency of the government grants permission to an individual to engage in a given occupation upon finding that the applicant has attained the minimal degree of competency required to ensure that the public health, safety, and welfare be reasonably protected (1978, p. 1).

The Shimberg and Roederer document is particularly important in that the Council of State Governments has given special attention to their comments and a series of workshops with legislatures and other licensing agencies have been conducted. Yet, Shimberg and Roederer, themselves, give little if any attention to issues of cultural differences among professional practitioners and clients. They do point out clearly that licensure boards often exist to protect the professional group rather than the public. They make valuable recommendations for more viable and responsive state and federal occupational licensing efforts.

Although giving no specific attention to culturally different populations, Shimberg and Roederer do provide suggestions for licensure and program implementation that would enable more relevant procedures:

While most applicants for entry into a regulated occupation usually apply after completion of an approved program of training, the law should make allowances for those who may have acquired their competence outside the formal educational system—in the armed forces, for example. It should also be recognized that for certain occupations no formal training programs presently exist. Drug and alcohol counselors, for example, often acquire their knowledge of chemical dependency through on-the-job training and experience. *Ways must be found to evaluate such individuals, not in terms of their formal training, but in terms of their demonstrated competence to perform the functions required by the job (Italics ours) (1978, pp. 6–7).*

*As indicated earlier, there are now highly specific ways in which helping professionals can demonstrate their competence. Traditional routes toward certification are inadequate.* These comments relate directly to earlier statements in this paper recommending that nonprofessionals and alternative professional groups (counselors, nurses, etc.) be the subjects of research demonstrating their competence. Further, evidence has been cited that suggests that highly trained middle-class professionals may not be as able to help certain groups as people more closely related to the life experience of the client (e.g., inner city disadvantaged youth, drug and alcohol populations, battered women, senior citizens).

As such, present licensing and accrediting laws as well as plans for third-party payments via insurance companies in mental health may be described as discriminatory. In this sense, it seems clear that Albee's (1977) comment that psychotherapy is a subsidy from the poor to the rich has some validity. This is especially so when one considers the data indicating that well-trained paraprofessionals may be able to deliver the same service as effectively as traditional personnel. Certification and licensure procedures must be opened to allow such people to demonstrate their competence and be eligible for funding, government support, and third-party payments.

Since a separate chapter of this series of policy papers speaks to the issue of distinct populations and the importance of providing culturally relevant treatment procedures, this section will conclude. The primary point to be made here is that data suggest that present-day modes of service delivery, accreditation, and licensure are not adequately tuned to the needs of all the population of this country. Poor people are denied freedom of choice in that they are unable to seek the type of help they would choose. No longer can we force them to seek traditional professional help that has not yet proved itself adequate to meet their needs. There appear to be alternatives that cost less and show more promise of results than continuing our current practice of expanding, accrediting, and licensing professionals who may not be fully equipped to respond to these needs.

A free marketplace where clients can choose their form of psychological help and their counselor (professional or paraprofessional), and obtain advocacy support to achieve their objectives is necessary. Simply put, present-day licensure and accreditation plans for delivery of mental health services discriminate in favor of psychiatrists and psychologists. But the literature of the field suggests that paraprofessionals and other professional groups beyond the monopoly professions are also able to help in the delivery of mental health services. In many cases, particularly among nonmajority populations, it appears that psychologists and psychiatrists may indeed be less effective than other professional and nonprofessional groups.

## EPILOGUE

### Implementing Social Policy: Recommendations Are Not Enough

Recommendations for changes in licensing and accreditation procedures are likely to fall on deaf ears unless adequate plans are made to ensure their consideration and eventual implementation. Public policy shifts are the result of a complex, interacting network of legislative, bureaucratic, and professional and personal actions at the federal, state, and local levels. Efforts to change licensing laws and accreditation criteria by a simple linear cause and effect model are naïve. For example, if this paper proposes admitting new professional and paraprofessional groups to licensure in counseling and psychotherapy, little action is likely to follow on written suggestions alone. Further, even if a single professional association (e.g., the American Psychological Association or the American Personnel and Guidance Association) should support this single recommendation, once again, little is likely to happen. Major shifts and changes in public policy are the result of a vast network of interlocking forces. Among these key forces are professional associations, elected officials, government administrators, and lay groups all operating at the local, state, and federal level.

Personal observations on the Washington scene reveal that elected members to Congress feel personally powerless to make changes similar to those described. The administrators in the Departments of Labor, Health, Education, and Welfare, Commerce, and others feel equally powerless. The White House itself clearly states its frustration with making things happen. Yet, as one wends his or her way through the Washington maze and examines how policy is made concerning the delivery of mental health and human services, one finds the constant hand of the American Medical Association. The A.M.A. provides a significant and powerful example of how policy is made and implemented in Washington. Through contacts with government officials: elected and/or civil service across all levels, the A.M.A. is able to influence and direct mental health policy formulation. How do they do this? The A.M.A. appears to be fully aware of the sense of powerlessness prevalent among those in Washington and brings special professional expertise and knowledge of the legislative process together with powerful and consistent lobbying efforts. The A.M.A. is able to influence legislation because it is there and knowledgeable. Its goals are clear and it knows how to transmit them. Further, the A.M.A. is backed up with strong state and local organizations who see that necessary support is available among critical populations. In a sense, it could be speculated that the A.M.A. task is easier at the state and local level, as constituencies competing with their aims are even more casually organized.

Does this mean that the American Medical Association is engaged in a systematic victimization of psychologists, social workers, counselors, and paraprofessional helpers? This is not likely, as the A.M.A. has the simple objective of selling its point of view effectively as possible. Believing as they believe about mental health services, they would be irresponsible if they did not lobby for their beliefs. There is no lobby in Washington or in California or North Dakota today with an equivalent influence. The task of psychology, social workers, and counselors may be simply stated as *"get your act together and sell your point of view effectively."*

Although I personally believe that the policy recommendations presented in this paper are potentially workable and beneficial to consumers, it is perhaps even more important to urge that professional associations of psychologists and counselors determine their own aims and goals as precisely as has the A.M.A.; to seek and systematically pursue their implementation as policy. Nonmedical professionals in our field must tend their own gardens and work on professional issues. Unless mental health workers move out of their narrow spheres, however, and on to the stage of public policy at local, federal, and state levels, the nature of their workplace and work-role could be determined more by chance (or by the A.M.A.) than by choice.

This paper closes with one first-hand observation of public policy in action. The training branch of the National Institute of Mental Health provides funds to support training for the national network of mental health service workers. Before considering how funds are distributed in this branch, it is important to note that paraprofessionals provide 38 percent of direct service contact in community health centers and more

than 50 percent of direct service when all mental health service delivery systems are pooled (Bass, 1979). Further, these paraprofessionals tend to be heavily nonwhite and female as compared with psychiatrists and psychologists. Psychiatrists provide the smallest number of direct service hours, but receive 40 percent of NIMH training funds. The paraprofessional branch receives three percent. As might be expected, psychologists, social workers, and psychiatric nurses receive funding at levels less than psychiatrists, but far above paraprofessionals.

The decisions of the National Institute of Mental Health to fund an A.M.A. group, psychiatrists, did not occur by chance. Funding for psychiatric training over other alternatives came from long-term, well-planned lobbying at all levels and areas of government. Unless alternative providers meet this challenge and unite behind new modes and methods of providing for the public, it can be anticipated that changes in their behalf will be small, gradual, and uneventful. *Without organization and extensive effort, the system will not change.* The American Psychological Association has recently become more active and is making a fuller impact on the Washington and state legislative scenes. Their model is close to that of the A.M.A. The question remains, will the A.P.A. and A.M.A. determine how mental health services are to be delivered or will other groups; ergo, A.P.G.A., become more active and competitive in their pursuit of a major role in this decision?

The current diffusion of federal policy to the individual states creates a new and open opportunity for counselors to become active representatives of their clients. Traditional lobbying efforts focused at the federal level are no longer as viable or productive due to this power shift. With such changes come opportunities to affect policy in significant and innovative ways.

## REFERENCES

- Albee, G. Does including psychotherapy in health insurance represent a subsidy to the rich from the poor? *American Psychologist*, 1977, 32, 719-721.
- American Personnel and Guidance Association. *Licensure Committee Action Packet*. APGA, Washington, D.C., 1978.
- Anthony, W., & Carkhuff, R. The functional professional therapeutic agent: In A. Gurman and A. Razin (Eds.) *Effective psychotherapy*. New York: Pergammon, 1977, pp. 103-119.
- Authier, J., Gustafson, K., Guernsey, B., Jr., & Kasdorf, J. The psychological practitioner as a teacher: A theoretical-historical and practice review. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 1975, 5, 31-50.
- Authier, J., & Lutey, B. Clinical management of the tearfully depressed patient. *Journal of Psychiatric Nursing and Mental Health Services*, February 1979.
- Bass, R. *Who's minding the store?* C.M.H.C. Staffing. Washington: U.S.D.H.E.W., N.I.M.H., B-16, 1979.
- Berzins, J. Therapist-patient matching. In A. Gurman and A. Razin (Eds.) *Effective psychotherapy*. New York: Pergammon, 1977, pp. 222-251.
- Caplan, G. *Principles of preventive psychiatry*. New York: Basic Books, 1964.
- Carkhuff, R. *Helping and human relations* (Vol. 1). New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1969a.

- Carkhuff, R. *Helping and human relations* (Vol. 2). New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1969b.
- Cummings, N. The anatomy of psychotherapy under national health insurance. *American Psychologist*, 1977a, 32, 711-718.
- Cummings, N. Prolonged (ideal) versus short-term (realistic) psychotherapy. *Professional Psychology*, 1977b, 8, 491-501.
- Danish, S., & Hauer, A. *Helping skills: A basic training program*. New York: Behavioral Publications, 1973a.
- Danish, S., & Hauer, A. *Helping skills: A basic training program—Leaders Manual*. New York: Behavioral Publications, 1973b.
- Dupuy, H. Self-representation of general psychological well-being of American adults. Presentation at the American Health Association meetings, October 17, 1978, Los Angeles.
- Emrick, C., Lassen, C., & Edwards, M. Nonprofessional peers as therapeutic agents. In A. Gurman and A. Razin (Eds.), *Effective psychotherapy*. New York: Pergamon, 1977, pp. 120-161.
- Foster, J. Licensure/certification for counseling psychologists and counselors. Special issue of the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977, 55, 571-624.
- Garfield, S., & Bergin, A. (Eds.) *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1978.
- Goldstein, A. *Structured learning therapy: Toward a psychotherapy for the poor*. New York: Acad Press, 1973.
- Goldstein, A., & Stein, N. *Prescriptive psychotherapies*. New York: Pergamon, 1976.
- Gurman, A., & Razin, A. *Effective psychotherapy*. New York: Pergamon, 1977.
- Hadley, S., & Strupp, H. Contemporary views of negative effects in psychotherapy. *Archives of General Psychiatry*, 1976, 33, 1291-1302.
- Hogan, D. *The regulation of psychotherapists. Vols. I-IV*. Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger, 1978, 1979.
- Ivey, A., & Alschuler, A. (Eds.) Psychological education: A prime function of the counselor. Special issue of the *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977, 55, 296-692.
- Ivey, A., & Gluckstern, N. *Basic attending skills: Leader and participant manuals*. North Amherst: Microtraining, 1974.
- Ivey, A., & Gluckstern, N. *Basic influencing skills: Leader and participant manuals*. North Amherst: Microtraining, 1976.
- Ivey, A., & McGowan, S. Weekending on the Coronation Gull. *The Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1979, 57, 381-385.
- Johnson, J. and O'Brien, C. Church workers: Part of the mental health team. *Counseling and Values*, October, 1981, 26, 1, 13-19.
- Lambert, M., Bergin, A., & Collins, J. Therapist-induced deterioration in psychotherapy. In A. Gurman and A. Razin (Eds.), *Effective psychotherapy*. New York: Pergamon, 1977, pp. 452-481.
- Landfield, A. *Personal construct systems in psychotherapy*. Chicago: Rand McNally, 1971.
- Lewis, J., & Lewis, M. *Community counseling*. New York: Wiley, 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Educating counselors for primary prevention. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, March, 1981, 20, 3, 172-181.
- Lichtman, R. Jobs and mental health in a social context. *Center Magazine*, 1978, 11, 7-17.
- Lorion, R. P. Research on psychotherapy and behavior change with the disadvantaged. In S. L. Garfield and A. E. Bergin (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change: An empirical analysis*. New York: John Wiley, 1978.
- Meara, N. M., Shannon, J. W., & Pepinsky, H. B. A comparison of the stylistic complexity of the language of counselor and client across three theoretical orientations. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1979, 26, 181-189.
- Messina, J. Why establish a certification system for professional counselor? A rationale. *AM HCA Journal*, 1979, 1, 9-22.
- Nietzel, M. and Fisher, S. G. Effectiveness of professional and paraprofessional helpers: A comment on Durlak. *Psychological Bulletin*, May, 1981, 89, 3, 555-565.

The President's Commission on Mental Health. *Report to the President from The President's Commission on Mental Health-1978* (Vol. 1). Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1978.

Rappaport, J. *Community psychology*. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1977.

Romaniuk, M., Priddy, J., and Romaniuk, J. Older peer counselor training. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, March, 1981, 20, 3, 225-231.

Shimberg, B., & Roederer, D. *Occupational licensing: Questions a legislator should ask*. Lexington, KY: The Council of State Governments, 1978.

Sloane, R., Staples, F., Cristol, A., Yorkston, N., & Whipple, K. *Psychotherapy verses behavior therapy*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1975.

Sue, D. Counseling the culturally different. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977, 55, 422-425.

Sue, S., & McKinney, H. Asian-Americans in the community mental health care system. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 1975, 45, 111-118.



# 11

## The Effects of Guidance and Counseling: Three Domains

Edwin L. Herr  
The Pennsylvania State University

---

Throughout this text authors have suggested that guidance and counseling are effective responses to such key national priorities as the facilitation of mental health, educational and occupational choice and adjustment, and other areas that bear upon the quality of individual planfulness and purpose, interpersonal relationships, and personal productivity. In large measure, these observations have been cast in terms of what guidance and counseling *could* do, not what they *have* done to make an impact on individual behaviors of national concern.

Traditional observations about what guidance and counseling *could* do convey a sense of moral imperative rather than a reliance on what empirical evidence shows that guidance and counseling does do and, by extrapolation, what other applications of these processes can be expected to demonstrate. Moral imperatives are useful and relevant to establishing the importance of a profession but guidance and counseling also have a research base that deserves attention.

This chapter will examine three types of support on which rest the claims for the validity of guidance and counseling as legitimate responses to selected national priorities. First to be addressed is the fact that the original support for guidance and counseling by decision makers was largely at the level of moral imperative. Guidance and counseling have

philosophical roots that emanate from concerns for individual rights, freedom of choice, human reclamation—all matters that the founding documents of this nation speak of as core tenets. But the validity of guidance and counseling does not stop with its philosophical appeal. There is also a body of scientific evidence that describes the effects of guidance and counseling upon different types of individual behavior. While this body of evidence is not unequivocal, it is, in the aggregate, quite positive. Less well known but likely to be important to the future support for guidance and counseling are cost-benefit analyses. Because of spatial limitations upon this chapter it is not possible to deal with each of these matters in the depth they deserve. Nevertheless, the intent is to capture the major emphases appropriate to either the philosophical, empirical, or cost-benefit effects that can be claimed for guidance and counseling and from which implications can be drawn for research and development as well as national policy.

## PHILOSOPHICAL BASES FOR GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

From their beginnings in this nation in the last century, guidance and counseling have had a continuing commitment to individual rights, to the facilitation of free and informed choice, and to helping persons develop intelligence about their personal characteristics and the opportunities available to them. Implicit in such value positions has been the intent of guidance and counseling to help persons become more purposeful and active in the management of the educational, occupational, and personal/social options available to them, to bring order to the chaos they sometimes experience, to help them cope with physical or psychological loss, and to help them improve their interpersonal relations in the family, at school, at work. Such value positions stand in opposition to passivity or nonassertiveness in behalf of one's rights or one's aspirations, to idleness or to behavior that is not consciously goal-directed.

Since the beginning of the 20th century when guidance and counseling grew out of the social reform movements of that time, these services have been associated with human reclamation, equal opportunity, and meeting the diverse human needs found in a pluralistic society. As the industrial revolution progressed, rapid social and occupational change has become the norm. Migration from the country to the city has advanced and new power distributions have arisen among families, schools, and other social institutions. Guidance and counseling processes have been applied to personalize mass education, to help youth and adults identify and act on choices before them, and to deal with the discontinuities or crises facing them.

Guidance and counseling in many countries are little more than selection and classification processes devised to separate citizens into areas that serve the national interest. Guidance and counseling in the United

States derives from a different cultural tradition. Here the emphasis is primarily upon the individual's capability for self-direction in the light of social and moral values within a belief system that opportunity exists, that challenge confronts him or her, that personal effort will have personal meaning. A major, if implicit, premise in the American society is that each individual has a responsibility to develop his or her potentiality, to become the best of their possible selves.

The set of assumptions upon which guidance and counseling rests are highly consonant with the values of a democratic society. Examples of such assumptions are the following:

1. The strength of the nation rests, in part, upon natural differences in individual talents and upon the freedom of each individual to develop and express these talents in a unique way.
2. A major goal for individual action is the ability to engage in free and informed choice. This preservation of the individual's integrity disavows any type of prescriptive guidance that coerces the individual into particular directions.
3. Individual development is a complex blend of hereditary and environmental factors, including those psychological, sociological, educational, political, economic and physical in nature. To assume one of these to be preeminent without taking the other factors into consideration is to risk a very narrow view of human development.
4. Persons who are able to find commitment and purposefulness in life are less likely to be alienated and uncaring and more likely to be productive, caring, valuing, and able to cope with change.
5. Every individual should be given the opportunity to obtain training equal to his or her capacity; society must provide education and training to persons at all levels of abilities and skills, not only to a few selected leaders; all persons should be given an opportunity to have full knowledge concerning personal capacities and potentialities and to decide the extent to which these will be utilized.
6. Individual development can best be facilitated by programs or processes that become available in the early years and continue to be available throughout the life of the person.

The final philosophical assumption on which guidance and counseling is based is that the previous assumptions are more likely to be borne out if systematic programs and processes are put in place to facilitate them. Pressing the point further, the existence of guidance and counseling argues that in a complex society such as the United States, guarantees of individual rights and the development of full potentiality are not automatically forthcoming. Most persons need information, support, and other forms of guidance and counseling to become their best selves, to know what possibilities exist for them, to be plantful. In short, talent must be cultivated; freedom and responsibility must be nurtured. Personal realities need to be considered and understood. Such goals are most likely to be realized when a systematic guidance and counseling program is established.

## EMPIRICISM IN GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING: RESEARCH ISSUES AND RESULTS

Research in the behavioral sciences is a complex and difficult matter. People behave psychologically, not logically. Therefore, human behavior is never as predictable as is the interaction of two chemical compounds, the movement of bodies in the solar system, or even the weather. Each of these natural phenomena are subject to certain laws that are basically immutable even though there are certain amounts of error that accompany their measurement.

There are those who would argue that it is not possible to measure modifications in human behavior caused by formal intervention strategies such as guidance and counseling. Other persons would argue that whether one can measure or predict such matters it should not be necessary to do so; guidance and counseling in concert with other social services should be taken on faith. Such persons are likely to believe that the moral imperatives with which guidance and counseling have been associated are sufficiently persuasive in their own right to justify social and fiscal support for such services.

Present realities, primarily economic, argue for a third view. Even though it may be difficult to assess the effects of social service systems or specific interventions upon human behavior, it is nevertheless necessary to obtain the fullest sense of these effects that current research will permit. Such a view acknowledges the fact that funds to support social services are scarce and, therefore, it is necessary to identify and implement those believed to be most effective. This perspective is in line with the scientific cast of our society that presupposes that if anything is happening to people or to institutions as a result of some form of intervention, the results should be observable and measurable, and that they can be expressed, somehow, in terms of psychological benefits to the individual recipient or in terms of the "cost" and "economic" benefits to the society.

Current questions about guidance and counseling tend to ask less about whether these services do any good and more about what they are good for. These are questions that ask about the uniqueness of guidance and counseling from other educational or social services, who should receive such services, and when. They also imply concerns for how guidance processes differ in their effectiveness, for whom and under what conditions or how the outcomes of guidance and counseling persist over time. Answers to all of these questions do not now exist but a relevant empirical base is enlarging.

To an increasing degree research in guidance and counseling is influencing the professional effectiveness of counselors in program planning, technical competencies, pre-service and in-service preparation and in accountability. It can be expected that as research provides a base for more effective guidance and counseling in the future it will also increasingly focus on the questions that yet have no or equivocal answers.

While some observers may assume that the only justification for guidance and counseling is a philosophical one, during the past two decades a large array of empirical studies have been addressed to the effectiveness of guidance, counseling, psychotherapy and related processes in changing certain types of individual behavior.

Not all of these studies have shown such processes to be effective and, in some cases, studies have shown that persons exposed to guidance, counseling, or psychotherapy have actually gotten worse rather than better. Most of the studies in which a "deterioration effect" has been noted have occurred in the literature on psychotherapy (Tennor, 1976; Bergin & Strupp, 1972) rather than in the literature on guidance and counseling. The latter studies if not positive are more likely to show no significant change in the target behavior rather than a deterioration in it.

Some readers may believe that combining findings from psychotherapy with those of guidance and counseling is inappropriate, other observers would disagree. Shertzer and Stone (1976) have contended that: "Attempts to differentiate among guidance, counseling, and psychotherapy have not met with any notable degree of success. Many counseling practitioners and many psychotherapists believe that distinctions among the terms, particularly between counseling and psychotherapy, are artificial, and that the terms should be used interchangeably" (p. 163). Although guidance and counseling use many of the same psychological processes and models typically ascribed to psychotherapy, the populations typically served and the purposes for these processes are different. Psychotherapy is more likely to be concerned with fundamental personality change; guidance and counseling is more concerned with acquiring skills or resolving conflicts associated with choice-making (Strupp, 1978; Tyler, 1969). The persons treated with psychotherapy are more likely to have experienced personal crises sufficient to cause anxiety and depression severe enough to preoccupy them or cause dysfunction in their ability to cope with tasks of daily living. Persons exposed to guidance and counseling are more likely to be anticipating or dealing with transition points in their lives that pose choices as part of normal development.

Bergin and Lambert (1978) have discussed at length the evaluation of therapeutic outcomes and, in particular, they have considered deterioration effects in relation to psychotherapy. Their conclusions tend to argue for better research methodology, for better training of practitioners, and for greater attention to the differential needs for psychotherapeutic approaches by different clients. Selected conclusions from their analysis of such outcomes through the early 1970s follow:

- "2. While the precision and methodological sophistication of studies had improved markedly over time, the evidence continued to yield the general conclusion that psychotherapy, on the average, has at least modestly positive effects. Most studies did not seem to provide strong evidence, but the number showing positive results was clearly larger than chance.
3. There was a slight tendency for more adequately designed studies to yield more positive results.
4. It seemed clear from the empirical evidence that something potent or efficacious was operating in some portion of the therapy routinely offered;



even though average effects were only moderately impressive when diverse cases, therapists, and change scores were lumped together.

7. Experienced therapists fared better than inexperienced therapists, and therefore it was recommended that future studies use experienced therapists to test for therapeutic effects.
8. It was concluded that at least two important factors were operating that made the observed effect of therapy seem more limited; the fact that a portion of patients were made worse (deterioration effect), and the fact that a portion of neurotic patients improve without treatment (so-called "spontaneous remission" phenomena)" (p. 145).

Bergin and Lambert conclude later in their analyses that:

- "1. Psychoanalytic/insight therapies, humanistic or client-centered psychotherapy, many behavioral therapy techniques and, to a lesser degree, cognitive therapies, rest on a reasonable empirical base. They do achieve results that are superior to no-treatment and to various placebo treatment procedures.
4. The rate of change or the efficiency with which formal psychotherapy achieves change is also one of its important advantages over the many change processes that occur under labels like "placebo" or "spontaneous remission." . . . Treatment effects of this magnitude [that obtained by spontaneous remission in two years] are frequently obtained in six months or less in formal psychotherapy, a considerable evidence of therapy's efficiency/efficacy over no treatment" (p. 171).

The findings reported by Bergin and Lambert as well as others cited here do not suggest that psychotherapy is an unqualified success under all conditions. But they do show that psychotherapy can be a powerful force for positive change when applied by properly trained and therapeutic practitioners.

What of guidance and counseling? Just as in the case of psychotherapy, the question of how effective guidance and counseling is depends upon the rigor imposed upon the research designs and procedures employed in the research base currently available. Given the current status of research methodology, rather than inflating the positive effects of guidance and counseling, the findings available may, in fact, be conservative estimates of the effects of these processes.

With due respect to the weaknesses in some research designs employed, to the lack of comparisons among guidance and counseling processes focused upon the same criteria, and to other related caveats, there is a pool of empirical findings now available about guidance and counseling. It is probably fair to suggest that the accumulated weight of evidence in favor of the demonstrated effects of guidance and counseling is larger than is known or systematically used. While not exhaustive of such findings, those inventoried below give an overview of much that is known about guidance and counseling effects across populations and problem areas.

The problem areas in which guidance and counseling have demonstrated their effects are wide ranging. They include the following:

- Characteristics of effective counselors
- Self-esteem, self-concept, interpersonal relations and mental health



- Decision-making
- Career planning, career development and career education
- School achievement
- Racial integration in education
- Transitions to work and work adjustment
- Juvenile delinquency
- Alcoholism and substance abuse
- Marital harmony
- Rehabilitation of physically and emotionally handicapped.

Most of the effects of guidance and counseling have been demonstrated on short-term bases, either immediately upon termination of the guidance and counseling contact or within a brief time thereafter. But there are also long-term gains from guidance and counseling that have been documented:

1. It has been found in longitudinal follow-ups as long as twenty-five years after exposure to counseling and related guidance processes, that persons so exposed in high school or in college can be distinguished from their peers not so exposed on such criteria as higher income and the number and types of contributions to society (Campbell, 1965).
2. In follow-up studies of high school students two and one-half, five and ten years after high school, differences have been found between those randomly assigned to extensive counseling and guidance services in high school and those who were not excluded from such services but for whom no special attempts were made to involve them. Among such differences: experimental students had better academic records both in high school and after; they had made more realistic and more consistent vocational choices and were more likely to stick with their first choice; they had made more progress in their employment; they were more likely to have entered college and to have graduated; and, they were more satisfied with their lives (Merenda & Rothney, 1958; Rothney, 1958).
3. Career adjustment at ages twenty-five and beyond is related to awareness of choices to be made, information and planning bearing on choices, possessing and being able to use occupational, psychological, educational, and economic information by students while in the secondary school (Super, 1969).

In some instances findings showing positive effects of guidance and counseling have been reported by evaluators concerned with the effects of government spending in support of guidance and counseling. For example, the 1975 annual report from the U.S. Office of Education, *Educational Programs That Work*, listed more than a dozen different counseling programs that had been evaluated by outside evaluators as being effective (U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare, 1975). In *Innovative Educational Practice*, six effective counseling programs validated by Elementary and Secondary Education Act Title III evaluators were listed (U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare, 1974). Similar find-

ings are reported in other government documents published by the Rehabilitation Services Administration or by the Department of Labor.

The following sections will identify findings in some of the major categories of guidance and counseling effects. Others will be identified in the subsequent section dealing with cost-benefit analyses.

## School Achievement

When guidance and counseling processes are implemented either on a demand basis or as part of a comprehensive program of student development, the degree to which they assist students in their academic achievement is likely to be a criterion. Often such achievement or its lack is a function of interference from emotional or social problems. Sometimes it is a function of poor study habits or test-taking anxiety. Each of these behavioral areas is susceptible to intervention through guidance and counseling.

Typical of findings related to the effects of guidance and counseling upon school achievement:

- In general, experimental studies report significant differences in academic achievement and in realistic choice of courses of study in favor of groups exposed to guidance and counseling as compared with those not so exposed. These findings are typically true in both secondary schools and in college (Adams, 1974; Benson & Blocker, 1967; Calhoun, 1956; Doyle, 1976; Schmiedling, 1966).
- Either group or individual counseling, extending over a reasonable amount of time, helps students whose ability is adequate or better to improve their scholastic performance if they choose to participate in it. Pertinent research typically indicates that better results are obtained if guidance and counseling focuses on the causes of underachievement and what can be done to correct them than more general approach is taken (Tyler, 1969).
- Community college students who have participated in a career-planning class have been found to complete both their first quarter and one full academic year at a substantially higher academic level than do students in a control group and they have reported more positive attitudes toward college (Pinto & Feigenbaum, 1974; Adams, 1974).
- The use of rational-emotive therapy has been found to be effective in reducing disruptive classroom behaviors and class cutting and in raising grade point average in students from a lower socioeconomic background (Block, 1978).
- Counselor teams who work closely with teachers, principals, and parents in dealing with emotional or social problems interfering with the use of their intellectual potential by children are helpful in increasing general levels of student academic achievement (Bertoldi, 1975; Philadelphia School District, 1976).

## Self-Concept, Self-Esteem, and Mental Health

As Combs, Avila, and Purkey (1974) have indicated:

"The psychological literature is overflowing with learned articles and research studies dealing with the effects of the self concept on a great variety of behaviors including failure in school, levels of aspiration or goal setting, athletic prowess, mental health, intelligence, delinquency and criminality, ethnic groups, the socially disadvantaged, and industrial productivity. In every aspect of human existence the self concept exerts its influence upon what people do and how they behave" (p. 44).

As a reflection of the importance of the self-concept, guidance and counseling is frequently directed to the development of the self-concept or self-esteem in relation to general mental health to specific topical areas such as vocational indecision. The effects of guidance and counseling upon self-concept and mental health take various forms. Among them are the following:

- Persons exposed to guidance and counseling tend to organize their concepts about themselves in a more coherent way leading to harmony between "ideal" and 'real' self-concepts (Tyler, 1969).
- Behavioral therapy and other forms of guidance and counseling have been found to have positive effects upon moderately severe neuroses and personality disorders, in reducing anxiety, in mediating psychosomatic disorders, and in alleviating phobic responses (Bergin, 1971; Sloane, Staples, Cristol, Yorkston, & Whipple, 1975).
- Adolescent Black males who have been assisted to decide upon vocational objectives have been found to have more positive self-concepts than do those who have not been (Jones, Tait, Washington, & Silcott, 1975).
- Studies of adolescents and young adults in rural areas showed that self-awareness activities, job-seeking skills activities, and peer interaction through group sessions, counseling, career materials displays, testing and information meetings caused observable positive changes in most of the participants (Paulsen, 1976).
- A combined program of communication, problem-solving, and behavioral self-control techniques designed to deliver motivational and skill-building behaviors to rehabilitation clients was found to improve the current life perspective among 85 percent of clients and to improve the future life prospects of 80 percent of the clients (Roessler, Cook, & Lillard, 1977).
- As a function of behavioral modification techniques, it has been found that delinquent boys in a community based home tend to improve dramatically in self-esteem and from externality to internality as compared with a control group (Eitzen, 1975).
- An individual and group counseling program, instituted in a large city school district and designed to improve the self-esteem of students was found to significantly reduce the dropout rate. A modified program instituted in the elementary schools was found to improve attendance, general achievement and reading as well as scores on a measure of pupil conduct and social adjustment (Bennett, 1975).

## Career Development, Planning, Education, and Choice

In large measure, the transition to work and work adjustment are processes that begin in the elementary and secondary schools or in college. It is in these settings that the emphases of guidance and counseling are developmental and preventive in focus, not simply remedial. The intent is to develop in students the knowledge, skills, and attitudes that underlie self-understanding, awareness of educational, occupational, and life style alternatives, and the ability to choose. These behaviors are frequently subsumed under the rubrics, career development, career planning, or career decision-making.

Many approaches have been combined into programs of career education or career guidance and are dealt with as separate processes in high schools, community college, and college settings. Typical of the findings reported in such studies:

- Guidance and counseling processes do help students to become competent decision-makers, to select high school courses, and make high school plans more appropriate to their abilities than is true of students not exposed to such processes (Babcock & Kauffman, 1976).
- Students exposed to model reinforcement and reinforcement counseling participate more intensely in external information-seeking behavior than do control students (Bergland, Quatrano, & Lundquist, 1975).
- A process for decision-making can be taught to junior high school students within a guidance and counseling setting employing the counselor as a model to help students become competent decision-makers; directed learning of decision-making is more effective than nondirected practice; directed learning appears to aid transfer of decision-making skills to real life circumstances outside the guidance and counseling setting (Evans & Cody, 1969).
- Through group problem-solving methods in a guidance and counseling context, students can be helped to understand the relationship between educational and vocational development, to clarify goals, and to acquire skill in identifying and using relevant information for their decision-making needs (Krumboltz & Thoresen, 1964; Stewart & Thoresen, 1968).
- Women college students exposed to a systematic career guidance class dealing with such topics as values clarification, decision-making, job satisfaction, sources of occupational information, workpower projections and career planning are found to have greater gains on self-knowledge and the relation of self-knowledge to occupations, and to engage in a greater number of career-planning activities than do students exposed only to individual counseling or to no treatment (Knosh & Grimm, 1976).
- Experimental/control studies of the effects of short-term counseling (three sessions) with tenth-grade students have found such counseling to facilitate the career maturity of these students with regard to such emphases as orientation to decision-making, planfulness, and independence of choice (Flake, Roach, & Stenning, 1975).

- Both individual and group counseling have been found to assist university students with self-understanding, clarification of interests and life goals and decision-making (Herr & Cramer, 1968).
- Guidance and counseling films (e.g., *Careers in the 70's*) have been found to affect high school students' attitudes positively, to motivate them to seek additional information, and to make career choices. These outcomes were significantly stronger when the films were an integral part of a planned program (Mitchell, 1971).
- Computer-based career guidance systems using experimental and control groups of students have shown that high school student users of such systems make larger gains than those who do not on such characteristics as degree of planfulness, knowledge and use of resources for career exploration, awareness of career options open to them and the costs and risks associated with these options (Myers, Lindeman, & Thompson, 1975).
- The use of simulated occupational experiences within guidance and counseling programs has been found to have a positive impact on student occupational knowledge among junior high school students (Krumboltz & Thoresen, 1964).
- In one liberal arts college, a career-planning program was established offering small group experiences for women over seven consecutive two-hour sessions. After six months, follow-up surveys were conducted; it was found that a good understanding of self and career options was expressed by 81 percent of the respondents, compared with a rate of 3 percent prior to the program. Before completing the program, 9 percent reported feeling capable of setting short-term and long-range goals. After completing the seminars, 88 percent reported feeling capable in these areas (Babcock & Kauffman, 1976).
- In one study a group counseling intervention was combined with teaching materials designed to aid students in improving their career maturity and decision-making skills. High school students, both academic and nonacademic in orientation, were involved over a ten-week period. As a result of the program, student reported outcomes were that they now knew more about occupational choices (62 percent); could go about getting information (73 percent); could recognize their values and use them in making decisions (76 percent); consider and rank alternatives according to the ones that are best for them (68 percent); could make career decisions (82 percent); and, that they could see that their first and second occupational choices made before the program may not be the best for them (Egner & Jackson, 1978).

## Transition to Work and Work Adjustment

Among the most vulnerable of the effects of guidance and counseling are those associated with transition to work and work adjustment. In the United States, the need to help waves of immigrants from abroad and Americans moving from the farms to the cities find ways to "access the burgeoning occupational structure" was a major motivator of the rise of guidance and counseling at the turn of the century. Through wars, depres-



sions, boom times, and periods of relative calm, the need to assist persons to choose, plan, and prepare for work, adjust to it, or reenter it have been important themes underlying school counseling, Employment Service counseling, rehabilitation counseling, and other applications of guidance and counseling.

Studies of the contributions of guidance and counseling to work related topics are frequent and wide ranging. Examples of such studies follow:

- Several studies have been done in state offices of the Employment Service focused upon the question: Does counseling help people get jobs? In one study, 10,000 applicants were studied who had received an average of two counseling interviews each during 1972-73 in one of four states: Iowa, Missouri, Utah, or Wisconsin. The study showed that in Missouri and Iowa, the placement rate for counseled applicants was twice that for all applicants serviced. In Missouri, 40 percent of those receiving counseling were placed in jobs compared with only 20 percent of all applicants. The comparable figures in Iowa were 53 percent and 27 percent. In Utah 41 percent of counselor-assisted individuals were placed compared with 24 percent for all applicants (Mason, 1974).
- In a study in Wisconsin, the records of a random sample of recent applicants who had received counseling were compared with an equal sample of those who had not. Thirty percent of those counseled were placed compared with 16 percent of those who had not been counseled. The outcomes of this study are particularly important because they refer to counseled applicants who were more difficult to place than those not counseled. In Wisconsin, for example, 64 percent of the counseled applicants had two or more employment barriers (such as being poor, disadvantaged, handicapped, school dropout) as compared with only 28 percent of the group not counseled. Among disadvantaged applicants in Wisconsin, 38 percent of those who had received counseling were placed in jobs whereas none of the "not counseled" was placed. For the handicapped the story was even more dramatic with 69 percent of those counseled being placed compared with none who received no counseling (Mason, 1974).
- The U.S. Department of Labor's Manpower Administration (1974) reported on the findings of the Texas Counseling Research Project. This project, which studied the outcomes for 668 persons referred to counselors, indicated that approximately twice the number of the counseled persons were placed as compared to a noncounseled control group.
- In data from across the United States on the effects of counseling on rehabilitation clients it was found that both long- and short-term counseling contact has advantages in rehabilitation but in differing directions. Long-term interventions tend to correlate with higher salaries among rehabilitants, while short-term contacts tend to lead to more placements among those considered rehabilitated. In addition it was found that "the percentage of monies allocated for counseling and training tend to favorably influence final salary" (Kunce, Miller, & Cope, 1974).



- In a study of the records of the Utah State Bureau of Employment Security for the year 1973–1974, it was found that those clients receiving counseling services were 57.4 percent more able to find placement than those who did not receive such service. Again, it was found that employability increased with the number of interviews conducted with the client (Philbrick, 1974).
- Guidance and counseling processes have been found to help the worker in sorting out available work choices, in considering personal commitments to work, and in developing ways of deriving feelings of psychological competence in the work place (Nelson, Nolf, & Bush, 1975; Thompson, 1975).

## Delinquents and Offenders

Among the most insistent of the social problems with which the nation is concerned are those concerning juvenile delinquents and adult offenders. Guidance and counseling approaches have been used both to prevent delinquency and to treat offenders. Since delinquents and offenders frequently experience self-concept problems, suffer from academic failures, and have had difficulties in the school to work transition or in maintaining an effective work pattern, many of the findings previously cited are relevant. There are also findings directly pertinent to these populations that might be noted, however. Some examples:

- Lower rates of recidivism, truancy, running away, and ungovernability were found in delinquent children who had taken part in a Baltimore project providing counseling and support services including youth advocates to predelinquent and potentially delinquent children (Mayor's Office of Manpower Resources, 1974).
- Participants in a counseling and training program had a 28 percent recidivism rate as compared with a 52 percent failure rate fifteen months after returning to the community in a Community Treatment Project of the California Youth Authority (Herrin & Muir, 1974).
- Chicago public schools have implemented dropout prevention programs in five high schools intended to prevent, control, and eliminate delinquent behavior through counseling, educational assistance, vocational training and placement, and recreational activities. The success of the program is reflected in a decline in the number of students actually dropping out of school or displaying delinquent behavior. Results of attitudinal tests and field notes on observations of students, parents, and staff reflect an interest in and more positive attitudes toward school. Police records show a reduction in juvenile offenses and arrests. Counseling and discipline records reflect a decrease in violations of school rules. A reduction in the recidivism rate of dropout program participants who were returnees from correctional institutions was also observed (Buckner, 1976).
- In Dallas, Texas, fourteen civilian counselors serve as a division unit for arrested juveniles ages ten to sixteen. In addition to individual counseling, the delinquents also are exposed to a systematic coun-

selor-conducted program emphasizing the development of interpersonal, physical, emotional, and intellectual skill development that they can apply to home, school, and community problem areas. The standing arrest recidivism rate for young offenders in Dallas was 54 percent. In 1974, the recidivism rate for 264 youths completing the counseling unit was 2.7 percent. A control group of 196 youths showed a 36.1 percent recidivism rate for the same time period (Dallas Police Department, 1975).

- In the Rio Grande Youth Care Center, New Mexico, which provides counseling and services to delinquent youth, 80 percent of whom are Chicano, the recidivism rate across a wide range of offenses has been lowered to about 14 percent (Valencia County Commission, 1974).
- A counseling program specifically combined with supportive instruction has been found to be successful in motivating truant, low-income boys back to regular attendance in school (Grala & McCauley, 1976).
- A program of short-term behavioral intervention with families of delinquent males and females was found to significantly increase family interaction and reduce recidivism (Alexander & Parsons, 1973).
- While not precisely an effect of guidance and counseling, male (N = 321) and female (N = 23) offenders enrolled in adult basic education, general educational development and vocational courses in eight Pennsylvania correctional institutions concluded that a lack of sufficient counseling services was a problem. They ranked career counseling as number one among seven needed services (Lewis & Boyle, 1976).

## COST BENEFITS OF GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

If the original appeal of guidance and counseling to decision-makers was philosophical, the more recent appeal has been the demonstrated effects of these processes upon individual behavior related to national social, economic, and occupational problems. The appeal of the future is likely to be the cost-benefit effects of guidance and counseling and related processes.

Cost-benefit analyses pertinent to guidance and counseling have just begun. Under the pressures for accountability and the wise management of scarce resources, it is likely that such inquiry will substantially increase in the future.

The central questions of cost-benefit analyses are How much does it cost to have guidance and counseling? How much will it cost not to have guidance and counseling? What are the economic payoffs or tradeoffs associated with having or not having programs of guidance and counseling? Answers are not presently available to such questions.

Cost-benefit analyses of guidance and counseling or other similar social services are not easy. The criterion behavior that guidance and counselor may effect may serve to reduce "social pathology" in the future. But, if

so, how are costs assigned to such social pathology, when do you assign a base year for such calculations, and can you be sure that preventive or developmental approaches in guidance and counseling have significantly added to what might simply have occurred through maturation? In order to arrive at such costs, a high degree of extrapolation from current indicators of social pathology in the population and from demonstrated effects of guidance and counseling must be joined.

When the cost benefits of treatment approaches to guidance and counseling are considered, the task is a bit easier but it still requires that many assumptions and extrapolations be made. Nevertheless, reductions in recidivism rates in correctional institutions, or in length of stay in psychiatric hospitals, or in general hospitals, or in unemployment—carry an economic factor that can be credited to the effectiveness of guidance and counseling. So do increases in worker productivity and job satisfaction, holding power of schools and institutions of higher education, decreases in vandalism in schools and workplaces, added educational attainments, decreases in welfare and unemployment compensation, increases in family solidarity and concurrent decreases in divorce costs, foster home care for children and related matters.

One might argue that each of the empirical effects of guidance and counseling discussed in the previous section contributes something to the Gross National Product either by increasing educational and occupational attainment or productivity or by decreasing losses associated with absence, or vandalism or by precluding the need for more expensive treatment in the future. While such an assumption may be true, such connections between the effects of guidance and counseling and the economic health of individuals or the society at large have not typically been made. Nor have there been attempts to compare the cost-benefit ratios of guidance and counseling to other competing social service alternatives.

## Selected Studies of Cost-Benefit Analysis

Most of the studies of cost-benefit analysis are not directed at guidance and counseling per se but at psychotherapy. As suggested in the previous section and elsewhere in this text, there is considerable overlap in the psychological processes used in guidance, counseling, and psychotherapy although the populations, settings, and purposes served are likely to differ. For example, psychotherapy is almost always provided as a treatment approach to a significant problem requiring behavior or personality change; it is not typically used for personal enrichment or for solving simple choices. Guidance and counseling frequently emphasizes the latter. Nevertheless, the studies of cost benefit analysis in psychotherapy do have significance for guidance and counseling as procedural paradigms and as reference points for outcomes that are likely to be true not only of psychotherapy but also of guidance and counseling.

The following studies, then, suggest the types of cost-benefit analyses that can and should be done in guidance and counseling. They suggest the importance of such inquiry but represent only a very small portion

of the questions that could be addressed and the types of data on guidance and counseling that need to be collected and reported.

A particularly comprehensive set of cost-benefit studies has been undertaken by Cummings and others to evaluate the economic feasibility of psychotherapy within a comprehensive health system (Cummings, 1977). A basic stimulus to such an approach stems from the generally accepted statistic that 60 percent of visits to physicians occur from sufferers of emotional distress, not organic illness. Indeed, as Cummings notes:

"... many, if not most, physical illnesses are the result of problems in living [or psychological, emotional distress including psychoneuroses and character disorders]. The way we live, eat, drink, smoke, compete, and pollute relate inevitably to strokes, heart attacks, cirrhosis, migraine, suicide, and asthma, to list only a few. . . . The way we live influences our bodies; conversely, chronic illness and intractable pain create a problem in living. Psychotherapy is a viable form of intervention that can alleviate problems in living and lessen disease, and it belongs in any comprehensive health service until that utopian moment when preventive techniques render it unnecessary" (p. 713).

Cummings has summarized a number of studies examining the experience of providing psychological services as part of the Kaiser Permanente Health Plan that now serves more than eight million subscribers in several regions: Northern and Southern California; Portland, Oregon; Hawaii; Cleveland, Ohio; and Denver, Colorado. The major studies he reports are summarized as follows.

Follette and Cummings (1967) compared the number and types of medical services sought before and after the intervention of psychotherapy in a large group of randomly selected patients. In doing so, they studied these utilization rates with regard to three groups of patients and a control group. The patient groups were divided into those who received one interview only, brief therapy, and long-term therapy. The findings of the study:

"(a) persons in emotional distress were significantly higher users of both inpatient (hospitalization) and outpatient medical facilities as compared to the health plan average; (b) there were significant declines in medical utilization in those emotionally distressed individuals who received psychotherapy, as compared to a control group of matched emotionally distressed health plan subscribers who were not afforded psychotherapy; (c) these declines remained constant during the 5 years following the termination of psychotherapy; (d) the most significant declines occurred in the second year after the initial interview, and those patients receiving one session only or brief psychotherapy (two to eight sessions) did not require additional psychotherapy to maintain the lower level of utilization for 5 years; and (e) patients seen 2 years or more in continuous psychotherapy demonstrated no overall decline in total outpatient utilization, inasmuch as psychotherapy visits tended to supplant medical visits. However, there was a significant decline in inpatient utilization (hospitalization) in this long-term therapy group from an initial rate several times that of the health plan average, to a level comparable to that of the general, adult, health plan population." (p. 716)

In another study, Cummings and Follette (1968) found that the number of subscribers seeking psychotherapy reached an optimal level and remained constant thereafter. This study was reinforced by a subsequent

one (Cummings & Follette, 1976) that indicated that increased demand for psychotherapy will not endanger the health care system because it is not the number of referrals received but the way in which psychotherapy services are delivered that drives up costs or that determines optimal cost—therapeutic effectiveness. Of particular interest here was their finding that one session only, with no repeat psychological visits, can reduce medical utilization by 60 percent over the following five years, as well as the finding of a 75 percent reduction in medical utilization over a five-year period for patients initially receiving two to eight psychotherapy visits (brief therapy). In an eight-year follow-up study of patients involved in psychotherapy within the health plan (Cummings & Follette, 1976), results reinforced the earlier findings that reduction in medical utilization occurred as a "consequence of resolving the emotional distress that was being reflected in the symptoms and in the doctor's visits." (p. 716)

In reviewing the series of studies of both the therapeutic and cost effectiveness of the psychological services provided, Cummings (1977) reported that only 5.3 percent of the patients were found to be "interminable," a condition that was effective neither in cost nor in therapeutic benefits. In subsequent work with such patients, Cummings has found that rather than increasing the intensity of psychological services for these persons, the commonly accepted remedy, seeing these persons at spaced intervals of once every two or three months has been found to be both cost and therapeutically effective.

Cummings (1977) concludes his review of the studies done within the Kaiser-Permanente Plan by suggesting several global findings. One is that "when psychotherapy is properly provided within a comprehensive health system, the costs of providing the benefit are more than offset by the savings in medical utilization." Second, "when active, dynamic, brief therapy is provided early and by psychotherapists who are enthusiastic and proactive regarding such intervention, it is the treatment of choice for about 85% of the patients seeking psychotherapy." Third, "by providing such brief therapy, it makes economically feasible the provision of long-term psychotherapy to the approximately 10% of the patients who require it for their treatment to be therapeutically effective." Fourth, "cost-therapeutically effective problems can be developed for groups with such problems in living as alcoholism, drug abuse, drug addiction, chronic psychosis, problems of the elderly, and severe character disorders" (p. 717).

The impact of psychotherapy on physical health suggested by Cummings (1977) has been further examined by Olbrisch (1977). She reviewed the research literature dealing with the effectiveness of psychotherapeutic intervention upon inappropriate utilizers of medical services, alcohol rehabilitation programs, preparation for surgery, cardiac patients, headache treatment, asthma, skin disorders, gastrointestinal disorders, and other health problems. She finds that while the quality of evidence is uneven across these categories, in general the evidence is quite promising, and that in the case of psychotherapeutic preparation for surgery there appears to be really solid evidence for a beneficial effect on physical health. She reports examples in which such beneficial effects are related to cost effectiveness.



In bringing together evidence on cost effectiveness of psychotherapy as related to physical health, Olbrisch indicates that "In the case of pre-surgical therapy, much of the evidence of effectiveness lies in cost savings resulting from decreased use of medications and shorter hospitalizations" (p. 774). She notes that the research with overutilizers of medical services suggests potentially enormous cost savings but continued research in the area is of utmost importance. She also notes that private industry "considers a psychotherapy program to be profitable in treating early alcoholism and associated problems while at the same time reducing medical expenses."

With regard to alcohol problems particularly, Olbrisch quotes an unpublished study done at the Kennecott Copper Corporation (1975). This corporation has estimated a return of \$5.83 per \$1.00 cost per year for its psychotherapy program. This financial impact is estimated from such results as reduced absenteeism, reduced hospital, medical, and surgical costs, and reduced costs of nonoccupational accident and illness.

In a similar study in the Lansing, Michigan, Oldsmobile plant (Alander & Campbell, 1975) the records of 117 workers who participated in an alcohol and drug recovery program were compared with those of twenty-four known substance abusers who did not participate in such a program. While the latter group worsened in terms of lost man-hours, sickness and accident benefits, leaves of absence, and disciplining actions, the treated employees improved in every category and experienced in a large drop in lost wages.

A study of the Employee Counselor Service of New York City Transit Authority found that the program that provided treatment to employees with alcohol-related illnesses had saved one million dollars a year in such pay benefits alone. This was early in the program and Joseph M. Warren, Program Director, estimated that currently such pay savings run to two million dollars annually (Warren, 1978).

From a somewhat different perspective, Karon and Vandenbos (1976) have compared the effects, including those relating to cost benefits, of conducting psychotherapy with schizophrenics by psychologists or by psychiatrists. Examining three groups of patients—medicated, psychotherapy conducted by psychiatrists, and psychotherapy conducted by psychologists—they found that total costs of treatment per patient were \$17,234, \$12,221, and \$7,813 respectively. They also conducted a two year follow-up study in which it was found that the patients treated by psychologists were hospitalized an average of 7.2 days, as compared with 99.8 for the medicated control group and 93.5 days for patients of psychiatrists. The apparent difference lies with the fact that psychologists tend to effect change in the disordered thought processes of the schizophrenic person whereas the psychiatrist's use of medication alone or adjunctive to psychotherapy brings behavior within acceptable limits but does not change the fundamental problems. Thus, psychiatric approaches may reduce original hospitalization time but not reduce total time of hospitalization or use of medication.

Foreyt, Rockwood, Davis, Desvousges, and Hollingsworth (1975) examined the cost-benefit ratio of a token economy program with adult psychiatric patients at the Florida State Hospital, Chattahoochee. Token



economy programs are frequently used in guidance and counseling efforts with emotionally disturbed children, juvenile delinquents, and other problems of behavioral control. In their analysis, they studied the hospital costs foregone by getting and keeping patients out of the hospital as well as the extra costs saved if the patient once released did become a consumer of public health benefits or other community services. The researchers calculated hospital costs and other forms of aid in the present and in the future as the bases for their analyses. For example, the cost of a patient hospitalized during 1972 was \$4,387. By 1982 it is estimated that these costs will be \$6,260. If one is able to obtain the discharge of the patient in 1972 whose life expectancy goes to 1982 or 1992, calculation is that one will save \$46,666 and \$98,829 respectively. If the person lives to the year 2012 but is discharged in 1972, the saving is \$222,314. Other types of estimates of the cost of aid in the state of Florida in 1972 included average aid to the disabled per year, \$968; foster home care, \$1,800; per patient cost for community mental health, including staff services and medication, \$600; division of vocational rehabilitation, \$600 per year. While these costs are high, they are less than hospitalization costs. If one is successful in helping discharged patients remain free of the need for these other community services, a double saving is effected by a successful treatment program.

In considering the cost benefits of the token economy program at Florida State Hospital, the researchers included the hiring of a psychologist for twenty hours a week over a year and a half period (\$13,125), clinical psychology graduate students to serve as consultants and behavioral mediators on the wards (\$7,500), hospital canteen cards that patients could purchase with tokens earned as behavior is appropriately modified (\$8,580). The cost of the total program was \$29,205. This staffing arrangement is consistent with other similar programs.

The net economic benefit of the program to the government was calculated to be \$2,671,855 if one assumed they would have been released anyway under typical lengths of hospitalization stay. If one made the assumption that these patients would have spent the rest of their life in the hospital, the net benefit of the program was calculated to be \$10,656,849. Under the first assumption, the cost-benefit ratio was calculated to be 90:1 in dollars saved versus program costs. In the second assumption, the ratio was approximately 360:1. With the ratio of 90:1 a million dollars worth of savings were calculated to occur for each \$11,100 of treatment cost.

Sussna (1977) has examined the question of measuring the benefits of a community mental health center. He begins from the "national view" of the costs and losses resulting from mental illness. His estimates for the year 1976 are as follows:

Losses of Productive Activity:

Reduced by the labor force	\$28.60 billion
Loss of homemaking services of women	1.94 "
Reduction in unpaid activities (volunteer work, recreation, etc.)	.48 "
	<hr/>
	\$31.02 billion

Sussna contends that the \$31 billion figure cited is a conservative estimate of the production lost and, therefore, the potential social benefits of improved mental health. This is true, he believes, because the values of homemaking services and not-for-pay services are understated. It can also be argued that many of the important outputs of community mental health centers, like other guidance and counseling settings, are preventive of future antisocial acts and of reduced output but that it is extremely difficult to estimate dollar values with what is represented.

Sussna then estimates that the costs of treatment and prevention in mental health programs for 1977 were as follows:

Inpatient care	\$5.00 billion
Outpatient facilities	2.20 "
Training, research and development	.66 "
	<hr/>
	\$7.86 billion

From such perspectives, there is a substantial dollar difference in social benefits over costs in the mental health area. Sussna has also compared the treatment costs per patients in state institutions (in Pennsylvania, for example, \$12,000 per year) with those in community mental centers (approximately \$400 per year).

Johns (1976) has reported upon the benefit cost ratios established in forty-one federally supported alcohol treatment centers. His findings suggest a \$3 benefit for each \$1 treatment cost although his assumption is that these benefits are conservative representations of the impact on individual earnings of the successful treatment.

Berkeley Planning Associates (1975) conducted a study of the costs and effectiveness of vocational rehabilitation service strategies in the state of Washington for individuals most severely handicapped (IMSH). The focus was on services directed at employment, not independent living. It was found that the average cost for IMSH clients was \$598.40 and for non-IMSH clients \$471.24. The study suggested that cost effectiveness could be enhanced by better diagnostic and evaluation services that in turn would lead to improved prescription of services. Also the data suggest that rather than rehabilitation counselors focusing only on getting clients employed attention to providing employment skills that might make them economically self-sufficient would enhance cost effectiveness of the services available.

Worrall (1978) studied the cost-benefits relationships in a vocational rehabilitation program for a national random sample of 3,743 rehabilitants and 1,063 unsuccessful closures after acceptance. The average case service costs for the rehabilitants was \$620.12 and for the nonrehabilitants, \$373.76 for FY 1970. Using a conservative model, they found that the rehabilitation program is generally returning more in productivity gains to society than the costs expended. On the average they found a benefit-cost ratio of 5 to 1 although this varied across sub populations stratified by age, race, marital status, and other demographic characteristics. Of 180 cost-benefit ratios for different subgroups only eight were found to be less than one (costs exceeding benefits) and seven of these involved persons over fifty-four years of age.

Kakalic et al. (1974) studied vocational rehabilitation services—including counseling—for hearing and vision handicapped youth. He investigated programs costs and benefits for eight categories of hearing and vision handicapped youth and for differences by sex and race. On balance the returns to society were considered to be substantial. They were found, however, to vary across handicap categories—under the most conservative assumptions the benefit-cost ratio varies from 1.1:1 for the legally blind; 2.7:1 for the partially sighted; 3:1 for the deaf, unable to talk; to 4.4:1 for those with one good eye.

Reardon (1976) describes an employee assistance program in a small company that utilizes outside agencies to aid employees whose personal problems interfere with their work. The Southern Connecticut Gas Company, which employs fewer than 600 persons in white- and blue-collar occupations, primarily used agencies that are part of the Family Services of America, Inc., the parent organization for more than 300 agencies throughout the United States and Canada, to help its employees. When an employee reached a point where disciplinary action became mandatory, the supervisor recommended a voluntary visit to the personnel department where the program was further explained. If the employee accepted the referral, the service agency would work directly with the employee, with his/her family or refer him/her to another agency.

Regarding the costs of the program, \$4,620 was spent to train the ninety supervisors and union officials in related procedures. Further, the company pays \$35 to the social service agency for each initial "intake" interview. Additional costs are borne by the employee or by his/her major medical and other health insurance coverage. In citing a report from the National Alcohol Council that states that a "troubled" employee can cost the employer \$1,000 in lost time, errors of omission or commission, hiring of temporary help, and so on, Reardon reports that the program has been well worth the effort in saving money, jobs, and families.

## Cost-Benefit Analyses in Primary Prevention

As suggested previously, there are no cost-benefit studies directly related to guidance and counseling programs that have primary prevention rather than treatment as their principal focus. There are, however, advocates who believe that this situation should change. According to Cowen (1973), primary prevention as compared with secondary or tertiary prevention "attempts to forestall dysfunction by promoting psychological health and well being." To the degree that such dysfunction and the resulting treatment was avoided, economic benefits of some magnitude would obviously ensue.

Harper and Balch (1975) contend that, "despite a growing emphasis on the need for primary prevention approaches, mental health innovators have found it difficult to justify funding for such activities. . . ." Thus while there appears to be general theoretical agreement that it would be desirable to prevent mental illness and promote mental health, actual support for primary prevention has been disappointingly limited." This is probably because it is, indeed, so difficult to make direct cost compar-

isons, and to put dollar values on benefits and on "non responses to pathologies."

Harper and Balch (1975) suggest that mental health can be considered "as an 'industry' in which primary, secondary, and tertiary prevention activities can be viewed as 'businesses' subject to economic analysis in terms of supply and demand, cost and efficiency." Applying an economic model to the three categories of response to mental illness/mental health they argue that "economic considerations argue for a reallocation of existing resources away from tertiary-secondary prevention sectors to the primary prevention sector." They suggest that primary prevention services "if utilized optimally, could provide the least cost equation per dollar spent for mental health services" (p. 25).

## Recommended Cost-benefit Analysis Procedures

Although specific studies of the cost-benefit of guidance and counseling do not presently exist, the professional literature does suggest models for such analyses. Frequently, such models have been described for related fields and not for guidance and counseling directly. For example, McDonnell, Swisher, and Hu (1979) in considering primary prevention in substance abuse contend that the technique of cost-benefit analysis consists of the following components: specification of the object function of the program; determination of constraints; elaboration of feasible options; measurement of the costs and benefits, or effects, of feasible options; evaluations; evaluation; and, choice.

Hu, Swisher, and McDonnell (1979) in discussing cost-effectiveness of drug prevention programs have outlined elements that need to be estimated both in terms of the costs and the benefits of such programs. Each of these elements also represents a measurement problem that needs to be dealt with. On the cost side the following are suggested for consideration:

*Economic costs*—As precisely as possible it needs to be known what budgeting expenditures are related to the specific output sought or obtained. This would include basic services, material expenses, time of professionals involved, and other matters directly related to behavioral change in clients or other outputs desired.

*Shared costs*—Where several program outputs occur from the same input or facility, the practice is typically to average shared costs across different programs. This is at best an imprecise measure, however.

*Capital costs*—Capital costs usually include site acquisition costs, capital improvements to the site, physical plant and building costs, and equipment costs. Measurement problems include the fact that the physical plant usually has an economic life longer than the period of a particular program's impact on a client or cohort and that the market value of the capital stock is not easily estimated. Typical practices have been to ignore capital costs or to use a straight line method of depreciation applied to replacement costs or the assessed valuation.

*Opportunity costs*—Opportunity costs include the costs of donated time or space at no cost to the program that can be used for other productive activities and to generate revenue. The problem is to impute a realistic value to these

energies or resources since, in the absence of the program at issue, they may be left idle or for other purposes that do result in revenue generation.

Opportunity costs also include the possible loss of income by program participants where extensive participation is required. This may include part-time or full-time jobs. Where actual income is foregone by program participation, it can be calculated; where such is not known, an estimate of the probability of employment for cohort groups can be made and opportunity costs estimated from this base.

On the benefit side, it is equally important to determine the economic effectiveness of programs. Such measures need to include monetary as well as nonmonetary benefits. The following elements are representative of such benefits:

*Private benefits*—Those received by individuals in the form of improvement of scholastic achievement, less dependency on drug use, increase in labor market activity.

*External benefits*—Those benefits incurred by a third party (family, employee, school) that derives from the changed behavior of the individual. For example, if a school counselor were successful in preventing ten students per year from dropping out of school, the school would continue to receive the state reimbursement associated with some weighted form of Average Daily Membership. For example, if the State Aid Ratio is \$910 per student per year, retention of these ten students would represent an economic benefit of \$9,100 minus the estimate of costs to achieve such a result.

*Social benefits*—Those benefits that go beyond private or external benefits but accrue in broader terms to society as a whole are social benefits. Examples might include reductions in psychological injuries or general society anxiety or inconvenience to other persons from specific individual behavior.

While many of the benefits of guidance and counseling can be measured in monetary forms, many others cannot. Changes in personal satisfaction, feelings of competence, or improvements in inter-family functioning are difficult to monetize even though they are clearly outcomes that derive from the application of guidance and counseling.

However one does cost-benefit analyses of the preventive aspects of guidance and counseling, assumptions need to be clearly stated and base line data need to be known about the incidence of behaviors that are likely to be modified over time by the implementation of guidance and counseling. As compared with traditional forms of process or outcome evaluation, these can be considered impact evaluation indices. Such indices might include changes in the following:

Future welfare payments	School attendance
Work loss, absenteeism, or unemployment	Scholastic performance
Drug use	Mental illness
Incarceration	Medical treatment
Socially undesirable behavior	Earnings differential

Impact evaluation of the primary prevention aspects of guidance and counseling includes the costs that might otherwise arise from treating or curing the dysfunction and the negative effects that accompany it (McDonnell, Swisher, Hu, 1979). The estimation of such benefits is often



more difficult than is the estimation of costs. Such programs cannot be dealt with in the limited terms that are true of a pure experiment with finite samples and controlled conditions. Nevertheless, if the potential of guidance and counseling is to be fully accepted and understood by policy makers and by practitioners, such analyses must be put forward as effectively and as comprehensively as possible.

## IMPLICATIONS FOR RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT IN GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

This chapter has briefly reviewed some of the demonstrated effects of guidance and counseling in philosophical, empirical, and cost-benefit terms. While in the aggregate these processes tend to manifest positive outcomes on many criteria, the quality and quantity of available research tends to be less than desirable as the base for broad scale policy making. Therefore, a research and development agenda related to the understanding and improvement of guidance and counseling needs to include attention to the following items:

### 1. Appropriate criteria for guidance and counseling

In large measure, research in guidance and counseling has been concerned with the roles counselors play in various settings or the techniques they employ rather than the behavioral changes they intend to effect. Research needs to be designed to define population needs for behavioral change and the likely impact of guidance and counseling upon such behavior. As suggested in this chapter, the behaviors upon which guidance and counseling have shown an impact are broader in scope than is traditionally assumed. The further question, however, is what types of behavioral change are required by different populations, under what assumptions? An additional question is: Which of these are most effectively enhanced or treated by guidance and counseling? And a related question is: What are the policy, economic, or personnel constraints which limit the impact of guidance and counseling on the behavioral criteria desired?

### 2. Comparative effects of guidance and counseling processes

There are two categories of research questions here. One has to do with the effectiveness of guidance and counseling processes in comparison with other process categories; e.g., education, information, chemotherapy. The second category has to do with the comparative effects of different guidance and counseling processes on the same presenting problems. Research has not yet led to a matrix of psychological problems, their behavioral



counterparts, and a predictive system that helps a counselor select the technique or process by which a particular type of problem can be most effectively addressed. Such comparative research is absolutely essential if an appropriate empirical base for counselors is to be available.

### 3. Guidance and Counseling Interventions by Developmental Age

An adjunct to comparative effects of guidance and counseling processes are questions of which forms of intervention are most appropriately and effectively used at different developmental ages. How are guidance and counseling techniques age related? What techniques are best used with children, adolescents, adults, under what conditions, for whom?

### 4. Guidance and Counseling Intervention for Different Populations

A related research question to those suggested above is how do preferences for or effects of guidance and counseling processes differ among males and females and among persons of different ethnic or racial backgrounds? How similar to the client's must the counselor's background be? Do the developmental experiences of males and females, minority and majority persons differ so comprehensively that the developmental age at which they wrestle with questions of self-identity, career identity, and other related matter differ significantly? If so, what are the implications for guidance and counseling?

### 5. Longitudinal Effects of Guidance and Counseling

Currently, it is difficult to argue that the benefits of guidance and counseling persist. As suggested previously, most of the outcomes credited to guidance and counseling have been results of short-term gain that have not been followed up over time. Thus, the existing empirical effects of guidance and counseling are vulnerable to charges of superficiality or to being time bound. Such longitudinal research as does exist tends to be supportive of this persistence but much more long-term validation of such effects needs to occur.

### 6. Cost-Benefit of Guidance and Counseling

Both models and studies of the cost-benefit ratio of guidance and counseling need immediate attention. While some positive cost-benefit analyses have been derived for treatment approaches to specific problems (e.g., alcoholism), no such research has been conducted on guidance and counseling as a mode of primary prevention. The pressures of accountability,

particularly in economic terms, would argue that such research is imperative.

## POLICY IMPLICATIONS IN GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

Policy and, particularly, its expression in state and federal legislation is the vehicle by which the improvement of guidance and counseling, the visibility and the coordination of such processes, the preparation of practitioners and the expansion of a pertinent research base are most likely to ensue. Therefore, an analysis of the philosophical, empirical, and cost-benefit perspectives on guidance and counseling suggest such policy and legislative implications as the following:

1. There is a need to provide policy and categorical funds directed to the initiation and maintenance of a comprehensive research and development program pertinent to guidance and counseling. Of particular concern in mounting such initiatives is the provision of support for training researchers who are competent to conduct both empirical and cost-benefit studies of guidance and counseling.
2. The existing research base in guidance and counseling appears to be larger than is customarily used in policy formulation at national and state levels or in program planning at local levels. Efforts need to be initiated to synthesize and to disseminate research findings in forms easily understood by policymakers and by practitioners for use in program development.
3. The existing research suggests that guidance and counseling are not simply helpful, they are essential in resolving many national social, occupational, and educational problems. Therefore in legislation dealing with at least the following types of problems guidance and counseling should be considered an essential, not an optional, element:
  - the school to work transition
  - career development, planning, and decision making
  - mental health
  - reduction of substance abuse
  - rehabilitation of the physically and emotionally handicapped and the ex-offender
  - equity for special populations
4. The support of a national research and development effort in guidance and counseling, including the legislative authorization thereof, needs to be coordinated across governmental agencies and professional organizations. Since guidance and counseling are applied processes whose practitioners work in many settings, private and governmental, research programs and research findings need to be coordinated so that a desired synthesis is achieved across multiple governmental units. Likewise, since guidance and counseling derive their conceptual bases from several disciplines and persons provid-

ing guidance and counseling are served by an array of professional organizations, efforts to establish advisory groups broadly representative of the multiple disciplines, settings, and professional organizations involved are extremely important. Further, large scale research efforts should be implemented in ways that include cross-disciplinary and/or consortia-based teams.

5. Because of the research voids related to the quality and impact of guidance and counseling in the United States it would be appropriate to conceive a congressionally mandated five-year study of such matters. Such a study could validate and extend the effects of guidance and counseling described here as well as make more comprehensive a research and development agenda for the 1980s and 1990s.
6. The effects of guidance and counseling seem to be sufficiently wide-ranging and important to justify a national center for research and development and advanced study centers comparable to that now available for vocational education.

## REFERENCES

- Adams, G. 'Preventative' career counseling-proving that it works. *Journal of College Placement*, Spring 1974, 27-33.
- Aiken, W. C., Isenburg, R., Bales, J., Brewer, E., Goss, P., & Sackrison, R. *Meeting the training, counseling, and placement needs of unemployed youth and adults*. Paper presented at the First Southern Regional Vocational Education Leadership Development Conference, Atlanta, April 1976 (ED 130 102).
- Alander, R., & Campbell, T. An evaluative study of an alcohol and drug recovery program, a case study of the Oldsmobile experience. *Human Resource Management*, 1975, 14, 14-18.
- Alexander, J. F., & Parsons, B. V. Short-term behavioral intervention with delinquent families: Impact on family process and recidivism. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, 1973, 81(3), 219-225.
- Babcock, R. J., & Kauffman, M. A. Effectiveness of a career course. *Vocational Guidance Quarterly*, 1976, 24(3), 241-266.
- Bennett, E. C. *Operation C.O.D.: A program designed to improve pupil self-esteem thereby reducing future school dropouts*. Chicago: Nova University, 1975 (ED 136 091).
- Benson, R. L., & Blocker, D. H. Evaluation of developmental counseling with groups of low achievers in a high school setting. *School Counselor*, 1967, 14, 215-220.
- Bergin, A. E. The evaluation of therapeutic outcomes. In A. E. Bergin & S. L. Garfield (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 1971.
- Bergin, A. E., & Lambert, M. J. The evaluation of therapeutic outcomes. In S. L. Garfield & A. E. Bergin (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavioral change*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1978, pp. 139-189.
- Bergin, A. E., & Strupp, H. H. *Changing frontiers in the science of psychotherapy*. Chicago: Aldine, 1972.
- Bergland, B. W., Quatrano, L. W., & Lundquist, G. W. Group social models and structured interaction in teaching decision-making. *Vocational Guidance Quarterly*, 1975, 24(1), 28-36.
- Berkeley Planning Associates. An evaluation of the costs and effectiveness of vocational rehabilitation service strategies for individuals most severely handicapped. Preliminary report. Berkeley, California: Associates, 320 Channing Way, February 1975.

- Bertoldi, A. R. *Remediation for auxiliary services students: Evaluation period, school year 1974-75*. Brooklyn, NY: New York City Board of Education, Office of Educational Evaluation, 1975 (ED 135 926).
- Block, J. Effects of a rational-emotive mental health program on poorly achieving, disruptive high school students. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1978, 25(1), 61-65.
- Buckner, M. P. *Effective dropout prevention programs*. Paper presented at the meeting of the National School Boards Association, San Francisco, April 1976 (ED 123 730).
- Calhoun, S. R. The effect of counseling on a group of underachievers. *School Review*, 1956, 64, 312-316.
- Campbell, D. P. *The results of counseling: Twenty-five years later*. Philadelphia, PA: W. B. Saunders Company, 1965.
- Columbus Job Service Office. Referral and placement of counseled applicants. Columbus, Ohio: The Office, 1973.
- Combs, A. W., Avila, B. L., & Purkey, W. W. *Helping relationships, Basic concepts for the helping professions*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, Inc., 1974.
- Cowen, E. L. Social and community intervention. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 1973, 24, 423-472.
- Cummings, N. A. The anatomy of psychotherapy under national health insurance. *American Psychologist*, 1977, 32(9), 711-718.
- Cummings, N. A., & Follette, W. T. Brief psychotherapy and medical utilization: An eight year follow up. In H. Dörken & Associates (Eds.) *The professional psychologist today: New developments in law, health, insurance and health practice*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1976.
- Cummings, N. A., & Follette, W. T. Psychiatric services and medical utilization in a prepaid health plan setting: Part II. *Medical Care*, 1968, 6, 31-41.
- Dallas Police Department. *Youth service program: Police diversion program*. Dallas, Texas: Dallas Police Department, 1975 (ED 127-533).
- Doyle, R. E. *Supportive services program: School year 1975-76*. Brooklyn, NY: New York City Board of Education, 1976 (ED 137 440).
- Egner, J. R., & Jackson, D. J. Effectiveness of a counseling intervention programs for teaching career decision making skills. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1978, 25(1), 45-52.
- Eitzen, D. S. The effects of behavior modification on the attitudes of delinquents. *Behavior Research and Therapy*, 1975, 18, 295-299.
- Evans, J. R., & Cody, J. J. Transfer of decision-making skills learned in a counseling like setting to similar and dissimilar situations. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1969, 16, 427-432.
- Flake, M. H., Roach, A. J., Jr., & Stenning, W. F. Effects of short-term counseling on career maturity of tenth grade students. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 1975, 6(1), 73-80.
- Follette, W. T., & Cummings, N. A. Psychiatric services and medical utilization in a prepaid health plan setting. *Medical Care*, 1967, 5, 25-35.
- Foreyt, J. P., Roekwood, C. E., Davis, J. E., Desvougues, W. H., & Hollingsworth, R. Benefit-cost analysis of a token economy program. *Professional Psychology*, 1975, 6(1), 26-33.
- Garfield, S. L., & Bergin, A. E. *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change: An empirical analyses* (2nd Ed.). New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1978.
- Gala, C., & McCauley, C. Counseling truants back to school: Motivation combined with a program for action. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1976, 23(2), 166-169.
- Harper, R., & Balch, P. Some economic arguments in favor of primary prevention. *Professional Psychology*, February 1975, 6(1), 17-25.
- Herr, E. L., & Cramer, S. H. *Guidance of the college-bound: Problems, practices, perspectives*. Chapter 4. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1968.
- Herrin, R., & Muir, J. The National Council on Crime and Delinquency New Gate Resource Center. Hackensack, NJ: New Gate Resource Center, 1974 (ED 137 574).
- Hu, T., Swisher, J., & McDonnell, N. Cost-effectiveness analysis of drug prevention program. Report submitted to the National Institute on Drug Abuse, Contract #271-77-4522, Uni-

- versity Park, PA: The Center for Research on Human Resources, Institute for Policy Research and Evaluation, The Pennsylvania State University.
- Johns, M. Benefit-cost analysis of alcoholism treatment centers (2 vols.) Report, Contract ADM-281-75-0031. Annandale, VA: JWK International Corporation, May 1976.
- Jones, J. A., Tait, A. L., Washington, K., & Silcott, T. G. *Learning and self-esteem among black and white pre-schoolers*. New York: Black Analysis, 1975 (ED 122 926).
- Kekalik, J. S., Brewer, G. O., Dougharty, L. A., Fleischauer, P. D., Genensky, S. M., & Wallen, L. M. Improving services to handicapped children with emphases on hearing and vision impairments. Santa Monica, California: RAND, R-1240-HEW, May 1974.
- Karon, B. P., & Vandenbos, G. R. Cost/benefit analysis: Psychologist versus psychiatrist for schizophrenics. *Professional Psychology*, 1976, 7(1), 107-111.
- Kennecott Copper Corporation. *Insight*. Unpublished report. Utah Copper Division, Salt Lake City, 1975.
- Knosh, M. N., & Grimm, J. E. Adult women's center planning in a liberal arts college utilizing male and female counselors. Paper presented at the American Personnel and Guidance Association Convention, Chicago, Illinois, April 1976 (ED 128 672).
- Krumboltz, J. D., & Thoresen, C. E. The effect of behavioral counseling in groups and individual settings on information-seeking behavior. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1964, 11, 324-333.
- Kunce, J. T., Miller, D. E., & Cope, J. S. Macro data analysis and rehabilitation program evaluation. *Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin*, 1974, 17, 132-140.
- Lazarus, A. A. Behavior rehearsal versus non-directive therapy versus advice in effecting behavior change. *Behavior Research and Therapy*, 1966, 4, 209-212.
- Lewis, J. P., & Boyle, R. Evaluation of the 1975-76 vocational and basic education program in the eight Pennsylvania state correctional institutions. Harrisburg, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State Department of Education, 1976 (ED 132 388).
- Mason, P. Counseling: Measuring the job payoff. *Manpower*, February 1974.
- Mayors Office of Manpower Resources. *Teens helping other teens get it together: An evaluation of the Baltimore youth advocate project*. Baltimore, MD: Mayor's Office of Manpower Resources, 1974 (ED 134-658).
- McDonnell, N., Swisher, J., & Hu, T. The implications of cost effectiveness/cost benefit evaluation for primary prevention of substance abuse. Based on report submitted to the National Institute for Drug Abuse, Contract #271-77-4522. University Park, PA: The Center for Research on Human Resources, Institute for Policy Research and Evaluation, The Pennsylvania State University.
- Merenda, P. F., & Rothney, J. W. M. Evaluating the effects of counseling—eight years later. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1968, 5, 163-168.
- Mitchell, A. *An evaluation of career guidance films*. Culver City Unified School District, Orange County Department of Education, Santa Ana, California, 1971, 25 (ED 066 673).
- Myers, R., Lindeman, R., & Thompson, A. Effects of the educational and career exploration system on vocational maturity. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 1975, 6, 245-254.
- Nelson, V. L., Nolf, G. J., & Bush, J. W. *Adult career education as an intervention strategy in mid-career crisis*. Cambridge, MASS: University Consultants, Inc., 1975 (ED 133 995).
- O'Hara, R. P. Vocational self-concepts and high school achievement. *Vocational Guidance Quarterly*, 1966, 15, 106-112.
- Olbrisch, M. E. Psychotherapeutic intervention in physical health. Effectiveness and economic efficiency. *American Psychologist*, 1977, 32(9), 761-777.
- Paulsen, R. *Career education for persons in rural areas—primary focus on adults sixteen and over*. Final report. Wausau, Wisconsin: North Central Technical Institute, 1976 (ED 133 600).
- Philadelphia School District. Evaluation of Title I ESEA projects, 1975-76. Report No. 77124. Philadelphia, PA: The School District, Office of Research and Evaluation, 1976 (ED 137 366).
- Philbrick, R. E. Counseling—a friend to placement. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 1975, 12, 18-25.

- Pinto, L. R., & Feigenbaum, L. Effects of clinical counseling on college achievement. *The Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1974, 21(5), 409-414.
- Reardon, R. W. Help for the troubled worker in a small company. *Personnel*, 1976, 53(1), 50-54.
- Roessler, R., Cook, D., & Lillard, D. Effects of systematic group counseling on work adjustment clients. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1977, 24(4), 313-317.
- Rothney, J. W. M. *Guidance practices and results*. New York: Harper and Brother, 1958.
- Schmieding, O. A. Efficacy of counseling and guidance procedures with failing junior high school students. *School Counselor*, 1966, 14, 74-80.
- Shertzer, B., & Stone, S. C. *Fundamentals of guidance* (3rd Ed.). Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1976.
- Sloane, R. B., Staples, F. R., Cristol, A. H., Yorkston, N. H., & Whipple, K. *Psychotherapy versus behavior therapy*. Cambridge, MASS: Harvard University Press, 1975.
- Stewart, N. R., & Thoresen, C. R. Behavioral group counseling for career development. Symposium presented at the Annual meeting of the American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1968.
- Strupp, H. Psychotherapy research and practice: An overview. In S. L. Garfield and A. E. Bergin (Eds.), *Handbook of psychotherapy and behavior change*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1978, pp. 1-21.
- Super, D. E. Vocational development theory: Persons, positions, and processes. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 1969, 1, 2-9.
- Sussna, E. Measuring mental health program benefits: Efficiency or justice? *Professional Psychology*, 1977, 8(4), 435-441.
- Tennor, D. *Psychotherapy: The hazardous cure*. Garden City, NY: Anchor Books, 1976.
- Thompson, V. M. *Programs to aid unemployed aerospace professionals: Implications for mid-life career direction*. Santa Monica, California: Rand Corporation, 1975 (ED 123 472).
- Tyler, L. E. *The work of the counselor* (3rd Ed.). Chapter 14. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1969.
- U.S. Department of Labor, Manpower Administration. Texas counseling research project. Letter to Associate Manpower Administration for Field Direction and Management. Dallas, Texas: August 23, 1974.
- Valencia County Commission. *Rio Grande Youth Care Center Final Report*. Los Lunas, New Mexico: The Commission, 1974 (ED 134 356).
- Warren, J. M. Changing attitudes of supervisors. *Labor-management Alcoholism Newsletter*, 1978, 1, 9.
- Williams, R. L., & Byars, H. Negro self-esteem in a transitional society. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1968, 47, 120-125.
- Worrall, J. D. A benefit-cost analysis of the vocational rehabilitation program. *The Journal of Human Resources*, Spring 1978, 13(2), 285-298.



# 12

## The Counselor as Political Activist

Judy Lombana  
University of North Florida

---

A cursory review of education and welfare legislation passed by Congress over the past few years could lead to the hasty conclusion that counseling services are highly valued from the federal perspective. One might further assume that counseling professionals represent a potent and forceful lobby in Washington. It is undoubtedly true that a great number of federal statutes, as well as pending legislation, contain counseling provisions. The Education Amendments of 1976 (P.L. 94-482) and 1978 (P.L. 95-561), The Education for All Handicapped Children Act (P.L. 94-142), amendments to CETA (P.L. 95-524), Career Education (P.L. 95-207), and portions of The Older Americans Act, the Civil Rights Act, the Juvenile Justice and Prevention Act, and the Rehabilitation Act serve as examples of federal legislation that attest to the importance of counseling services for the welfare of this nation's citizens (see Jennings discussion, Chapter 9).

More careful examination of these and other legislative provisions reveal certain inescapable themes that can be translated into Congressional views toward the practice of counseling. A comparison of authorization rhetoric and appropriated dollars, for example, indicates that counseling is valued in much the same way as are apple pie and motherhood; that is, philosophical support need not be translated into financial commitment.

An analysis of those guidance-oriented programs funded by Congress and regulated by various federal offices reveal other emphases not tra-

ditionally embraced by the counseling profession: counseling as separate from the concept of therapy, counseling techniques that are population-specific, counseling in non-institutional settings, and counselors as managers, collaborators, planners, and program evaluators (Herr, 1977; Pinson, 1978).

While many counselors would agree that, to some extent, the Congressional message has merit and reflects current issues of internal dialogue, the fact remains that, by and large, the political and regulatory structure does not view counselors as they view themselves. Furthermore, analyses of certain laws and/or regulations lead to a conclusion that counselors are not only viewed differently from a federal perspective, but that such views are not particularly positive. Most counselors cannot begin to understand how the Department of Labor could issue regulations that eliminate training requirements for employment counselors. They are understandably troubled that P.L. 94-142, with its vast implications for school counselors, completely altering roles in some instances, does not even contain the word "counselor." It seems incomprehensible that a law like The Hatch Act (amended in P.L. 95-561, Section 1250) which, in essence, devalues all aspects of affective education, could ever be passed by enlightened lawmakers.

Such post facto concerns are of course solely rhetorical, because the deeds have, in fact, been done. A number of questions are generated, however, most of which must be directed not to "shortsighted" legislators and bureaucrats, but to the counseling profession itself. The inquiry ultimately points toward an examination of ways in which counselors can control their own political destiny. A review of previous accomplishments, an examination of barriers to development of social and political activism, and a description of possible strategies for mobilization may help to address the issue.

## COUNSELORS AND POLITICAL ACTION: AN OVERVIEW

In spite of the fact that counseling-oriented federal legislation has been supported routinely for a number of years, the impact of such efforts was not noticeably felt until the mid 1960s. The implementation of Title V of the National Defense Education Act signalled a massive upsurge in the growth of the profession, particularly in educational settings. Federal support for counseling services and training programs was obtained without significant effort on the part of educators. Thus it was that a complacent and bemused profession found it difficult to face the fact that, by the end of the decade, federal priorities had changed, and new and foreign watchwords had emerged. For a group accustomed to categorical support for its efforts and to a comfortable dependence on the intrinsic worth of therapy and developmental processes, little attention was paid to the glimmerings of "consolidation" and "accountability." Not until overt actions such as the disintegration of U.S.O.E. guidance leadership, sharp

reductions in the number of state-level guidance supervisors, and drastic cuts in federal dollars for local school guidance support (Heddesheimer & Erpenbach, 1978) did the counseling profession confront the need to become politically proactive.

A major thrust toward political involvement was initiated by the American Personnel and Guidance Association in 1972 with the establishment of a "Federal Relations" committee. In the ensuing years other organizations, including the Guidance Division of the American Vocational Association, the National Association of Student Personnel Administrators, and the National Association of Women Deans, Administrators, and Counselors have developed comparable structures to address legislative issues. APGA government relations efforts, in particular, have expanded considerably in terms of individual and group involvement, scope, and accomplishment. The communications network established extends into every state; most APGA divisions are at least verbally supportive of political activities at federal and/or state levels; and the organization has experienced notable successes, particularly since 1975.

As with federal guidance legislation, however, a cursory examination of organizational efforts and accomplishments can be misleading. A closer look reveals that federal legislative activities were invariably accomplished by a small group of dedicated "Paladins" (Lawton, 1971; Pinson, 1979) rather than through a swell of grassroots efforts. One can only speculate as to what might be accomplished if professional counselors throughout the country, working individually and through a politically committed association, were to actively involve themselves in social and political issues.

## BARRIERS TO POLITICAL ACTIVISM

Other than issues of self-preservation (e.g., licensure, confidentiality, accreditation), the practicing counselor appears to have little interest in social or political concepts—or at least has not translated such interest into action. Counseling literature is virtually devoid of articles calling for or relating instances of political activism (Pinson, 1979), and in terms of social activism there exists a significant disparity between what is advocated in the literature and what is accomplished in actual practice.

The myriad causes or explanations for the relative lack of counselor involvement in political and social action issues can be attributed to three types of constraints: societal/economic barriers, institutional/organizational barriers, and self-imposed counselor barriers.

### Societal/economic Barriers

Societal/economic barriers are relatively few in number, but they are extremely potent. One prevailing societal view is that counseling and "politics" are philosophically incompatible. This attitude, borrowed from the helping professions in general and education in particular, carries

with it the notion that "politics" and "politicians" represent unsavory, alien forces to be avoided at all costs. At the same time, counselors align themselves with other educators who too frequently look to the federal government, particularly at election time, as the financial savior of their programs (Kirst, 1976). Time and experience have increasingly demonstrated that neither view is realistic. Unfortunately, these assumptions continue and become translated into apathy and inaction on the part of too many counselors. As a result of their perception that decisions concerning them will continue to be made by politicians, politicians have tended to turn elsewhere for advice about the substance of counseling.

Another prevailing notion that has undoubtedly served to inhibit counselor activity is that human services in general, and education in particular, are currently in disfavor with the public. Difficulties and dissatisfactions with certain welfare programs have succumbed to the "spread" phenomenon so common to stereotypical views; that is, the negative attributes of certain social programs are assumed to characterize all of human services. Likewise, the opinion persists that federal support for education is not supported by the public, in spite of surveys (e.g., Wolanin, 1976) indicating the contrary.

## Institutional Barriers

The primary institutions with which counselors are affiliated: training programs, work settings, and professional organizations have contributed to the inhibition of political and social action. As Warnath (1973) pointed out nearly ten years ago, the format for counselor education had been stable for the preceding twenty-five years. With a few notable exceptions, e.g., the increase in community counseling specialty options, there is little indication of significant changes in the direction of counselor training since then. This "stability" is reflected in the characteristics of counselor educators themselves, the selection of students into programs, and the nature of coursework and philosophical orientations presented. Counselor educators are not typically risk-takers or prone to clash with restrictive social or institutional forces; they tend to select trainees whose previous educational and work experiences more closely approximate their own. All too frequently, students' didactic experiences omit learning that has evolved from practical experience in agency settings (Lewis & Lewis, 1971).

The philosophical orientation espoused by most counselor-training institutions serves to militate against social and political activism. Trembley (1977) attributes counselors' political naiveté to the inappropriate generalization of nondirective counseling approaches, particularly in areas such as budget negotiation. Pleading for an activist approach to the delivery of services, Menacker (1976) advocates a move from a behavioral to a social science base in counselor training. Traditional theory places the counselor in a reflective, verbal role with the client as the central focus. A more activist—and pragmatic—stance would find the counselor engaged in eliminating environmental obstacles, with or without the active participation of the client. Such a challenge to traditional theory,

first delineated by Gordon (1967), has not appeared to have motivated counselor educators to redesign their programs within such a sociological/anthropological/political science framework. Most counselor educators themselves have had little training in the social sciences; thus, counselor trainees get little exposure to these fields. Practicing counselors, particularly in educational settings, have difficulty dealing positively with social problems such as drug abuse (Pine, 1975). Likewise, the great majority of counselors have had no training in political action (Healy, 1972); therefore, it remains a little-known tool for the accomplishment of guidance objectives.

Upon completion of a training program, even the most proactive and socially conscious counselor frequently finds the work world to be curiously inhibiting in terms of political and social action. Counselors employed by state or local governmental agencies must frequently adhere to institutional policies restricting political and social action. Legal constraints, however, represent a minor barrier for counselors. Far more prevalent, although less overt, are institutional pressures to conform. Unfortunately, the status quo in many institutional settings appears designed to meet administrative rather than client needs. Because of these pressures to conform, counselors usually operate from a weak power position (Haettenschwiler, 1970) and frequently resign themselves to the situation, becoming apathetic followers more concerned with job security than with innovation and social involvement (Stubbins, 1970). Many counselors, particularly in educational settings, consider that they have little choice. Given the current economic climate, they are ever mindful of the fact that they work under the supervision of administrators whose primary function is to make the organization run smoothly (Warnath, 1973) and that they need job security as much as do the students they counsel (Wells, 1974).

Guidance legislative provisions are not always welcomed by counselors, primarily because of the usual accompanying institutional red tape. Many laws that are designed to provide needed social or educational services for clients become embroiled in a proliferation of forms and reports by the time they proceed through various bureaucratic levels to the service providers. For example, a recent study of Florida school counselors revealed that more than half spend the majority of their work time with handicapped students, who represent less than five percent of the school enrollment. Further, the primary activities performed by the counselors are screening students for placement and maintaining records. All too frequently, counselors view federal legislation, particularly as interpreted through federal and state regulations, with suspicion. They often consider that the benefits to be gained are far outweighed by the demands and restrictions of administrative and clerical requirements.

Professional organizations, too, serve as institutional barriers to political and social activism, perhaps more by omission than commission. Because of the diversity in work settings and client populations, professional counselor groups have proliferated, and a single organization may consist of a number of divisions with varying and sometimes conflicting interests. The diverse interests of an organization can result in internal strife and competition that, in turn, inhibits political effectiveness (Bar-



baro, 1977). Too, without at least a coalition of like-minded interest groups, individual organizations are greatly restricted in their ability to provide adequate financial support and commitment to the pursuit of legislative goals. As Wolanin (1976) points out, educational organizations are known for their failure to help "friends of education" attain and retain office.

In addition to the various problems inherent in the proliferation and splintering of professional counseling groups, the effectiveness of such organizations is further weakened by their self-perpetuating, status-quo orientation. In calling for an action-oriented counseling association, Lawton (1971) asserts that the profession's survival is partially contingent on the development of a support group that can exert political influence, take proactive stands on vital issues, support action programs, and accept adaptive change as the only constant of life. Most current counseling organizations cannot be said to meet such criteria.

## Self-Imposed Barriers

Although a number of economic, societal, and institutional forces have operated to hinder counselors' involvement in political and social action, the primary barriers have been self-imposed. Many counselors tend to isolate themselves (Lewis & Lewis, 1971; Pine, 1975), conducting their activities in one-to-one relationships behind closed doors. Likewise, their professional relationships are characterized by encapsulation; counselors tend to discuss issues with each other rather than communicating with the general public (Pinson, 1978) or with other agencies. A political role is frequently considered totally inappropriate and in conflict with professional responsibilities and ethics. At least one study (Allen, 1975) has confirmed the notion that most counselors prefer a clinical role to an environmental one. Allen's survey of 108 school counselors revealed that they enjoy and "feel more comfortable" in an isolated role; further, they perceive that others in the school (except the students!) expect them to be clinical.

Allen's research corroborated others that have illustrated that counselors are more inclined to attend to the wishes of their employers than those of their clients. Although the literature is replete with calls for activist counselors (e.g., Adams, 1973; Baker & Cramer, 1972; Atkinson, Froman, Romo, & Mayton, 1977), such calls are seldom made by practicing counselors. Walz and Benjamin (1978) attribute this fact to the difficulties of viewing a system from within. Dworkin and Dworkin (1971) consider that counselors firmly believe that the locus of problems in society can be attributed to individual adjustment and that many have never considered that problems can be mediated through environmental manipulation. Whatever the causes or explanations, it appears that typical counselors are agents of the institutional system, protecting the status quo and failing to address needed changes either within themselves or the social environment. Indeed, some writers have publicly disclaimed political involvement: "If counselors honestly believe that the professional activities expected of them by the public are a sell-out to an oppressive society, it would seem logical that such counselors disengage themselves



from the guidance profession and pursue their social-political objectives in a different role" (Drapela, 1974, p. 450).

Although it appears that counselors have striven above all else to support the established systems and adhere to the expectations of the more powerful of their various publics, it is well known that, in general, counselors suffer from a somewhat tarnished public image. Problems in credibility can often be traced to justifiable complaints. The "credibility gap," in turn, serves as still another hindrance to effective counselor political and social action. Odell (1973) has pointed out that at least part of the political reaction to the counseling profession is a result of counselors' own claims that they can help everybody and contribute significantly to the solution of almost every social and economic problem. At the same time, counselors have virtually ignored changing societal conditions and resisted the implementation of new practices and procedures (Aubrey, 1970). Unrealistic claims coupled with ostrichlike behavior have been further compounded by counselors' resistance to public and legislative demands for accountability. Counselors who are unwilling or unable to document positive results of their efforts, preferring instead to discuss the process of counseling and the "roles and functions" of counselors, have created a public image that is hardly conducive to public support.

## STRATEGIES FOR POLITICAL/SOCIAL ACTIVISM

If counselors are to dismantle the imagined obstacles to their own political and social activism, a number of strategies will need to be implemented within the profession. Most such changes appear to be directly related to one or more of three long-range goals for counselor renewal: redefining the counseling process; improving counselor credibility; and establishing linkages with other groups.

### Redefining the Counseling Process

Counselors and their various publics must accept the concept of political and social action as legitimate counseling outcomes. Environmental manipulation in order to meet client needs and promotion of legislation to secure social programs and services should be recognized as appropriate methods to extend the notion of counseling beyond the therapeutic, as well as to dispell myths that a single strategy is appropriate for all clients.

### Improving Counselor Credibility

Counselors must break away from the self-fulfilling prophesy that has served to lower their own self-esteem as well as others' views of counselor competence. Professional self-respect and public acceptance are necessary prerequisites to the implementation of social action programs as well as

to credible documentation of legislative needs. In order to elevate their public image, counselors will need to be able to model independent thinking, stop supporting the institutional status quo, and insist on program accountability and professional credentialing.

## Establishing Linkages with Other Groups

Counselors must find ways to reach beyond their immediate colleagues in terms of dialogue, service delivery, and political action. The power in numbers that is readily apparent for specific legislative purposes is also evident in the implementation of client advocacy at local and state levels. Some university training models currently exist that provide several of these components. For example, many community counseling programs and student personnel programs provide a training milieu that includes a focus on programs and organizational impact. These program methodologies should be examined carefully for inclusion in all counselor training programs.

## Recommendations

In order to build necessary power bases, create professional unity, foster creative solutions to social problems, and update counselor skills, the following strategies are recommended:

- *Organizations concerned with counseling and guidance should consider merging into one professional association.* Political and social action on behalf of clients should be the primary organizational thrust and necessary financial commitments should be made by all parties.
- *The organization must take public stands on issues of social and political importance.* Discussion of such issues should be promoted through the media as well as through presentations to a wide variety of lay and professional noncounseling groups.
- *The organization should establish formal linkages with other groups whose interests may periodically overlap.* Temporary and issue-specific liaisons with groups having considerable political experience can serve training purposes as well as facilitate development of effective and long-range coalitions.
- *Counselor training programs should base selection of students at least partially on the students' experience and interest in social and political action.* The selection of passive, status-quo-oriented counselors who view therapy as the only viable intervention must not be perpetuated.
- *Counselor training programs should restructure their curricula in order to respond to current social and political issues.* Examples of skills and knowledge that should be developed are a comprehensive understanding of the legislative process, knowledge of and experience with organizational development, and understanding of the political, social, and economic views of current societal problems.

- *Increase the informal/formal linkages among the helping professions.* A prototype of this kind of liaison is beginning to emerge as networks of professional agencies pool their interests and clientele to achieve goals no single agency's budget can achieve. State legislatures are far more impressed by collaborative efforts that focus on client gain and services than upon single agency turfmanship.
- *Counselor training programs and/or the professional associations should offer in-service education for counselor educators and practicing counselors.* The inclusion of political and social action as a counseling skill will necessitate retraining of committed but uninformed professionals.
- *Counselors, counselor training programs and the professional association must redefine professional ethics to include institutional, as well as individual, behavior and responsibilities.* Counselors must assume responsibility for examining laws and plans that profess to govern their practice and to take action when such institutional policies are unjust or obsolete (Pinson, 1978).
- *Counselors should develop program plans that specify who they will serve and the various strategies to be employed.* In order to increase efficiency as well as to correctly represent themselves to the public, counselors need to focus on the clients who most need help and to use social and political action strategies when appropriate.
- *Counselors should demonstrate commitment to social and political action through involvement in state level politics.* Running for office, campaigning for other candidates, and promoting specific legislation on behalf of clients can build public support and confidence in counselors as doers rather than talkers.
- *Counselors, counselor educators, and organization leaders need to make systematic efforts to educate the profession, political leaders, and the lay public regarding the importance of counseling for social action.* Professional literature, workshops, speeches to civic groups and media announcements should all be employed to develop awareness, support, and commitment to social action.
- *Counselors need to create political coalitions with clients and with authority figures within the community.* Counselors have neglected to involve clients and other publics (e.g., parents) in efforts to achieve strong social action programs, in spite of the fact that such efforts by other groups have been extremely successful. At the same time, counselors should seek support of community leaders and other authority figures who can, from a different vantage point, provide support and strengthen coalition efforts.
- *The professional association should expand efforts to regulate the profession.* Emphasis should be placed not only on credentialing training programs but also on self-policing of practicing counselors. Credibility of the entire profession is lowered by the actions of a few incompetent or unethical individuals; tenure and certification laws must not allow unwarranted protection.
- *Counselors must assume responsibility for program accountability and make data available to the public.* The collection, analysis, and

dissemination of program effectiveness information can serve to provide visibility for counseling programs, increase self and public confidence in social and political action as counseling strategies, and provide documentation for legislative needs. The professional organization should serve as a central clearinghouse for documented evidence of counseling effectiveness.

- *Counselors and their professional organization should promote legislation that is based on documented needs.* Too frequently, legislative efforts have been viewed as self-serving and inordinately expensive while unfounded by factual evidence.

## CONCLUSION

Implementation of political and social action as a viable counseling modality will not be an easy task. Training, retraining, reorganization, and exploring new coalitions and ways of working are endeavors that will take time, a great deal of professional commitment, and considerable financial resources. Before such efforts could begin to be undertaken, a degree of acceptance and support will need to be garnered from the profession. There are many who will argue that the task is either too difficult or too radical. In spite of the evidence that counselors do, in fact, employ political strategies, if only to support establishment policies, some counselors will continue to assert that counseling and politics are innately incompatible. Factual information to the contrary, some will maintain that one-to-one therapy is the only viable means of solving personal and social problems. Many will perceive a conflict of interest or allegiances in activities such as running for office or forming coalitions with clients.

It is possible that many social and political action strategies will be undertaken with a degree of personal and professional risk. Counselors may well find that they will alienate colleagues and/or employers who prefer to maintain the status quo. Multiple allegiances are frequently hard to maintain, particularly when political ramifications are present. Some counselors will find the transition from therapy to environmental manipulation particularly visible—and painful. Counselor educators and organization leaders, too, will undoubtedly be reluctant to relinquish roles and responsibilities with which they have long been associated.

In spite of the certain difficulties involved in developing politically and socially active counselors, overwhelming evidence points toward a realization that without significant moves in such a direction, the profession itself may not survive! On a more positive note, there are strong indications that counselors possess the strength and capabilities needed to alter the present course. As a group, counselors possess a strong social consciousness. They are caring people who are concerned with the quality of their clients' lives. They are well trained as listeners, observers, and mediators, qualities that can be applied to the political process as well as to counseling. Professional commitment and diligent efforts, then, can result in a renewal and expansion of the counseling process; social ad-

vocacy to address the environmental needs of clients and political/legislative promotion of a wide array of counseling programs naturally follows.

## REFERENCES

- Adams, H. J. The progressive heritage of guidance: View from the left. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1973, 51, 531-538.
- Allen, S. D. Helping roles in school systems: Counselors as maintainers of the status quo. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association. Washington, D.C., 1975.
- Atkinson, D. R., Froman, T., Romo, J., & Mayton, D. M., II. The role of the counselor as a social activist: Who supports it? *School Counselor*, 1977, 25, 85-91.
- Aubrey, R. F. Some strategies for guidance intervention. *Focus on Guidance*, 1970, 3, 3.
- Baker, S. B., & Cramer, S. H. Counselor or change agent: Support from the profession. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1972, 50, 661-665.
- Barbaro, F. The role of interest groups in educational politics. *Clearinghouse*, 1977, 51, 136-142.
- Drapela, V. J. Counselors, not political agitators. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1974, 52, 449-453.
- Dworkin, E. P., & Dworkin, A. L. The activist counselor. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1971, 49, 748-753.
- Gordin, E. W. The socially disadvantaged student: Implications for the training of guidance specialists. In *Preparing school counselors in educational guidance*. New York: College Entrance Examination Board, 1967.
- Haettenschwiler, D. L. Control of the counselor's role. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 1970, 17, 437-442.
- Healy, C. C. Manpower trends: Counseling or political solutions? *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1972, 51, 39-43.
- Heddesheimer, J., & Erpenbach, W. Federal, state, and local coordination and supervision of guidance and counseling programs. In *The status of guidance and counseling in the nation's schools*. Washington, D.C.: American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1978.
- Herr, E. L. The relationship of guidance and counseling to national educational, social, and occupational priorities. Washington, D.C.: American Personnel and Guidance Association, 1977.
- Kirst, M. W. The future federal role in education: Parties and candidates in the 1976 elections. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 1976, 58, 155-158.
- Lawton, R. Counselors need a green light organization. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1971, 49, 759-763.
- Lewis, M. D., & Lewis, J. A. Counselor education: Training for a new alternative. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1971, 49, 754-758.
- Menacker, J. Toward a theory of activist guidance. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1976, 54, 318-321.
- Odell, C. E. Change in a developing field. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1973, 52, 141-144.
- Pine, G. J. Quo vadis, school counseling? *Phi Delta Kappan*, 1975, 56, 554-557.
- Pinson, N. M. Federal legislative perspectives on guidance processes and services. Paper presented at the First Annual Summer Institute for Guidance Leadership. University Park, PA, 1978.
- Pinson, N. M. Political activism and the counselor. Unpublished paper, 1979.
- Stubbins, J. The politics of counseling. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1970, 48, 611-618.

- Trembley, E. L. Three steps toward consumer advocacy. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1977, 56, 210-213.
- Walz, G. R., & Benjamin, L. A change agent strategy for counselors functioning as consultants. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 1978, 56, 331-334.
- Warnath, C. G. The school counselor as an institutional change agent. *School Counselor*, 1973, 20, 202-208.
- Wells, C. E. Speakout. *School Counselor*, 1974, 21, 182-183.
- Wolanin, T. R. The national higher education associations: Political resource and style. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 1976, 58, 181-184.



# PART FIVE

## Conclusions and Recommendations for Action

---

# 13

## A Review of the Issues; Implications for Research and for Policy

Nancy M. Pinson and Edwin L. Herr

---

The primary intent of this text has been to examine the state of the art with regard to guidance and counseling in national policy. This is an extremely complex goal because of the array of governmental agencies that have interest in or responsibility for the provision of guidance and counseling in specific settings and with specific populations.

The place of guidance and counseling in policy formulations has not traditionally been considered in research or in other scholarly activities. Therefore, this text begins a process in which both the actualities and the potentialities of guidance and counseling can be considered in relation to emerging priorities for social action. What is to be desired is that this text will raise the consciousness of readers, decision-makers, practitioners, researchers about guidance and counseling as sociopolitical processes with vast potential to contribute to the achievement of national and state goals in mental health, education, rehabilitation, employment, and other social priorities and concerns. The content of this text, then, is to be viewed as a stimulus to further dialogue about the conceptualization and implementation of guidance and counseling in future national policy, not as the conclusion of such dialogue.

This chapter will attempt to capture some of the highlights of the preceding chapters, and in doing so will suggest the elements of research

and development, as well as a policy agenda from which specific future actions might emerge. It will also identify a range of issues that must be addressed if counseling as a profession is to successfully accommodate the demands of the future. Before doing so, it will address the definition and character of policy as used in this text.

## Policy: Definitions and Constructs<sup>1</sup>

By definition, the *Merriam-Webster Dictionary* (1975) describes policy as: "(1) wisdom in the management of affairs, and (2) a definite course or method of action selected to guide and determine present and future directions." It is principally the second definition that has guided the content of this text although it has been assumed that it is difficult to be wise in the management of affairs unless one has a plan, a definite course of action, by which to guide and give direction to action.

At a macro level, policy should reflect the ways by which nations or states choose to act out their social metaphors and their belief systems about their immediate and future destinies. At a micro level, policy should reflect and guide the elected subsystems—for example, guidance and counseling—as these systems interact in the aggregate to implement the larger national or state metaphor.

Policy can be conceived as the creation of a set of hypotheses that reflect the "best guesses" by which to change *the circumstances* giving rise to the policy: e.g., concerns for equity, women's rights, unemployment, implementation of new technological bases, whatever. Policy, then, is based on a set of assumptions about the conditions needing change as well as about the actions that will change them. At issue is, of course, the question of by whom and how either the problems or the actions were defined. Since policy formulation is typically not a closed system, and, indeed, is frequently the art of compromise, political activism by special interest groups—consumers, professionals, others—ordinarily makes a difference in who is affected by the policy and how.

A somewhat different way of making this point is that within the policy context, "all decisions, all actions are made with at least an implicit assumption of the future environment in which that decision will be carried out and with some theory of how the decision will affect the future, presumably in a way agreeable to the decision-maker or the constituency for whom he or she is presumably acting" (Bruce-Biggs, 1979, p. 1). Thus, depending upon the nation, the state, the times, and the particular political process, policy and future studies may converge. The futurologist may be the link from the present to the future as the middle- and long-distance environment is defined as the policy target. Or, the forecast for the future may be the status quo as it has been through much of history. Such differences depend in part on whether programs of action are seen

---

<sup>1</sup> Material in this section and in certain other parts of this chapter have previously been published in Edwin L. Herr, *Policy in Guidance and Counseling: The U.S. Experience*, *International Association of Vocational Guidance, Bulletin*, 1981.

as prisoners of the contexts in which they are located or shapers of such contexts. In the case of guidance and counseling, it is assumed in this text that much statesmanship is required of the theorists, researchers, and practitioners of counseling to help policy makers understand the growth and potential, the dynamics of change, inherent in this field.

However the future is viewed by policy makers, it seems clear that policy creates realities. Whitehead (Whitehead, 1929; Tyler, 1979, p. 8) has talked of the choicemaking of individuals in the context that history is comprised of "actual occasions," happening in time, when persons convert potentiality into actuality. Potentialities are plural; actual occasions are singular. While only a small part of the possible is actualized in such "actual occasions," new entities are created and their reality affects the next "actual occasion." So it is with policy. In the creation of new entities and new realities, policy can move a subsystem such as guidance and counseling from the center to the periphery of national or state policy, or the reverse. It can also create by image and support, an "actual entity," a model of guidance and counseling that will retard or accelerate its inclusion as an instrument of future national or state policy.

While much has been written about political theory and policy formulation in macro terms, very little scholarly inquiry has been devoted to the place of guidance and counseling in national or sub-national policy, either in the United States or in other nations.

What seems to be true is that policies concerning guidance and counseling are a mosaic; there is no single policy direction, there are various policies. Until recently in the United States there has been little attention given to a national or to a state policy in guidance and counseling. To be sure, there is a wide range of legislative initiatives that bear upon the substance and definition of guidance and counseling and the target groups to be served. These pieces of legislation, however, tend to be random events focused independently on special problems, agencies, or counselor types rather than manifestations of a coherent policy, a statement of direction, designed to advanced the systematic implementation of guidance and counseling with respect to the needs of various persons across the life span, the vagaries of the institutional missions where guidance and counseling is implemented, and the most effective use of human and fiscal resources in guidance and counseling.

There are those who would argue that rather than the symmetry and sequence found in the Merriam-Webster definition of policy cited earlier, in the real world policy occurs as persons in the Executive Branch of government interpret legislation, write regulations by which to interpret it, etc.: that policy is really a *post hoc* rather than an *a priori* exercise. While a legitimate view of how policy frequently unfolds, the fact remains that without some coherent statement of direction before the fact that legislation can translate into action, because of the pressures for expedience and compromise among special interests, legislation frequently divides rather than integrates and where policy follows instead of precedes such action it becomes fragmented and prone to all sorts of slippage. It creates a collage of differences; in language, in enactments, in expectations, in the degrees to which guidance and counseling are seen as independent methods of achieving national policy goals or as components

of a more complex program of intervention or service. The latter is in turn reflected in whether funding for guidance and counseling is categorical or permissive.

Since both policy and guidance and counseling act upon and are in turn shaped by the social environment in which they are found, it is useful to reexamine some of the images of that future environment as depicted in the preceding chapters.

## AMERICA IN TRANSITION

The early chapters of this text assume that the America of the 1980s and beyond will not be the America of the previous two hundred years. Appellations such as "identity society," "psychological society," "post-industrial society" that appear in the popular press connote changes in individual responsibility for choice and shifts in the possibility structures available. Other terminology such as "spaceship earth" or "global island" reinforces the trend toward increased group interaction and mutual understanding that will characterize cultures and peoples previously able to be independent of each other.

The assumption of the early parts of this book is that shifting international coalitions, the realities of energy requirements, changes in monetary policies, limited resources, changing population demographics, emerging and waning technologies will each have significant effects upon domestic social policy, the quantity of life of all American citizens, and the subsequent acknowledgment and use of guidance and counseling as deliberate methods of facilitating specific national goals.

Hays and Green detail in Chapters 1 and 2 many of the trends or events that have shaped the likely outlines of the next decade. As another example of the changes and, indeed, the challenges of the future, Halperin (1979) has extracted the domestic consequences of ongoing population change in the United States.<sup>2</sup> Such forecasts and their implications represent ingredients of the social blueprint that must be formulated to guide social policy and against which the potential impact of guidance and counseling can be cast in the future.

1. The United States is likely to continue experiencing large new waves of immigration, both legal and illegal. (Refer to Davidson, Chapter 6)

\*Bicultural and bilingual education dedicated to absorbing new value structures into our society will require massive infusion of new ad-

---

<sup>2</sup> Sources for predictions, statistical estimates, and population characteristics and trends quoted here are (a) Domestic Consequences of United States Population Change. Washington, D.C.: A U. S. House of Representatives Committee Report, U.S. Gov't. Printing Office, Dec., 1978, and (b) prepared testimony given to the House subcommittee on Elementary, Secondary, and Vocational Education on April 26, 1979 by Patricia Graham, Arthur Lewis, Robert Theobald and Samuel Halperin. Extensions of certain of these implications have been developed by Pinson for this text.

vocacy systems. These must allow for the increase in competition for jobs by alien groups and the establishment of apprenticeships and peer-counseling networks that can assure equal access by the resident disadvantaged.

2. Despite declining fertility, the percentage of preschool children with mothers in the labor force will increase. In the eighties, baby-boom females will have reached peak child-bearing years—yet will find it more and more necessary to enter the work force for economic reasons. (Refer to Perry, Chapter 5)

\*Day-care centers will need to increase by two-thirds; young parents, specifically unwed mothers, will be particularly impoverished in parenting skills. Multigenerational family arrangements will be re-established out of necessity, not desire. The elderly or aging will also become involved as victims of domestic upheaval, if not abuse, by their adult children.

3. During the next decades, we will experience a marked shortage of young workers; the capacity of this group to support the growing population of aging Americans will be sorely tested.

\*The future society will be dramatically affected by the investments we make today in the employability and education of our youth. With vigorous competition from the private sector for the more competent of these young workers, the fields of education, counseling, and mental health will need to offer extraordinary incentives to compete for or to retain the most qualified future or present practitioners.

4. By 2030, American's post-65 population will have increased to at least 22 percent of the total.

\*Care for the aging is three times as costly as the education and other forms of sustenance provide our youth. Because states and localities will continue to assume the bulk of this latter responsibility, the federal government's share will be relatively small, less than ten percent. Conversely, care for the elderly by the year 2030 could reach 40 percent of the entire federal budget if pre-Reagan Administration policies are followed. State and local governments will need to take on more of these costs and, at the same time, work to correct the conditions necessitating them by restoring the older citizen to a higher level of psychic and economic well-being.

5. Education will increasingly be defined as learning how and where to get information, to solve problems, to recreate, to self-renew. In this context, qualitative access to opportunity will be stressed equally with equity of access. [Refer to Chapters by Franklin (7), Green (3), and Hays (2)]

\*Strong centralizing tendencies (who controls the information and the skills needed to access it) will vie with decentralizing trends: groups and communities insisting on more autonomy in describing and delivering services. The definition of education can no longer belong to one group, or even to a coalition of professional disciplines. It will need to be expanded to encompass a kind of civic morality



that transcends governments, cultures, and national boundaries (Halperin, p. 10).

Whether one accepts such characterizations of future need as valid or not, the fact is that such forecasts must be included in the crucible of policy formulation. They must be used as stimuli by those who not only understand society's challenges and problems but who also can conceive creative and economical solutions to such problems.

The halcyon days of the Great Society are over; days when government largesse was tied to broad entitlements to human reclamation, redemption, or unlimited opportunity. Today's leaders, at both federal and state levels, are short on staff, energy and information. They must now depend on plain speaking, hard-data bearing intermediaries for underserved groups in the population. If this data also testifies to the forecasting skills of its communicators, so much the better. Neither national nor state leaders wish to be associated with a policy that has a short life span, one incapable of resounding social impact. Neither will they espouse an idea without supporting evidence, without specification of available resources, or without measurable outcome criteria for its beneficiaries.

Clearly, the burden of the present is on petitioners for social program policy reform. They must demonstrate their advocacy and their creativity within an atmosphere of conservatism, fiscal restraint, and suspicion of the single-issue interest group phenomenon so prevalent in the 1970s. But, they must demonstrate their advocacy not only of outcomes but of questions to be answered—to a research agenda capable of securing empirical evidence critical to recommendations for policy.

## SOME PERSPECTIVES ON A RESEARCH AGENDA IN GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING

In the preceding chapters, we have been informed, provoked, and—very possibly—inspired to give serious thought to a new role for the counseling profession: that of modifying or stimulating state and national policies directed toward the achievement of specific social goals. If a certain arrogance characterizes such comment for the reader, it will be recalled that this text has also conveyed a sharp sense of the limitations as well as the strengths of this group of practitioners in resolving the universe of challenges facing our society in the eighties. In point of fact, within this narrative lies what may be the more important dialectic: a profession beginning to think more broadly, to share more fully, and to acknowledge the need to become more catholic in its distribution, its skill, and its assumptions about human behavior.

While improved social program policies might result simply as a consequence of publishing these and comparable essays on the potential and actual effects of counseling intervention upon certain target groups, it is highly unlikely that they alone can accomplish that objective. Far more critical to this desired impact will be the continuing delivery to policy-

makers at every level of governance of evidence drawn from current and past program beneficiaries, to wit:

1. Federal, state, or local programs in which counseling has been a required component have shown significantly greater gains for their recipients than programs without that proviso.

*\*Sample indices:* employability, reduction in antisocial behavior, improved social and interpersonal skills, reversal of disadvantage, educational goal setting or achievement, occupational skill attainment, self-discipline, adjustment to handicap, etc.

2. Developmentally or educationally oriented programs in which counseling serves either a primary prevention or intervention function with target groups are demonstrably more cost-effective than social programs aimed at human reclamation on a massive scale.

*\*Sample index:* the cost to taxpayers of ten programs in which the chief characteristics are prevention of, or early intervention with manifestations of alienation, underachievement, antisocial behavior, and the insidious effects of poverty, handicap, racial or sex stereotyping will be *less* than the cost of one program when incarcerated or unemployed individuals are targeted for rehabilitation or job placement.

3. The counseling profession has correctly assessed the nature and the urgency of specific social, educational, economical, and employment trends on several dimensions: their impact on certain groups with whom they work, their effects on the quality of life within the entire society, and the dilemma confronting decisionmakers who must weigh costs, benefits, and transient political climates and loyalties against human needs.

*\*Sample index:* guidance and counseling policy recommendations conveyed to the executive and legislative branches of government will be characterized by (a) authoritative documentation of need, (b) fiscal rationality, (c) feasibility within time and setting restraints, (d) ease of translation into program format, (e) creative use of existing resources, (f) capacity for inclusion in current policy or legislation, (g) a plan for state and local assumption of responsibility, (h) the provision of a companion research and development agenda, and (i) a clear sensitivity to the place of such recommendations within the larger social policy agendas decision makers must address.

Inherent in the needs for evidence related to these three broad categories of assertion is the further realization that pervasive to each of the previous chapters are research questions. Indeed, most of the assertions made throughout the text are testable although their requirements for time, resources, and conceptual paradigms vary significantly in complexity. Overarching specific categories of needed research, it would appear that the following research philosophy must characterize future efforts by the counseling profession to improve the base for broad scale policy making in human services:

- a. Research needs to be designed to define population needs for behavioral change and the likely impact of guidance and counseling on such behavior.

- b. Models and studies of the cost-benefit of guidance and counseling over other treatment approaches need immediate attention. These should examine the assumptions that both primary prevention and problem intervention mediated by the professional counselor are less costly, less time consuming and less likely to prolong client dependency than competing social service methodologies (e.g., institutionalization, medical intervention alone, etc.).
- c. Longitudinal effects of specific guidance and counseling processes or programs should be studied in order to demonstrate the persistence over time of the behavioral change that results.

Beyond these transcendent research needs are those that emerge from the various analyses comprising the text. These major, but not exhaustive, recommendations for research in guidance and counseling can be classified as follows:

## The Demonstrated Effects of Guidance and Counseling

1. What types of desired behavioral change are most influenced by counseling interventions? With what populations, in what settings, are these interventions likely to show the most beneficial effects?
2. How do counseling and guidance processes employed with groups of persons with the same presenting problems differ in effectiveness from other interventions; e.g., information, education, chemotherapy, psychotherapy? How do such characteristics sex, age, race, cultural, or ethnic background mediate such outcomes?
3. What forms of intervention are most appropriately and effectively used at different developmental ages? What are the policy, economic, ethical, and personnel constraints that inhibit the influence of these interventions?
4. How do preferences for or effects of guidance and counseling differ among males and females and among persons of different ethnic or racial backgrounds? How similar to the client's must the counselor's background be in these instances to achieve the desired outcomes?
5. How can guidance and counseling as modes of primary prevention be conceptualized in cost-benefit terms? What are the likely economic returns of providing guidance and counseling to different populations, at different ages, in different settings? How can existing approaches to research and evaluation of guidance and counseling be modified or extended to include cost-benefit information?

## Special Populations

1. How can the beneficiaries of social programs targeted to special populations be most effectively classified and participate most fully in research designs evaluating the effectiveness of these programs?

2. How do "special populations" defined by problems of equity or by problems of risk at transition points differ in their needs for guidance and counseling?
3. How can counselor education programs be used as settings to conduct applied research in the following areas?
  - a. *Comparison studies*: What are the effects of separate or field course experiences dealing with the counseling needs of women, minorities, bilingual, ethnically different, handicapped, elderly, etc. versus the integration of such content in courses dealing with theoretical principles and techniques of counseling and guidance?
  - b. *Longitudinal studies*: What are the results of following program graduates into fields of employment to determine relationship and adequacy of training for present work settings, movement between settings, and requests/access to upgrading experiences, particularly as they relate to skills needed to work with special populations?
  - c. *Pilot studies*: What are the outcomes in the quality of service delivery and comprehensiveness with populations served when (a) Instituting paraprofessional training at baccalaureate level and graduate levels with representative samples of special populations; (b) Instituting community counseling curriculum in concert with health and mental hygiene agencies that emphasize consultation, a psychoeducational approach, community networking and advocacy, crisis intervention and family counseling, (c) Instituting exemplary candidacy policy that permits nontraditional applicants (per educational requirements) to enter counselor education programs?

## Community-Based Guidance and Counseling Services for Adults

1. Identify patterns of successful adult career transition with a cohort of 35 to 50 year olds. Isolate the intervention(s) that improved such transitions, the provider, the setting, and the occasion for contact by the client. Test the usefulness of these findings with an older group of 50 to 70 year olds.
2. Develop a validated (by employers) matrix of transferable employability skills; skills that are useful across as well as within occupational clusters. Conduct training programs in these skills for counselors and educators in selected regional settings with funds and/or support from business and industry. Test effects of applying these in individual or group counseling with selected adult populations.
3. Study the influences of different types of mixes of information media and information networks on adult participation in continuing education and in the use of available guidance and counseling services.
4. What are the most effective mixes of professional and paraprofessional counselors needed for various adult populations in different types of communities and with varying service delivery structures?

## Youth Employment

1. Longitudinal studies are needed on the effects of school based counseling interventions upon disadvantaged youth; how do these compare with community-based services provided to similar groups of youth in terms of meaningful job placement and mobility?
2. Career aspirations of minority females and males should be studied to compare their (a) source, (b) their realism, (c) their feasibility, (d) their durability, and (e) their capacity for modification by certain advocates and/or systems.
3. What are the effects on urban, minority youth of self-contained career guidance programs and those programs that combine career guidance with other services such as education, employment, family counseling, peer counseling, community service, etc.? How do age, sex, race or ethnicity mediate these results?
4. The most effective delivery systems for job training, job seeking, finding, and keeping skills need to be identified and studied as they relate to youth and young adults who are (a) handicapped, (b) disadvantaged, (c) members of a racial or ethnic minority group. Such findings need to be examined in terms of resource requirements, characteristics of practitioners, duration and context.

## POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

In addition to the recommendations for a research agenda, pervasive to the chapters have been recommendations for policy itself. While it is easy to decry a lack of national policy in guidance and counseling—a public commitment to a plan that increases the quality of and access to a variety of helping services at nominal cost—petitioners for such a policy are obligated to identify the required elements of such a plan. What follows are such recommendations both for federal action and for state and local policy.

### I. Community Based Counseling and Guidance Services for Adults

#### A. *Federal Policy*

1. Restore appropriations for the Education Information Center program specified in the Education Amendments of 1976 (P.L. 94-482) in Title I (Higher Education) Subpart 5, and in subsequent legislation; e.g. P.L. 96-374.
2. Expand financial assistance to adult learners who cannot meet the minimum "half-time student" criteria; reflect this expansion in reauthorizing language for the Higher Education Act and/or related legislation.
3. Enact into law and appropriate funds for the Counseling Assistance for Older Americans Act of 1979 (Pepper, D-Florida).

#### B. *State and Local Policy*

1. Expand high school guidance, counseling, and information services—including computerized system access—to provide

- evening and weekend sessions for the community's adults.
2. Develop public libraries' capacities as adult information and consultation centers. Employ professionally trained counselors to supervise and upgrade the staff in competencies needed.
  3. Increase the capabilities of community human service agencies to perform adult brokering services in the areas of counseling, referral, education, and skill training.

## II Youth Employment

### A. *Federal and State Policy*

1. In social program policy undergirding training and employment legislation, counseling responsibilities specified for providers should include developing peer counseling networks and skills among beneficiaries.
2. Future youth employment legislation should specify involvement of parents, community agencies, employers, as well as counselors before funds can be distributed to petitioning state and local agencies or individuals.

### B. *Local Policy*

1. Involve youth, particularly minority youth, in the planning, implementation, and evaluation of community resource development programs that emphasize meaningful employment as one of several components; the others: economics, education, family life, consumer awareness, mental and physical health, housing, politics, transportation, etc.
2. Intervention strategies that have shown success in the elimination of racism, sexism and ethnic/language/cultural barriers should be given top priority by all providers of counseling, education, and health services as they submit annual plans to their governing agencies.

## III. The Demonstrated Effects of Guidance and Counseling

### A. *Federal Policy*

Federal policy and/or legislation needs to provide categorical funds directed to research on the effects of the presence or absence of guidance and counseling upon the recipients of social program benefits.

### B. *State and Local Policy*

Recognized national goals in such areas as the school to work transition, career development, planning, and decision-making, mental health, reduction of substance abuse, rehabilitation of the physically and emotionally handicapped, the ex-offender, and equity for special populations should constitute a policy agenda for both the executive and legislative branches of the state and local governments. The potential of guidance and counseling processes and programs to carry out this agenda should be reflected in all related social programs through specification of their delivery.



#### **IV. Special Populations**

##### **A. Federal Policy**

1. Coordinate federal initiatives addressing the needs of special populations under a single human service policy. As part of that policy, require the kinds of guidance and counseling interventions determined by research as most beneficial to these populations.
2. Federal legislation addressed to special populations should specify more than token representation of these groups in the design, location, diversity, and evaluation of services at state and local levels.
3. Increased authorization and appropriation of funds for training of service providers, for pilot studies, and for applied and empirical research should characterize the discretionary provisions of all legislation focused on special groups.

##### **B. State Policy**

1. Review and modify state certification requirements to (a) assure expertise in the skills needed by those who educate and counsel special populations, and (b) reduce barriers to certification for those who are themselves members of special populations, and who wish to become trained to serve their peers.
2. State and local policy regarding the delivery of services to special populations should encourage flexibility and collaboration between sponsoring agencies; e.g., counselors should be deployed in consultative and coordinating roles as well as in direct one-to-one relationships with clients.
3. State legislation addressing special populations should particularize and customize related programs seeded by federal funds. State aid must compensate for those omissions in federal policy that do not account for the disproportionate incidence and location of certain special groups needing services within given states.

#### **V. The Nation's Mental Health Agenda and Its Service Providers**

##### **A. Federal Policy**

1. The reemphasis upon primary prevention modes in mental health services recommended by the White House Conferences on Mental Health will require all involved federal agencies to redefine their efforts in terms of program policies. These must place early intervention, education, and coordination of federal, state, and community resources as first priority.
2. An increasing percentage of the currently modest national mental health budget should be targeted for research and exemplary projects emphasizing preventive community-based mental health programs and projects. This policy should be complemented by the provision of increased technical assistance to states and communities so that they might become more effective and efficient in maintaining such programs.

3. All social program legislation proposed by either the Executive or Legislative branch should specify a *competency* level for any service providers associated with the delivery of such programs at the state and local level to be implemented and monitored by the appropriate state and local program administrators and professional associations.

**B. State Policy**

1. Entitlement to third-party payments (from insurance groups, state departments of social welfare) should be extended to the staffs of those alternative human service agencies who have demonstrated a history of effectively serving their clientele; e.g., volunteer alcohol and drug abuse centers, spouse and domestic violence clinics, etc.
2. Similar entitlement should be extended to individuals who are professionally trained rehabilitation counselors, marriage and family counselors, vocational guidance counselors, gerontological counselors, community counselors, etc., whose work settings or clientele are nonschool/non "student" in nature.
3. State licensure boards concerned with the regulation of mental health services providers should plan for the (a) gradual phasing in of a major representation of consumers as members. (b) modification of licensure requirements to reflect demonstration of competency as primary criteria versus years of education; requirements that all individual and agency mental health service providers not only open their practice and practices to consumer inspection, but provide sufficient information and data on effectiveness necessary to permit potential clientele an appropriate choice of services and providers.
4. Increase local control, coordination, and management of mental health services; specifically, empty schools or empty buildings in school district "catchment" areas are ideally suited as the settings for such centers.

**VI. The Future Role of Guidance and Counseling in the Conservation of Human Resources**

**A. Federal Policy**

1. A national policy on the development and conservation of human resources should be promulgated to serve as the basis for future executive and legislative branch decisions in the area of social programs. Within this policy, the role of guidance and counseling should be explicated as a major component.
2. One element of a national policy in guidance and counseling should be the responsibility for and provisions made to advise business and industry of the potential human impact of proposed technological advances; e.g., an energy policy's impact on the elderly and disadvantaged, the growing substitution of machines and systems for human energy, etc.
3. Such national policy on Guidance and Counseling should assist the country's educational leaders in the scrutiny of the entire industry of public education; is it in fact preparing itself for entry into the 21st century? What should the federal role

be? How narrowly (or how broadly) should education be interpreted in the future? What relationships should be established with Labor, Justice, Defense, Housing, Health and Human Services, for example?

**B. State Policy**

1. Create a Human Protection Commission to review all growth activities, including military installations, construction, manufacturing proposed within a given state to determine their impact on targeted groups or individuals. This agency would also serve to provide a check and balance to the national policy on Human Resource Development and Conservation.
2. Sufficient incentives must be provided (through academic credit, tuition-reimbursement, tax credit, etc.) to instruct prospective and current parents in becoming more effective and more knowledgeable models for and advocates of their children. Widely available workshops and institutes on these topics should be a first priority with state and community leaders, with staffing comprised of skilled counselors and allied professionals.
3. Increase state incentives to pool initiatives now separately devoted to technological and human services that directly or indirectly influence the quality of life. Growth industries such as construction, manufacturing, tourism, housing, etc., should open policy and planning forums to human service agencies; by the same token, the latter groups can increase their forecasting and resource development skills with input from these and other industries.

**VII. Public Education: A Future Scenario**

**A. Federal Policy**

1. The Department of Education or its successor should target discretionary funds to studies of the value and effectiveness of the traditional secondary school as compared with alternative structures for entry into continuing education and/or employment.
2. Reverse the trend of bitterly contested battles by special groups for limited resources (via legislation/appropriations) through assurances that (a) a commonality of all programs will guarantee equity through the 10th year of high school, and (b) a distinction between programs will meet needs of individuals seeking continued education, education combined with work, or direct entry into the job market.
3. Remove the classification of part- or full-time student as a determinant in financial aid eligibility for those seeking further education. Reflect current inflationary spiral in levels of eligibility for grants or loans.

**B. State Policy**

1. Eliminate the high school diploma (or its equivalent) as the single criterion for access to postsecondary education by establishing additional criteria of equal weight and status; e.g., work experience, demonstrations of competency, community

- projects; volunteer service, testimonials, etc. from which a student can choose.
2. Involve major employers and postsecondary institutions in the development of these criteria for screening applicants on other grounds than high school attainment.
  3. As high school exit behavior becomes more closely allied with performance levels and student/institution contracting, consider eliminating the Carnegie Unit structure in certain school districts to determine its continued relevance as a parallel compliance.
  4. Align two- and four-year colleges in the delivery of accessible units of education, combined with paid or non-paid work experience, to anyone who has reached his or her sixteenth year or has completed the tenth grade in a secondary school.

As this text was being written, leaders in the counseling profession were queried by the editors on their perceptions of policy focus and the content of a companion research and development agenda. With few exceptions, their collective judgment was remarkably consistent with the recommendations just presented. For the reader's benefit, their comments are summarized below:

## Desired Policy Outcomes

1. Provision for lifespan planning by short-term program recipients.
2. Federal or state support for testing and evaluation.
3. Competency-based requirements for the practice of counseling in all settings.
4. Federal, state, and local reciprocity agreements in the standardization of requirements and salaries for providers of mental health services.
5. Emphasis on the human resource/reclamation role: increased stress on family and community counseling, networking, and the development of advocacy/information systems.
6. Provision of research funds directed toward aspects of primary prevention: "wellness," longevity, employability, human resource development, life support networks, etc.
7. Counseling a required part of all social programs; a condition of receiving funds from all levels of government.

## Content for Research and Development

1. Measure the effectiveness of guidance and counseling interventions on the basis of costs, persistence over time, and client report of quality and appropriateness at immediate and subsequent intervals.
2. Conduct applied research with volunteers undergoing "normal" life crises; stress anthropological approach over animal science approach.

3. Determine the minimum training and performance levels required of practitioners who work with specific target populations, for specific reasons, and at particular points in time. From these findings, extrapolate both generic and specific counselor competence capable of standardization in training programs, by certifying or licensing agencies, and through public registry.
4. Increase student/counselor knowledge of the work dynamics and job requirements confronting their clientele by requiring added increments of work-setting exchange or tutorial, externships with business and industry, and placement within agencies or institutions dedicated to community services.
5. Study the impact of depression/recession on selected groups: unwed mothers, the rural poor, the unemployed urban resident, the minority youth . . . for example. Construct and test community based models of guidance, counseling, and mental health systems that show promise of combatting these effects.
6. Follow up graduates of a counselor education program that included coursework in political activism, power salience, management skills, organizational psychology and environmental engineering, public relations—or any combination of these—to determine the range of their placements and their impact on clientele. Compare this cohort with a matched group of graduates from a program containing none of these elements on the same criteria.

## ISSUES FOR THE PROFESSION

The preceding elements of a research and policy agenda imply changes in the delivery of guidance and counseling in the United States, in the preparation and credentialing of practitioners, and in the professional metaphors by which the field is described. Thus, the various configurations by which this agenda, or parts of it, come to fruition, will determine the success of guidance and counseling practitioners, theorists, and researchers in meeting the challenges of the future as forecast in this text. These issues deserve careful and systematic analysis.

Throughout the text many issues important to guidance and counseling have been implied or explicitly stated. Space does not permit a complete inventory of these. The major issues, however, that do emerge in the text can be classified into those that relate to planning, to professional identity and practice, and to cooperation among related professional groups. They include the following:

### Planning

- What does the vulnerability to economic, social, and political forces of guidance and counseling processes and delivery systems mean for the planning of such efforts in different settings and at different governmental levels?

- How should planning include the amount of influence upon the organization and content of guidance and counseling that accrues from legislative definition and the allocation of resources?
- How necessary is a coordinating mechanism that crosses federal and state agencies to advocate the contributions of guidance and counseling to national or state policy goals, to the coordination of federal and state language about and expectations of guidance and counseling, and to the analysis of proposed legislation with respect to its impact upon guidance and counseling?
- In order to respond to pressures for accountability how can the empirical and cost-benefit bases of guidance and counseling be expanded and effectively communicated to policy-makers?
- Can the existing state of knowledge in guidance and counseling be made to yield fuller insight into 'what works' and 'what does not work' in guidance and counseling for minority youth and for other special populations? How can and in what ways should the knowledge base for guidance and counseling be extended?
- Should guidance and counseling be separated out for categorical funding from those programs in which they are essential components or seek to be included as set asides in all social programs to which they can make contributions?
- Is counseling helpful or essential to all persons or to special populations and under what conditions? If essential, how should this be demonstrated to policy-makers?
- How population specific are guidance and counseling techniques and what are the implications for differential treatment? What is the state of relevant knowledge about such issues and how should it be improved?
- How can counselor credibility be effectively achieved with consumers, with policy-makers, and with related specialists at local, state, and national levels?

## Professional Identity and Practice

- What are the bases on which the delivery and the content of guidance and counseling should be differentiated for children, youth, and adults, for males and females, and for special populations?
- On what bases and under what conditions should or can guidance and counseling practitioners serve both individual development and institutional missions?
- Is there a necessary balance between preventive, psychoeducational and treatment, remedial roles in guidance and counseling? How are these balances affected by settings, practitioner competence, and consumer populations?
- What are the professional identity implications of the counselor being seen as a political activist in behalf of improved support for guidance and counseling and as an advocate for the needs of special populations?



- How and in what fashion should guidance and counseling practitioners in different settings confirm their mission, identify its limits, and be held accountable for its promise?
- What is the proper role for guidance and counseling practitioners in modifying the psychosocial ecology of institutions in either group or in individual terms?
- Should limits be imposed on the diversity of intervention strategies included as within the capability and ethical parameters of guidance and counseling practitioners in order to sharpen the field's definitions?
- What are the needs for definition and use of paraprofessional and indigenous workers in guidance and counseling?
- What are the necessities for and models of specific counselor training and expertise in cross-racial, cross-cultural, and cross-sex counseling?
- How can the informational and motivational needs of minority youth and other special populations be clearly identified, understood, and met?
- Should secondary school guidance and counseling be extended to adult populations, under what conditions, and with what expectations?
- Should guidance and counseling in all settings be seen as having brokering responsibilities?

## Cooperation Among Related Professional Groups

- What is the likelihood of networking related groups of guidance and counseling practitioners—e.g., school, employment, rehabilitation counselors, marriage and family therapists, counseling psychologists, social workers—in order to minimize problems of professional turfdom?
- What is the desirability of increasing the standardization of the language by which guidance and counseling goals, processes, behavioral outcomes, etc. is described across populations, settings, legislative acts and practitioner types?
- How adequate or appropriate for the future are existing or proposed credentialing mechanisms and how can they be made more inclusive across professional groups of guidance and counseling practitioners? Does credentialing have relevance beyond the establishment of competence in service-providers?
- To what degree do guidance, counseling, and psychotherapy have distinct meanings and what are the implications of these for cooperation, training, and credentialing of their practitioners?

## CONCLUDING STATEMENT

This chapter has restated the rationale for and some of the ingredients of policy formulation in guidance and counseling in the United States as

they have been perceived in this text. In particular, it has provided an inventory of recommendations for research and for policy as well as the professional issues that accompany these recommendations. In a major sense, the recommendations and issues described here are the *raison d'être* for engaging to such a policy analysis. The result is a cognitive map of future actions that needs to be undertaken by guidance and counseling as a profession.

## REFERENCES

- Bruce-Biggs, B. The Social, Economic and Political Milieu of Education During the Next Decade. In *Future Trends in Education Policy*, Jane Hewilt (Ed.), Lexington, Massachusetts: D.C. Health and Company, 1979.
- Halperin, S. The future and educational governance: Some prospects and possibilities. Scottsdale, Arizona. Presentation to the State Directors of Vocational Education, 1979 (mimeo).
- Herr, Edwin L., Policy in guidance and counseling: The U.S. Experience, International Association of Vocational Guidance Bulletin, Special Issue, 1981.
- Tyler, Leona E. *Individuality. Human Possibilities and Personal Choice in the Psychological Development of Men and Women*. San Francisco, California: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1979.
- Whitehead, Alfred North. *Process and Reality*. New York: Free Press, 1969 (originally published in 1929).

# APPENDIX A

## About the Authors

---

# Appendix A

---

**JULIA P. DAVIDSON (Ph.D.)** is currently a consultant to the National Alliance of Business—subsequent to serving as a Program Administrator with *Youthwork, Incorporated* in Washington, D.C. She previously served as an Associate Executive with the American Personnel and Guidance Association; Director, the Mission-Moton Educational Opportunity Center; Director/Coordinator of the Intensive Educational Development Program, University of Maryland; an Instructor in Counseling and Personnel Services; and a Counselor in various programs at the University of Maryland. She has been a consultant on race relations, student affairs, and minority programs at many institutions of higher education. She has received the Shaw University National Alumnus Meritorious Service Award.

**PAUL FRANKLIN** is an Educational Consultant associated with the National Center for Educational Brokering. He resides in Oregon. Franklin previously directed a Talent Search project and was involved in the development of the Oregon Career Information System. He currently serves as Co-coordinator of the Oregon Educational Information Centers project and is a consultant to EIC programs in several other states. He attended Eastern Oregon State College and the University of Oregon.

**THOMAS F. GREEN (Ph.D.)** is Professor of Education and Director, Division of Educational Foundations, Syracuse University. He formerly served as Director, Educational Policy Research Center, as well as member of the faculty at Michigan State University and earlier at the South Dakota School of Mines and Technology. Dr. Green has served as the President, Philosophy of Education Society; a Member, National Academy of Education; and a Fellow, National Institute of Education. The holder of John Simon Guggenheim and Alfred North Whitehead Fellowships, Dr. Green has been a consultant to OECD in Paris and a guest lecturer at many universities and professional conferences. Dr. Green is the author of five books and more than thirty articles.

DONALD G. HAYS (Ph.D.) is Administrator, Pupil Services, Fullerton Union High School District. Before his twenty years of pupil services administration in Fullerton, Dr. Hays served as an Instructor and as a Counselor of freshmen men, Arizona State University; a junior high school counselor; and, a Research Assistant at the Guidance Laboratory for Superior Students, University of Wisconsin. He has served as a consultant to numerous school districts and as President, the American School Counselors Association, California School Counselors Association, California Association of Counselor Education and Supervision, and the California Council of Pupil Services Associations. He has served on the Editorial Boards of *Counselor Education and Supervision*, *The Personnel and Guidance Association*, and *The School Counselor*. He has published four books and a number of articles in national journals.

EDWIN L. HERR (Ed.D.) is Professor and Head, Division of Counseling and Educational Psychology, The Pennsylvania State University. He formerly served as an Assistant/Associate Professor of Counselor Education at the State University of New York at Buffalo; Director, Bureau of Guidance Services, Pennsylvania Department of Education; and as a business school counselor, and director of guidance in school systems in Pennsylvania. He is a licensed psychologist in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and New Jersey. He has also served in overseas research and teaching roles in Britain, Germany, Norway, Panama, and Japan. Dr. Herr has been President of the North Atlantic Association of Counselor Education and Supervision as well as national president of the latter group. He recently completed three years on the Board of Directors of the American Personnel and Guidance Association. He is currently immediate past-president of the National Vocational Guidance Association. Dr. Herr is the author or coauthor of twenty books and monographs and more than 160 articles; he has served as editor of *Journal of Counselor Education and Supervision* and on the editorial boards of several other journals.

ALLEN E. IVEY (Ed.D.) is currently Professor of Counseling and Mental Health Administration, University of Massachusetts, Amherst. He formerly served as Director of Counseling and Professor of Psychology at Colorado State University, Director of Counseling at Bucknell University, and Director of Student Activities at Boston University. He has also served as a Fulbright scholar at the University of Copenhagen and as a consultant or speaker to more than 100 universities and agencies in the U.S.A. and abroad. A licensed psychologist in Massachusetts and a Diplomate in Counseling Psychology, American Board of Professional Psychology, Dr. Ivey is currently President of Division 17 (Counseling Psychology) of the American Psychological Association. The author of six books and more than 100 articles, Dr. Ivey's major publication is *Micro-counseling: Innovations in Interviewing Training*.

JOHN F. JENNINGS (J. D.) has served since 1967 as Counsel and Staff Director for the Subcommittee on Elementary, Secondary, and Vocational Education of the Committee on Education and Labor of the U.S. House

of Representatives. In addition to serving as the chief staff person to Chairman Carl D. Perkins, major responsibilities include serving as the principal staff person for the Subcommittee's other ten Democratic members in matters relating to the jurisdiction of the Subcommittee. This jurisdiction includes the Elementary and Secondary Education Act, the School Lunch Act, the Vocational Education Act, the Emergency School Aid Act, Indian education, school construction, school busing and desegregation, impact aid, school financing, and other general legislation affecting elementary and secondary education. The Subcommittee also has responsibility for the Department of Defense Overseas Schools. Mr. Jennings has written many journal articles such as for the *Journal of Law and Education* and the *Journal of the American Vocational Association*. His duties also include addressing organizations to explain the intent of proposed and present Federal legislation. Mr. Jennings was admitted to the Bar of the State of Illinois in November 1967; to the Federal Bar (7th Circuit) in November 1967; and to the Bar of the District of Columbia in February 1969. Mr. Jennings was admitted to practice before the U.S. Supreme Court in October 1979. He is also on the steering committee of the Educational Staff Seminar.

**JUDY HARRIS LOMBANA (Ph.D.)** Is currently Associate Professor of Counselor Education, the University of North Florida. She previously served as a consultant, middle and secondary school guidance, Florida Department of Education as well as an English teacher, counselor and director of testing in schools in Virginia and Georgia. She has served on the Government Relations Committee of the American Personnel and Guidance Association and various legislative task forces. She has also served as the President of the Florida Association for Counselor Education and Supervision and the Board of Directors of the Florida Personnel and Guidance Association. She has received Distinguished Service Awards from the American Personnel and Guidance Association, the Florida Association for Counselor Education and Supervision and the Southern Branch Assembly of APGA. Dr. Lombana is the author or editor of more than thirty books, articles, and research reports.

**FRANCIS U. MACY.** As Senior Associate of the National Manpower Institute and Director of the National Center for Educational Brokering (1976 to present), Macy (a) collects and disseminates materials on career and educational information services; (b) designs and conducts pre-service and in-service training for counselors; (c) co-leads production of a manual on selection and training of counselors of adults; (d) collaborates with Association of Computer-Based Career Information Systems; (e) consults with state and school officials on information and counseling services; (f) advises staff of National Manpower Institute on counseling and information issues. Macy, Director of the Regional Learning Service (1972-77), designed with Stephen K. Bailey a prototype community-based educational counseling service for adults. He established and managed RLS with a staff of thirty counseling adults on educational and career decisions in five counties of central New York. He was a Peace Corps Administrator from 1964 until 1972.



LEE PERRY (Ed.D.) is Assistant Professor and Associate Director of the Program in Counseling and Consulting Psychology, Harvard Graduate School. She previously served as a research psychologist and a member of the faculty at UCLA. She has also been in the private practice of psychotherapy, a director of psychological services, and child psychologist in various settings in California. Dr. Perry is active in a variety of professional organizations and currently serves as chair of the Committee on Scientific Affairs of Division 17 of the American Psychological Association. She is licensed as a clinical psychologist and as a marriage, child, and family counselor in Pennsylvania.

NANCY PINSON(Ph.D.) is a consultant in Research and Development subsequent to serving as Coordinator of Vocational Guidance and Career Decelopment with the Maryland State Department of Education. She formerly held positions as a government research specialist, cooperative kindergarten director, and teacher in school systems in Maryland, Washington, D.C. and Florida. She has consulted widely with state and federal government agencies, school districts, and higher education institutions and recently completed an IPA with the National Institute of Education. A recent member of the Editorial Board of *Counselor Education and Supervision*, a Trustee of the National Vocational Guidance Association, the Accreditation Chairperson for Counselor Education Programs in fourteen southern states, and Chairperson of ACES and NVGA's Government Relations Committees, Dr. Pinson has also been credited with influencing a number of guidance-focused legislative initiatives. She has received the Pi Lambda Theta Award as an author of an outstanding book in education; the PBS Emmy Award for a reading series on instructional television; the Distinguished Legislative Service Award from the American Personnel and Guidance Association, and has served as a National Education Policy Fellow. Dr. Pinson is the coauthor of five books and the author of numerous articles and monographs.

BRUCE SHERTZER (Ed.D.) is Professor of Education and Chairman, Counseling and Personnel Services, Purdue University. Dr. Shertzer served as a teacher, counselor, and director of guidance in public schools, a state director of guidance, Associate Director on Guidance of Superior Students for the North Central Association of College and Secondary Schools before joining the faculty of Purdue University in 1960. Dr. Shertzer has served as President of the American Personnel and Guidance Association (1973-74); President, Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (1970); Chairman, North Central ACES (1968); and, President, Indiana Personnel and Guidance Association (1963). A Fulbright Lecturer to the University of Reading, England, he has served on the National Advisory Council for Career Education and was its Chairman in 1975-76. Dr. Shertzer is the author or coauthor of twelve books, twelve monographs and pamphlets, and some forty articles and book reviews.



## **THE AMERICAN PERSONNEL AND GUIDANCE ASSOCIATION,**

A professional educational association  
for members of the guidance and counseling pro-  
fessions, offers many valuable services to its  
members. These include:

- Division memberships
- Journals
- APG Foundation  
(opportunities for  
tax-free g.)
- Insurance benefits
- Career Placement Center
- Publications at special  
member prices

You can benefit professionally from a membership in  
APGA. For further information write to:

**APGA HEADQUARTERS**  
Two Skyline Place  
Suite 400  
5203 Leesburg Pike  
Falls Church, VA 22041

